REGIONAL DIRECTORATE OF FOOD KARACHI REGION KARACHI. NO: A/C (F-I)/ A. Tender 2017-2018/2017/93 3 Dated: 14-03-2017

To,

The Manager (ENT-II),

Sindh Public Procurement Regularity Authority,

Karachi.

Subject:

Copy to:-

1.

2.

BID EVALUATION REPORT ON TENDER PROCUREMENT

HELD ON 08-03-2017 FOR TRANSPORTATION AND LABOUR

WORK.

Enclosed herewith Bid Evaluation Report (in original) duly signed by the Chairman and Members of the Committee for Annual Tender Notice for the year 2017-18 held on 08-03-2017 for transportation of wheat from various districts to interior Sindh to Karachi and Labour Work (Refilling of bags) for the period from 01-03-2017 to 28-02-2018 for further necessary action.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOOD

KARACHY REGION HUSSain Ghumo Deputy Director Food Karachi Region Karachi

P.A to Director Food Sindh, Karachi.

P.S to Secretary Food Sindh, Karachi.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOOD KARACHI REGION

ATTENDANCE SHEET OF MEMBERS OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE TENDER FOR THE TRANSPORTATION & LABOUR WORK FOR THE YEAR 2017-18 (NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017) TENDER OPEN ON 08-03-2017 TIME 2.00 P.M)

| e 4 | 27 - 24 - 24 - 24 - 24 - 24 - 24 - 24 - | | |
|------|---|---|-----------|
| S.NO | Name of Member | Designation | Signature |
| 1 | Municipal Community | DEGNIS OREGING COO | Mounn |
| 2 | Doted Hussain Balanch | 7 Q: A | Shim? |
| 3 | SHAHZES SHAIKH_ | Assist AND COMMISSION Chemeral KARACHI DYISTON | +~ |
| 4 | 2 | | |
| 5 | | | |

Attendance Sheet of Participant in Technical Bidding Of Tender for Transportation Work For the Year 17-18

Tender Opening Date: 08-03-2017

NIT (NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017)

| 144 1160 | 201m. | | |
|------------|---------------------|-------------------|--|
| S.NO / NA | ME OF COMPANY | NAME OF PARTICIPA | ANTS SIGNATURE |
| | sau Toanporter | Joti. | Ahry 2 |
| / | Anwar. | m. Anwar. | The state of the s |
| | SAR PAT. | Jai Park arch | Sard |
| | N 3 TRANSTORTE H | HARESH. | WW 1 S |
| | nmander. | Cachmondon | . Cally Marie |
| | idTrader | m. Faronyu. (1 | m) dra x |
| 7 × Nat | ional logistic Cell | | 6 ml |
| | NOKA Pai. | Namab Al: | Pandoll |
| / | ian & co. | Fahad Clures | - Duly ? |
| 10 2 840 | | Hashim. | thank Ale of |
| | ded Rice. | Jarn. | Sape rand |
| | MOAR Movies. | | Col hul |
| | mmas Placem. | | 7 |
| 1 | Ries Milly - | - ACTATE SIL | vine Eylin 7 |
| 15 7 Abd | ullah Lakhain | A bolollach. | 2 1 |
| 16 & Farh | an Rioz, | Parlyn. | |
| 17 Hare | , Lmal. | Harosh mal | |
| 18 = Allie | d & Co- | Wavan | Os V |
| 19 7 Ven | ces | (exrais) | · Duy |
| 20 - KHAY | Im Hussam 80 | , - | 3 |
| 21 2 M UHA | minest come | | 7 |
| 22 ABE | | | 7 |
| | millar YC | | 9 |
| 24 FR16 | wil Network. | | 36 |
| 25 | , | * | |
| 26 | | | .4 |
| 27 | | 21.74 | . 'A |

COMPARATIVE STATEMENT OF RATE OFFERED BY THE PARTIES FOR TRANSPORTATION OF IND: WHEAT LIFTING FROM VARIOUS NO:

Date of Submissi Date of Opening Time 08-03-2017 08-03-2017 02:00 P.M

A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017

| S.No | Name of Parties | Sukkur | Umerkot | Dadu | Jamshoor o/ PRC Bolhari | S.Benazira bad | Thatta | Ghotki | Khairpur | N.Feroze | Larkana | Shikarpur | Jacobabad | Qambar /Shahdad kot | Kashmore /Kandhkot | Mirpurkh as | Sanghar | Signature of the Contractors |
|------------|-----------------|--------|---------|--------|-------------------------------|-------------------|--------|--------|----------|----------|---------|-----------|-----------|---------------------------|-----------------------|----------------|---------|---------------------------------|
| 1 | KOHISAT. | 119.19 | 131.77 | 101.99 | 88.86 | 83.33 | 84.77 | 132.32 | 97.17 | 81.11 | 129.77 | 159.59 | 133-33 | 151 51 | 149.99 | 115.49 | 97.97 | |
| 2 | Mehrann. | | 124.40 | | 88.88 | 96.80 | | 106.70 | 109.40 | | 131.40 | | | 131.70 | 115-60 | 113.40 | | |
| 3 | m. Anwar | | | | | | | | | | | 123.40 | | | 1,67 | | | No. |
| 4 | Perrcez Ali | 110 | | 94.75 | 104 | 93 | | 111 | 103 | - | 123 | 117 | 125 | 125 | 103 | | 82.85 | 9 |
| 5 | Abdullahlakh. | | | | | | | | ¥. | | | | | 1 | | | 93 | |
| 6 | Hasan 8Co- | | | | | | | | 115 | | | | | | 109.8 | | | |
| 7 | Sharjah | | | | 8390 | 88.80 | | 121:70 | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8 | Chancka | | | 100.9 | Ē | | | | | | 130.9 | 114.8 | 119.80 | | | | | * |
| . 9 | Noce Rice. | | | 89 | | | | | 11 | | | | Ti. | | | | | 3 |
| 10 | m. Azeem | | | | | | | | | 729 | 77.9 | | (*) | | | | 79 | |
| 11 | NLC | 133 | 141 | 133 | 91 | 120 | 91 | 141 | 133 | 123 | 162 | 133 | 133 | 133 | 162 | 106 | 112 | |
| ϵ | UnitedRice | | - 5 | | 78-6 | | 76.66 | 98:66 | | | 121.66 | | | | | | 73.66 | |
| 13 | Golden | | | | | | 8360 | | | | 136.69 | | | 135.35 | | | | |
| 14 | Lachmandon | | 1313 | | | | 84.48 | | | | | | | | | 115.15 | , | |

Deputy Director Food

Karachi Food Region

Chairman Of the Committee

Schrift .

Assistant Director Food

Karachi Food Region

Member - I

Shahzaib Shaik k

Assistant Commissioner General

Member - II

COMPARATIVE STATEMENT OF RATE OFFERED BY THE PARTIES FOR TRANSPORTATION OF IND: WHEAT LIFTING FROM VARIOUS

DISTRICT OF INTERIOR SINDH TO KARACHI (TENDER FOR THE YEAR 2017-18)

Date of Submissi Date of Opening Time

08-03-2 02:00 P.

A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017

| S.No | Name of Parties | Sukkur | Umerkot | Dadu | Jamshoor o/ PRC Bolhari | S.Benazira bad | Thatta | | | N.Feroze | Larkana | Shikarpur | Jacobabad | Qambar /Shahdad kot | Kashmore /Kandhko | Mirpurki as | Sanghar | Signature of the Contractors |
|------|------------------------------|--------|---------|------|-------------------------------|-------------------|--------|-------|----|----------|---------|-----------|-----------|---------------------------|----------------------|----------------|---------|------------------------------|
| 15 | Hareshmal. | 90 | | 1 | E 1 | | | 94.98 | 90 | | | 708 | | | | | | 0 2 |
| 16 | Allied Stor | 78.99 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 17 | KHADIM HUSSAIN | | | | | | | | | | | | 109.50 | | | * | | |
| 18 | milken H. (a) | | | | y 8 | | | | | ¥ * | y 1 | +3 | | | | | 99 | |
| 19 | M. Hasting About Burnelly | | | | | | | | | | | | 110 | | 10010 | 7 | *** | |
| 20 | | | | | | | | | | | | - | | | | | | |
| 21 | | | - | | | | | | • | | | | | | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | · · | | | | 31 |
| 23 | | | | 197 | | to the | | | * | | | | | (*) | | | | , |
| -24 | | | | | | | | | ē. | | | | | | | | | (4) |
| 25 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

(College)

Deputy Director Food

Karachi Food Region

Chairman Of the Committee

Assistant Director Food

Karachi Food Region

Member - I

Shahzaib Shaik,

Assistant Commissioner General

Member - II

Attendance Sheet of Participant in Technical Bidding Of Tender for Labor Work For the Year 17.

Tender Opening Date: 08-03-2017

NIT (NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017)

| S.NO | NAME OF COMPANY | NAME OF PARTICIPANTS | S SIGNATURE |
|------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------|
| 1 | KHAN PRIERPRISES. | | CHEMI |
| | SHER AU | SHER ALL | Scin . |
| 2 / | | | الله المالي |
| 3 / | RACI MUHAMMAN | Raji, | 156/- |
| 4 | AONAN ENT. | | Ouz ? |
| 5 | CHAUDRY LAFAR OVBOL | copped in (+ spect). | 68 |
| 6 % | ZAHID. PATERDRILES | (appear in 1/2 support). | |
| 7 = | SAH EMFRORISES | , | 3 |
| 8 | Riaz Poli | M. Kim | Chiff ! |
| 9 - | Parkau hil. | , , | ا قریات |
| 10 | Persais Ali | · Parrocez AL | Pas |
| 11 | Azeers | | 3 |
| 12 | Cal william | | |
| | (13 Man XIII) | | ü |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | | |
| 15 | 0 -4 | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | | | |
| 18 | | | |
| 19 | 3 | | |
| 20 | | • | |
| 21 | | | e. |
| 22 | | | |
| 23 | | | |
| | | | |
| 24 | (a) | | |
| 25 | | | |
| 26 | | | |
| 27 | | | |

COMPARATIVE STATEMENT OF RATE OFFERED BY THE PARTIES FOR LABOUR WORK AT SINDH GOVERNMENT GODOWNS AND HIRED PRIVATE STORAGE GODOWNS (TENDER FOR THE YEAR 2017-18)

Reference Nit No:NO A/C NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/83B DATED 14-02-2017

| Date of | Submission | 08-03-2017 |
|---------|------------|------------|
| | | |

| Date of Opening (| 8-03-2017 at 2.00 P.M |
|-------------------|-----------------------|
|-------------------|-----------------------|

| | | Rate for P.P | Rate for Jute |
|------|------------------------|--------------|---------------|
| S.No | Name of Parties | Katta | Bags |
| 1 | KHAN ENTERD | 3.9. | 7.9 |
| 2 | SHER ALL GETERVAISES . | 4.5 | 8.5 |
| 3 | SAH | 424.5 | 8.49 |
| 4 | RALL MUHAMMAS ENT | 3.25 | 6.50 |
| 5 | OUKBAN KOLACHI | 4.75 | 7.75 |
| 6 | RIAZ ENTERPRISES | 3.45 | 6-95 |
| 7 | CHAUDRY ZAFAR DOYBAL | 7 | 13 |
| 8 | FARHAN RIAZ. | 6.90 | 9.74 |
| 9 | AZEEM. | 5-75 | 11.50 |
| 10 | | | \ |
| 11 | | | \ |
| 12 | | | |
| 13 | • | | |
| | E. | | |

Dollar X sini

2 de la constante de la consta

Evaluation Report On Tender Proceedings Held on 08-03-2017 AT 2:00 P.M at Deputy Director Food Office Karachi Region For Transportation of wheat from Various districts of Interior Sindh to Karachi And Labor Work (Refilling of Begs) for the Period From 01-03-2017 to 28-022018

The Regional Directorate of Food Karachi / Procuring Agency Re-invited bids from the interested parties for transportation of wheat from various Districts of interior Sindh to Karachi and labour work at government godowns at Landhi for the period to be enforced from 01-03-2017 to 28-02-2018, vide this office Tender Notice NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017 and the members of procurement committee attended the meeting. The Tender Notice was published in the following news papers.

The Express Tribune (English)
 The Daily Jang Karachi (Urdu)
 Dated: 17-02-2017
 Dated: 19-02-2017
 Dated: 17-02-2017

The Tender Notice was also hosted on Sindh Government website www.sindh.gov.pk for convenience of the interested parties. On the whole 89 Forms were issued to various parties interested in the transportation work and 12 forms were issued for labour work. The Technical Bid was opened on schedule date and time i.e. 08-03-2017 at 2.00 P.M and Financial Bid was opened on 08-03-2017 at 2.00 P.M before the Committee constituted by the Government No: SO(G)Food(6-39)2013-14/131 dated 27-01-2014 under the Chairmanship of Deputy Director Food Karachi. The tender was carried out in two phases one for transportation work and other for labour work.

A-FOR TRNASPORTATION WORK

As per schedule the parties were called in the office of the Deputy Director Food Karachi and entered their names in Attendance Sheet. 22 Parties attended and participated in tendering process. In accordance to condition Number 1 (a) & (b) all the parties produced two envelops one was marked as Technical and other was Financial. The 22 envelops having marked as Technical were opened by the chair in the presence of Members and all participants and checked the documents provided by the parties. As a result the documents of 20 Parties were seen in order where as the documents of two parties Namely 1) M/s Zahid Traders 2) Friends Network & Co were not completed, hence they were not allowed to participate in Financial bids and they were returned financial envelope un-opened.

After completion of above position, the Financial Forms of 20 (Twenty) parties were opened by the Committee before all the participants and recorded the bids offered by them in respect of each district. Meanwhile a Comparative Statement showing rate offered by each party was prepared on spot before the Committee and enclosed herewith duly signed by the Members and Chairman of the Committee. As per Comparative Statement the lowest rates for transportation of wheat and recorded as under along with approved rates of last two years for same Districts and work:-

4~

Cont'd Page-2

| S.No | District | Name of Party | Rate offered on 08- 03-2017 for the year 2017-18 | Approved Rates for the year 2016-17 | Approved Rates for the year 2015-16 | approved rates of last year |
|------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|--|--|--|-----------------------------|
| 1 | Dadu | Noor Rice Mills | 89 | 104.50 | 110.80 | Low Rs. 15.5 (15% Low) |
| 2 | Jamshoro / PRC Bolhari | United Rice | 78.66 | 84.50 | 97.77 | Low Rs. 5.84 (7% Low) |
| 3 | S.Benazirabad | Kohisar Enterprises | 83.33 | 89.90 | 94.94 | Low Rs.6.57 (7% Low) |
| 4 | Thatta | United Rice | 76.66 | 84.84 | 0 | Low Rs. 8.18 (10% Low) |
| 5 - | Ghotki | HareshMal Santwani | 94.98 | 99.66 | 109.66 | Low Rs. 4.68 (5 % Low) |
| 6 | Khairpur | HareshMal Santwani | 90 | 92.66 | 99.22 | Low Rs. 2.66 (3% Low) |
| 7 | N.Feroze | M.Azeem & Co | 72.9 | 84.49 | 96.69 | Low Rs. 11.59 (14%) |
| 8 | Larkana | United Rice | 121.66 | 125.00 | 142.66 | Low Rs. 3.34 (3% Low) |
| 9 | Shikarpur | HareshMal Santwani | 108 | 124.50 | 132.00 | Low Rs. 16.5 (13% Low) |
| 10 | Jacobabad | Khadim Hussain | 109.5 | 120.66 | 139.00 | Low Rs.11.16 (9% Low) |
| 11 | Mirpurkhas | National Logistic Cells | 106 | 00 | 00 | Not Applicable |
| 12 | Sanghar | United Rice | 73.66 | 89.66 | 99.66 | Low Rs. 16 (18% Low) |
| 13 | Kashmore / K-Kot | Pervaiz Ali | 103 | 117.00 | 133.00 | Low Rs. 14 (12% Low) |
| 14 | Sukkur | HareshMal Santwani | 90 | 00 | | Not Applicable |
| 15 | Umerkot | Mehran Transport Contractors | 124.40 | 00 | | Not Applicable |
| 16 | Qambar / S- Kot | Pervaiz Ali | 125 | 127.00 | 143.00 | Low Rs.2/- (2% Low) |

The above comparison reveals that the rates offered by the parties in respect all districts are Low and justified. In View of the above, the procurement committee considers and is of the opinion that bids for transportation of wheat from various districts of interior Sindh to Karachi Region for the period from 01-03-2017 to 28-02-2018 may be approved.

B-FOR LABOUR WORK

By similar way, the interest parties in labour work The 12 parties participated in bids. in accordance to condition Number 1 (a) & (b) all the parties produced two envelops one was marked as Technical and other having marked as Technical were opened by the chair in the participants and checked the documents provided by the parties. As a result the documents of 9 Parties were seen in order where as the documents of two parties namely 1) M/s Adnan Enterprises 2) Zahid Enterprises were not completed, hence they in Financial bids and they were returned financial envelope un-opened. Further One Participant Namely 1) Perveez Ali qualified in technical bidding, does not participated in financial bidding.

Page-3

Cont'd on Page-3

The Financial Envelops were opened before the parties and recorded in the rates offered by the parties.

| S.No | Name of Party | Rate Offered Jute Bags | Rate Offered P.P Katta | Approved Rates for the year 2016- 17 | Approved Rates for the year 2015-16 |
|------|------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|---|---|
| 01 | Khan Enterprises | 7.9 | 3.9 | Rs.8 For | Rs.13 For Jute |
| 02 | Sher Ali Enterprises | 8.5 | 4.5 | Jute Begs | Begs And P.P |
| 03 | SAH Enterprises | 8.49 | 4.245 | And Rs.4 | Katta Begs. |
| 04 | Rafi Muhammad Enterprises | 6.5 | 3.25 | For P.P Katta Begs | |
| 05 | Qurban Kolachi | 7.75 | 4.75 | | |
| 06 | Riaz Enterprises | 6.95 | 3.45 | | |
| 07 | Chaudry Zafar Iqbal | 13 | 7 | | |
| 08 | Farhan Riaz | 9.74 | 6.90 | | |
| 09 | Azeem | 11.50 | 5.75 | | |

From the above it reveals that the rates offered by the M/s Rafi Muhammad Enterprises viz Rs.6.5/= for Jute Bag and Rs.3.25/= for P.P Katta are lowest. Comparison with the last year rates is produced as follows.

| Lowest Quoted Rates By M/S Rafi Muhammad Enterprises against the Refilling of Following Bags | | Approved Rates for the year 2016-17 | Part of the second second |
|--|------------|---|----------------------------|
| Jute Bags | Rs. 6.5/- | Rs. 8/- | Low Rs. 1.5/- (18.75% Low) |
| P.P Katta | Rs. 3.25/- | Rs.4/- | Low Rs. 0.75/- (18.75% |

In View of the above, it reveals that the rates offered by the parties are less than the approved rates of last year for both the Transportation and Labor work. The procurement committee also scrutinizes the lowest bidder viz, Bank Statements, NTN, Company Profile, Valid SRB Certificate, etc. As such the committee is of the view that rates offered by the lowest bidders for transportation of wheat from Various district of interior Sindh to the Godowns of Karachi, and Refilling of Bags (Labor Work), Being reasonable, may be approved by the competent authority subject to fulfillment of all codal formalities/TOR and agreement to be signed in that matter.

(SHAHZEB SHAIKH)
ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER
GENERAL KARACHI DIV.
MEMBER OF THE COMMITTEE

(ZAHID HUSSAIN BALUCH)
ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOOD
KARACHI REGION KARACHI
MEMBER OF THE COMMITTEE

(MUHAMMAD HUSSAIN GHUMRO)
DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOOD
KARACHI REGION
CHAIRMAN OF THE COMMITTEE

ANNUAL TENDER FOR TRANSPORTATION OF WHEAT AND LABOUR WORK FOR THE YEAR 2017-18

BID EVALUATION REPORT

| 1 | Name of Procuring Agency | Deputy Director Food Karachi Region, Government of Sindh |
|----|----------------------------|---|
| 2 | Tender Reference No: | NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/ 2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017 |
| 3 | of Work / Item: | (a)Transportation of Wheat from various Districts of interior Sindh to Karach (b) Labour work for Refilling of Bags inside the Godowns |
| 4 | Method of Procurement | By open Bids |
| | | The Express Tribune(Eng) Dated 17-02-2017, The Daily Jang Karachi (Urdu) |
| 5 | Tender Published | dated 19-02-2017, The Daily Ibrat(Sindhi) Dated:17-02-2017 |
| 6 | Total Bid Document Sold | a) for transportation work 89 (b) for labour work 12 (Total 101) |
| 7 | Total Bids Received | a) for transportation work 87 (b) for labour work 9 (Total 96) |
| 8 | Date(if applicable) | 8/3/2017 |
| | No of Parties Technically | a) Nineteen Parties qualified in techanidal process and participated in Transportation Bids |
| 9 | qualified (if applicable) | (b) Nine Parties qualifed and participated in Labour Work |
| 10 | Bid(s) Rejected | a) Two Parties techanically disqualified / rejected in transportation work b) two party technically disqualified / rejected in labour work and One Party doesnot participated In Financial Bidding. |
| 11 | Financial Bid opening date | 8/3/2017 |

Bid Evaluation Report for Transportation of Wheat and Labour Work

| S.NO | Name of Firm of Bidder | Rate | Ranking | Estimated | Estimated Cost | Reason for | Remarks |
|------|-------------------------------|---|----------|------------|----------------|-----------------------|---------|
| | | offered | in terms | Allocation | as per Rates | acceptance / | |
| | | by the | of cost | (M.Ton) | Offered and | rejection | |
| | | Bidder/1 | | | Estimated | | |
| | | 01 Kg | | | Allocation | | |
| | | Beg | | | | | |
| | 9 | | | | | | |
| | M/s Noor Rice (District | | | | | Due to Lowest | |
| 1 | Dadu) | 89.00 | 1st | 25,000 | 22,250,000 | Rate | |
| | M/s United Rice (PRC Bolhari | | | | | Due to Lowest | |
| 2 | / Jamshoro) | 78.66 | 1st | 50,000 | 39,330,000 | Rate Due to Lowest | |
| 3 | S.Benazirabad) | 83.33 | 1st | 60,000 | 49,998,000 | Rate | |
| 4 | United Rice (District Thatta) | 76.66 | 1st | 5,000 | 3,833,000 | Rate | |
| | Hareshmai Santwani(District | 111111111111111111111111111111111111111 | | | | Due to Lowest | |
| 5 | Ghotki) | 94.98 | 1st | 60,000 | 56,988,000 | Rate | |
| | Hareshmai Santwani (District | V 500 5 100 5 100 1 | 2.5 | 00.000 | 54,000,000 | Due to Lowest | |
| 6 | Khairpur) | 90.00 | 1st | 60,000 | 54,000,000 | Rate | |

Chilling -

Shows ...

| | Azeem & Co (District | | | | | | Due to Lowest |
|----|------------------------------|---|-----|--------|------|---------|--------------------|
| 7 | Naushahro Feroze) | 72.90 | 1st | 60,000 | 43, | 740,000 | Rate |
| | United Rice (District | 0.0000000000000000000000000000000000000 | | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 8 | Larkana) | 121.66 | 1st | 15,000 | 18, | 249,000 | Rate |
| | Haresnmai | | | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 9 | Santwani(Shikarpur) | 108.00 | 1st | 10,000 | 10, | 300,000 | Rate |
| | | 400.50 | 50 | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 10 | Khadim Hussain (Jacobabad) | 109.50 | 1st | 15,000 | 16, | 125,000 | Rate |
| | Hareshmai Santwani (District | | | 40.000 | | 200 000 | Due to Lowest |
| 11 | Sukkur) | 90.00 | 1st | 10,000 | 9,1 | 000,000 | Rate Due to Lowest |
| 12 | United Rice (Sanghar) | 73.66 | 1st | 70,000 | 51 | 62,000 | Rate |
| 12 | Wienran Transporters | 70.00 | 151 | 70,000 | 01, | 002,000 | Due to Lowest |
| 13 | (Umerkot) | 124.40 | 1st | 5,000 | 6, | 220,000 | Rate |
| | Pervaiz Ali (Kashmore / | | | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 14 | K-Kot) | 103.00 | 1st | 30,000 | 30, | 000,000 | Rate |
| | | | | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 15 | Perveez Ali(Qambar / S-Kot) | 125.00 | 1st | 15,000 | 18,7 | 750,000 | Rate |
| | National Logistic Cells | | | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 16 | (Mirpurkhas) | 106.00 | 1st | 10,000 | 10,€ | 000,000 | Rate |
| | Rafi Muhammad Enterprises | Jute Bag Rs.6.5/= & PP Katta | | | | | Due to Lowest |
| 17 | (Labour Work) | Rs.3.25/= | 1st | 1-0 | | - | Rate |

A.

SHAHZEB SHAIKH

Assistant Commissioner General Karachi Division (Member) (ZAHID HUSSAIN BALOCH)

Assistant Director Food Karachi

(Member)

(MUHAMMAD HUSSAIN GHUMRO)

Deputy Director Food Karachi

Chairman

Minutes of Meeting Held on 08-03-2017 AT 2:00 P.M at Deputy Director Food Office Karachi Region For Tenders of Transportation of wheat from Various districts of Interior Sindh to Karachi And Labor Work (Refilling of Begs) for the Period From 01-03-2017 to 28-02-2018

The Regional Directorate of Food Karachi / Procuring Agency Re-invited bids from the interested parties for transportation of wheat from various Districts of interior Sindh to Karachi and labour work at government godowns at Landhi for the period to be enforced from 01-03-2017 to 28-02-2018, vide this office Tender Notice NO: A/C(F-1)/A.TENDER/2017-18/2017/833 DATED 14-02-2017 and the members of procurement committee attended the meeting. The Tender Notice was published in the following news papers.

The Express Tribune (English)
 The Daily Jang Karachi (Urdu)
 Dated: 17-02-2017
 Dated: 19-02-2017
 Dated: 17-02-2017

The Tender Notice was also hosted on Sindh Government website www.sindh.gov.pk for convenience of the interested parties. On the whole 89 Forms were issued to various parties interested in the transportation work and 12 forms were issued for labour work. The Technical Bid was opened on schedule date and time i.e. 08-03-2017 at 2.00 P.M and Financial Bid was opened on 08-03-2017 at 2.00 P.M before the Government No: SO(G)Food(6-39)2013-14/131 dated 27-01-2014 under the Chairmanship of Deputy Director Food Karachi. The tender was carried out in two phases one for transportation work and other for labour work.

A-FOR TRNASPORTATION WORK

As per schedule the parties were called in the office of the Deputy Director Food Karachi and entered their names in Attendance Sheet. 22 Parties attended and participated in tendering process. In accordance to condition Number 1 (a) & (b) all the parties produced two envelops one was marked as Technical and other was Financial. The 22 envelops having marked as Technical were opened by the chair in the presence of Members and all participants and checked the documents provided by the parties. As a result the documents of 20 Parties were seen in order where as the documents of two parties Namely 1) M/s Zahid Traders 2) Friends Network & Co were not completed, hence they were not allowed to participate in Financial bids and they were returned financial envelope un-opened.

After completion of above position, the Financial Forms of 20 (Twenty) parties were opened by the Committee before all the participants and recorded the bids offered by them in respect of each district. Meanwhile a Comparative Statement showing rate offered by each party was prepared on spot before the Committee and enclosed herewith duly signed by the Members and Chairman of the Committee. As per Comparative Statement the lowest rates for transportation of wheat and recorded as under along with approved rates of last two years for same Districts and work:-

Cont'd Page-2

| S.No | District | Name of Party | Rate offered on 08- 03-2017 for the year 2017-18 | Approved Rates for the year 2016-17 | Approved Rates for the year 2015-16 | |
|------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|--|--|--|------------------------|
| 1 | Dadu | Noor Rice Mills | 89 | 104.50 | 110.80 | Low Rs. 15.5 (15% Low) |
| 2 . | Jamshoro / PRC Bolhari | United Rice | 78.66 | 84.50 | 97.77 | Low Rs. 5.84 (7% Low) |
| 3 | S.Benazirabad | Kohisar Enterprises | 83.33 | 89.90 | 94.94 | Low Rs.6.57 (7% Low) |
| 4 | Thatta | United Rice | 76.66 | 84.84 | 0 | Low Rs. 8.18 (10% Low) |
| 5 | Ghotki | HareshMal Santwani | 94.98 | 99.66 | 109.66 | Low Rs. 4.68 (5 % Low) |
| 6 | Khairpur | HareshMal Santwani | 90 | 92.66 | 99.22 | Low Rs. 2.66 (3% Low) |
| 7 | N.Feroze | M.Azeem & Co | 72.9 | 84.49 | 96.69 | Low Rs. 11.59 (14%) |
| 8 | Larkana | United Rice | 121.66 | 125.00 | 142.66 | Low Rs. 3.34 (3% Low) |
| 9 | Shikarpur | HareshMal Santwani | 108 | 124.50 | 132.00 | Low Rs. 16.5 (13% Low) |
| 10 | Jacobabad | Khadim Hussain | 109.5 | 120.66 | 139.00 | Low Rs.11.16 (9% Low) |
| 11 | Mirpurkhas | National Logistic Cells | 106 | 00 | 00 | Not Applicable |
| 12 | Sanghar | United Rice | 73.66 | 89.66 | 99.66 | Low Rs. 16 (18% Low) |
| 13 | Kashmore / K-Kot | Pervaiz Ali | 103 | 117.00 | 133.00 | Low Rs. 14 (12% Low) |
| 14 | Sukkur | HareshMal Santwani | 90 | 00 | | Not Applicable |
| 15 | Umerkot | Mehran Transport Contractors | 124.40 | 00 | | Not Applicable |
| 16 . | Qambar / S- Kot | Pervaiz Ali | 125 | 127.00 | 143.00 | Low Rs.2/- (2% Low) |

The above comparison reveals that the rates offered by the parties in respect all districts are Low and justified. In View of the above, the procurement committee considers and is of the opinion that bids for transportation of wheat from various districts of interior Sindh to Karachi Region for the period from 01-03-2017 to 28-02-2018 may be approved.

B-FOR LABOUR WORK

By similar way, the interest parties in labour work were called by the Committee. The 12 parties participated in bids. in accordance to condition Number 1 (a) & (b) all the parties produced two envelops one was marked as Technical and other was Financial ,the 12 envelops having marked as Technical were opened by the chair in the presence of Members and all participants and checked the documents provided by the parties. As a result the documents of 9 Parties were seen in order where as the documents of two parties namely 1) M/s Adnan Enterprises 2) Zahid Enterprises were not completed, hence they were not allowed to participate in Financial bids and they were returned financial envelope un-opened. Further One Participant Namely 1) Perveez Ali qualified in technical bidding, does not participated in financial bidding.

Cont'd on Page-3

The Financial Envelops were opened before the parties and recorded in the rates offered by the parties.

| S.No | Name of Party | Rate Offered Jute Bags | Rate Offered P.P Katta | Approved Rates for the year 2016- 17 | State of the state |
|------|------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|---|--|
| 01 | Khan Enterprises | 7.9 | 3.9 | Rs.8 For | Rs.13 For Jute |
| 02 | Sher Ali Enterprises | 8.5 | 4.5 | Jute Begs | Begs And P.P |
| 03 | SAH Enterprises | 8.49 | 4.245 | And Rs.4 | Katta Begs. |
| 04 | Rafi Muhammad Enterprises | 6.5 | 3.25 | For P.P Katta Begs | |
| 05 | Qurban Kolachi | 7.75 | 4.75 | | |
| 06 | Riaz Enterprises | 6.95 | 3.45 | | |
| 07 | Chaudry Zafar Iqbal | 13 | 7 | | |
| 08 | Farhan Riaz | 9.74 | 6.90 | | |
| 09 - | Azeem | 11.50 | 5.75 | | |

From the above it reveals that the rates offered by the M/s Rafi Muhammad Enterprises viz Rs.6.5/= for Jute Bag and Rs.3.25/= for P.P Katta are lowest. Comparison with the last year rates is produced as follows.

| Lowest Quoted Rates By M/S Rafi Muhammad Enterprises against the Refilling of Following Bags | | Approved Rates for the year 2016-17 | | |
|--|------------|---|----------------------------|--|
| Jute Bags | Rs. 6.5/- | Rs. 8/- | Low Rs. 1.5/- (18.75% Low) | |
| P.P Katta | Rs. 3.25/- | Rs.4/- | Low Rs. 0.75/- (18.75% | |

In View of the above, it reveals that the rates offered by the parties are less than the approved rates of last year for both the Transportation and Labor work. The procurement committee also scrutinizes the lowest bidder viz, Bank Statements, NTN, Company Profile, Valid SRB Certificate, etc. As such the committee is of the view that rates offered by the lowest bidders for transportation of wheat from Various district of interior Sindh to the Godowns of Karachi, and Refilling of Bags (Labor Work), Being reasonable, may be approved by the competent authority subject to fulfillment of all codal formalities/TOR and agreement to be signed in that matter.

(MUHAMMAD HUSSAIN GHUMRO)
DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOOD
KARACHI REGION
CHAIRMAN OF THE COMMITTEE