

MINUTES OF 3RD MEETING OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE OF LIVESTOCK & FISHERIES DEPARTMENT HELD ON 18.12.2014 TO EVALUATE AND FINALIZE THE TECHNICAL BIDS FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANTS FOR CIVIL WORKS






The Expression of Interest (EOI) for hiring of consultant (Civil Works) for ADP scheme # 1328 namely "Surveillance and characterization of circulating pathogens of poultry in Sindh including avian influenza containment program" were invited through advertisement, which was appeared in national newspapers Daily Sobh on dated: 29-10-14, Daily Jang and Daily Awami Awaz on dated: 30.10.2014, respectively and was also placed on the websites of SPPRA and Government of Sindh for public view, up till closing date i.e. 13.11.2014.

Four (04) firms M/S Young Associates, Karachi, M/S National Engineering Services, M/S G3 Engineering Consultant and M/S Zaheruddin Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd submitted the sealed proposals, which were opened on 13.11.2014 in presence of the interested bidders / their representatives, keeping in considerations of relevant SPPRA Rules and formalities.

The technical proposals of Expression of Interest were placed in this meeting before the Committee to evaluate and finalize the same and prepare Request for Proposal (RFP) which will later be issued to short listed consultant firms. Based on the credentials and pre-set criteria, each member assigned the score to the participant / bidders separately. On the basis of scores assigned by the Committee, out of 04 bidders, 03 bidders have obtained the score of 75 and above.

Summary		# of firms
75 - 100 points		03
below 75 points		01
Total		04

The details evaluation report is as follows:









**TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANT (CIVIL WORKS)
FOR ADP SCHEME NO. 1328 NAMELY "SURVEILLANCE & CHARACTERIZATION OF CIRCULATING
PATHOGENS OF POULTRY IN SINDH INCLUDING AVAIAN INFLUENZA CONTAINMENT PROGRAM**


S.#	Details	Total Marks	Marks obtain by participating Firms / Companies				
			M/S Young Associates Karachi	M/S G-3 Engineering, Karachi	M/S NESPAK Pvt. Ltd, Karachi	M/S Zaheruddin Consultants, Karachi	
A EXPERIENCE AND PAST PERFORMANCE							
Specific Experience of the Firm with reference to year of Establishment and relevant experience to the assignment							
i	Experience as per establishment	10	10	3	10	10	
	General Civil Projects	10	7.2	10	10	10	
	Hospital / Laboratory Projects	15	3	15	15	15	
	SUB TOTAL	35	20.2	28	35	35	
ii a	Adequacy of methodology / scope	5	5	5	5	5	
b	Technical Approach (Feasibility reports)	5	5	5	5	5	
c	Work Plan (Res. & Pharm. Labs)	5	0	5	5	5	
d	Organization and staffing (Branches & No. of Tech. staff)	5	5	5	5	5	
	SUB TOTAL	20	15	20	20	20	
iii	Local Participation	5	5	5	5	5	
B KEY PERSONNEL QUALIFICATION & EXPERIENCE							
i	Qualification of key personnel like Team Leader						
ii	Civil / Electrical Eng.	15	11	15	15	4	
iii	Environmentalist	5	2.5	5	5	2.5	
iv	Economist	5	2.5	5	5	2.5	
v	Computer Specialist	5	5	5	5	5	
	SUB TOTAL	30	21	30	30	14	


C FINANCIAL						
i	Financial Capability with reference to Annual Audit Accounts for last three (03) years	3	3	0	3	3
ii	Bank Statements for last three (03) years showing financial soundness (min 5.00 m)	4	0	0	4	4
iii	Income Tax Return for last three (03) years	3	3	3	3	3
SUB TOTAL		10	6	3	10	10
GRAND TOTAL		100	67.2	86	100	84


Hence on the basis of credentials of various bidders and scores obtained by them, only M/s G3 Engineering Lahore, M/S NESPAK Karachi and M/S Zahceruddin Consultants, Karachi, obtained the technical score of 75 or / and above and thus qualify technically. Request for Proposals (RFP) document will be issued to only qualifying firms i.e. M/s G3 Engineering Lahore, M/S NESPAK Karachi and M/S Zahceruddin Consultants, Karachi.


ABDUL SAMI SHAIK,
 Accounts & Administrative Officer
 Sindh Poultry Vaccine Centre, Karachi


ALI SHER TALPUR,
 Section Officer (Dev),
 Livestock & Fisheries Department
 Government of Sindh, Karachi


SYED AHMED ALI SHAH,
 Executive Engineer (Buildings-II)
 Works & Services Department,
 Government of Sindh, Karachi


DR. HAFEEZ-UR-REHMAN KALHORO,
 Planning & Development Department
 Government of Sindh, Karachi


ABDUL HAMEED KHASKHELLI,
 Section Officer (Dev-II)
 Finance Department,
 Government of Sindh, Karachi


MS. KAUSAR MEHMOOD
 Senior Research Officer
 Sindh Poultry Vaccine Centre,
 Korangi, Karachi


DR. NAZEER HUSSAIN KALHORO,
 Executive Director,
 Sindh Poultry Vaccine Centre, Karachi

**TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANT (CIVIL WORKS)
FOR ADP SCHEME NO. 1328 NAMELY "SURVEILLANCE & CHARACTERIZATION OF CIRCULATING
PATHOGENS OF POULTRY IN SINDH INCLUDING AVAIAN INFLUENZA CONTAINMENT PROGRAM"**

Sr. #	Details	Total Marks	Marks Obt.	Participating Firms / Companies
M/S Young Associates Karachi				

A EXPERIENCE AND PAST PERFORMANCE				
Specific Experience of the Firm with reference to year of Establishment and relevant experience to the assignment				
i)	- Experience as per establishment	10	10	43 Years 72 projects 01 hospital complex / lab.
	- General Civil Projects	10	7.2	
	- Hospital / Laboratory Projects	15	03	
SUB TOTAL		35	20.2	
ii) a	Adequacy of methodology / scope	05	05	Attached They have shown in their scope of services that they have undergone different comprehensive range of constructions and developments for all type of projects from inception to completion, which include pre-investment studies, Technical & Economic feasibility studies, cost benefit analysis, economic evaluation etc
b	Technical Approach (Feasibility reports)	05	05	
c	Work Plan (Res. & Pharm. Labs)	05	00	01 head office @ Karachi with 02 branches at Islamabad & Faisalabad 22 Tech. persons with other supporting staff Ph.D 01 M.S / MBA equivalent 03 B.E / equivalent 11 DAE / Tech. staff / equivalent etc 09
d	Organization and staffing (Branches & No. of Tech. staff)	05	05	
SUB TOTAL		20	15	
iii)	Local Participation	05	05	Yes




 and
 


B KEY PERSONNEL QUALIFICATION & EXPERIENCE				
i.	Qualification of key personnel like Team Leader			B.S (Civil)
ii.	Civil / Electrical Eng.	15	11	11
iii.	Environmentalst	05	2.5	01
iv.	Economist	05	2.5	01
v.	Computer Specialist	05	05	02
SUB TOTAL		30	21	
C FINANCIAL				
i.	Financial Capability with reference to Annual Audit Accounts for last three (03) years.	03	03	Yes – attached with average turnover Rs. 11.382 million
ii.	Bank Statements for last three (03) years showing financial soundness (min 5.00 m)	04	00	Accounts maintenance certificates from M/S HBL and Summit bank attached
iii.	Income Tax Return for last three (03) years	03	03	Attached for the years 2011, 2012 and 2013
SUB TOTAL		10	06	
TOTAL		100	67.2	


**TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANT (CIVIL WORKS)
FOR ADP SCHEME NO. 1328 NAMELY "SURVEILLANCE & CHARACTERIZATION OF CIRCULATING
PATHOGENS OF POULTRY IN SINDH INCLUDING AVIAN INFLUENZA CONTAINMENT PROGRAM"**

Sr. #	Details	Total Marks	Marks obt.	Participating Firms / Companies
M/S G-3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd, Lahore				

A EXPERIENCE AND PAST PERFORMANCE				
Specific Experience of the Firm with reference to year of Establishment and relevant experience to the assignment				
i)	- Experience as per establishment	10	03	Since 2000 - 14 Years experience 07 projects Universities + 21 projects of educational buildings + 30 projects of consultancy other buildings + 13 projects of Public health + 30 project of detailed topography + 12 projects of design & 3 rd party validation + 22 projects of road safety engineering + 20 projects on water resources engineering + 13 projects on environmental impact + 10 other projects of different civil works under ADB QESCO, HESCO = 178 18 projects
	- General Civil Projects	10	10	
- Hospital / Laboratory Projects		15	15	
SUB TOTAL		35	28	
ii) a	Adequacy of methodology / scope	05	05	Yes, schedule of proposed methodology attached
b	Technical Approach (Feasibility reports)	05	05	Yes, 196 (the projects undergone from inception to completion)
c	Work Plan (Res. & Pharm. Labs)	05	05	Attached (expertise of 18 Lab. Projects on credit) One head office + 02 branches + 05 area offices Approximately 200 permanent employees
d	Organization and staffing (Branches & No. of Tech. staff)	05	05	- Ph.D 08 - M.S Engineering etc 20 - BE (civil, Architect etc) 139 - Other Professionals 20
SUB TOTAL		20	20	
iii)	Local Participation	05	05	

B KEY PERSONNEL QUALIFICATION & EXPERIENCE				
i.	Qualification of key personnel like Team Leader		Li Col (Rtd) Syed Asaf Ali Shah (TI(M)) <i>Chief Executive</i>	
ii.	Civil / Electrical Eng.	15	15	
iii.	Environmentalst	05	05	
iv.	Economist	05	05	
v.	Computer Specialist	05	05	
	SUB TOTAL	30	30	
C FINANCIAL				
i.	Financial Capability with reference to Annual Audit Accounts for last three (03) years	03	00	Annual turnover provided worth Rs.218.663 million for the year 2013 - 14
ii.	Bank Statements for last three (03) years showing financial soundness (min 5.00 m)	04	00	Certificate of Meezan Bank attached
iii.	Income Tax Return for last three (03) years	03	03	Yes, provided
	SUB TOTAL	10	03	
	TOTAL	100	86	



**TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANT (CIVIL WORKS)
FOR ADP SCHEME NO. 1328 NAMELY "SURVEILLANCE & CHARACTERIZATION OF CIRCULATING
PATHOGENS OF POULTRY IN SINDH INCLUDING AVIAN INFLUENZA CONTAINMENT PROGRAM"**

Sr. #	Details	Total Marks	Marks obt.	Participating Firms / Companies
-------	---------	-------------	------------	---------------------------------

M/S National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi

A EXPERIENCE AND PAST PERFORMANCE				
i)	Specific Experience of the Firm with reference to year of Establishment and relevant experience to the assignment - Experience as per establishment - General Civil Projects - Hospital / Laboratory Projects	10	10	Since 1973 - 41 years - 3524 projects undertaken (3014 domestic & 510 abroad) More than 30 projects
		10	10	
		15	15	
		SUB TOTAL		
ii) a	Adequacy of methodology / scope	05	05	Yes, schedule of proposed methodology attached
b	Technical Approach (Feasibility reports)	05	05	Yes. More than 56 projects are on the credit (Lab. Side)(from inception to completion)
c	Work Plan (Res. & Pharm. Labs)	05	05	Attached (expertise of 56 Lab. Projects on credit) Head office, Lahore with 04 Regional offices at Islamabad, Karachi, Peshawar and Quetta along with 06 Foreign offices at Iran, Saudi Arabia, Oman, Qatar, USA & Afghanistan - 4738 staff members - 09 - Ph.D - 120 - Masters in Engineering & other fields - 210 - BE (civil / elec. / Arch.) & equiv.
d	Organization and staffing (Branches & No. of Tech. staff)	05	05	
SUB TOTAL		20	20	
iii)	Local Participation	05	05	Yes

[Handwritten signatures and initials]

B KEY PERSONNEL QUALIFICATION & EXPERIENCE					
i. Qualification of key personnel like Team Leader				B.E (Hon.), Civil / Structures	
ii. Civil / Electrical Eng.		15	15	330	
iii. Environmentalist		05	05	03	
iv. Economist		05	05	02	
v. Computer Specialist		05	05	Sufficient staff	
SUB TOTAL		30	30		
C FINANCIAL					
i. Financial Capability with reference to Annual Audit Accounts for last three (03) years		03	03	Attached	
ii. Bank Statements for last three (03) years showing financial soundness (min 5.00 m)		04	04	Attached	
iii. Income Tax Return for last three (03) years		03	03	Attached	
SUB TOTAL		10	10		
TOTAL		100	100		

**TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANT (CIVIL WORKS)
FOR ADP SCHEME NO. 1328 NAMELY "SURVEILLANCE & CHARACTERIZATION OF CIRCULATING
PATHOGENS OF POULTRY IN SINDH INCLUDING AVIAN INFLUENZA CONTAINMENT PROGRAM"**

Sr. #	Details	Total Marks	Marks obt.	Participating Firms / Companies
M/S Zaheeruddin Consultants (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi				

A EXPERIENCE AND PAST PERFORMANCE				
i)	Specific Experience of the Firm with reference to year of Establishment and relevant experience to the assignment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Experience as per establishment - General Civil Projects - Hospital / Laboratory Projects 	10	10	Since 1950 – 64 years <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 186 projects undertaken - 08 projects
		10	10	
		15	15	
		SUB TOTAL		
ii) a	Adequacy of methodology / scope	05	05	Yes, schedule of proposed methodology attached
b	Technical Approach (Feasibility reports)	05	05	Yes, More than 186 projects are on the credit (Hospital / Lab. Side - 08)(from inception to completion)
c	Work Plan (Res. & Pharm. Labs)	05	05	Attached (expertise of 186 Projects on credit) (Hospital / Lab. Side - 08)
d	Organization and staffing (Branches & No. of Tech. staff)	05	05	Head office, Karachi <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 09 staff members with other supporting staff - 01 – Ph.D - 04 – Masters in Engineering & other fields - 04 – BE (civil / elec. / Arch.) & equiv.
SUB TOTAL		20	20	
iii)	Local Participation	05	05	Yes

B KEY PERSONNEL QUALIFICATION & EXPERIENCE			
i.	Qualification of key personnel like Team Leader		M.E (Structures)
ii.	Civil / Electrical Eng.	15	04
iii.	Environmentalst	05	2.5
iv.	Economist	05	2.5
v.	Computer Specialist	05	05
SUB TOTAL		30	14
C FINANCIAL			
i.	Financial Capability with reference to Annual Audit Accounts for last three (03) years	03	03
ii.	Bank Statements for last three (03) years showing financial soundness (min 5.00 m)	04	04
iii.	Income Tax Return for last three (03) years	03	03
SUB TOTAL		10	10
TOTAL		100	84

