



TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION REPORT

FEASIBILITY STUDY AND TRANSACTION ADVISORY SERVICES FOR GHOTKI - KANDHKOT BRIDGE PROJECT



**WORKS & SERVICES DEPARTMENT
GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
KARACHI**

Consultants:



EA Consulting Pvt Ltd

In association with



Ford Rhodes
Sidat Hyder



EMC Pakistan
Private Limited

HAIDERMOTA BNR

AL-9, 15th Lane, Khayaban-e-Hilal, Phase-VII, D.H.A., Karachi-75500.
U +92-21-111-111-584, F +92-21-3584-1825, E info@eaworld.com

February 2018

SUMMARY OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION APPROVED BY TFEC

S.NO	Criteria	Weightage/ Marks	M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)	M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)	M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd	Remarks
I. LEGAL REQUIREMENT (PASS/FAIL)			PASS	PASS	PASS	
II. BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)			FAIL	PASS	PASS	
III. DETAILED EVALUATION (SCORING)						
A	Specific Construction Experience	40	Not Evaluated for Scoring. Fails in Basic Eligibility Criteria	40	40	
B	Financial (Historical Financial Performance)	30		30	26	
C	Work Methodology	10		5	10	
D	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience	10		7.5	4.5	
E	Plant & Equipment	10		5	10	
F	Total	100		87.5	90.5	

EVALUATION - LEGAL

BIDDER	POWER OF ATTORNEY FOR SIGNING OF BID	POWER OF ATTORNEY TO AUTHORIZE THE LEAD MEMBER OF THE CONSORTIUM	COMMITMENT FORM	DECLARATION	NDA	INTEGRITY PACT	AFFIDAVIT
FWO-DB	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
ANHUI-KAINAAT	✓	✓ (CNIC/Passport Details of witnesses not provided)	✓	✓	✓	✓ (Bid submission date was Jan 09, 2018 whereas the date on the Integrity Pact is Mar 05, 2017)	✓
SACHAL	✓	N/A	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

TECHNICAL EVALUATION
M/S ANHUI CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING GROUP CO. LTD.
& M/S KAINAT ENTERPRISES (JV)

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)					
S.NO	Requirement	M/s Anhui	M/s Kainat	M/s Techno	Remarks
1	<p>Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)</p> <p>a • For construction: The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category ‘CA’ and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p> <p>b • For Design: Valid PEC registration certificate in Project Profile Code 1215 (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS
2	<p>Registration with Tax Authorities</p> <p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.)</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)					
S.NO	Requirement	M/s Anhui	M/s Kainat	M/s Techno	Remarks
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)	N/A	N/A	N/A	PASS
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s Anhui	M/s Kainat	M/s Techno	Remarks
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (in case of Consortium, all members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s Anhui	M/s Kainat	M/s Techno	Remarks
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation	PASS	N/A	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s Anhui	M/s Kainat	M/s Techno	Remarks
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PASS	N/A	N/A	PASS
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member) & M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s Anhui	M/s Kainat	M/s Techno	Remarks
12	Specific Work Experience a For Construction Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement) In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.	Fail to provide evidence of 500m long river bridge & river training works	N/A	N/A	
	b For Design Similar Work i.e. design of River Bridge of at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit evidence of award and completion of design work)	N/A	N/A	FAIL	FAIL

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

M/S ANHUI CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING GROUP CO. LTD.

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)				
1	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	
a	<p><u>• For construction:</u> The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category 'CA' and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>			
b	<p><u>• For Design:</u> Valid PEC registration certificate in Project Profile Code 1215 (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	M/s Techno Consult International (Pvt) Ltd
2	Registration with Tax Authorities	NTN Certificate provided	Pass	
	<p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.) (Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>			

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)				
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)	N/A	Pass	
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)				
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (in case of Consortium, all members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)				
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion	Provided	Pass	
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation	US\$ 912 million	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)				
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	US\$ 5,399 million	Pass	
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	27	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)				
12	a Specific Work Experience For Construction Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement) In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.	Fail to provide evidence of 500m long river bridge & river training works	Fail	
	b For Design Similar Work i.e. design of River Bridge of at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit evidence of award and completion of design work)	No river bridge design	Fail	M/s Techno Consult International (Pvt) Ltd

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Anhui Construction Engineering Group Co. Ltd (Lead Member)

Year	Turnover US\$ Million
2016	5,009
2015	5,699
2014	5,490
Total Turnover	16,198.000

Evaluation	3 5,399.33
Total No. of Years	
Average Turnover per Year (in million US\$)	

Result;
Pass

Applicant's Financial Evaluation

Financial Information in US \$	Actual Previous Five Years June - July		
	3 2016	2 2015	1 2014
1. Total Assets	6,666,990,122	6,105,105,663	5,158,539,913.000
2. Total Liabilities	5,775,617,346.000	5,409,715,911.000	4,008,514,932.000
Overview Analysis	Estimated Amounts from above Table (Million PKR)		
7. Net Worth (1-2)	891,372,776.000	695,389,752.000	1,150,024,981.000
8. Average Net Worth	912,262,503.000		

Result;
Pass

TECHNICAL EVALUATION
M/S KAINAT ENTERPRISES (JV)

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV Member)				
1	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) a • <u>For construction:</u> The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category 'CA' and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	
2	Registration with Tax Authorities The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.) (Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	NTN Certificate provided	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV Member)				
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)		N/A	
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV Member)				
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium), or members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	<p>Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used</p>	<p>Pass</p>	
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	<p>Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used</p>	<p>Pass</p>	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV Member)				
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion	Provided	Pass	
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation	Not Required	Pass	Lead member meets the criteria

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV Member)				
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	Not Required	Pass	Lead member meets the criteria
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	39 Years	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Kainat Enterprises (JV Member)				
12	<p>Specific Work Experience</p> <p>a For Construction</p> <p>Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement)</p> <p>In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.</p>	No exepreince of River Training Works	Fail	<p>Since, M/s Kainat Enterprises is JV member its expereice of river bridge is not considered. Also, no document is submitted for verification of completion of outstanding/punch list items</p>

TECHNICAL EVALUATION
M/S FRONTIER WORKS ORGANIZATION (FWO)
& M/S SARDAR ASHRAF D BALOCH (JV)

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**
- **TECHNICAL EVALUATION (SCORING)**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	M/s Zeeruk/Loya JV	Remarks
1	<p>Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)</p> <p>a • For construction: The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category ‘CA’ and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p> <p>b • For Design: Valid PEC registration certificate in Project Profile Code 1215 (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PASS	PASS	PASS	PASS
2	<p>Registration with Tax Authorities</p> <p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.)</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	M/s Zeeruk/Loya JV	Remarks
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)	PASS	N/A	N/A	PASS
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	M/s Zeeruk/Loya JV	Remarks
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (in case of Consortium, all members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	M/s Zeeruk/Loya JV	Remarks
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	M/s Zeeruk/Loya JV	Remarks
b	Average Annual Construction Turnover The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years. Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years. (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet) In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS
11	General Construction Experience For Construction For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.) For other members of JV Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.	PASS	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	M/s Zeeruk/Loya JV	Remarks
12	a For Construction Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement) In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.	PASS	PASS	N/A	<u>TFEC accepted the river training works of SMADB as sufficient for qualification</u>
	b For Design Similar Work i.e. design of River Bridge of at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit evidence of award and completion of design work)				

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
A	Specific Construction Experience Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge of at least 500 m length with Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc.), completed in the past fifteen (15) years (submission of commencement letter and completion certificates are mandatory) For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV Specific Construction Experience.. 40 Marks (max.) For River Bridge of length 500m including Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc... 35 Marks One mark for each increment of 50 m in length For other members of JV: Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.	24	16	40	
B	Financial (Historical Financial Performance) For Single Entity i) Average Annual Construction Turnover for last 03 years 20 Marks (max.) Rs. 3,000 Million 15 Marks One mark for each increment of Rs. 500 Million ii) Average Net worth for last 03 years.. 10 Marks (Max) Rs. 1,500 Million 07 Marks One mark addition for each increment of Rs. 200 Million For JV As per share in JV (Attach Documentary evidence of financial position, bank statement and audited accounts of the last Three (3) years and fill the forms).	PASS 12	8 4	20 10	
C	Work Methodology 10 Marks (Max.) Detailed & Project Specific ... 10 Marks Substantially Detailed 05 Marks Sketchy & Irrelevant 00 Marks	5		5	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
D	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience The Bidder must demonstrate that it has the personnel for the key positions that meet the following requirements (All engineers must have valid Registration with PEC, it is mandatory). (For all Engineers, the Bidders are required to submit PEC registration certificate and the signed CVs of personnel be attached				
i)	Bridge Design Engineer (MSc Structures, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1.0 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	2		2	
ii)	Highway Design Engineer (MSc Transportation, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	1		1	
iii)	Financial Specialist (CA/ACCA/MBA/MSc(Preferably Major in Finance)/ or equivalent), 10 years' experience, 8 years relevant 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	1		1	
iv)	Legal Specialist (LLB, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0		0	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
v)	Project Manager Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	2		2	
vi)	Operation & Maintenance Engineer (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 08 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0		0	
	Highway Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5		0.5	
viii)	Structural Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	0		0	
ix)	Material Engineer Construction (MSc Geology, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5		0.5	
x)	Site Engineers Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 8 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 08 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5		0.5	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member) & M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV)

S.NO	Requirement	M/s FWO	M/s SMAD. Baloch	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
E	Plants and Equipment				
	Description of Equipment's				
i)	Bulldozer 200 HP... 4 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
ii)	Motor Grader 140hP 4 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
iii)	Vibratory Roller 10-12 Ton4 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
iv)	Pneumatic Roller 18 - 21 Ton 3 nos 0.3 Marks	0.3		0.3	
v)	Tandem Roller 8 -12 Ton 2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2		0.2	
vi)	Water Bowser 10,000 Lit 2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2		0.2	
vii)	Wheel Loader 2.5 Cum 4 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2		0.2	
viii)	Dump Truck 18 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	0.3		0.3	
ix)	Dump Truck 10 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	0.3		0.3	
x)	Excavator (wheel +chain) 105 HP 2+2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2		0.2	
xi)	Asphalt Plant 120 ton/Hr 1 no 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
xii)	Asphalt Paver 145 HP (3-6m wide) 2 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
xiii)	Concrete Batching Plant 30 Cum 2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2		0.2	
xiv)	Concrete Transit Mixer 6 Cum 6 nos 0.3 Marks	0.3		0.3	
xv)	Crane 150 Ton 2 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
xvi)	Concrete Pump 2 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4		0.4	
xvii)	Boring Rig 2m dia 60m long 2 nos 3 Marks	0		0	
xviii)	Launcher 1 no 2 Marks	0		0	
TOTAL MARKS = 100				87.5	>75, Qualified

TECHNICAL EVALUATION
M/S FRONTIER WORKS ORGANIZATION (FWO)

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**
- **TECHNICAL EVALUATION (SCORING)**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)				
1	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	
	<p>a • <u>For construction:</u> The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category 'CA' and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>			
	<p>b • <u>For Design:</u> Valid PEC registration certificate in Project Profile Code 1215 (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PEC Certificates in required category and discipline provided	Pass	M/s Zeeruk-Loya (JV)
2	Registration with Tax Authorities			
	<p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.) (Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>		Pass	M/s FWO is exempted from tax

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)				
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)				
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (in case of Consortium, all members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	Affidavit is provided	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)				
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion	Provided	Pass	
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation	PKR 43,704	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)				
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PKR 50,459	Pass	
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	50	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)				
12	Specific Work Experience			
a	<p>For Construction</p> <p>Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement)</p> <p>In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.</p>	1200m long bridge over river indus at Chachran Sharif (Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Bridge)	Pass	
b	<p>For Design</p> <p>Similar Work i.e. design of River Bridge of at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit evidence of award and completion of design work)</p>	1300m Bridge over River Indus + River training works	Pass	M/s Loya Associates

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)					
A	<p>Specific Construction Experience</p> <p>Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge of at least 500 m length with Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc.), completed in the past fifteen (15) years (submission of commencement letter and completion certificates are mandatory)</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Specific Construction Experience.. 40 Marks (max.)</p> <p>For River Bridge of length 500m including Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc... 35 Marks</p> <p>One mark for each increment of 50 m in length</p> <p>For other members of JV:</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	1200m Bridge without river training works	24		
B	<p>Financial (Historical Financial Performance)</p> <p>For Single Entity</p> <p>i) Average Annual Construction Turnover for last 03 years 20 Marks (max.)</p> <p>Rs. 3,000 Million 15 Marks</p> <p>One mark for each increment of Rs. 500 Million</p> <p>ii) Average Net worth for last 03 years.. 10 Marks (Max)</p> <p>Rs. 1,500 Million 07 Marks</p> <p>One mark addition for each increment of Rs. 200 Million</p> <p>For JV</p> <p>As per share in JV</p> <p>(Attach Documentary evidence of financial position, bank statement and audited accounts of the last Three (3) years and fill the forms).</p>	<p>PKR 50,459 mil</p> <p>PKR 43,704 mil</p>	<p>12</p> <p>6</p>		<p>60% share i.e. Rs. 1800 million</p> <p>60% share i.e. Rs. 900 million</p>

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)					
C	Work Methodology 10 Marks (Max.) Detailed & Project Specific ... 10 Marks Substantially Detailed 05 Marks Sketchy & Irrelevant 00 Marks	Substantially Detailed	5		For pavemnt design Road Note 31 is also mentioned. For boring 2m dia 60m long boring rig is not mentioned. Also for
D	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience The Bidder must demonstrate that it has the personnel for the key positions that meet the following requirements (All engineers must have valid Registration with PEC, it is mandatory). (For all Engineers, the Bidders are required to submit PEC registration certificate and the signed CVs of personnel be attached)				
i)	Bridge Design Engineer (MSc Structures, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1.0 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc Structures with 38 years expereince	2		Mr. Khalil Ahmed Loya Associates
ii)	Highway Design Engineer (MSc Transportation, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	MSc (Civil) with 41 years expereince	1		میراج (K) عزیز کاظمی مدرس M/s Zeeruk

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)					
iii)	Financial Specialist (CA/ACCA/MBA/MSc(Preferably Major in Finance)/ or equivalent), 10 years' experience, 8 years relevant 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	Expereince=12years	1		Syed Fareed Murtaza
iv)	Legal Specialist (LLB, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	Bar-at Law with 4 years expereince	0		Mr. Omer Farooq M/s Farooq Khan & Mirza other proposed staff is not employee of consortium
v)	Project Manager Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc Civil with 31 years expereince	2		Mr. Salman Qaisarani of M/s FWO
vi)	Operation & Maintenance Engineer (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 08 years relevant 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc with 31 years expereince	0		Mr. Aftab Aziz M/s FWO no relevant expereince other proposed staff are also have no relevant expereince

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)					
vii)	Highway Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	PHD with 24 years expeirence	0.5		Maj. Dr. Nadeem Anwar, M/s FWO
viii)	Structural Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	BE Civil with 17 years expeirence	0		Mr. Adnan Zafar, M/s FWO (has no relevant expeirence). Also, other proposed staff has no relevant expeirence
ix)	Material Engineer Construction (MSc Geology, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc Geology with 23 years expeirence	0.5		Mr. Shahid Anwar Ghotki M/s FWO
x)	Site Engineers Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 8 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 08 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc with 11 years expeirence	0.5		Maj. Abdul Majid, M/s FWO

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)					
E	Plants and Equipment				
	Description of Equipment's				
i)	Bulldozer 200 HP... 4 nos 0.4 Marks	6	0.4		Documents of most of the equipment provided, however, for Boring Rig (2m dia 60m long), no documents provided. M/s Ashraf D Baloch provided an undertaking of another Contractor M/s Usmani International Associates , which is not acceptable because M/s Usmani has nothing to do with this Project. In methodology, it is written that Piling Work will be subcontracted.
ii)	Motor Grader 140hP 4 nos 0.4 Marks	6	0.4		
iii)	Vibratory Roller 10-12 Ton4 nos 0.4 Marks	6	0.4		
iv)	Pneumatic Roller 18 - 21 Ton 3 nos 0.3 Marks	5	0.3		
v)	Tandem Roller 8 -12 Ton 2 nos 0.2 Marks	3	0.2		
vi)	Water Bowser 10,000 Lit 2 nos 0.2 Marks	4	0.2		
vii)	Wheel Loader 2.5 Cum 4 nos 0.2 Marks	8	0.2		
viii)	Dump Truck 18 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	25	0.3		
ix)	Dump Truck 10 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	30	0.3		
x)	Excavator (wheel +chain) 105 HP 2+2 nos 0.2 Marks	8	0.2		
xi)	Asphalt Plant 120 ton/Hr 1 no 0.4 Marks	2	0.4		
xii)	Asphalt Paver 145 HP (3-6m wide) 2 nos 0.4 Marks	3	0.4		
xiii)	Concrete Batching Plant 30 Cum 2 nos 0.2 Marks	3	0.2		
xiv)	Concrete Transit Mixer 6 Cum 6 nos 0.3 Marks	8	0.3		
xv)	Crane 150 Ton 2 nos 0.4 Marks	2	0.4		
xvi)	Concrete Pump 2 nos 0.4 Marks	2	0.4		
xvii)	Boring Rig 2m dia 60m long 2 nos 3 Marks		0		
xviii)	Launcher 1 no 2 Marks	Not have	0		

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO) (Lead Member)

Year	Turnover PKR Million
2016	67,388
2015	47,301
2014	36,689
Total Turnover	151,378.000

Evaluation	3 50,459.33
Total No. of Years	
Average Turnover per Year (in million PKR)	

Result;
Pass

Applicant's Financial Evaluation

Financial Information in US \$	Actual Previous Five Years June - July		
	3 2016	2 2015	1 2014
1. Total Assets	131,274,738,596	98,323,139,538	73,967,762,468
2. Total Liabilities	76,848,942,307	58,237,760,068	37,366,160,435
Overview Analysis	Estimated Amounts from above Table (Million PKR)		
7. Net Worth (1-2)	54,425,796,289	40,085,379,470	36,601,602,033
8. Average Net Worth	43,704,259,264		

Result;
Pass

TECHNICAL EVALUATION
M/S SARDAR ASHRAF D BALOCH (JV)

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**
- **TECHNICAL EVALUATION (SCORING)**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)				
1	<p>Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)</p> <p>a • For construction:</p> <p>The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category 'CA' and in discipline CE01 & CE02.</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02.</p> <p>(Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached)</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	
2	<p>Registration with Tax Authorities</p> <p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion</p> <p>(Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.)</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	NTN Certificate provided	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)				
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)	N/A	PASS	
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)				
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium, the members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	<p>Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used</p>	<p>Pass</p>	
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	<p>Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used</p>	<p>Pass</p>	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)				
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	Affidavit is provided, however format given in RFP is not used	Pass	
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion			
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation	Not Required	Pass	Lead member meets the criteria

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)				
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	Not Required	Pass	Lead member meets the criteria
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	34	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)				
12	Specific Work Experience a For Construction Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement) In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, <u>guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.</u>	Sufficient evidence provided for river training works on one side of Larkana-Khairpur Bridge over River Indus	Pass	<u>TFEC accepted the river training works of SMADB as sufficient for qualification</u>

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)					
A	Specific Construction Experience Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge of at least 500 m length with Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc.), completed in the past fifteen (15) years (submission of commencement letter and completion certificates are mandatory) For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV Specific Construction Experience.. 40 Marks (max.) For River Bridge of length 500m including Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc... 35 Marks One mark for each increment of 50 m in length For other members of JV: Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.	<p>Sufficient evidence provided for river training works on one side of Larkana-Khairpur Bridge over River Indus</p> <p>34 years</p>	16		TFEC accepted the river training works of SMADB as sufficient for qualification
B	Financial (Historical Financial Performance) For Single Entity i) Average Annual Construction Turnover for last 03 years 20 Marks (max.) Rs. 3,000 Million 15 Marks One mark for each increment of Rs. 500 Million ii) Average Net worth for last 03 years.. 10 Marks (Max) Rs. 1,500 Million 07 Marks One mark addition for each increment of Rs. 200 Million For JV As per share in JV (Attach Documentary evidence of financial position, bank statement and audited accounts of the last Three (3) years and fill the forms).	<div>8,949.00</div> <div>18080.75</div>	<div>8</div> <div>4</div>		<div>40% share i.e. Rs. 1200 million</div> <div>40% share i.e. Rs. 600 million</div>

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

NAME OF BIDDER" M/s Sardar Ashraf D Baloch (JV Member)

Year	Turnover PKR Million
2016	9,520.000
2015	8,421.000
2014	8,906.000
Total Turnover	26,847.000

Evaluation	3
Total No. of Years	
Average Turnover per Year (in million PKR)	
	8,949.00

Result;

Applicant's Financial Evaluation

Financial Information in PKR	Actual Previous Five Years June - July		
	3 2016	2 2015	1 2014
1. Total Assets	35,018.820	21,773.240	21,454.940
2. Total Liabilities	16,444.370	3,574.720	3,985.650
Overview Analysis	Estimated Amounts from above Table (Million PKR)		
7. Net Worth (1-2)	18,574.450	18,198.520	17,469.290
8. Average Net Worth	18,080.753		

Result;

TECHNICAL EVALUATION
M/S SCAHAL ENGINEERING & WORKS (PVT.) LTD

- **BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA**
- **TECHNICAL EVALUATION (SCORING)**

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	M/s AA Associates	Remarks
1	<p>Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)</p> <p>a • For construction: The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category ‘CA’ and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p> <p>b • For Design: Valid PEC registration certificate in Project Profile Code 1215 (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PASS	PASS	PASS
2	<p>Registration with Tax Authorities</p> <p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.) (Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	M/s AA Associates	Remarks
3	<p>Affidavit for government owned legal entities</p> <p>In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law</p> <p>(Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)</p>	N/A	N/A	PASS
4	<p>No conflict of interest</p> <p>The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest</p> <p>(Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS
5	<p>No - blacklisting</p> <p>The Bidder shall not be blacklisted</p> <p>(Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	M/s AA Associates	Remarks
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (in case of Consortium, all members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	M/s AA Associates	Remarks
8	<p>Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years.</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS
9	<p>Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy.</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS
10	<p>Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	M/s AA Associates	Remarks
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

SUMMARY OF BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	M/s AA Associates	Remarks
12	Specific Work Experience			
a	<p>For Construction</p> <p>Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years.</p> <p>(The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement)</p> <p>In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.</p>	PASS	N/A	PASS
b	<p>For Design</p> <p>Similar Work i.e. design of River Bridge of at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years.</p> <p>(The Bidders shall submit evidence of award and completion of design work)</p>	N/A	PASS	PASS

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)				
A	Specific Construction Experience Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge of at least 500 m length with Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc.), completed in the past fifteen (15) years (submission of commencement letter and completion certificates are mandatory) For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV Specific Construction Experience.. 40 Marks (max.) For River Bridge of length 500m including Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc... 35 Marks One mark for each increment of 50 m in length For other members of JV: Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.	40	40	
B	Financial (Historical Financial Performance) For Single Entity i) Average Annual Construction Turnover for last 03 years 20 Marks (max.) Rs. 3,000 Million 15 Marks One mark for each increment of Rs. 500 Million	16	16	
	ii) Average Net worth for last 03 years.. 10 Marks (Max) Rs. 1,500 Million 07 Marks One mark addition for each increment of Rs. 200 Million For JV As per share in JV (Attach Documentary evidence of financial position, bank statement and audited accounts of the last Three (3) years and fill the forms).	10	10	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)				
C	Work Methodology 10 Marks (Max.) Detailed & Project Specific ... 10 Marks Substantially Detailed 05 Marks Sketchy & Irrelevant 00 Marks	10	10	
D	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience The Bidder must demonstrate that it has the personnel for the key positions that meet the following requirements (All engineers must have valid Registration with PEC, it is mandatory). (For all Engineers, the Bidders are required to submit PEC registration certificate and the signed CVs of personnel be attached			
i)	Bridge Design Engineer (MSc Structures, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	0	0	
ii)	Highway Design Engineer (MSc Transportation, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5	0.5	
iii)	Financial Specialist (CA/ACCA/MBA/MSc(Preferably Major in Finance)/ or equivalent), 10 years' experience, 8 years relevant 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0	0	
iv)	Legal Specialist (LLB, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0	0	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)				
v)	Project Manager Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	2	2	
vi)	Operation & Maintenance Engineer (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 08 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0	0	
vii)	Highway Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5	0.5	
viii)	Structural Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5	0.5	
ix)	Material Engineer Construction (MSc Geology, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5	0.5	
x)	Site Engineers Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 8 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 08 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	0.5	0.5	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

S.NO	Requirement	M/s SACHAL	Total	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)				
E	Plants and Equipment			
	Description of Equipment's			
i)	Bulldozer 200 HP... 4 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
ii)	Motor Grader 140hP 4 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
iii)	Vibratory Roller 10-12 Ton4 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
iv)	Pneumatic Roller 18 - 21 Ton 3 nos 0.3 Marks	0.3	0.3	
v)	Tandem Roller 8 -12 Ton 2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2	0.2	
vi)	Water Bowser 10,000 Lit 2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2	0.2	
vii)	Wheel Loader 2.5 Cum 4 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2	0.2	
viii)	Dump Truck 18 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	0.3	0.3	
ix)	Dump Truck 10 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	0.3	0.3	
x)	Excavator (wheel +chain) 105 HP 2+2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2	0.2	
xi)	Asphalt Plant 120 ton/Hr 1 no 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
xii)	Asphalt Paver 145 HP (3-6m wide) 2 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
xiii)	Concrete Batching Plant 30 Cum 2 nos 0.2 Marks	0.2	0.2	
xiv)	Concrete Transit Mixer 6 Cum 6 nos 0.3 Marks	0.3	0.3	
xv)	Crane 150 Ton 2 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
xvi)	Concrete Pump 2 nos 0.4 Marks	0.4	0.4	
xvii)	Boring Rig 2m dia 60m long 2 nos 3 Marks	3	3	
xviii)	Launcher 1 no 2 Marks	2	2	
TOTAL MARKS = 100			90.5	> 75, Tecch. Qualified

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd				
1	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	
	<p>a • <u>For construction:</u> The Bidder must possess valid PEC registration certificate in category 'CA' and in discipline CE01 & CE02. In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, the Lead Member must meet the criterion while all other members of the Consortium must at least have PEC registration certificate in category C1 and in discipline CE01& CE02. (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>			
	<p>b • <u>For Design:</u> Valid PEC registration certificate in Project Profile Code 1215 (Valid PEC registration certificates to be attached) strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PEC Certificate in required category and discipline provided	Pass	M/s AA Associate
2	Registration with Tax Authorities	NTN Certificate provided	Pass	
	<p>The Bidder must possess valid registration certificate from income tax authority (i.e the NTN certificate)and Sindh Revenue Board (SRB), if applicable In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion (Valid NTN certificate and tax returns filed for last three years to be attached and SRB certificate, if applicable.) (Foreign entities if participating in the Bidding Process should submit tax certificate of their country duly attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>			

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd				
3	Affidavit for government owned legal entities In case if the Bidder or a Member of a Consortium is a government owned legal enterprise or institution, such Bidder must establish that it is legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law (Bidders who are government owned legal enterprise or institution shall submit an Affidavit confirming that they are legally and financially autonomous and operating under commercial law)	N/A		
4	No conflict of interest The Bidder shall not have any Conflict of Interest (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
5	No - blacklisting The Bidder shall not be blacklisted (Bidders (in case of a consortium, the Lead Member, on behalf of each member) shall submit an Affidavit for non-blacklisting)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd				
6	<p>Litigation History</p> <p>All pending litigation against the Bidder shall in total not represent more than fifty (50) % of the Bidder's net worth, nor shall there be any litigation that prevents or materially impedes the Bidder from its obligations in respect of the Project Highway and the terms of the Concession Agreement</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium), or members of the Consortium) shall provide details of the litigation or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case of no litigation on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p>	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
7	<p>History of Non-Performing Contracts</p> <p>Any non-performance of a contract by a Bidder should not occur in a period of 5 years prior to Proposal Deadline based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation. A fully settled dispute or litigation is one that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted</p> <p>(The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such non-performance of contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)</p> <p>The past performance of the Bidder on all completed and ongoing projects may also be checked in coordination with other government departments</p>	Affidavit is provided	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd				
8	Failure to Sign Contracts The Bidder shall not be under execution of a bid securing declaration for last 5 years. (The Bidders (including members of a Consortium) shall provide details of such failure to sign contracts or the Bidder (in case of Consortium, the Lead Member of the Consortium) shall submit an Affidavit in case if not applicable on Rs. 100 Stamp paper attested by Notary Public. Foreign Bidders' Affidavit should be attested by Pakistani Consulate/ Pakistan High Commission of their country)	Affidavit is provided	Pass	
9	Health & Safety Policy The Bidders shall submit copy of their health & safety policy. In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, all members of the Consortium (including the Lead Member) must meet the criterion	Provided	Pass	
10	Financial Situation/ Historical Financial Performance a Average Net Worth for last 03 years of the Bidder shall be Rs. 1500 Million (excluding any surplus on revaluation) as reflected in the annual audited financial statement for the last 03 years) (the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet, Financial Statement and Income Tax returns) In case of a Bidder who is a Consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion. (Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation	PKR 2,519.5 million	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd				
b	<p>Average Annual Construction Turnover</p> <p>The Bidder shall have an average annual construction turnover of PKR 3,000 million for last three (03) years.</p> <p>Minimum average annual construction turnover as mentioned above shall be calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed in last three (03) years.</p> <p>(the Bidders shall submit Audited Balance Sheet)</p> <p>In case of a Bidder who is a consortium, any member of the Consortium must meet the criterion.</p> <p>(Foreign entities if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation)</p>	PKR 3,672.2 million	Pass	
11	<p>General Construction Experience</p> <p>For Construction</p> <p>For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 15 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity. In case of JV, letter of intent to form JV or JV agreement.)</p> <p>For other members of JV</p> <p>Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.</p>	25	Pass	

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project
TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Requirement	Bidder's Response	Result	Remarks
BASIC ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA (PASS/FAIL)				
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd				
12	Specific Work Experience			
a	For Construction Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit commencement letter and completion certificates, which is mandatory requirement) In case main firm/contractor has no experience of river training works, it is permitted that it can make JV with any firm who has experience of River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years, specially, guide bank of length 500m or more on each side of river bridge.	More than one bridge + River Training Works	Pass	
b	For Design Similar Work i.e. design of River Bridge of at least 500 m length with River Training Works i.e. guide banks, gunda bund, cunette, spurs etc.), completed in last fifteen (15) years. (The Bidders shall submit evidence of award and completion of design work)	More than one bridge + River Training Works	Pass	M/s AA Associate

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd					
A	Specific Construction Experience Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project i.e., River Bridge of at least 500 m length with Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc.), completed in the past fifteen (15) years (submission of commencement letter and completion certificates are mandatory) For Single Entity/Lead Member of JV Specific Construction Experience.. 40 Marks (max.) For River Bridge of length 500m including Guide Banks/River Training works, Gunda Bund, Cunette, spurs etc... 35 Marks One mark for each increment of 50 m in length For other members of JV: Firms/Contractor have been in business of construction for at least for 10 years. (Attach Articles of Incorporation or Documents of Constitution, and documents of registration of the legal entity.	More than 1000m bridges on River Indus	40		
B	Financial (Historical Financial Performance) For Single Entity i) Average Annual Construction Turnover for last 03 years 20 Marks (max.) Rs. 3,000 Million 15 Marks One mark for each increment of Rs. 500 Million ii) Average Net worth for last 03 years.. 10 Marks (Max) Rs. 1,500 Million 07 Marks One mark addition for each increment of Rs. 200 Million For JV As per share in JV (Attach Documentary evidence of financial position, bank statement and audited accounts of the last Three (3) years and fill the forms).	PKR 3,672.2 million PKR 2,519.5 million	16 10		

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd					
C	Work Methodology 10 Marks (Max.) Detailed & Project Specific ... 10 Marks Substantially Detailed 05 Marks Sketchy & Irrelevant 00 Marks	Detailed & Poject Specific	10		
D	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience The Bidder must demonstrate that it has the personnel for the key positions that meet the following requirements (All engineers must have valid Registration with PEC, it is mandatory). (For all Engineers, the Bidders are required to submit PEC registration certificate and the signed CVs of personnel be attached)				
i)	Bridge Design Engineer (MSc Structures, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1.0 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	BSc Civil with 62 years expereince	0		A.Aleem Khan Requirement is MSc
ii)	Highway Design Engineer (MSc Transportation, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc with 13 years expereince	0.5		Hina Zeeshan
iii)	Financial Specialist (CA/ACCA/MBA/MSc(Preferably Major in Finance)/ or equivalent), 10 years' experience, 8 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	Pakbrunei, Financial Consultant	0		CV not provided

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd					
iv)	Legal Specialist (LLB, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	Ahmed & Qazi, Advocates & Legal Consultant	0		CV not provided
v)	Project Manager Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 20 years' experience, 10 years relevant experience) 20 or more years' experience(02 Marks) < 20 > 15 years' experience(1.5 Marks) < 15 > 10 years' experience (1 Marks) Less than 10 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc with 25 years expeirince	2		Munawar Ali Memon
vi)	Operation & Maintenance Engineer (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 08 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(01 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.75 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience (0.50 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	BE Mech with 33 years of expereince	0		Capt (R) Nazar BSc Civil is the requirement
vii)	Highway Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	BE Civil with 15 years expeirince	0.5		Rana Mohammad Atiq

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd					
viii)	Structural Engineer Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 10 years' experience, 05 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	BE Civil with 28 years experience	0.5		Anjum Majid
ix)	Material Engineer Construction (MSc Geology, 10 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 10 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 10 > 08 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 08 years' experience(0 Mark)	Msc Geology with 39 years experience	0.5		Zafaruddin
x)	Site Engineers Construction (BSc Civil Engineering, 8 years' experience, 5 years relevant experience) 08 or more years' experience(0.5 Marks) < 08 > 05 years' experience(0.25 Marks) Less than 05 years' experience(0 Mark)	BE Civil with 13 years experience	0.5		Imtiazul Haq

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

TECHNICAL EVALUATION

S.NO	Criteria & Requirement	Bidder's Response	Marks Obtained	Result	Remarks
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (SCORING)					
NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd					
E	Plants and Equipment				
	Description of Equipment's				
i)	Bulldozer 200 HP... 4 nos 0.4 Marks	6	0.4		Documents of Plant & Equipment provided
ii)	Motor Grader 140hP 4 nos 0.4 Marks	6	0.4		
iii)	Vibratory Roller 10-12 Ton4 nos 0.4 Marks	6	0.4		
iv)	Pneumatic Roller 18 - 21 Ton 3 nos 0.3 Marks	4	0.3		
v)	Tandem Roller 8 -12 Ton 2 nos 0.2 Marks	5	0.2		
vi)	Water Bowser 10,000 Lit 2 nos 0.2 Marks	6	0.2		
vii)	Wheel Loader 2.5 Cum 4 nos 0.2 Marks	5	0.2		
viii)	Dump Truck 18 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	8	0.3		
ix)	Dump Truck 10 Ton 6 nos 0.3 nos	9	0.3		
x)	Excavator (wheel +chain) 105 HP 2+2 nos 0.2 Marks	9	0.2		
xi)	Asphalt Plant 120 ton/Hr 1 no 0.4 Marks	1	0.4		
xii)	Asphalt Paver 145 HP (3-6m wide) 2 nos 0.4 Marks	2	0.4		
xiii)	Concrete Batching Plant 30 Cum 2 nos 0.2 Marks	2	0.2		
xiv)	Concrete Transit Mixer 6 Cum 6 nos 0.3 Marks	13	0.3		
xv)	Crane 150 Ton 2 nos 0.4 Marks	2	0.4		
xvi)	Concrete Pump 2 nos 0.4 Marks	2	0.4		
xvii)	Boring Rig 2m dia 60m long 2 nos 3 Marks	2	3		
xviii)	Launcher 1 no 2 Marks	1	2		

Ghotki – Kandhkot Bridge Project

NAME OF BIDDER: M/s Sachal Engineering & Works (Pvt) Ltd

Year	Turnover PKR Million
2016	6,269
2015	2,553
2014	2,195
Total Turnover	11,016.600

Evaluation	3
Total No. of Years	
Average Turnover per Year (in million PKR)	
	3,672.20

**Result;
Pass**

Applicant's Financial Evaluation

Financial Information in PKR	Actual Previous Five Years June - July		
	3 2016	2 2015	1 2014
1. Total Assets	5,666,756,000	3,328,883,000	2,433,779,000
2. Total Liabilities	2,359,690,000	1,000,356,000	510,855,000
Overview Analysis	Estimated Amounts from above Table (Million PKR)		
7. Net Worth (1-2)	3,307,066,000	2,328,527,000	1,922,924,000
8. Average Net Worth	2,520		

**Result;
Pass**