



## Minutes of Technical & Financial Evaluation Committee (TFEC) Meeting on Ghotki Kandhkot Bridge Project

A meeting of Technical & Financial Evaluation Committee (the “TFEC”) for the Ghotki Kandhkot Bridge Project (the “Project”) was held on Thursday, 1<sup>st</sup> February 2018 at 3:00 p.m. at the Committee Room of Chairman, Planning & Development Board, Government of Sindh under the chairmanship of Chairman, Planning & Development Board (formerly ACS Dev.). The meeting was convened to discuss and approve technical proposals evaluation for investor solicitation for the Project under Public Private Partnership (“PPP”) mode. The list of TFEC members attended the meeting is attached at [Annexure-A].

2. The Chair initiated the discussion by welcoming the participants. The Legal Specialist, PPP Node Works & Services Department informed the forum that the agenda of the meeting is to discuss and approve technical proposals evaluation. He stated that the TFEC in its last meeting opened three (3) bids received from i. Sachal Engineering Works (Pvt) Limited, ii). FWO and D Baluch Consortium and iii). Anhui and Kainatt Enterprises Consortium. He invited the consultants to present the technical evaluation to the forum.

3. Mr. Siddiqui Sulemani, representative of M/S EA Consulting (Pvt) Limited presented the technical proposals evaluation. He said that all the bids were initially evaluated against the basic eligibility criteria pursuant to the request for proposal (RFP) document. He informed that during the evaluation certain clarifications were sought from all of the three (3) bidders so that the sub-committee may evaluate bids with full clarity. He elaborated the outcomes of evaluation based on eligibility criteria as summarized below:






#	Bidder	Description	Comments
i.	Sachal Engineering Works (Pvt) Limited	Meets all required eligibility criteria.	Pass
ii.	FWO and Sardar D.Baluch Consortium	Meets all required eligibility criteria.	Pass
iii.	Anhui Construction and Kainatt Enterprises	Not meeting the following: - River Training Works of bridge over river of at least 500 meters - Design of river bridge of at least 500 meters	Fail

4. The technical proposals were further evaluated of eligible bidders at serial i and ii of para 3 above. The evaluation was made in pursuance to evaluation criteria given under the RFP document. The technical evaluation report of consultants is attached at **Annexure-B**. The evaluation score is produced below:

#	Bidder	Score	Remarks
i.	Sachal Engineering Works (Pvt) Ltd	90.50	Technical Qualified
ii.	FWO and Sardar D.Baluch Consortium	87.50	Technical Qualified

**Decision:** The TFEC endorsed the evaluation of eligibility criteria and technical proposal evaluation. Furthermore, the TFEC approved technical qualification of two (2) bids mentioned at para 4 above.

5. Meeting ended with a vote of thanks.

 Mr. Muhammad Waseem <b>Chairman</b> Planning & Development Board	 Mr. Aijaz Ahmed Memon <b>Secretary</b> Works & Services Department	 Mr. Shahab Qamar Ansari <b>Acting Secretary</b> Finance Department
 Mr. Khalid Mehmoood Shaikh <b>Director General, PPP Unit</b> Finance Department	 Mr. Shafiq-ur-Rehman Memon <b>Project Manager</b> Ghotki-Kandhkot Bridge Project, Works & Services Department	

## **Annexure-A**

### List of TFEC members attended the meeting

1. Mr. Muhammad Waseem, Chairman Planning & Development Board
2. Mr. Aijaz Ahmed Memon, Secretary Works & Services Department
3. Mr. Shahab Qamar Ansari, Acting Secretary Finance Department
4. Mr. Khalid Mehmood Shaikh, DG PPP Unit, Finance Department
5. Mr. Shafiq ur Rehman Memon, Project Manager, Ghotki Kandhkot Bridge Project, Works & Services Department