

**Consolidated Evaluation of EOIs
Preparation of Master Plan for I.I Depot at Karachi**

S.No	Qualification Requirement	MAX Score	MS International Design Group	MS M.K.A Associates	MS Afti Naaz Associates	MS Zabeenuddin Consultant Pvt Ltd	MS G-3 Engineering Consultants	MS Engineering Consultants
1	Lead Architect/ Architect (Incharge) (I.Depot)	100	66	65	78	72	58	62
2	Lead Architect/ Architect (Incharge) (I & D Department)	100	63	69	80	72	58	62
3	Lead Architect/ Architect (Incharge) (I & D Department)	100	63	70	80	71	58	62
4	Senior Architect/ Architect (Senior Dept)	100	63	69	75	73	54	62
5	Senior Architect/ Architect (Senior Dept)	100	61	64	75	71	54	62
6	Senior Architect/ Architect (Senior Dept)	100	61	64	75	71	54	62
Total Score		500	316	340	388	359	302	308
			63.20	68.00	77.60	71.80	60.40	61.60

Dr. Syed Qamar Abbas
 Director (Incharge) I.I. Depot
 Representative of Frontier Department

Dr. Suresh Kumar
 Special Secretary (PH) / Chairman

Shahnaz Siddiqui
 Representative P & D Department
 Kiran Nauman
 Additional Secretary (Dep)

Working Paper
Preparation of Master Plan for Defect I.I Depot at Karachi

S.No	Qualification Requirement	M/s International Design Group	M/s M.K.A Associates	M/s Afif Nazir Associates	M/s Zaheruddin Consultant Pvt. Ltd	M/s C-3 Engineering Consultants	M/s Engineering Consultants International Pvt
1	<p>Cover Page indicating Scope of work, Name of Lead consultant with full contact details: Mailing address, Cell, Fax and Email</p> <p>The letter is signed by the Principal Applicant and Lead consultant if other than the Principal Applicant showing Consent to sign (Integrity Pact)</p> <p>CDs and 05 sets of hard copies (01 Original & 04 Copies)</p> <p>Include on all pages of the proposal by authorized representative of the firm. The Authorization is confirmed by a written power of attorney accompanying the EOBs.</p>	Present as desired	Present as desired	Present as desired	Present as desired	Present as desired	Present as desired
2	<p>Copy of valid registration certificate of Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) and other Registration bodies (e.g. as a consulting engineering company) firm with renewal of the same for the year 2012</p> <p>Evidence of ISO certification</p>	Renewal for year 2012 is not present while with above bodies is present	Present as desired	Present as desired	Renewal for year 2012 is not present	Present as desired	Present as desired
3	<p>Undertaking on judicial stamp paper of Rs. 1000 confirming that information given by company/firm is true and correct. Details of litigations especially those with any government departments (if any)</p> <p>A brief Summary not more than two pages indicating Organization status and credibility in consultation work</p> <p>Must describe their history of collaboration with other organization and government Partners</p>	Furnished	Furnished	Furnished	Not Furnished	Not Furnished	Furnished

Handwritten notes:
 Xr for: *(Signature)* *(Signature)* *(Signature)* *(Signature)* *(Signature)*

<p>A brief description of the applicant about the nature and type of each assignment, size, timeline of completion of Projects, studies and whether an schedule, Project site, sponsoring and other participating organization, total cost of each assignment and current status.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicant's description of all ongoing and completed field-based work. List of similar projects designed / in hand with all system / services. Designed/supervised of project cost of above Rs.250.00 million and above. 	well described	well described	well described	well described	well described	well described
<p>Description of Human Resource available</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Projects related Technical and non technical Lead consultant Other key team members, brief statement of each member's role, relevant competence and experience and planned contribution to the project. Personnel already present with the Organization or immediately available and which one will be engaged further to contract award. 	Human resource available is appropriate but not mentioned which staff will be available further on contract award	Human resource available is appropriate but not mentioned which staff will be available further on contract award	Human resource available is appropriate but not mentioned which staff will be available further on contract award	Human resource available is appropriate but not mentioned which staff will be available further on contract award	Human resource available is appropriate but not mentioned which staff will be available further on contract award	Human resource available is appropriate but not mentioned which staff will be available further on contract award
<p>CVs of Lead consultant and other key technical team members for the Project applied for.</p>	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present
<p>Applicant's description of the current infrastructure and non-human resources that is available with the applicant especially in</p>	Mentioned properly	Fair	Fair	very well defined	Not mentioned	Not mentioned

As per
Copy: [Signature]
AM
[Signature]

<p>The financial profile of the company / firm with supportive documents, evidence by any schedule bank of the country of by reputable international Banks.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Description of the current financial management systems of the principal applicant • Previous Audit Reports of three years • National Tax No / Sales Tax Registration No. & Income Tax Certificate. Certificate of the last Income Tax return 	<p>Evidence by schedule bank of the country is not present. Financial system is not mentioned. Audit reports are not furnished. National Tax number & Certificate of the last income Tax return is present.</p>	<p>Evidence by schedule bank of the country is present but financial system is not mentioned. Audit reports of year 2011 & 2010 are not furnished. National Tax number and Certificate of the last income Tax return is present.</p>	<p>Evidence in schedule bank of the country is present but financial system is not mentioned. Audit reports are furnished. National Tax number and Certificate of the last income Tax return is present.</p>	<p>Evidence by schedule bank of the country is present but financial system is not mentioned. Audit reports are furnished. National Tax number and Certificate of the last income Tax return is present.</p>	<p>Evidence by schedule bank of the country is present but financial system is not mentioned. Audit reports are furnished. National Tax number and Certificate of the last income Tax return is present.</p>	<p>Evidence by schedule bank of the country is present but financial system is not mentioned. Audit reports are furnished but National Tax number & last Certificate is not present.</p>
<p>8. The applicant must submit successful completion certificate for the last projects of similar nature</p>	<p>Not furnished</p>	<p>Not furnished</p>	<p>furnished</p>	<p>furnished</p>	<p>Not furnished</p>	<p>furnished</p>
<p>Recommendations</p>	<p>Not furnished</p>	<p>Not furnished</p>	<p>furnished</p>	<p>furnished</p>	<p>Not furnished</p>	<p>furnished</p>

Dr. Syed Qamar Abbas
 Officer in-charge, I. Depot

Mr. Muntia Ali Gopang
 Representative Finance Department

Dr. M. Sulaiman Otho
 M & E Specialist, CREAM (C.O.-opted)

Dr. Suresh Kumar
 Special Secretary (TH) / Chairman

Shahbaz Siddiqui
 Representative P & D Department

Md. Kiran Nauman
 Additional Secretary (Dev)

Eng. Shabir Ahmed
 Executive Engineer KMC (Coupled)

**SELECTION OF CONSULTANTS FOR PREPARATION OF MASTER PLAN FOR I.I DEPOT & CONSTRUCTION OF HEALTH SECRETARIAT BUILDING AT I.I
DEPOT KARACHI**

DATA SHEET

M/s. International Design Group

Criteria, Sub Criteria and point system for the evaluation of design Proposal

S.No.	Description	Points as per Criteria	Mrs. Shahnaz Siddiqui Chief Health P&D Department GOS	Mr. Mumtaz Ali Gopang Deputy Secretary Finance Department GOS	Engr. Amanullah Memon Project Engineer	Dr. Abdul Majeed Chutto Incharge I.I Depot / PD Medical Colleges Sindh, Karachi	Dr. Khalid Hussain Shaikh Additional Secretary (Technical) Health Deptt.	Average Points
			Member 1	Member 2	Member 3	Member 4	Chairman	
a)	Master Plan	15	9	7	8	5	8	7.4
b)	Planning							
i.	Space Plan	20	12	8	10	7	11	9.6
ii.	Area Utilization	10	8	4	5	3	5	5
iii.	Parking	10	7	4	5	3	5	4.8
iv.	Utility Designs	10	7	5	5	3	4	4.8
c)	Aesthetics	20	12	8	10	6	7	8.6
d)	Overall Presentation	15	10	6	7	6	6	7
		100	65	42	50	33	46	47.2


Member 1


Member 2


Member 3


Member 4


Chairman

**SELECTION OF CONSULTANTS FOR PREPARATION OF MASTER PLAN FOR I.I DEPOT & CONSTRUCTION OF HEALTH SECRETARIAT BUILDING AT I.I
DEPOT KARACHI**

DATA SHEET

M/s. Atif Nazar Associates

Criteria, Sub Criteria and point system for the evaluation of design Proposal

S.No.	Description	Points as per Criteria	Mrs. Shahnaz Siddiqui Chief Health P&D Department GOS	Mr. Mumtaz Ali Gopang Deputy Secretary Finance Department GOS	Engr. Amanullah Memon Project Engineer	Dr. Abdul Majeed Chutto Incharge I.I Depot / PD Medical Colleges Sindh, Karachi	Dr. Khalid Hussain Shaikh Additional Secretary (Technical) Health Deptt.	Average Points
			Member 1	Member 2	Member 3	Member 4	Chairman	
a)	Master Plan	15	10	14	13	14	14	65
b)	Planning							
i.	Space Plan	20	8	15	16	18	17	74
ii.	Area Utilization	10	6	8	8	10	9	41
iii.	Parking	10	7	10	9	10	9	45
iv.	Utility Designs	10	6	9	9	9	8	41
c)	Aesthetics	20	14	16	16	18	19	83
d)	Overall Presentation	15	9	13	13	12	14	61
			60	85	84	91	90	82


Member 1


Member 2


Member 3


Member 4


Chairman

**SELECTION OF CONSULTANTS FOR PREPARATION OF MASTER PLAN FOR I.I DEPOT & CONSTRUCTION OF HEALTH SECRETARIAT BUILDING AT I.I
DEPOT KARACHI**

DATA SHEET

M/s. Zaheeruddin Consultants Didn't Deliver presentation in Design Contest

Criteria, Sub Criteria and point system for the evaluation of design Proposal

S.No.	Description	Points as per Criteria	Mrs. Shahnaz Siddiqui Chief Health P&D Department GOS	Mr. Muntaz Ali Gopang Deputy Secretary Finance Department GOS	Engr. Amanullah Memon Project Engineer	Dr. Abdul Majeed Chutto Incharge I.I Depot / PD Medical Colleges Sindh, Karachi	Dr. Khalid Hussain Shaikh Additional Secretary (Technical) Health Deptt.	Average Points
a)	Master Plan	15	Member 1	Member 2	Member 3	Member 4	Chairman	
b)	Planning		/	/	/	/	/	
i.	Space Plan	20	/	/	/	/	/	
ii.	Area Utilization	10	/	/	/	/	/	
iii.	Parking	10	/	/	/	/	/	
iv.	Utility Designs	10	/	/	/	/	/	
c)	Aesthetics	20	/	/	/	/	/	
d)	Overall Presentation	15	/	/	/	/	/	


Member 1


Member 2


Member 3


Member 4


Chairman



OFFICE OF THE PROJECT DIRECTOR

ESTABLISHMENT OF MEDICAL COLLEGES IN SINDH (KARACHI, HYDERABAD, MIRPURKHAS)

2nd FLOOR SINDH NURSING DIRECTORATE BUILDING, KARACHI
PHONE NO. 021-99203421. FAX NO. 021-99203420

Email: pamedicalcolleges@yahoo.com



RECORD OF BID OPENING

FINANCIAL PROPOSAL AND NEGOTIATION FOR "CONSULTANT FOR CONSTRUCTION OF
HEALTH COMPLEX BUILDING AT I.I. DEPOT KARACHI"

31st May 2013 @ 10:30 a.m.

Quoted Rates:

Serial No.	Name of contractor	For Preparation of PC-1 (Stage-1) (Quote in Lump sum Amount)	For Detailed Design (Stage-2) (Quote in Percentage of Tender Cost)	For Detailed Supervision (Stage-2) (Quote in Percentage of Tender Cost per Year)
01.	M/S ATIF NAZAR ASSOCIATES, Consultant Engineers Architects, Planners & Project Managers Karachi.	1 Billion (Twice)	2.25%	0.75%

After Negotiation: (As Allowed In Design Contest Selection Method)

Serial No.	Name of contractor	For Preparation of PC-1 (Stage-1) (Quote in Lump sum Amount)	For Detailed Design (Stage-2) (Quote in Percentage of Tender Cost)	For Detailed Supervision (Stage-2) (Quote in Percentage of Tender Cost per Year)
01.	M/S ATIF NAZAR ASSOCIATES, Consultant Engineers Architects, Planners & Project Managers Karachi.	9.5 Million	1.5%	0.70%

Agreed
31/05/13

[Signature]
(Member)

Dr. Abdul Majeed Chhutto
In-charge I.I Depot Karachi &
Project Director Establishment of
Medical Colleges in Sindh

[Signature]
(Member)

Engineer Amrullah Memon
Technical person from
Health Department Dev. Wing
Government of Sindh, Karachi

[Signature]
(Member)

Mrs. Shehnaaz Siddiqui
Chief Health
P & D Department,
Government of Sindh, Karachi

[Signature]
(Member)

Mr. Muntaz Ali Gopang
Deputy Secretary Finance
Government of Sindh, Karachi

[Signature]
(Member)

Dr. Khalid Hussain Shaikh
Additional Secretary (Technical)
Government of Sindh, Karachi

Note: In case of Stoppage work
month notice will be given
for Demobilization of staff