

SINDH PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY

CONTRACT EVALUATION FORM

TO BE FILLED IN BY ALL PROCURING AGENCIES FOR PUBLIC CONTRACTS OF WORKS, SERVICES & GOODS

- 1) NAME OF THE ORGANIZATION / DEPTT. Finance Department, Government of Sindh
- 2) PROVINCIAL / LOCAL GOVT./ OTHER Provincial
- 3) TITLE OF CONTRACT Appointment of Audit Firm
- 4) TENDER NUMBER N/A
- 5) BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CONTRACT Appointment of Audit Firms for audit of 10 funds
- 6) FORUM THAT APPROVED THE SCHEME Board members of Funds
- 7) TENDER ESTIMATED VALUE N/A
- 8) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE (For civil works only) N/A
- 9) ESTIMATED COMPLETION PERIOD (AS PER CONTRACT) N/A
- 10) TENDER OPENED ON (DATE & TIME) 3:30 pm on 21st February 2011
- 11) NUMBER OF TENDER DOCUMENTS SOLD Five
(Attach list of buyers)
- 12) NUMBER OF BIDS RECEIVED Five
- 13) NUMBER OF BIDDERS PRESENT AT THE TIME OF OPENING OF BIDS Nil
- 14) BID EVALUATION REPORT (Enclose a copy) Enclosed
- 15) NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE SUCCESSFUL BIDDER 1. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co. 2. Riaz Ahmad & Co
3. A.F Ferguson & Co.
- 16) CONTRACT AWARD PRICE N/A
- 17) RANKING OF SUCCESSFUL BIDDER IN EVALUATION REPORT (i.e. 1st, 2nd, 3rd EVALUATION BID). N/A

18) METHOD OF PROCUREMENT USED : - (Tick one)

- a) SINGLE STAGE – ONE ENVELOPE PROCEDURE Domestic/ Local
- b) SINGLE STAGE – TWO ENVELOPE PROCEDURE
- c) TWO STAGE BIDDING PROCEDURE
- d) TWO STAGE – TWO ENVELOPE BIDDING PROCEDURE

PLEASE SPECIFY IF ANY OTHER METHOD OF PROCUREMENT WAS ADOPTED i.e. EMERGENCY, DIRECT CONTRACTING ETC. WITH BRIEF REASONS:

19) APPROVING AUTHORITY FOR AWARD OF CONTRACT _____

20) WHETHER THE PROCUREMENT WAS INCLUDED IN ANNUAL PROCUREMENT PLAN?

Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
-----	--------------------------	----	-------------------------------------

21) ADVERTISEMENT :

i) SPPRA Website
(If yes, give date and SPPRA Identification No.)

Yes	Yes
No	

ii) News Papers
(If yes, give names of newspapers and dates)

Yes	Express-7 February 2011 Dawn & Kawish - 6 February 2011
No	

22) NATURE OF CONTRACT

Domestic/ Local	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Int.	<input type="checkbox"/>
--------------------	-------------------------------------	------	--------------------------

23) WHETHER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA
WAS INCLUDED IN BIDDING / TENDER DOCUMENTS?
(If yes, enclose a copy)

Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
-----	-------------------------------------	----	--------------------------

24) WHETHER BID EVALUATION CRITERIA
WAS INCLUDED IN BIDDING / TENDER DOCUMENTS?
(If yes, enclose a copy)

Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
-----	-------------------------------------	----	--------------------------

25) WHETHER APPROVAL OF COMPETENT AUTHORITY WAS OBTAINED FOR USING A
METHOD OTHER THAN OPEN COMPETITIVE BIDDING?

Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
-----	--------------------------	----	-------------------------------------

26) WAS BID SECURITY OBTAINED FROM ALL THE BIDDERS?

Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
-----	-------------------------------------	----	--------------------------

27) WHETHER THE SUCCESSFUL BID WAS LOWEST EVALUATED
BID / BEST EVALUATED BID (in case of Consultancies)

Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
-----	-------------------------------------	----	--------------------------

28) WHETHER THE SUCCESSFUL BIDDER WAS TECHNICALLY
COMPLIANT?

Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
-----	-------------------------------------	----	--------------------------

29) WHETHER NAMES OF THE BIDDERS AND THEIR QUOTED PRICES WERE READ OUT AT
THE TIME OF OPENING OF BIDS?

Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
-----	--------------------------	----	-------------------------------------

30) WHETHER EVALUATION REPORT GIVEN TO BIDDERS BEFORE THE AWARD OF
CONTRACT?
(Attach copy of the bid evaluation report)

Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
-----	--------------------------	----	-------------------------------------

31) ANY COMPLAINTS RECEIVED
(If yes, result thereof)

Yes	
No	No

32) ANY DEVIATION FROM SPECIFICATIONS GIVEN IN THE TENDER NOTICE / DOCUMENTS
(If yes, give details)

Yes	
No	No

33) WAS THE EXTENSION MADE IN RESPONSE TIME?
(If yes, give reasons)

Yes	
No	No

34) DEVIATION FROM QUALIFICATION CRITERIA
(If yes, give detailed reasons.)

Yes	
No	No

35) WAS IT ASSURED BY THE PROCURING AGENCY THAT THE SELECTED FIRM IS NOT BLACK LISTED?

Yes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	<input type="checkbox"/>
-----	-------------------------------------	----	--------------------------

36) WAS A VISIT MADE BY ANY OFFICER/OFFICIAL OF THE PROCURING AGENCY TO THE SUPPLIER'S PREMISES IN CONNECTION WITH THE PROCUREMENT? IF SO, DETAILS TO BE ASCERTAINED REGARDING FINANCING OF VISIT, IF ABROAD:
(If yes, enclose a copy)

Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
-----	--------------------------	----	-------------------------------------

37) WERE PROPER SAFEGUARDS PROVIDED ON MOBILIZATION ADVANCE PAYMENT IN THE CONTRACT (BANK GUARANTEE ETC.)?

Yes	<input type="checkbox"/>	No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
-----	--------------------------	----	-------------------------------------

38) SPECIAL CONDITIONS, IF ANY
(If yes, give Brief Description)

Yes	
No	No

39) Date of Award of Contract: 6th April 2011

Signature & Official Stamp of
Authorized Officer

Syed Shahnawaz Nadir Shah
Chief Investment Specialist
(F.M.H)

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

ERU, Finance Department
Govt. of Sindh

SPPRA, Block. No.8, Sindh Secretariat No.4-A, Court Road, Karachi
Tele: 021-9205356; 021-9205369 & Fax: 021-9206291

Bid Evaluation Report

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Finance Department, Government of Sindh
2. Tender Reference No: N.A
3. Tender Description/ Name of Work / item: Audit of 10 Funds Managed by Sindh Fund Management House
4. Method of Procurement: Single Stage – One Envelope
5. Tender Published: Express - 7th Feb 2011 and Dawn & Kawish 6th Feb 2011
6. Total Bid documents Sold: Five
7. Total Bids Received: Five
8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) N.A.
9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): Four
10. Bid(s) Rejected: Nil
11. Financial Bid Opening date: N.A.

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S. No.	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the bidder	Ranking in Term of cost	Comparison with estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance / Rejection	Remarks
1.	Riaz Ahmed & Co.	Rs. 3,210,000	N.A.	N.A.	Low Cost & Fulfills the criteria	Recommended for Board approval
2.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	Rs. 2,994,430	N.A.	N.A.	Low Cost & Fulfills the criteria	Recommended for Board approval
3.	A.F. Ferguson & Co.	Rs. 3,335,000	N.A.	N.A.	Low Cost & Fulfills the criteria	Recommended for Board approval
4.	Avais Hyder Liaquat Noman	Rs. 1,360,000	N.A.	N.A.	Submitted bid for only one group, Fulfills the criteria although High cost	Not recommended due to high cost
5.	Howrath Hussain Chaudhury & Co.	Rs. 9,149,500	N.A.	N.A.	High Cost & does not fulfills the criteria	Not recommended due to high cost and criteria not fulfilled


Syed Shahnawaz Nadir Shah
Chief Investment Specialist
(F.M.H)
ERU, Finance Department
Govt. of Sindh

BIDDING PROCEDURE FOR AVAILING SERVICES OF
AUDIT FIRMS

S. No.	Name of Firm	Bidding Document Issued	Bids Submitted	Group 1	Group 2	Group 3
1.	Riaz Ahmad & Company	8-Feb-11	21-Feb-11	1,075,000	1,080,000	1,055,000
2.	KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	8-Feb-11	19-Feb-11	728,420	1,033,200	1,232,810
3.	Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman	8-Feb-11	21-Feb-11		1,360,000	
4.	Horwath Hussain Chaudhury & Co.	10-Feb-11	21-Feb-11	3,177,000	3,127,900	2,844,600
5.	A.F. Ferguson & Co.	17-Feb-11	19-Feb-11	1,002,000	1,167,000	1,166,000
			Lowest Bid	728,420	1,033,200	1,055,000

Bids opened at 3:30 pm on 21st Feb 2011 by the

following:


21.2.11
TAHAR NOMAN KHAN
Investment Specialist (F.M.H.)
Finance Department
Government of Sindh


21st Feb 2011

Syed Shahmawaz Nadir Shah
Chief Investment Specialist
(F.M.H.)
ERU, Finance Department
Govt. of Sindh



Government of Sindh
Finance Department
(Fund Management House)
NO: F.D (FMH) 2 (1)2009-10 / 320
Karachi, dated 6th April, 2011

To,

Riaz Ahmad & Co.,
Chartered Accountants,
108-109, 1st Floor Park Avenue
Block 6, P.E.C.H.S
Shahrah e Faisal
KARACHI.

Subject: **Appointment as Auditors of Viability Gap Fund, Peoples' Housing Cell Fund, Sindh Flood Relief Fund and Sindh Coal Development Fund**

With reference to your bid submitted dated 21st February 2011 for the advertisement "Invitation for bids for Availing Service of Firms of Chartered Accountants", we would like to inform you that you have been selected for the audit of Group 3. As mentioned in the bidding document this engagement will be till FY'13 and includes the following funds:

- Vaibility Gap Fund
- Peoples' Housing Cell Fund
- Sindh Flood Relief Fund
- Sindh Coal Development Fund

You are therefore kindly requested send signed engagement letter for signature of authorized signatory.

(TAHA NOMAN KHAN)
Investment Accounting & Settlement
Analyst (FMH)

Copy to:

- P.S.O to Finance Secretary, Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- P.S to Special Finance Secretary (B&E-Res), Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- Master copy

(TAHA NOMAN KHAN)
Investment Accounting & Settlement
Analyst (FMH)

Block No. 18, Sindh Secretariat No. 4-A, Finance Department, Court Rd, Karachi PH: # 021-99203522



Government of Sindh
Finance Department
(Fund Management House)
NO: F.D (FMH) 2 (1)2009-10 / 318
Karachi, dated 6th April, 2011

To,

KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.,
Chartered Accountants,
1st Floor Sheikh Sultan Trust Building No. 2,
Beaumont Road
KARACHI.

Subject: Appointment as Auditors of Sindh Pension Fund, Sindh Bank Fund and SASO Pensioners' Fund

With reference to your bid submitted dated 19th February 2011 for the advertisement "Invitation for bids for Availing Service of Firms of Chartered Accountants", we would like to inform you that you have been selected for the audit of Group 1. As mentioned in the bidding document this engagement will be till FY'13 and includes the following funds:

- Sindh Pension Fund
- Sindh Bank Fund
- SASO Pensioners' Fund

You are therefore kindly requested send signed engagement letter for signature of authorized signatory.

(TAHA NOMAN KHAN)
Investment Accounting & Settlement
Analyst (FMH)

Copy to:

- P.S.O to Finance Secretary, Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- P.S to Special Finance Secretary (B&E-Res), Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- *Master copy*

(TAHA NOMAN KHAN)
Investment Accounting & Settlement
Analyst (FMH)

Block No. 18, Sindh Secretariat No. 4-A, Finance Department, Court Rd, Karachi PH: # 021-99203522



Government of Sindh
Finance Department
(Fund Management House)
NO: F.D (FMH) 2 (1)2009-10/319
Karachi, dated 6th April, 2011

To,

A.F. Ferguon & Co.,
Chartered Accountant
State Life Building No. 1/C,
I.I. Chundrigar Road,
KARACHI.

Subject: Appointment as Auditors of Sindh Social Relief Fund, Sindh General Provident Investment Fund and Provincial Disaster Management Fund

With reference to your bid submitted dated 21st February 2011 for the advertisement "Invitation for bids for Availing Service of Firms of Chartered Accountants", we would like to inform you that you have been selected for the audit of Group 2. As mentioned in the bidding document this engagement will be till FY'13 and includes the following funds:

- Sindh Social Relief Fund
- Sindh General Provident Investment Fund
- Provincial Disaster Management Fund

You are therefore requested to send signed engagement letter for signature of authorized signatory.

(TAHA NOMAN KHAN)
Investment Accounting & Settlement
Analyst (FMH)

Copy to:

- P.S.O to Finance Secretary, Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- P.S to Special Finance Secretary (B&E-Res), Finance Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- Master copy

(TAHA NOMAN KHAN)
Investment Accounting & Settlement
Analyst (FMH)

Block No. 18, Sindh Secretariat No. 4-A, Finance Department, Court Rd, Karachi PH: # 021-99203522