

No./MS/CHK/2017-2018/620 Civil Hospital, Baba-e-Urdu Raod, Karachi Dated: 15/01/, 2018

To,

The Managing Director, Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Government of Sindh, Karachi

SUBJECT:

BID EVALUATION REPORT FOR CLEANLINESS/ JANITORIAL SERVICES AT DR. RUTH K.M PFAU CIVIL HOSPITAL, KARACHI

SPPRA REF # 35442chkkhi281117

Refer to the subject the following documents are submitted herewith for hoisting at SPPRA website against SPPRA Ref # 35442chkkhi281117

1- Bid Evaluation Report as per SPPRA format

Minutes of Meeting of Procurement Committee for Technical Opening, Evaluation & financial Opening

3- Fechnical & Financial Evaluation of Bids.

4- Attendance sheet of Procurement Committee & Bidders for technical opening

5- Attended sheet of Procurement Committee & Bidders for Financial opening

6- NIT published in newspapers

MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT Dr. Rúth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi

C.C. to

1. The P.S. to Secretary, Health Department, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi

2. The AMS (Procurement). Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi

2. The Account Section, Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi

3. Office File.

MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi

SPPRA INWARD DIARY NO: YSQ! DATED: 15-01-18



OFFICE OF THE MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT DR. RUTH K.M.PFAU, CIVIL HOSPITAL KARACHI

Bid Evaluation Report

1. Name of Procurement Agency:

Office of the Medical Superintendent Sindh Govt.

Civil Hospital, Karachi

2. Tender Reference No:

No./MS/CHK/2017-2018/48613

3. Tender description/Name of

NIT: Cleanliness/Janitorial Services

work/items:

1111. Creammess samon

4. Method of Procurement:

Single stage two envelop procedure

Tender Published:

The EXPRESS TURBINE (26-11-2017).

6. Total Bid documents Sold:

(02)

7. Total Bids Received:

(02)

8. Technical Bid Opening date:

15/12/2017

9. No. of Bid technically qualified:

02

10. Bid(s) Rejected:

0

11. Financial Bid Opening date:

29/12/2017

12. Bid Evaluation Report

S. #	Name of Firm/ Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in term of cost	Comparison with Estimated Cost	Reason for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/S. Master Multi Tech Pvt. Ltd	Rs. 48,471,196.	1 st Lowest	Within Estimated Cost	Technically Responsive	Recommended for award of work.
2	M/s. Al-Basit Facilities Pvt. Itd	Rs. 53,569,956.	2 nd Lowest		Technically Responsive	

Dr. Rubina Bashir. Addl. Medical Superintendent, Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi. (Chairman) Dr. Shagufta Bano Chief Medical Officer (DMC South) (Member)

Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya

Addl. Medical Superintendent,
(Planning & Development)

Dr. Ruth K. M. Pfan Civil Hospital Karae

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi (Member)



No./MS/CHK/2017-2018/ Dr, Ruth K.M.Pfau, Civil Hospital, Baba-e-Urdu Raod, Karachi Dated: , 2017

MINUTES OF CONTRACTOR SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING FOR OPENING OF FINANCIAL PROPOSAL & FINALIZATION OF CONTRACTOR FIRM FOR;

HIRING OF CONTRACT SERVICES FOR "CLEANLINESS/ JANITORIAL SERVICES AT DR. RUTH K.M. PFAU, CIVIL HOSPITAL KARACHI"

The meeting of Procurement committee was held for Opening of Financial Proposal and Finalization of Contract Services on dated 29.12.2017 at 11:00 AM in the presence of committee members and participants of qualified firm at the Committee Room of Civil Hospital, Karachi. Following members attended the meeting:-

Participants:

1- Additional Medical Superintendent (Proc.),
 Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi

Chairman

2- Additional M.S (Planning & Development) Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi Member/ Secretary

3- Chief Medical Officer, DMC (South) Member

Minutes of Meeting:

- Subsequent to the technical evaluation meeting of Procurement Committee held on 23.12.2017, the meeting for financial opening of technically qualified contractors was called on 29.12.2017 at 11:00 AM, the participants of following qualified firm is called to attend the meeting. (enclosed attendance sheet)
 - 1) M/s Master Multitech.
 - 2) M/s Al-Basit.
- In the presence of members of Procurement Committee and technically qualified bidders, the financial proposals of qualified firms were opened by the committee. Afterward the necessary financial evaluation of proposals being done by the Procurement Committee as per SPPRA Rules. The following bids were received by the bidders.



S.No.	Name Of the Firm	Financial Bid Amount	Ranks
01	M/s Master Multi Tech Pvt. Ltd	48,474,100/-	1 st Lowest Bidder
02	M/s Al-Basit Facilities Management Pvt. Ltd	54,092,687/-	2 nd

- The detail assessment sheet of both technical & financial evaluation of aforementioned bidders duly signed by the Procurement Committee is enclosed herewith.
- The Procurement Committee decided to award the work to Lowest Competitive bidder actor i.e. M/s Master Multi Tech Pvt. Ltd for subject janitorial services and further directed to the member/ Secretary of the committee to share the Evaluation/Scoring sheets of qualified firms with SPPRA for hoisting at website and complete all codal formalities as per SPPRA rules 2010 (Amended 2017).
- The meeting ended with the vote of thanks to and from the chair.

01	Dr. Rubina Bashir, Additional Medical Superintendent (Proc.), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi	29-
02	Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya, ional Medical Superintendent (P&D), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi	85
03	Dr. Shagufta Bano, Chief Medical Officer, DMC South	





OFFICE OF THE MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT DR. RUTH K.M PFAU CIVIL HOSPITAL KARACHI

NIT: JANITORIAL SERVICES

DATE & TIME OF TENDERS

ISSUANCE

14/12/2017 2:00 PM DATE & TIME OF BIDS SUBMISSION

15/12/2017 11:30 AM

DATE & TIME OF OPENNING

OF BIDS.

15/12/2017

12:00pm

Amount of Estimate (TS)

Amount	t of Estimate. (TS)	50.00 M						
S. No:-	Items	Discription of Works	Tender No.	Cost of Items. (Rs) Rate Quoted by Contractor M/S MASTER MULTI TECH Rate Quoted by Contractor M/S		Rate Quoted by Contractor M/S AL-B	ASIT	
1	Janitorial Services				As per Item rates	Total	As per Item rates	Total
				-	48,471,196	48,471,196	53,569,956	53,569,956
			contractor	bid rates		48,471,196		53,569,956
			Corrected Total	al Bid Amount		48,471,196		53,569,956
			Rema	arks.		1ST		2ND

Dr. Rubina Bashir

Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement)

Civil Hospital, Karachi.

Chairman

Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya

Adll. Medical Superintendent (P & D)

Civil Hospital, Karachi.

Member

Dr. Shagufta Bano

Chief Medical Officer

DMC (South)

Member



NIT: JANITORIAL SERVICES

DATE & TIME OF TENDERS

ISSUANCE

14/12/2017

2:00 PM

DATE & TIME OF BIDS SUBMISSION

15/12/2017

DATE & TIME OF OPENNING

OF BIDS.

15/12/2017

12:00pm

Amount of Estimate. (TS)

50.00 M

S. No:-	Items	Discription of Works	Tender No.	Cost of Items. (Rs)	AS PER ENGINEER'S ES	AS PER ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Rate Quoted by Contractor M/S MASTE MULTI TECH		
1	Janitorial Services			As per Item rates		As per Item rates				
				\$ -		50,000,000			48,471,196	
	l'	Corrected Total Bid Amount					48,471,196			
			Rema	arks.	# F		1st lowest			

Dr. Rubina Bashir

Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement)

Civil Hospital, Karachi.

Chairman

Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya

Adll. Medical Superintendent (P & D)

Civil Hospital, Karachi.

Member

Dr. Shagufta Bano Chief Medical Officer

DMC (South)

Member



No./MS/CHK/2017-2018/
Dr, Ruth K.M.Pfau,
Civil Hospital,
Baba-e-Urdu Raod, Karachi
Dated: , 2017

MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS FOR CLEANLINESS / JANITORIAL SERVICES WORKS AT DR. RUTH K.M. PFAU, CIVIL HOSPITAL KARACHI"

The meeting of Procurement committee was held for Evaluation/Finalization of Technical Proposals' on dated 23-12-2017 at 2:30 PM in the presence of committee members and at the office of the Additional Medical Superintendent (Procurement), 1st Floor, Admin Block of Civil Hospital, Karachi. Following members attended the meeting:-

Participants:

1- Additional Medical Superintendent (Proc.), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi Chairman

2- Additional M.S (Planning & Development) Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi Member/ Secretary

 Chief Medical Officer, DMC (South) Member

Minutes of Meeting:

- At the bid opening date i.e. 15-12-2017, the technical proposals of two firms were received and opened in the presence of committee members, afterward the proposals were given to consultant for detailed evaluation as per the criteria mentioned in the bidding document.
- The consultant apprised the committee members about the criteria and evaluation performed, the members of the committee review the evaluation according to the criteria mentioned in bidding document.
- Each member technically evaluates the document and score accordingly, subsequently a cumulative scoring sheet prepared in the meeting.

Page 1 of 2

F

- As per technical assessment, the following both firms were technically qualified (Scored above 65 Marks. Minimum qualified marks). The duly signed evaluation sheet of each member along with cumulative assessment sheet and the comments of Procurement Committee is enclosed herewith for reference.
 - M/s Al-Basit Facilities Management Pvt. Ltd
 - M/s Master Multi Tech Pvt. Ltd
- The Procurement Committee approved the technical evaluation and then decided to open the financial proposal on 29.12.2017 at 12:00 noon of technically qualified firms at the same venue mentioned above and also advised to invite the representatives of Technically Qualified firm to participate in the meeting.
- The meeting ended with the vote of thanks to and from the chair.

01	Dr. Rubina Bashir, Additional Medical Superintendent (Proc.), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi	De.
02	Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya, ional Medical Superintendent (P&D), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi	S. i
03	Dr. Shagufta Bano, Chief Medical Officer, DMC South	Service Control of the Control of th

SUMMARY OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION/ ASSESMENT OF BIDDERS

CLEANLINESS / JANITORIAL SERVICES.

Following two bidders had been appeared for the cleanliness/ Janitorial Services.

- 1- M/s Al-Basit Facilities Management (Pvt.) Ltd.
- 2- M/s Master Multi-Tech Pvt. Ltd

Detailed Evaluation is given bellow.

S.No	Mandatory Registrations.	Al-Basit Facilities Management (Pvt) Ltd.	Master Multi-Tech	
1	Copy of the Registration Certificate with EOBI / SESSI	Yes Yes Yes Yes		
2	Copy of the Registration Sindh Revenue Board for SST	Yes	Yes	
3	Copy of the Registration Certificate with Income Tax Department with N.T. No	Yes	Yes	
	Eligible / Non-Eligible	Eligible	Eligible	

Dr. Rubina Bashir.

Addl. Medical Superintendent,

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi.

(Chairman)

Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya Addl. Medical Superintendent,

(Planning & Development)

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi

(Member)

Dr. Shagufta Bano Chief Medical Officer (DMC South)

(Member)

DETAILS OF TECHNICAL ASSESSMENT OF EACH JANITORIAL BIDDER

1- Al-Basit Facilities Management (Pvt) Ltd.

S.#	Criteria for Evaluation of Janitorial Bid (T.E.R)	Total Marks	Marks Obtained	Remarks
	Janitorial Services Experience I. 05 to 10 Years of Firm similar nature of assignment experience (10 Marks) II. 03 to 05 Years of Firm similar nature of assignment experience (06 Marks) III. 01 to 03 Years of Firm similar nature of assignment experience (04 Marks)	10	10	Ten Year Experience in janitorial Services.
1	Company Profile Previous experience in similar nature of works of last five (03) years particularly–Must submit the Acceptance Letters, Work Orders, Agreements Copy, Performance certificates from departments and all clients MUST be attached. (Submission of atleast 03 similar nature project, each project with Minimum Cost of Rs 10.0 Million per Year shall be provided with 10 marks Each)	30	20	Copies attached (
2	Janitorial Plan for Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfua, Civil Hospital, Karachi covering all activities provided in the Tender Documents as given below 1. Sweeping of Roads and Open Spaces (05 Marks) 2. Internal Department Cleaning and Disinfection including Washing of Operation Theatre and similar departments (05 Marks) 3. Disposal of Municipal Solid Waste Being generated from the facility (2.5 Marks) 4. Daily cleaning of all Toilets, Biannual cleaning of Septic Tanks, sewer system etc (2.5 Marks) 5. Disposal of Infectious Waste (05 Marks)	15	07	Plan is not Comprehensive. Septic tank and sewer system Cleaning plan not included.





	Eligible / Non-Eligible		E	ligible
6	Total	100 Marks	72 Marks	
5	Financial stability showing and submitting through; i. Bank Statements for the last One years, ii. Professional Tax certificates of last three (03) years, iii. Audited Financial Statements of last three (03) Years, and iv. Annual income tax returns for minimum period of last three (03) years. NOTE: Every required financial document has specific points (10 marks per year) to be calculated for evaluation of the firm, therefore attach all required documents.	30	30	Copies attached
4	Client List / Relevant Experience/Previous year performance in Hospital (Mandatory) – 2.5 Marks for each Hospital information of atleast 02 Hospital Provided	05	0	Hospitals information no Provided
3	List of Machinery / Equipments (which will be utilized by the Contractor in Hospital) as specified in Annexure B or equivalent by Contractor	05	05	Attached

Minimum Qualifying Marks are 65 Marks out of 100 Marks

Dr. Rubina Bashir. Addl. Medical Superintendent,

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi.

(Chairman)

Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya Addl. Medical Superintendent, (Planning & Development)

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi (Member)

Dr. Shagufta Bano **Chief Medical Officer (DMC South)** (Member)

2- MASTER MULTI-TECH

S. #	Criteria for Evaluation of Janitorial Bid (T.E.R)	Total Marks	Marks Obtained	Remarks
	Janitorial Services Experience IV. 05 to 10 Years of Firm similar nature of assignment experience (10 Marks) V. 03 to 05 Years of Firm similar nature of assignment experience (06 Marks) VI. 01 to 03 Years of Firm similar nature of assignment experience (04 Marks)	10	10	Sixteen Year Experience in janitorial Services.
1	Company Profile Previous experience in similar nature of works of last five (03) years particularly—Must submit the Acceptance Letters, Work Orders, Agreements Copy, Performance certificates from departments and all clients MUST be attached. (Submission of atleast 03 similar nature project, each project with Minimum Cost of Rs 10.0 Million per Year shall be provided with 10 marks Each)	30	20	Copies attached
2	Janitorial Plan for Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfua, Civil Hospital, Karachi covering all activities provided in the Tender Documents as given below 6. Sweeping of Roads and Open Spaces (05 Marks) 7. Internal Department Cleaning and Disinfection including Washing of Operation Theatre and similar departments (05 Marks) 8. Disposal of Municipal Solid Waste Being generated from the facility (2.5 Marks) 9. Daily cleaning of all Toilets, Biannual cleaning of Septic Tanks, sewer system etc (2.5 Marks) 10. Disposal of Infectious Waste (05 Marks)	20	15	Plan is not Comprehensive. Septic tank and sewer system Cleaning plan not included.
3	List of Machinery / Equipments (which will be utilized by the Contractor in Hospital) as specified in	05	05	Copies Attached





	Eligible / Non-Eligible	Eligible			
6	Total	100 Marks	85 Marks		
5	Financial stability showing and submitting through; v. Bank Statements for the last One years, vi. Professional Tax certificates of last three (03) years, vii. Audited Financial Statements of last three (03) Years, and viii. Annual income tax returns for minimum period of last three (03) years. NOTE: Every required financial document has specific points (10 marks per year) to be calculated for evaluation of the firm, therefore attach all required documents.	30	30	Copies attached	
4	Annexure B or equivalent by Contractor Client List / Relevant Experience/Previous year performance in Hospital (Mandatory) – 2.5 Marks for each Hospital information of atleast 02 Hospital Provided	05	05	Copies Attached	

Minimum Qualifying Marks are 65 Marks out of 100 Marks

CONCLUSION:

As per evaluation the following bidder and firms technically qualified against the NITs of janitorial works published in Newspaper.

- 1- M/s Al-Basit Facilities Management (Pvt) Ltd.
- 2- M/s Master Multi-Tech Pvt. Ltd.

Dr. Rubina Bashir. Addl. Medical Superintendent,

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi.

(Chairman)

Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya Addl. Medical Superintendent,

(Planning & Development)

Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital Karachi (Member) Dr. Shagufta Bano Chief Medical Officer (DMC South) (Member)



No./MS/CHK/2017-2018/ Dr. Ruth K.M.Pfau, Civil Hospital, Baba-e-Urdu Raod, Karachi Dated: , 2017

MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING FOR OPENING OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS FOR CLEANLINESS / JANITORIAL SERVICES WORKS AT DR. RUTH K.M. PFAU, CIVIL HOSPITAL KARACHI"

The meeting of Procurement Committee was held for opening of Technical Proposals/RFP' on dated 15-12-2017 at 12:00 PM in the presence of committee members and the bidders who participated in the bid at the office of the Additional Medical Superintendent (Procurement), 1st Floor, Admin Block of Civil Hospital, Karachi. Following members attended the meeting:-

Participants:

1- Additional Medical Superintendent (Proc.), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi Chairman

2- Additional M.S (Planning & Development) Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi Member/ Secretary

3- Chief Medical Officer, DMC (South)

Member

Minutes of Meeting:

- It was informed to the committee members that the following two firms are submitted their proposals/ bids in a given scheduled dated & time against NIT for Cleanliness / Janitorial Services Works at Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi
 - 1- M/s Al-Basit Facilities Management Pvt. Ltd
 - 2- M/s Master Multi Tech Pvt. Ltd.
- The Technical proposals of aforementioned submitted firms were opened in the presence of committee members and representative of participated bidders.



- Afterwards, it was decided that consultant for Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau Civil Hospital will initially evaluated the technical proposals as per the criteria and requirements mentioned in the bidding document and then onward present the evaluation to committee in the technical evaluation meeting.
- The meeting ended with the vote of thanks to and from the chair.

01	Dr. Rubina Bashir, Additional Medical Superintendent (Proc.), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi	D
02	Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya, ional Medical Superintendent (P&D), Dr. Ruth K.M. Pfau, Civil Hospital, Karachi	Piri
03	Dr. Shagufta Bano, Chief Medical Officer, DMC South	

A Procurement Committee meeting held on 15-12-2017 at 11.00 am in the Committee Room of Civil Hospital, Karachi under the Chairmanship of Dr., Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi to open the **Technical Bids** to provide **Janitorial Services** at Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi for one year (Extendable for further period on performance basis).

The following Officers have attended the meeting:

S.NO	NAME OF OFFICER(s)	SIGNATURE
1	Dr. Rubina Bashir Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi (Chairperson)	29
2	Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya Addl. Medical Superintendent (P&D) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi (Member)	23
3	Representative of Local Government Addl. Medical Superintendent (P&D) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi (Member)	Davo .

Dated: 15-12-2017

A Procurement Committee meeting held on 15-12-2017 at 11.00 am in the Committee Room of Civil Hospital, Karachi under the Chairmanship of Dr., Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi to open the **Technical Bids** to provide **Janitorial Services** at Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi for one year (Extendable for further period on performance basis).

The following Service Providers / Firms have attended the meeting:

S.NO	NAME OF REPRESENTATIVE	SIGNATURE
1	MASIGR Mell' Tech	0333-34833-22
2	AL-BASIT	Conjest 03/2-2284839
1		and a few
1		



Dated: 29-12-2017

A Procurement Committee meeting held on 29-12-2017 at 11.00 am in the Committee Room of Civil Hospital, Karachi under the Chairmanship of Dr., Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi to open the **Financial Bids** to provide **Janitorial Services** at Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi for one year (Extendable for further period on performance basis).

The following Officers have attended the meeting:

S.NO	NAME OF OFFICER(s)	SIGNATURE
1	Dr. Rubina Bashir Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi (Chairperson)	29-
2	Dr. Syeda Rifat Suraya Addl. Medical Superintendent (P&D) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi (Member)	Bi .
3	Representative of Local Government Addl. Medical Superintendent (P&D) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi (Member)	By a

Dated: 29-12-2017

A Procurement Committee meeting held on 29-12-2017 at 11.00 am in the Committee Room of Civil Hospital, Karachi under the Chairmanship of Dr., Addl. Medical Superintendent (Procurement) Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi to open the **Financial Bids** to provide **Janitorial Services** at Dr. Ruth K.M Pfau, Civil Hospital Karachi for one year (Extendable for further period on performance basis).

The following Service Providers / Firms have attended the meeting:

S.NO	NAME OF REPRESENTATIVE	SIGNATURE
2	MASTER Mulli Tecle	0333-24837-82
2	AL-BASIF	Coff 03/2-1284839
7		
/		1
1		

