

**CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND FROM NORTH
SIDE OF MALIR RIVER**

APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY (20 MARKS)

S. No	Name of Firm	Understanding of Scope (2 Marks)	Comments on TOR (5 Marks)	Risk and Mitigation (1 Mark)	Methodology (5 Marks)	WBS (1 Mark)	Staffing Schedule (3 Marks)	General Presentation (2 Marks)	Total Marks
1	BM Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	1	0	0	5	1	3	2	12
2	G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.	2	0	0	4	1	2	2	11
3	National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd.	2	5	0	6	1	3	2	19
4	Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd.	2	0	0	5	1	3	2	13

[Signature]

Enclosure 1

**SURVEY AND FEASIBILITY STUDY OF REALIGNMENT OF PROTECTION BUND
FROM NORTH SIDE OF THE MALIR REVER.**

Sr, No.	Name of Company	CRITERIA FOR SHORT LISTING OF CONSULTANTS.					Total points obtained	Remarks
		General Experience	Relevant Experience	Personal	Relevant past performance	Current commitments		
		Maximum Points (Total 100)						
01	G-3 Engineering Consultant Pvt. Limited	20	40	30	05	05	95	Qualified
02	Associate & Consulting Engineering Pvt. Limited.	20	40	20	05	05	90	Qualified
03	M.M. P. Pakistan Pvt. Limited	20	40	25	05	05	95	Qualified
04	Usmania & Co. Pvt. Limited	20	25	25	05	05	80	Qualified
05	Engineering General Consultant Pvt. Limited	20	30	30	05	05	90	Qualified
06	NESPAK	20	40	30	05	05	100	Qualified
07	B.M. Consulting Pvt. Limited	20	25	20	05	05	75	Qualified

Deputy Secretary (Tech)
W&S Department
Member

Chief PR&H,
Planning &
Development
Department Member

Additional Secretary (Dev)
Finance Department
Member

Additional Secretary
(Tech)
Irrigation Department
Member

Executive Engineer
Coastal Highways Division
Hyderabad
Member/Secretary



OFFICE OF THE
COMMISSIONER KARACHI DIVISION /
PROJECT DIRECTOR

Enclosure 'II'

CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF
BUND FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR RIVER


BID EVALUATION REPORT

FINAL SCORING

(Formula: $S = ST \times T(90)\% + SF \times F(10)\%$)

S #	NAME OF FIRMS	FORMULA CALCULATION	FINANCIAL CUM TECHNICAL SCORE
01	M/s. B.M. Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	Not Technically Qualified so Financial Bid not Announced	
02	M/s. G-3 Engineering Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd., Lahore.	$77.08 \times 90\% + 100 \times 10\%$ $= 69.372 + 10$	79.372
03	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	$96.91 \times 90\% + 56.182 \times 10\%$ $= 87.219 + 5.620$	92.819
04	M/s. Associated Consulting Engineers – ACE (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	$78.70 \times 90\% + 22.495 \times 10\%$ $70.83 + 2.250$	73.08

Recommendation:- On the basis of Technical cum Financial Evaluation, as per criteria mentioned in the Bidding Documents, the highest scoring bidder i.e M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Limited is recommended to be award the consultancy works.


Addl. Secretary (Tech) Irrigation Dept.,
GOS. Member


Addl. Secretary (Dev) FD, GOS
Member


Dy. Secretary (Tech) Works & Services
Dept., GOS
Member


Chief (PP&H) P&D Dept. GOS
Member


XEN, Coastal Highway, Hyderabad
Member Secretary

FINANCIAL BID POSITION

S #	NAME OF FIRMS	BID AMOUNT	TECHNICAL EVALUATED MARKS
01	M/s. B.M. Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	Not Technically Qualified so Financial Bid not Announced	60.04
02	M/s. G-3 Engineering Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd, Lahore.	Rs. 66,80,000/-	77.08
03	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	Rs. 1,18,89,774/-	96.91
04	M/s. Associated Consulting Engineers – ACE (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	Rs. 2,96,94,209/-	78.70

15/5/21



FINANCIAL SCORING

(Formula: $SF = 100 \times \frac{Fm}{\text{Lowest Bidder}}$)
F (Specified Bidder)

S #	NAME OF FIRMS	FORMULA CALCULATION	POINTS
01	M/s. B.M. Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	Not Technically Qualified so Financial Bid not Announced	
02	M/s. G-3 Engineering Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd., Lahore.	$100 \times \frac{66,80,000}{66,80,000}$	100
03	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	$100 \times \frac{66,80,000}{1,18,89,774}$	56.182
04	M/s. Associated Consulting Engineers – ACE (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	$100 \times \frac{66,80,000}{2,96,94,209}$	22.495




CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR RIVER

SUMMARY

S. No	Name of Firm	Company Profile	Project Team	Approach and Methodology	GRAND TOTAL
		40 Marks		40 Marks	
1	BM Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	17.00	31.04	12.00	60.04
2	G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.	32.00	34.08	11.00	77.08
3	National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd.	40.00	37.91	19.00	96.91
4	Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd.	32.00	33.70	13.00	78.70

NOTE:

1. Financial Bid for BM Consulting Engineers shall not be opened. They did not qualify in Initial Scrutiny as their PEC Certificate is not valid. After further evaluation, they did not meet the minimum 50% criteria in Company Profile and they also get the cumulative marks below 70%, hence disqualified in Evaluation as well.

2. Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd are conditionally qualified. They did not qualify in Initial Scrutiny as they did not submit their PEC Certificate. Financial Bid for Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd. shall be opened if they submit a valid PEC Certificate.

Addl. Secretary (Tech) Irrigation Dept., GOS, Member

Dy-Secretary (Tech) Works & Services Dept., GOS Member

Chief (PP&H) P&D Dept. GOS Member

Addl. Secretary (Dev) RD, GOS, Member

XFN, Coastal Highway, Hyderabad Member / Secretary

Enclosure III

**CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND
FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR RIVER**

INITIAL SCRUTINY/ MANDATORY REQUIREMENT

S. No	Name of Firm	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council		Validity	Details of Similar Projects	Cost in Millions	Result
		Category 1205	Yes				
1	BM Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	Yes	31-Dec-2011	Supervision and monitoring of four number Irrigation Bund in Thar region (In Progress)	PKR 140.00	Not Qualified	
				Sindh Water Sector Improvement Project Phase - 1 (In Progress)	PKR 77.00		
				Feasibility Study for Transition of SCARP tube wells to Private Sector Phase - 1	PKR 475.00		
2	G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.	Yes	31-Dec-2012	Providing Stone Pitching and Strengthening FP Bund and Constructing 2 Nos. Landries, SMB Division Sindh	PKR 681.00	Qualified	
				Raising/ Strengthening of LS Bund and Construction of Guage Pillars, Sourthern Dadu Division, Sindh	PKR 464.00		
				Raising of Manchar Containing Bank to Design Level and Stone Pitching, Shahbaz Irrigation Division, Sindh	PKR 472.00		

10/12/11

[Signature]

**CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND
FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR RIVER**

INITIAL SCRUTINY/ MANDATORY REQUIREMENT

S. No	Name of Firm	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council		At least three (3) projects with cumulative cost of PKR 500 Million including one (1) project with cost of PKR 300 Million	Result
		Category	Validity		
3	National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd.	Yes	31-Dec-2012	Details of Similar Projects	Cost in Millions
				Mangla Dam Raising Project	PKR 102,000.00
				Quick Impact Project in South Waziristan Agency	PKR 11,931.00
4	Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd.	Not Provided	Not Provided	Punjab Irrigated Agricultural Investment Program	PKR 275,800.00
				Preparation of Feasibility Studies for Rehabilitation and Modernization of Sukkur Barrage, Detailed Design & Tender Documents and for supervision of Construction Works	PKR 3,885.00
				Construction Supervision & Contract Management of Toiwar/ Batozai Storage Dam	PKR 912.50
				Mangla Dam Raising Project	PKR 102,000.00
					Not Qualified

15/12

[Signature]

CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR

RIVER

COMPANY PROFILE (40 MARKS)

S. No	Name of Firm	Details of Similar Projects	Cost in Millions	Marks Obtained	Value of Similar Assignments (Consultancy Fee of Completed Projects ≥ Rs 100 M - 8 Marks, 50 M to 10 M - 6 Marks, Less than 10 M - 4 Marks)		Annual Turnover of the Firm (PKR 500 M and more - 8 Marks, 300 M to 500 M - 6 Marks, Less than 300 M - 4 Marks)	Organizational Structure - Full time staff (> 300 = 8 Marks, > 200 = 6 Marks, < 200 = 0 to 4 Marks)		TOTAL MARKS OUT OF 40	
					Consultancy Fees in Millions	Marks Obtained		Marks Obtained	No		Marks Obtained
1	GM Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	Feasibility Study for Transition of SCARP tube wells to Private Sector Phase - 1	PKR 475.00	8	18.99	6	Audited Balance Sheets not submitted	0	109	3	17
		Engineering Services for rehabilitation of Old Cross Regulators along Rohri Main Canal (almost completed)	PKR 180.00		7.25						
		Providing Stone Pitching and Strengthening FP Bund and Constructing 2 Nos. Landfills. SMB Division Sindh	PKR 691.00		26.55						
		Raising/ Strengthening of LS Bund and Construction of Gauge Pillars. Southern Dadu Division, Sindh	PKR 464.00		18.11						
2	G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.	Raising and Strengthening of Earthwork along BU Bund Sukkor Division Sindh	PKR 440.00	16	17.16	8	Audited Balance Sheets not submitted	0	362	8	32
		River Bank Protection and Land Reclamation in Khaini Shereef and adjoining areas of District Mirpur, Azad Kashmir	PKR 697.00		23.90						
		Raising of Manchar Containing Bank to Design Level and Stone Pitching, Shahbaz Irigaton Division, Sindh	PKR 472.00		18.40						

PKR/

CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR

RIVER

COMPANY PROFILE (40 MARKS)

S. No	Name of Firm	Details of Similar Projects	Cost in Millions	Marks Obtained	Value of Similar Assignments (Consultancy Fee of Completed Projects ≥ Rs 100 M - 8 Marks, 50 M to 10 M - 6 Marks, Less than 10 M - 4 Marks)		Annual Turnover of the Firm (PKR 500 M and more - 8 Marks, 300 M to 500 M - 6 Marks, Less than 300 M - 4 Marks)	Organizational Structure - Full time staff (> 300 = 8 Marks, > 200 = 6 Marks, < 200 = 0 to 4 Marks)	TOTAL MARKS OUT OF 40		
					Consultancy Fees in Millions	Marks Obtained					
3	National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd.	Mangla Dam Raising Project	PKR 102,000.00	16	867.00	8	5,500	1934	8	40	
		Kachhi Canal Project Phase - 1	PKR 36,023.00		473.00						
		National Program for Improvement of Water Courses in Punjab, Pakistan	PKR 26,220.00		712.00						
		Mega Irrigation Project Punjab	PKR 52,000.00		438.00						
		Rehabilitation Lower Chenab Canal Project	PKR 9,142.00		544.00						
4	Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd	Feasibility Study for the Survey & Designing of Surface Drainage for the part Command Area of Mitharo, Khirpor and Lower Nara Canal	PKR 750.00	16	30.00	8	Audited Balance Sheets not submitted	0	700	8	32
		Mirani Dam Project	PKR 4,250.00		113.42						
		Al-Khard Dam	PKR 2,100.00		84.00						
		Beris Dam Project - Malaysia	PKR 370.00		14.80						
		Porali Dam - Lasbela	PKR 490.00		19.60						

15/1/20



CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF SURVEY, FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DESIGN FOR RE-ALIGNMENT OF BUND FROM NORTH SIDE OF MALIR RIVER

PROJECT TEAM (40 MARKS)

S. No	Name of Firm	Team Leader (12 marks)		Hydraulic Design Engineer (09 marks)		GIS Specialist (07 marks)		Geotechnical Engineer (07 marks)		Environmental Engineer (05 marks)		TOTAL MARKS
		Education (10 Marks) PhD = 100% MSc = 75% BSc = 60%	Experience (30 Marks) General Experience = 20 Yrs or more (30%) Specific Experience = 15 Yrs or more (70%)	Education (10 Marks) PhD = 100% MSc = 75% BSc = 60%	Experience (30 Marks) General Experience = 20 Yrs or more (30%) Specific Experience = 15 Yrs or more (70%)	Education (10 Marks) PhD = 100% MSc = 75% BSc = 60%	Experience (30 Marks) General Experience = 20 Yrs or more (30%) Specific Experience = 15 Yrs or more (70%)	Education (10 Marks) PhD = 100% MSc = 75% BSc = 60%	Experience (30 Marks) General Experience = 20 Yrs or more (30%) Specific Experience = 15 Yrs or more (70%)	Education (10 Marks) PhD = 100% MSc = 75% BSc = 60%	Experience (30 Marks) General Experience = 20 Yrs or more (30%) Specific Experience = 15 Yrs or more (70%)	
1	EM Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	1.60	9.00	2.25	6.75	1.05	0.24	1.31	5.25	1.25	2.14	31.04
			10.80		9.00		1.29		6.56		3.39	
2	G3 Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.	3.00	5.70	1.68	6.75	1.31	5.26	1.75	5.25	1.25	2.14	34.08
			8.70		8.44		6.56		7.00		3.39	
3	National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd.	3.00	9.00	2.25	6.75	1.31	3.89	1.75	6.25	1.25	3.47	37.91
			12.00		9.00		5.20		7.00		4.72	
4	Associated Consulting Engineers - ACE (Pvt) Ltd.	3.00	9.00	2.25	6.75	1.05	0.40	1.31	5.25	0.94	3.75	33.70
			12.00		9.00		1.45		6.56		4.69	