

5

**EVALUATION REPORT OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE ON THE  
TENDER PROCEEDINGS HELD ON 08-06-2011 AT 2.30 P.M..**

The Regional Directorate of Food, Karachi / Procuring Agency invited bids from the interested parties for transportation of wheat from District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad, Sanghar & Shikarpur to Karachi for the period up to 28-02-2012, vide this office Tender Notice No. A/C(F-I)/Annual Tender/2011-12/2011/911 dated 21-05-2011. The Tender notice was published in Daily "Dawn" dated 25-05-2011, "Juraat" dated 24-05-2011, "Ibrat" dated 25-05-2011 and "Intikhab" dated 24-05-2011. The tender was opened on the scheduled date and time i.e. 08-06-2011 at 2.30 p.m.

It is however to mention that above tenders were called in view of the action taken against M/s Rana Rashid Ali Khan & Co, in the light of report of the Procurement committee dated 07-06-2011, who were appeared as lowest bidders for District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad and Sanghar, in the tenders opened on 10-05-2011 but failed to execute agreement and started work, even after various notices sent to them by the procuring agency.

However, in all 29-tender forms were issued by the Regional Directorate of Food, Karachi to various parties for District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad and Sanghar, while no any party purchased Tender Form for District Shikarpur. The tenders were opened in presence of the committee members, whereas participants or their representatives were also present. The comparative statement was prepared on spot which was signed by all the members, as well as chairman of the committee.

The Committee discussed on the rates offered by the parties on 08-06-2011, as well in the last tenders held on 10-05-2011 for transportation of wheat from District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad & Sanghar to Karachi, in comparison with the last two years rates and the position appeared is as under:-

*Handwritten notes on the left side of the table:*  
 8/6/2011  
 [Signature]  
 [Signature]  
 8/6/2011

S.No	Name of Parties offered lowest rates on 08-06-2011	District	Lowest rate offered on 08-06-2011	Lowest rate offered on 10-05-2011	Approved Rate for the year 2009-10	Approved Rate for the year 2010-11	Ratio of increase / decrease
1.	M/s Sharja Trading Co.	Khairpur	121.95	89.00	98.30	108	12.87
2.	M/s Noor Rice.	S.Benazirabad	94.73	86.00	98.00	106	-10.63
3.	M/s Divine Commodities	Sanghar	115.00	94.00	95.00	104	10.58

In view of above, the committee observed that lowest offered rates for District Khairpur, Nawabshah (S. Benazirabad) and Sanghar appears reasonable with ratio of increase from 10% to 12% for District Khairpur and Sanghar, while rate of S.Benazirabad is below last year rate up to -10.63%.

Cont. p/2

It was also considered that the process of re-tendering has already taken sufficient time, as the 1st tender was opened on 29-03-2011, which was cancelled due to high rates, 2<sup>nd</sup> tender was held on 10-05-2011, but the lowest bidder failed to execute agreement and start work and now this tender has been invited 3<sup>rd</sup> time, besides the stocks of fresh crop in these Districts are lying in open, under threat of weather, therefore, the committee is of the opinion that the rates as offered by the parties on 08-06-2011, as mentioned bellow, are reasonable looking to present market situation and frequent increase in the diesel prices and recommended to be approved by the Procuring Authority.

S.No	Name of Parties offered lowest rates on 08-06-2011	District	Lowest rate offered on 08-06-2011
1.	M/s Sharja Trading Co.	Khairpur	121.95
2.	M/s Noor Rice.	S.Benazirabad	94.73
3.	M/s Divine Commodities	Sanghar	115.00

  
(WAHEED AHMED)  
AAO/RAO (Member)

  
(NOORUDDIN LARK)  
B&AO Food (Member)

  
(NAZAR HUSSAIN SHAHANI)  
Section Officer (Budget),  
S&GAD (Member)

  
(AMANULLAH JUMANI)  
Deputy Director Food, Karachi  
(Chairman) 8/6/11

**EVALUATION REPORT OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE ON THE  
TENDER PROCEEDINGS HELD ON 08-06-2011 AT 2.30 P.M..**

The Regional Directorate of Food, Karachi / Procuring Agency invited bids from the interested parties for transportation of wheat from District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad, Sanghar & Shikarpur to Karachi for the period up to 28-02-2012, vide this office Tender Notice No. A/C(F-I)/Annual Tender/2011-12/2011/911 dated 21-05-2011. The Tender notice was published in Daily "Dawn" dated 25-05-2011, "Juraat" dated 24-05-2011, "Ibrat" dated 25-05-2011 and "Intikhab" dated 24-05-2011. The tender was opened on the scheduled date and time i.e. 08-06-2011 at 2.30 p.m.

It is however to mention that above tenders were called in view of the action taken against M/s Rana Rashid Ali Khan & Co, in the light of report of the Procurement committee dated 07-06-2011, who were appeared as lowest bidders for District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad and Sanghar, in the tenders opened on 10-05-2011 but failed to execute agreement and started work, even after various notices sent to them by the procuring agency.

However, in all 29-tender forms were issued by the Regional Directorate of Food, Karachi to various parties for District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad and Sanghar, while no any party purchased Tender Form for District Shikarpur. The tenders were opened in presence of the committee members, whereas participants or their representatives were also present. The comparative statement was prepared on spot which was signed by all the members, as well as chairman of the committee.

The Committee discussed on the rates offered by the parties on 08-06-2011, as well in the last tenders held on 10-05-2011 for transportation of wheat from District Khairpur, S.Benazirabad & Sanghar to Karachi, in comparison with the last two years rates and the position appeared is as under:-

S.No	Name of Parties offered lowest rates on 08-06-2011	District	Lowest rate offered on 08-06-2011	Lowest rate offered on 10-05-2011	Approved Rate for the year 2009-10	Approved Rate for the year 2010-11	Ratio of increase / decrease.
1.	M/s Sharja Trading Co.	Khairpur	121.95	89.00	98.30	108	12.87
2.	M/s Noor Rice.	S.Benazirabad	94.73	86.00	98.00	106	-10.63
3.	M/s Divine Commodities	Sanghar	115.00	94.00	95.00	104	10.58

In view of above, the committee observed that lowest offered rates for District Khairpur, Nawabshah (S. Benazirabad) and Sanghar appears reasonable with ratio of increase from 10% to 12% for District Khairpur and Sanghar, while rate of S.Benazirabad is below last year rate up to -10.63%.


Cont. p/2


It was also considered that the process of re-tendering has already taken sufficient time, as the 1st tender was opened on 29-03-2011, which was cancelled due to high rates, 2<sup>nd</sup> tender was held on 10-05-2011, but the lowest bidder failed to execute agreement and start work and now this tender has been invited 3<sup>rd</sup> time, besides the stocks of fresh crop in these Districts are lying in open, under threat of weather, therefore, the committee is of the opinion that the rates as offered by the parties on 08-06-2011, as mentioned bellow, are reasonable looking to present market situation and frequent increase in the diesel prices and recommended to be approved by the Procuring Authority.

S.No	Name of Parties offered lowest rates on 08-06-2011	District	Lowest rate offered on 08-06-2011
1.	M/s Sharja Trading Co.	Khairpur	121.95
2.	M/s Noor Rice.	S.Benazirabad	94.73
3.	M/s Divine Commodities	Sanghar	115.00

  
(WAHEED AHMED)  
AAO/RAO (Member)

  
(NOORUDDIN FARUK)  
B&AO Food (Member)

  
(NAZAR HUSSAIN SHAHANI)  
Section Officer (Budget),  
S&GAD (Member)

  
(AMANULLAH JUMANI)  
Deputy Director Food, Karachi 876711  
(Chairman)