

No. NSUSC/O&S/Proc./ICB/2011/ 1655

Dated: 18 Jan. 2011

BID EVALUATION REPORT

PROCUREMENT OF SOLID WASTE COLLECTION EQUIPMENT

Loan No. : ADB Loan 2499-PAK, Sindh Cities Investment Improvement Program-Project 1.

Contract No. : C2-SWCE-01

North Sindh Urban Service Corporation (NSUSC) Limited's invitation for Bid for the "Procurement of Solid Waste Collection Equipment" was advertised in daily "Kawish" on 17 Oct. 2010 and in daily "Dawn" on 18 Oct. 2010. The IFB was also hoisted over Asian Development Bank (ADB) and NSUSC website. The principal funding source for financing this procurement is a loan from the ADB. The mode of this procurement was International Competitive bidding under ADB's One-Stage Two Envelope bidding procedure.

2. Following two bidders out of 04 who purchased the bidding document participated in the bidding procedure and submitted its proposal before the submission deadline of 11 AM on 02 Dec. 2010. As such, under two envelope bidding only technical proposals of these bidders were opened before the NSUSC procurement committee, representative of bidders, and public/stake holders at 11:15 AM on 02 Dec. 2010, .

Bidder A: M/s. Hinopak-CHIL JV

Bidder B: M/s Automobile Corporation (Pvt.) Ltd

3. The procurement comprised of following two lots and for each lot separate bid security was called from the bidders.

Lot 1 : 33 Nos. Side Loading Trucks Including 430 Nos., 3.5m³ SKips

Lot 2 : 07 Nos. Rear Loading Trucks Including 90 Nos. ,7m³ Skips

4. Evaluation of 1st Stage Proposals were carried by NSUSC Procurement Committee, assisted by International Consultant M/s. Posch and Partners, Austria. Following are the results of 1st stage technical proposal evaluation.

Name of Bidder	Lot No.1	Lot No. 2
Bidder A: M/s. CHIL-Hinopak JV	Technically Non-responsive*	Substantially Responsive
Bidder B: M/s Automobile Corporation (Pvt) Ltd.	Substantially Responsive	Substantially Responsive

* The shape and skip container design for Lot 1 submitted by the Bidder A is not substantially responsive as required under Section-VI of the bidding document. As such "i) During the discharging the skip wall adjacent the discharging edge must have a minimum tilt angle of 50 (with the discharging edge being the lowest point of the skip)", ii) Minimum length: 1.9 m +/- 1%, Maximum length 2.3 m +/- 1% but not greater than the width of the truck chassis". . The Bidder A vide his clarification to the evaluation query in this respect could not satisfy the condition thus his bid for lot 1 is not accepted.

5. The price proposal opening as per above evaluation results was set on 11 Dec. 2010. Both the bidders were accordingly informed about the price proposal opening vide NSUSC letter Nos. NSUSC/O&S/Proc./ICB/2010/1420 & 1421 dated 09 Dec. 2010. The **Bidder A** was informed about technical evaluation results in respect of its bid for Lot 1 found as technically non-responsive vide letter No. NSUSC/O&S/Proc./ICB/2010/1433 dated 11 Dec. 2010. As such the price proposal of **Bidder A** was not disclosed/announced in price proposal opening held on 11 Dec. 2010 at 13:00 hrs at Committee Room, NSUSC head office.

6. The results of price proposal opening and evaluation of the same is given as under:

Lot 1 (33 Nos. Side Loading Trucks including 430 Nos. , 3.5 m³ skips)

Name of Bidder	As Opened in Pak Rupees	Evaluated Cost in Pak Rupees	Ranking
Bidder A (M/s. CHIL-Hinopak JV)**	-	-	-
Bidder B (M/s. Automobile Corp. Ltd)	166,000,000/-	166,000,000/-	1

** Bidder A found technically non-responsive for Lot 1.

Lot 2 (7 Nos. Rear Loading Trucks including 90 Nos, 7, m³ skips)

Name of Bidder	As Opened in Pak Rupees	Evaluated Cost in Pak Rupees	Ranking
Bidder A (M/s. CHIL-Hinopak JV)	39,175,000/-	39,175,000/-	1
Bidder B (M/s. Automobile Corp. Ltd)	41,000,000/-	41,000,000/-	2

7. Name of the winning bidder, and its price offered

A)	M/s. CHIL-HinoPak JV	Lot 2 (7 Nos. rear loading trucks including 90 Nos., 7m ³ Skips)	RKR. 39.175 Million
B)	M/s. Automobile Corporation Ltd.	Lot 1 (33 Nos. Side Loading Trucks including 430 Nos, 3.5 m ³ Skips)	PKR 166.0 Million

8. Summary Scope of the project:

The procurement comprises Solid waste collection equipment for secondary collection system (vehicles and skip containers) to NSUSC be delivered to NSUSC regional offices/operational areas at cities of Sukkur, New Sukkur, Rohri, Khairpur, Larkana, and Shikarpur (TMAs).


(Nayyar Hussain)
Procurement & Contract
Specialist


(Muhammad Ali Sheikh)
Manager Capital Works


(Naveed Akhtar)
Manager Finance


(Abid Hussainy)
Director (O&S)