

## OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION THAR @ MITHL

No: TC/G-55/ 765 Provincial Highway Division, Thar @ Mithi, dated: 23 / 08 /2016.

Subject:- PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 23-08-2016.

A Meeting of the procurement committee was held in the office of the Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi Under the chairmanship of Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi.

2. The below mentioned members of committee attended the meeting to discuss the bids invited for the procurement of works vide Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi letter No. TC/G-55/712 dated: 03-08-2016 and subsequently hoisted on the website of Sindh Public Procurement Regularity Authority and Information Technology Department Government of Sindh.

Following attended the meeting:

Niaz Ahmed Memon Chairman
Executive Engineer,
Provincial Highway Division,
Thar @ Mithi.

2 Riaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer, Education Works Division, Tharparkar@Mithi.

Member

3 Ayoub Kaim Khani Assistant Engineer, Provincial Highway Sub-Division, Thar-I@Mithi. Member

- During the course of meeting following discussion were made by the committee.
  - i The tenders were received back from the bidders on dated: 23-08-2016 @ 12.00 noon and opened @ 1.00 PM before the Procurement Committee in presence of representatives of participants.
  - The methods for bidding documents observed as single envelop.
  - iii. The tenders were opened on 23-08-2016 before the tender opening Committee.
- 4. The Committee was informed that the NIT contains 02 works, the bidding documents for above works have been purchased by the bidders upto 22-08-2016 and receiving back their tender



documents today on 23-08-2016 upto 1:00 noon in the office of Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi.

During the opening of tender received, following status was found.

Sr. No.	Name of Firms	Ranking in terms of Cost	Remarks
1.	M/s Fazal & Brothers	Lowest	Accepted
2.	M/s Haseeb & Tahseem	Highest	Rejected
3.	M/s Harish & Co.	Highest	Rejected
4.	M/s Khalil Engineering Wo:ks	Highest	Rejected
5.	M/s Khokhar Brothers	Highest	Rejected

6. The Committee thoroughly scrutinized each case/tender documents, comparing mathematically and financially with sanctioned estimates / bill of quantities and criteria for determining minimum qualification as per bidding documents.

#### 7. Recommendation

After Due deliberation / scrutiny of each tender document by the committee it was recommended that lowest evaluated responsive bidder may be awarded the respective tender.

#### 8. Decision

In view of Para No. 7 of this report it is decided that tenders are being awarded to above mentioned lowest responsive bidder accordingly.

Ayoub Kain Khani Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division

Thar-I @ Mithi

Riaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Education Works Division Tharparkar (2) Mithi Niaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division

Thar @ Mithi

#### **Bid Evaluation Report**

Name of Procuring Agency:	Executive En	ngineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi	
Tender Reference No:	Provincial: Hi	lighway Division Thar @ Mithi No.TC/G-55/712 dated:- 0	3-08-2016
Tender Description / Name of	work / item:	Construction of Road from Village Borabah To Village Qaboolani Mile 0/0-3/1 (5.00 Kms)	i.
Method of Procruement:	Single Stage	- one envelope procedure	
Tender Published	Jejal (Sindhi) o 06.08.2016 (INF	dt: 05.08.2016, Dawn (English) Dt: 06.08.2016 & Daily Expres F_KRY_3145/16 (SPPRA S.No.29644) (SPPRA ID 2147483647)	s (Urdu) dt:
Total Bid documents Sold:		5 Nos.	
Total Bid Received		3 Nos.	
Technical Bid Opening date: (	f applicable)	N.A (Provide details in separate fro	m)
No. of Bid technically qualified	(if applicable)	N.A	
Bid(s) Rejected:		02 Nos	
Financial Bid Opening date:		23.08.2016	
	Tender Reference No:  Tender Description / Name of Method of Procruement:  Tender Published  Total Bid documents Sold:  Total Bid Received  Technical Bid Opening date: (i)  No. of Bid technically qualified  Bid(s) Rejected:	Tender Reference No:  Provincial: Formula in the second se	Tender Reference No:  Provincial: Highway Division Thar @ Mithi No.TC/G-55/712 dated:-0  Tender Description / Name of work / item:  Construction of Road from Village Borabah To Village Qaboolani Mile 0/0-3/1 (5.00 Kms)  Method of Procruement:  Single Stage - one envelope procedure  Jejal (Sindhi) dt: 05.08.2016, Dawn (English) Dt: 06.08.2016 & Daily Expres 06.08.2016 (INF_KRY_3145/16 (SPPRA S.No.29644) (SPPRA ID 2147483647)  Total Bid documents Sold:  5 Nos.  Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable)  N.A (Provide details in separate from No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable)  N.A  Bid(s) Rejected:  02 Nos

#### 12 Bid Evaluation Report:

**Estimated Cost** 

96014148

S.No.	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of Cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance / Rejection	Remarks
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	M/s Fazal & Brothers	94502429	1st Lowest	1511719 Saving	Lowest	Accepted
2	M/s Khalil Engineering Works	95145909	2nd Lowest	868239 Saving	Highest	Rejected
3	M/s Harish & Co.	95628564	3rd Lowest	385584 Saving	Highest	Rejected

Ayoub Kain Khani Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Thar-I @ Mithi

Riaz Ahmed Memon **Executive Engineer Education Works Division** Tharparkar @ Mithi

Naz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi

# COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

Date of Issue: 4p to 22/8/2016.

Date of Opening: 23 -08-70/6.

This rates quoted by M/s/	2	2.	-	NAME OF WORK:- O
Mary & Rolling - Gow	15 Hussa & E.	M/S. Khalil Engineery rock.	M/s Fazel & Rolling.	CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM VILLAGE BORABAH TO VILLAGE QABOOLANI MILE 0/0-3/1 (5.00 KMS)  Name of Contractor / Company
Government Contractor found lowest	Part 'A' Road more 0:45/ Below, part 'B' enclused, 35% About, 1	Put is culvery 33% Above to Put is P. W. 57% Above to	Pust A Road wale 1.45% Belows -, Pust B cullus 30% Above (+) Pust C I well 55% Above (+)	H TO VILLAGE QABOOLANI MILE 0/0-3/1 (5.00 KMS)

Provincial Highway Sub Division

Thar -I @ Mithi

Education Works Division

**Executive Engineer** 

Tharparkar @ Mithi

Provincial Highway Division
Thar @ Mithi

(Niaz Ahmed Memon) Executive Engineer

(Riaz Ahmed Memon)

(Ayoub Kaim Khani) Assistant Engineer

#### **Bid Evaluation Report**

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Executive En	gineer, Provincia	Highway Division Thar @ Mithi
2	Tender Reference No:	Provincial: Hi	ghway Division	har @ Mithi No.TC/G-55/712 dated:- 03-08-2016
3	Tender Description / Name of	work / item:	Construction of 0/0-1/2 (2.00 Km	Road from Village Milkam To Bhadsandha Mile is)
4	Method of Procruement:	Single Stage	one envelope p	rocedure
5	Tender Published	Jejal (Sindhi) 0 06.08.2016 (INF	tt: 05.08.2016, Daw KRY_3145/16 (SP	n (English) Dt: 06.08.2016 & Daily Express (Urdu) d PRA S.No.29644) (SPPRA ID 2147483647)
6	Total Bid documents Sold:		5 Nos.	
7	Total Bid Received		3 Nos.	
8	Technical Bid Opening date: (	if applicable)	N.A	(Provide details in separate from)
9	No. of Bid technically qualified	(if applicable)	N.A	
10	Bid(s) Rejected:	\$0	2 Ncs	
11	Financial Bid Opening date:		23.03.2016	

#### 12 Bid Evaluation Report:

**Estimated Cost** 

43399531

S.No.	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of Cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance / Rejection	Remarks
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	M/s Fazal & Brothers	42618214	1st Lowest	781317 Saving	Lowest	Accepted
2	M/s Haseeb & Tahseem	42951123	2nd Lowest	448408 Saving	Highest	Rejected
3	M/s Harish & Co	43213693	3rd Lowest	185838 Saving	Highest	Rejected

Ayoub Kain Khani Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Thar-I @ Mithi

Riaz Ahmed Memon **Executive Engineer Education Works Division** Tharparkar (2) Mithi

Naz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi

# COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

Date of Issue: 45 to 22-8-20/6 Date of Opening: 23-08-2016

NAME OF WORK:- CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM VILLAGE MILKAM TO BHADSANDHA MILE 0/0-1/2 (2.00 KMS)  Sr. No. Name of Contractor / Company  Part it Road work 1/2 Siden  Part is well - 58/2. Above  Part is well - 58/2. Above
2. M/s Hasa & 6.
m/s Fazed & Brollins

Provincial Highway Sub Division Thar –I @ Mithi **Assistant Engineer** (Ayoub Kaim Khani)

Education Works Division Tharparkar @ Mithi **Executive Engineer** 

(Riaz Ahmed Memon)

Provincial Highway Division
Thar @ Mithi **Executive Engineer** (Nidz Ahmed Memon)

# Attendance Sheet of the members of Procurement Committee for the NIT No.TC/G-55/712 dated 03-08-2016 opening date 23-08-2016

Name	Designation	Signature
1. Mr. Niaz Ahmed Memon	Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi/Chairman	Adm
2. Mr. Riaz Ahmed Memon	Executive Engineer Education Works Division Tharparkar @ Mithi/Member	23
3. Mr. Muhammad Ayoub Khaimkhani	Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Divis Thar-I @ Mithi/Member	ion Market

### **Attendance Sheet of participants Contractor**

	N11 N0.1C/G-33/12 dated 05-06 2010 opening date
1)	KHAMI Engineer WOOKS
2).	Ms Fazal & Pons.
3).	M/s Khokhax Brother. consti
4)	MIS Hasees. And Taliseen.
5)	Me House 2 6

Executive Engineers
Provingal High Way Division
That a Mithic

#### BIDDERS QUALIFICATION REPORT

1. Tender reference No.

NIT No. TC/G-55/712

dated: 03-08-2016

2. Name of Procuring Agency:

Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi.

3. Tender Description / Name of work

 Construction of Road from Village Borabah To Village Qaboolani Mile 0/0-3/1 (5.00 Kms)

 Construction of Road from Village Milkam To Bhadsandha Mile 0/0-1/2 (2.00 Kms)

4. Method of Procurement:

Single Stage- one envelope procedure

5	Name of firm / Bidder	M/s Fazal & Brothers	M/s Haseeb & Tahseem	M/s Harish & Co.	M/s Khalil Engineering Works	M/s Khokhar Brothers
6	N.T.N:	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.
7	Registration with P.E.C	Available	Available	Available	Available	Available
8	Sindh Board of Revenue	Registered	Registered	Registered	Registered	Registered
9	Relevant Experience:	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.	Not Available
10	Turnover of at least last Five years	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.	Not Available
11	Funds / Budget	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.
12	05% Earnest Money	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.	Available.
13	Tender Fee / Cost of Bidding Document	Deposited.	Deposited.	Deposited.	Deposited.	Deposited.
14	Qualified/Non- qualified.	Qualified.	Non Qualified	Non Qualified	Non Qualified	Non Qualified

Ayoub Kain Khani Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Thar-I @ Mithi

Riaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Education Works Division Tharparkar (2) Mithi

Niaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi Notice of Dissatistaction

If a Party is dissatisfied with the decision of the Engineer of consultant or if no decision is given within the time set out in Sub-Clause 15.1 here above, the Party may give notice of dissatisfaction referring to this Sub-Clause within fourteen (14) days of receipt of the decision or the expiry of the time for the decision. If no notice of dissatisfaction is given within the specified time, the decision shall be final and binding on the Parties. If notice of dissatisfaction is given within the specified time, the decision shall be binding on the Parties who shall give effect to it without delay unless and until the decision of the Engineer is revised by an arbitrator.

If a contractor is dissatisfied with the decision of the Engineer of the department or decision is not given in time then he can approach Superintending Engineer within 14 days, in case of dissatisfaction with decision of Superintending Engineer or not decided within 28 days, then arbitration process would be adopted as per clause 15.3.

#### 15.3 Arbitration

A dispute which has been the subject of a notice of dissatisfaction shall be finally settled as per provisions of Arbitration Act 1940 (Act No. X of 1940) and Rules made there under and any statutory modifications thereto. Any hearing shall be held at the place specified in the Contract Data and in the language referred to in Sub-Clause 1.5.

#### 16 INTEGRITY PACT

- 16.1 If the Contractor or any of his Sub-Contractors, agents or servants is found to have violated or involved in violation of the Integrity Pact signed by the Contractor as Schedule-F to his Bid, then the Procuring Agency shall be entitled to:
- recover from the Contractor an amount equivalent to ten times the sum of any commission, gratification, bribe, finder's fee or kickback given by the Contractor or any of his Sub-Contractors, agents or servants;
- (b) terminate the Contract; and
- (c) recover from the Contractor any loss or damage to the Procuring Agency as a result of such termination of any other corrupt business practices of the Contractor or any of his Sub-Contractors, agents or servants.

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER
PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION

THAR @ MITH

.volice of Dissatistaction

If a Party is dissatisfied with the decision of the Engineer of consultant or if no decision is given within the tune set out in Sub-Clause 15.1 here above, the Party may give notice of dissatisfaction referring to this Sub-Clause within fourteen (14) days of receipt of the decision or the expiry of the time for the decision. If no notice of dissatisfaction is given within the specified time, the decision shall be final and binding on the Parties. If notice of dissatisfaction is given within the specified time, the decision shall be binding on the Parties who shall give effect to it without delay unless and until the decision of the Engineer is revised by au arbitrator.

If a contractor is dissatisfied with the decision of the Engineer of the department or decision is not given in time then he can approach SuperIntending Engineer within 14 days, in case of dissatisfaction with decision of Superintending Engineer or not decided within 28 days, then arbitration process would be adopted as per clause 15.3.

#### 15.3 Arbitration

A dispute which has been the subject of a notice of dissatisfaction shall be finally settled as per provisions of Arbitration Act 1940 (Act No. X of 1940) and Rules made there under and any statutory modifications thereto. Any hearing shall be held at the place specified in the Contract Data and in the language referred to in Sub-Clause 1.5.

#### 16 INTEGRITY PACT

- If the Contractor or any of his Sub-Contractors, agents or servants is found to have violated or involved in 16.1 violation of the Integrity Pact signed by the Contractor as Schedule-F to his Bid, then the Procuring Agency shall be entitled to:
- recover from the Contractor an amount equivalent to ten times the sum of any commission, gratification, (a) bribe, funder's fee or kickback given by the Contractor or any of his Sub-Contractors, agents or servants;
- (b) terminate the Contract; and
- recover from the Contractor any loss or damage to the Procuring Agency as a result of such rermination of (c) of any other corrupt business practices of the Contractor or any of his Sub-Contractors, agents or servants.

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION

THAR @ MITH

#### **BIDDING DATA**

#### INSTRUCTIONS TO BIDDERS

Clause Reference:-

14.4

Number of Copies of the Bid to be submitted:

One original plus Nil copies.

CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM VILLAGE

BORABAH TO QABOOLANI MILE 0/0-3/1 (5.00 KMS)

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS 1.1 Name of Procuring Agency: -DIVISION THAR @ MITHI Brief Description of Works:-PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION THAR @ MITHI 5.1 (a) Procuring Agency's address: PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION THAR @ MITHI (b) Engineer's address: 10.3 Bid shall be quoted entirely in Pak. Rupees. The payment shall be made in Pak. Rupees. 11.2 The bidder has the financial, technical and constructional capability necessary to perform the Contract as follows: As published in NIT. Financial capacity: (must have turnover of Rs 400Million). ii. Technical capacity: PEC Registration iii. Construction Capacity: (45 of equipment). 12.1 A detailed description of the Works, essential technical and performance characteristics. (a) (b) Complete set of technical information, description data, literature and drawings as required in accordance with Schedule B to Bid, Specific Works Data. This will include but not be limited to a sufficient number of drawings, photographs, catalogues, illustrations and such other information as is necessary to illustrate clearly the significant characteristics such as general construction dimensions and other relevant information about the works to be performed. 13.1 Amount of Bid Security: -/- (Rs. 4.881 M). @ (5%) Rs. 14.1 Period of Bid Validity: -(90 Days).

### **BIDDING DATA**

#### INSTRUCTIONS TO BIDDERS

Clause Reference:- Construction Of Road From Village Milkam To
Bhadsandha Mile 0/0-1/2 (2.00 Kms)

1.1	Nam	ne of Procuring Agency: -		IVE ENGINEER PROVINC N THAR @ MITHI	IAL HIGHWAYS
	Brief	f Description of Works:-			
5.1	(a) Pı	rocuring Agency's address:	PROV	INCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION	N THAR @ MITHI
	(b) E	Engineer's address:	PROV	INCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION	THAR @ MITHI
10.3	Bid s	shall be quoted entirely in Pak.	Rupees. The pa	ayment shall be made in Pak. Rupee	s.
11.2		bidder has the financial, techni ws: As published in NIT. Financial capacity: (must ho		ructional capability necessary to per f. Rs_300 Million).	rform the Contract as
	ii.	Technical capacity: Re	egistration	PEC	
	iii.	Construction Capacity: (45	of equipment).		
12.1	(a)	A detailed description of the	e Works, essen	itial technical and performance chara	acteristics.
	(b)	accordance with Schedule E sufficient number of drawin is necessary to illustrate	B to Bid, Specings, photograph clearly the si	description data, literature and dra ific Works Data. This will include b hs, catalogues, illustrations and such ignificant characteristics such as about the works to be performed.	out not be limited to a other information as
13.1	Amou	unt of Bid Security: - @	(5%) Rs.	/- (Rs. 2.250 M).	
14.1	Perio	d of Bid Validity: - (9	00 Days).		
14.4	Numb	ber of Copies of the Bid to be	submitted:		

One original plus Nil copies.



# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION THAR @ MITHI.

NO:TC/G-55/787
Provincial Highway Division,
Thar @ Mithi. dated:- \*5 /09/2016

To,

The Manager Director
Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority.
Barrack No.8, Sindh Secretariat Block-4 A, Court Road
Karachi.

SUBJECT: - COMPLAINT AGAINST EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION THAR @ MITHI REGARDING NON ISSUANCE OF TENDERS / BIDDING DOCUMENTS FOR THE TENDERS INVITED ON 03-08-2016 (SPPRA # 29644).

On-Going through the contents of above complaint dated 19-08-2016 by M/s Khokhar Brothers Construction it is informed that the contractor has participated in the tenders, signed the attendance sheet and also filled up / quoted the rates and submitted the bidding documents in this office.

On scrutiny of the bidding documents the rates quoted by the M/s Khokhar

Brothers Construction Government Contractor are found highest hence the same were rejected.

On this consequence the contractor made application / complaint by raising base less allegations against the under signed.

This is for favour of your kind information.

Executive Engineer
Provincial Highway Division
Thar @ Mithi.



#### GOVERNMENT OF SINDH WORKS & SERVICES DEPARTMENT

Karachi dated 19th August, 2016.

#### NOTIFICATION

No.E&A(W&S)3-9/2014 (PHD-THAR): In supersession of this Department's Notification of even number dated 01-04-2016 and with the approval of Competent Authority, Procurement Committee, in terms of Rule-7 of Sindh Public Procurement Rules-2010 (Amended 2013), is hereby constituted for procurement of "Goods / Works" in the Office of Executive Engineer, Provincial Highways Division, Tharparkar @ Mithi excluding, procurement involving foreign exchange, with the following composition:-

Executive Engineer, Provincial Highways Division, Thar @ Mithi

Chairman

ii. Executive Engineer, Education Works Division, Thar @ Mithi

Member

iii. Assistant Engineer, Highways Sub-Division, Thar-I @ Mithi

Member

 The Functions & Reoponoibilities of the Committee will be same as specified in Rules-7 & 8 of Sindh Public Procurement Rules-2010

SECRETARY TO GOVT. OF SINDH

No.E&A(W&S)3-9/2014 (PHD-Thar)

Karachi, dated the 19th August, 2016.

A copy is forwarded for information to-

- 1. The Accountant General, Sindh, Karachi.
- 2. The Managing Director, SPPRA, Karachi.
- 3. The Chief Engineer (Highways), Hyderabad.
- 4. The Chairman / Members of the Committee.
- 5. The Deputy Director (Monitoring), PM&E Cell, W&SD.
- 6. P.S to Minister, Works & Services Sindh.
- 7. P.S to Secretary, W&S Department.
- 8. Notification file.

SECTION OFFICER (GENERAL)
FOR SECRETARY TO GOVT. OF SINDH



# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION THAR @ MITHI.

No: TC/G-55/765 Provincial Highway Division, Thar @ Mithi, dated: 23/8/2016.

Subject:-

#### PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 23-08-2016.

A Meeting of the procurement committee was held in the office of the Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi Under the chairmanship of Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi.

2. The below mentioned members of committee attended the meeting to discuss the bids invited for the procurement of works vide Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi letter No. TC/G-55/712 dated: 03-08-2016 and subsequently hoisted on the website of Sindh Public Procurement Regularity Authority and Information Technology Department Government of Sindh.

Following attended the meeting:

Niaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division, Thar @ Mithi.

Chairman

2 Riaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer, Education Works Division, Tharparkar@Mithi.

Member

3 Ayoub Kaim Khani Assistant Engineer, Provincial Highway Sub-Division, Thar-I@Mithi. Member

- During the course of meeting following discussion were made by the committee.
  - The tenders were received back from the bidders on dated: 23-08-2016 @ 12.00 noon and opened @ 1.00 PM before the Procurement Committee in presence of representatives of participants.
  - ii. The methods for bidding documents observed as single envelop.
  - iii. The tenders were opened on 23-08-2016 before the tender opening Committee.
- 4. The Committee was informed that the NIT contains 02 works, the bidding documents for above works have been purchased by the bidders upto 22-08-2016 and receiving back their tender

documents today on 23-08-2016 upto 1:00 noon in the office of Executive Engineer, Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi.

During the opening of tender received, following status was found.

Sr. No.	Name of Firms	Amount of Rates Quoted by the Contractor for work no.1	Amount of Rates Quoted by the Contractor for work no.2	Ranking in terms of Cost	Remarks .
1.	M/s Fazal & Brothers	Rs. 94502429	Rs. 42618214	Lowest	Accepted
2.	M/s Khalil Engineering Works	Rs. 95145909		Highest	Rejected
3.	M/s Harish & Co.	Rs. 95628564	Rs. 43213693	Highest	Rejected
4.	M/s Haseeb & Tahseem		Rs. 42951123	Highest	
5.	M/s Khokhar Brothers			Un-complete Documents	Rejected

6. The Committee thoroughly scrutinized each case/tender documents, comparing mathematically and financially with sanctioned estimates / bill of quantities and criteria for determining minimum qualification as per bidding documents. The tenders of M/s Khokhar Brothers Rejected due to un-complete documents

#### 7. Recommendation

After Due deliberation / scrutiny of each tender document by the committee it was recommended that lowest evaluated responsive bidder may be awarded the respective tender.

#### 8. Decision

In view of Para No. 7 of this report it is decided that tenders are being awarded to above mentioned lowest responsive bidder accordingly.

Ayoub Kain Khani Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Thar-I @ Mithi

Riaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Education Works Division Tharparkar @ Mithi

Niaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Thar @ Mithi