Bid Evaluation Report

- 1. Name of Procuring Agency: Sindh Board of Investment
- 2. Tender Reference No:
- 3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: Feasibility Study for China Special Economic Zone
- 4. Method of Procurement: Quality Based Selection Method (QBS)
- 5. Tender Published: 19th February, 2017 in Dawn, Jang and Kawish Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)
- 6. Total Bid documents Sold; Four
- 7. Total Bids Received: Three
- 8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) 16th May, 2017
- 9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): One as per QBS Method
- 10. Bid(s) Rejected: None
- 11. Financial Bid Opening date: 20th June, 2017

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S No	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6
1.	Osmani & Company	45710,000	First	N/A	Technically First	QBS Method
2.	KPMG with NESPAK	NIA	Second	N/A	Technically Second	
3.	Consultants Group	NIA.	Third	N/A	Technically Thir	

Shaikh Adnapaxli

Member

Ms. Bushra Aini Dars

Member

aili

Member

Mr. Nisar Abro

Mr. Abdul Azeem Uqaili

Member

Syed Manzoor Abbass Rizvi

Chairman

رقعه كالموائدة المسلمة المتعالمة بخراست

of the transfer of the transfe



אנייקפינרות אול בואיקקליים חקרים



وورومه والكراء ويوارك المرابعة والمرابعة والمرابعة

a san areas altoys

Controlled

Contro were the stift a weeky

same America Charles ph

whater the CHEST OF

Control of the Contro

ربجنل ڈانریکٹریٹ آف ٹوڈ کراچی ریجن کراچی

دوباره طلبى سالانه ثبينأ رنواس

40.00 1700 241 72 (3-2-4 11 3200 1387

A STATE OF THE STA o section is a gricial file and alternative which is a grice in a section is a section of the section of the section is a section of the sect THE CAME IN THE PARTY OF THE PA Property of the

ومعرا فيشرفوذ (Control of the property of th

3 CORRUPTION SAY NO TO OL ON AVS PUND CHRENOC-150 همدهشتكرديكي فلاف متحد 3000

"فزيبلش اسثثر كالنفقاد كراني كييني كنسلشنس سروسر كاحصول" SBI investment (

en grand of the state of the st

فر موں کبلنے معبار اغلبت

Contracting the second of the

Conference (1985) 1. political de la filologia promone es mayor en ema para porteca para de Capalo (1980) de la papa de la filo (mayor españa) produción politica de la filologia de la filo

and the control of th

*. [14,424,(4,84424a)

شريق الاوال والمرابع والدائم الراق المرابع والواري الان والمرابع المدول والمرابع المرابع المرابع المرابع المرابع מינים בינים בי ent pravious proposition of the ने प्रतिकार सम्बद्धा के प्रतिकार के कार्या के प्रतिकार के प्रतिकार के प्रतिकार के प्रतिकार के प्रतिकार के प्रत • प्रतिकार सम्बद्धा के प्रतिकार के प्र

· color of the contract of the state of the state of the color

الماقية العرب عدادي والشراء والمعربين في المراجعة والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية الإنجواع مدامت عدادية والمدارة المدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية والمدارية

الماد مادر الماد والماد والماد والمادية المادية والماد والمادية المادية

Surface the property of the region of the control of

ATHER MATERIAL T

EVALUATION CRITERIA

1

Description		Points	
(I) Firm's relevant experience of similar projects/Assignments (15 Marks)	Osmani & Co with E &Y	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS GROUPS
Evaluation of bidders shall be based on the following criteria: a) Experience and past performance in similar contracts/projects i.e. Consultation for Feasibility studies of Industrial Parks/ Zones/Industrial Estates (last 10 years) (Kindly enclose satisfactory service completion certificate / Evidence) 10 to 15 Project 15 Marks 05 to 09 Project 10 Marks Less than 05 Projects. 05 Marks The Consultant/ Firms need to highlight the above mentioned experience in the technical proposal, facilitating the procuring agency to pick the relevant experience.	1	15	3
		D ::	

1) Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner	Osmani & Co with E	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS
(10 Marks)	&Y		GROUPS
 Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or 			
Architect or Master Planning having			
experience of providing consultancy			
services for construction of Buildings and	10	10	16
Master Planning of similar type projects:		10	10.
(Completion Certificate is required)			
 5 and above projects: 10 marks 			
4 projects: 8 marks			
3 projects: 6 marks			
2 projects: 4 marks			
2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)			
 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance 			
preferable having experience of conducting			
feasibility study and Post Qualification			
experience of 10 years:			
 4 and above projects: 05 marks 	/		/.
3 projects: 04 marks	5	5	5
2 projects: 02 marks			
1 projects: 01 marks			
			**
3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks)			
 Proven record of working in team/ individual as a 		XM	
Special Economic Zone Specialist.		N	

1) Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner	Osmani & Co with E	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS
(10 Marks)	&Y		GROUPS
 Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or Architect or Master Planning having experience of providing consultancy services for construction of Buildings and Master Planning of similar type projects: (Completion Certificate is required) 5 and above projects: 10 marks 4 projects: 8 marks 	10	10	10.
3 projects: 6 marks			
2 projects: 4 marks			
2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)			
 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance preferable having experience of conducting feasibility study and Post Qualification experience of 10 years: 			
 4 and above projects: 05 marks 	/	r	/.
 3 projects: 04 marks 	5	5	5
2 projects: 02 marks			
1 projects: 01 marks			
3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks)			
 Proven record of working in team/ individual as a 		XLT	
Special Economic Zone Specialist.		N	/

	4 and above projects: 05 marks	5	2	2	
	2 projects: 02 marks	-		V-1	
	0.5.		, ,		
	4) Environmental Engineer (5 Marks)		,	**	
	Master/Bachelor in Environmental Engineering		9		
	having more than 10 years of post qualification	5	3		
	Experience		2	2,	
	(5 Marks)				
b)	Bidding/Legal Document Expert				Æ.
	1) Bidding/ Legal Document Expert (10 Marks)				3
	Civil Engineer preferably having LLB degree must				8
	be experience in preparing Bidding Documents for				- 180
	hiring of contractors including Bill of Quantity and	5	0	_	
	other agreements.	10	8	5	
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks				
	Between 20 to 25 years Marks				
	Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks				
c)	On Ground Technical Team				
	1) Quantity Surveyor (10 Marks)				
	Having graduate degree in Quantity Surveyor				
	having post qualification experience of more than 10				
	years especially:	,	.7	<	
		10	T .	U	
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks				
	Between 20 to 25 years Marks				
	Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks				

2) Civil Engineering (Residential Engineer)			
Masters/ Bachelor in Civil Engineering with at		,	W
least 10 years of post-qualification experience (5			
Marks)			
More than 20 years of experience 05	<	3.	3
Marks	5	11	
Between 15 to 20 years of experience 3		.2	,
Marks			
Between 10 years to 15 years of experience Marks		,	
d) Principal Architect (10 Marks)			
Bachelor in Architect having 15 years of experience:			
More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks	10	7	5
Between 20 to 25 years Marks	15		
Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks			



	equacy of proposed work plan and methodology	•			
			OSMANI & CO	KPMG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTNTS GROUP
Α.	Understanding of TOR (Here Interested Firm must mention the detail of Assignment as per Scope of Services)	5	3	2	1
B.	Quality of Approach and Methodology (By Drawings as per ToR's)	10	5	5	2
C.	Work Program and Manning Schedule	5	3	2	2
Alexander of the second	Total	20			
	Grand Total (I +II+III)	100	86	69	45.

NAME OF MEMBER

SIGNATURE:

ARDUR AZBEM DEATCH Dreet SBJ

4



EVALUATION CRITERIA

Description		Points	
(I) Firm's relevant experience of similar projects/Assignments	Osmani & Co	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS
(15 Marks)	with F &Y		GROU, S
Evaluation of bidders shall be based on the following criteria:			
a) Experience and past performance in similar contracts/projects i.e.		i i	×
Consultation for Feasibility studies of Industrial Parks/			1
Zones/Industrial Estates (last 10 years)		. 9	
(Kindly enclose satisfactory service completion certificate / Evidence)			
• 10 to 15 Project 15 Marks	1/	1/	
05 to 09 Project 10 Marks	15	10	0
Less than 05 Projects. 05 Marks			
The Consultant/ Firms need to highlight the above mentione	ď		
experience in the technical proposal, facilitating the procuring agenc	3		
to pick the relevant experience.			2

Shaiku Adna Ati.

1) Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner	Osmani & Co with E	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS
Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or Architect or Master Planning having experience of providing consultancy services for construction of Buildings and Master Planning of similar type projects:	&Y		GROUPS
(Completion Certificate is required) • 5 and above projects: 10 marks • 4 projects: 8 marks • 3 projects: 6 marks • 2 projects: 4 marks 2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)	10	10	10
 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance preferable having experience of conducting feasibility study and Post Qualification experience of 10 years: 4 and above projects: 05 marks 3 projects: 04 marks 2 projects: 02 marks 1 projects: 01 marks 	5	5	5
3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks) • Proven record of working in team/ individual as a Special Economic Zone Specialist.	5	3	2

	4 and above projects: 05 marks 2 projects: 02 marks			
	4) Environmental Engineer (5 Marks) • Master/Bachelor in Environmental Engineering having more than 10 years of post qualification Experience (5 Marks)	5	5	2
b)	Bidding/Legal Document Expert			6
	Bidding/ Legal Document Expert (10 Marks) Civil Engineer preferably having LLB degree must			
	be experience in preparing Bidding Documents for hiring of contractors including Bill of Quantity and		t .	
	other agreements.		la"	10
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks	10	C .*	1.5
	Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks		-	;
c)	On Ground Technical Team			**
	1) Quantity Surveyor (10 Marks)			
	Having graduate degree in Quantity Surveyor having post qualification experience of more than 10			
	years especially:			
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	1	7	7

2) Civil Engineering (Residential Engineer) Masters/ Bachelor in Civil Engineering with at least 10 years of post-qualification experience (5			
More than 20 years of experience 05 Marks Between 15 to 20 years of experience 3 Marks Between 10 years to 15 years of experience	5	5	5
d) Principal Architect (10 Marks) Bachelor in Architect having 15 years of experience:			
 More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks 	10	10	16

11). Ad	equacy of proposed work plan and methodology i	n respo	onding to TORs	*	,	
		,	OSMANI & CO	KPMG V/ITH NESPAK	CONSULTA. TS	GROUP
Α.	Understanding of TOR (Here Interested Firm must mention the detail of Assignment as per Scope of Services)	5 ` .	5	4	g.	
В.	Quality of Approach and Methodology (By Drawings as per ToR's)	10	8	7	5	i
C.	Work Program and Manning Schedule	5	4	3	3	
distriction of	Total	20				
	Grand Total (I +II+III)	100	89	84	. 60	

NAME OF MEMBER

SIGNATURE:

Sharen Ada a Mi

EVALUATION CRITERIA

i & Co &Y	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS GRO!
~	9 j	
5	15	5
		2
	5	



1) Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner	Osmani & Co with E	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS
(10 Marks)	&Y		GROUPS
Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or		1	
Architect or Master Planning having			
experience of providing consultancy	114	n	1
services for construction of Buildings and	0	8.	10
Master Planning of similar type projects:		**	
(Completion Certificate is required)			
5 and above projects: 10 marks			
4 projects: 8 marks			
3 projects: 6 marks			
2 projects: 4 marks			
2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)			
 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance 			
preferable having experience of conducting			
feasibility study and Post Qualification			
experience of 10 years:			
 4 and above projects: 05 marks 	5	4	5
3 projects: 04 marks	.)	'	
2 projects: 02 marks			,
1 projects: 01 marks			
3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks)	/		
Proven record of working in team/ individual as a			
Special Economic Zone Specialist.	100		

	4 and above projects: 05 marks 2 projects: 02 marks	4	2	3
	4) Environmental Engineer (5 Marks) • Master/Bachelor in Environmental Engineering having more than 10 years of post qualification Experience (5 Marks)	5	3	4
(b)	Bidding/Legal Document Expert			
	1) Bidding/ Legal Document Expert (10 Marks) Civil Engineer preferably having LLB degree must be experience in preparing Bidding Documents for hiring of contractors including Bill of Quantity and other agreements. • More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks • Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks • Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	10	8	5
c)	On Ground Technical Team		10 18 m	ы н
	1) Quantity Surveyor (10 Marks) Having graduate degree in Quantity Surveyor having post qualification experience of more than 10 years especially: More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Uetween 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	8	7	7

	2) Civil Engineering (Residential Engineer) Masters/ Bachelor in Civil Engineering with at least 10 years of post-qualification experience (5 Marks)			
)	More than 20 years of experience 05 Marks Between 15 to 20 years of experience 3 Marks Between 10 years to 15 years of experience	5	3	3
	d) Principal Architect (10 Marks) Bachelor in Architect having 15 years of experience:	**.		
.3'	 More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks 	8	7	7



II). Ad	equacy of proposed work plan and methodology in r	responding to TORs		
			*	
		OSMANI & CO	KPMG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTATS GROUP
Α.	Understanding of TOR (Here Interested Firm must mention the detail of Assignment as per Scope of Services)	3	3	· 2
В.	Quality of Approach and Methodology (By Drawings as per ToR's)	0 7	7	.3
C.	Work Program and Manning Schedule 5	5	3	1
	Total	0		8
	Grand Total (I +II+III)	85	70	55

NAME OF MEMBER

SIGNATURE:

8. Manson Rizur, Da SBI Chair CSC

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Description		Points	
(I) Firm's relevant experience of similar projects/Assignments (15 Marks)	Osmani & Co with E & Y	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS GROUPS
Evaluation of bidders shall be based on the following criteria: a) Experience and past performance in similar contracts/projects i.e. Consultation for Feasibility studies of Industrial Parks/ Zones/Industrial Estates (last 10 years) (Kindly enclose satisfactory service completion certificate / Evidence) 10 to 15 Project 15 Marks 05 to 09 Project 10 Marks Less than 05 Projects. 05 Marks The Consultant/ Firms need to highlight the above mentioned experience in the technical proposal, facilitating the procuring agency to pick the relevant experience.	15	15	5

	Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner	Osmani &	Co	with E	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS	
	(10 Marks)	&Y				GROUPS	
	Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or	1.75.50					
	Architect or Master Planning having						
	experience of providing consultancy						
	services for construction of Buildings and				100		
	Master Planning of similar type projects:				10	9	
1	(Completion Certificate is required)	10	,		10.	1	
	 5 and above projects: 10 marks 					10	
	4 projects: 8 marks						
	3 projects: 6 marks						1 2-
	2 projects: 4 marks						
	2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)						
	 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance 						
	preferable having experience of conducting	(9	9	14, 7
	feasibility study and Post Qualification	ے			١.	\ ,	
	experience of 10 years:						
	 4 and above projects: 05 marks 				a 1 147		di no
	• 3 projects: 04 marks						My
	2 projects: 02 marks						
	1 projects: 01 marks				338		(
					. /	(0)	1
	3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks)				1000	1	XV
	Proven record of working in team/ individual as a				f ()W//	/	1
	Special Economic Zone Specialist.					/	

	 4 and above projects: 05 marks 2 projects: 02 marks 4) Environmental Engineer (5 Marks) Master/Bachelor in Environmental Engineering having more than 10 years of post qualification Experience (5 Marks) 	5	3.	3	
b)	Bidding/Legal Document Expert 1) Bidding/ Legal Document Expert (10 Marks) Civil Engineer preferably having LLB degree must be experience in preparing Bidding Documents for hiring of contractors including Bill of Quantity and other agreements. • More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks • Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks • Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	10	9	—	
c)	On Ground Technical Team				
	Quantity Surveyor (10 Marks) Having graduate degree in Quantity Surveyor having post qualification experience of more than 10 years especially:	9	8	7	CD Tax
	 More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks 		A Di	Pods	

Sindh Board of Investment | RFP

2) Civil Engineering (Residential Engineer) Masters/ Bachelor in Civil Engineering with at least 10 years of post-qualification experience (5 Marks) More than 20 years of experience 05 Marks Between 15 to 20 years of experience 3 Marks Between 10 years to 15 years of experience 1 Marks d) Principal Architect (10 Marks) Bachelor in Architect having 15 years of experience:	5	4	4
 More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks 		8	7

A Se

And South Aut

III	Adequacy of proposed work plan and methodology in responding to TORs		OSMANI & CO	KPMG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS Group
Α.	Understanding of TOR (Interested Firm must mention the detail of Assignment as per Scope of Services)	5	1		
В.	Quality of Approach and Methodology	10	19	() .	C
C.	Work Program and Manning Schedule	5			
	Total	20	7	,	
MAR STATE	Grand Total (I +II+III)	100	87	76	55.

Name:	MS. Bushra Dars	Name: Shaikh Adnan Ali.
Departmer	nt: Planning & Development Board.	Department: Sindle Board of Investment.
Designatio	n: Assistant Chief.(IND)	Designation: Section Officer (Admn).
Signature:	Bors.	Signature:
Name: Nis	sar Abro.	Name: Abdul Azeen Uqaili.

Department: Finance Department.

Designation: Deputy Secretary (Dev-I).

Designation: Designation: Director Projects.

Signature: Signature: Signature:

Name: Dr. Mansoor Abbas Rizvi

Department: Sindh/Board of Investment.

Designation: Director General.

Signature:



EVALUATION CRITERIA

Description		Points	
Ask in the delication was tendered as a notice of the contract	Osmani & Co with E &Y	KMPC WITH NESPAK	CONSUL : ANTS
Evaluation of bidders shall be based on the following criteria: a) Experience and past performance in similar contracts/projects i.e. Consultation for Feasibility studies of Industrial Parks/			
Zones/Industrial Estates (Inst 10 years) (Kindly enclose satisfactory service completion certificate / Evidence) 10 to 15 Project	15	15	5
 Less than 05 Projects. 05 Marks The Consultant/ Firms need to highlight the above mentioned experience in the technical proposal, facilitating the procuring agency to pick the relevant experience. 			e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e



1000 100 110	Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner (10 Marks)	Osmani & Co with E	KMPG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTANTS GROUPS
	Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or Architect or Master Planning having experience of providing consultancy services for construction of Buildings and	No.		
)	Master Planning of similar type projects: (Completion Certificate is required)	9	10	7
	 5 and above projects: 10 marks 			
	4 projects: 8 marks			
	3 projects: 6 marks			
	2 projects: 4 marks		3.	0.00
	2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)			
	 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance 			
	preferable having experience of conducting			
	fensibility study and Post Qualification			
	experience of 10 years:		X.	, ,
	 4 and above projects: 05 marks 		1.	0
	3 projects: 04 marks	S	9	N
	2 projects: 02 marks			
	1 projects: 01 marks			
	3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks)			
	• Proven record of working in team/ individual as a			CVA A
	Special Economic Zone Specialist.			W.O.M

	4 and above projects: 05 marks 2 projects: 02 marks	5	3	3
	Environmental Engineer (5 Marks) Master/Bachelor in Environmental Engineering having more than 10 years of post qualification Experience (5 Marks)	4	3	3
b)	Bidding/Legal Document Expert			1
	1) Bidding/ Legal Document Expert (10 Marks) Civil Engineer preferably having LLB degree must be experience in preparing Bidding Documents for hiring of contractors including Bill of Quantity and other agreements. • More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks • Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks • Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	10	8	8
c)	On Ground Technical Team			
	Quantity Surveyor (10 Marks) Having graduate degree in Quantity Surveyor having post qualification experience of more than 10 years especially:			
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	10	8	7

)	2) Civil Engineering (Residential Engineer) Masters/ Bachelor in Civil Engineering with at least 10 years of post-qualification experience (5 Marks) More than 20 years of experience 05 Marks Between 15 to 20 years of experience 3 Marks Between 10 years to 15 years of experience 1 Marks d) Principal Architect (10 Marks)	4	4	3
	Bachelor in Architect having 15 years of experience:			
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	8	8	5



П). Ас	equacy of proposed work plan and methodology in	resp	onding to TORs		
			OSMANI & CO	KPMG WITH NESPAK	CONSULTATS GROUP
۸.	Understanding of TOR (Here Interested Firm must mention the detail of Assignment as per Scope of Services)	5	3	3	1.
Ŗ.	Quality of Approach and Methodology (By Drawings as per ToR's)	10	7	5	3
C.	Work Program and Manning Schedule	5	2	, 2	1
	Total	20	2		
	Grand Total (I +II+III)	100	82	73	48

NAME OF MEMBER

SIGNATURE:

Misar Adus Abor Depthy Senting Rusin Depth

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Description		Points	
(I) Firm's relevant experience of similar projects/Assignments	Osmani & Co	KMPC VITH NESPAK	CCNSÚLTANTS
(15 Marks)	with E & Y	*	GROU ₃ S
Evaluation of bidders shall be based on the following criteria:		N	
a) Experience and past performance in similar contracts/projects i.e.			
Consultation for Feasibility studies of Industrial Parks/			
Zones/Industrial Estates (last 10 years)			
(Kindly enclose satisfactory service completion certificate / Evidence)			
10 to 15 Project 15 Marks	15	15	7
 05 to 09 Project 10 Marks 	13	· ·	
Less than 05 Projects.	Del 54 Del		001 000
The Consultant/ Firms need to highlight the above mentioned	d		17
experience in the technical proposal, facilitating the procuring agence	y		
to pick the relevant experience.			



1) Lead Engineer / Architect/Master Planner	Osmani	8. Co	with I	KMP	G WITH	VESPAK	CONSULTANTS	
(10 Marks)	1.7510.750.730.000.00				J			
	&Y						GROUPS	
Master/Bachelor in Civil Engineering or						3.	1 4	
Architect or Master Planning having								
experience of providing consultancy					21		1 20	
services for construction of Buildings and					*		_	-
Master Planning of similar type projects					, -		,	Sile
(Completion Certificate is required)								
 5 and above projects: 10 marks 	1	0			10		10	*
4 projects: 8 marks	,							
3 projects: 6 marks				į				
2 projects: 4 marks				ĺ				
2) Financial Expert (05 Marks)	1							
 CA/ACCA/ACMA/MBA/MS Finance 		3		1				-
preferable having experience of conducting		140						
feasibility study and Post Qualification	l							
experience of 10 years:							,	
4 and above projects: 05 marks								
3 projects: 04 marks		_		İ	,-		5	
2 projects: 02 marks		>			2			
				-				
1 projects: 01 marks	1							
3) Special Economic Zone Specialist (5 Marks)								
· Proven record of working in team/ individual as	a							4
Special Economic Zone Specialist.					1			

	4 and above projects: 05 marks 2 projects: 02 marks	5	4	4.
	4) Environmental Engineer (5 Marks) • Master/Bachelor in Environmental Engineering having more than 10 years of post qualification Experience (5 Marks)	5	5	4
b)	Bidding/Legal Document Expert			
	1) Bidding/ Legal Document Expert (10 Marks) Civil Engineer preferably having LLB degree must be experience in preparing Bidding Documents for hiring of contractors including Bill of Quantity and other agreements. • More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks • Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks • Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	10	10	. 8
c)	On Ground Technical Team		*	
	Quantity Surveyor (10 Marks) Having graduate degree in Quantity Surveyor having post qualification experience of more than 10 years especially:			
	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks Between 20 to 25 years 5 Marks Between 15 to 20 years 2 Marks	10	10	10

				2
	Civil Engineering (Residential Engineer) Masters/ Bachelor in Civil Engineering with at			,
	least 10 years of post-qualification experience (5			
	Marks)	1	,	
		10.4		Ten T
)	More than 20 years of experience 05	_	_	<u></u>
	Marks Between 15 to 20 years of experience 3	5	1,	-/
	Marks		. **	
	Between 10 years to 15 years of experience			
	l Marks		*	
	d) Principal Architect (10 Marks)			
	Bachelor in Architect having 15 years of experience:			
100	More than 25 years of experience 10 Marks			1
	Between 20 to 25 years Marks	10	10	7
	Between 15 to 20 years Marks			



			OSMANI & CO	KPMG WITH NESPAK O	CONSULTANTS GROUP
A.	Understanding of TOR (Here Interested Firm must mention the detail of Assignment as per Scope of Services)	5	5	3	1
В.	Quality of Approach and Methodology (By Drawings as per ToR's)	10	9	5	2
C.	Work Program and Manning Schedule	5	4	3	
1 (45.44) 4 1 (45.44)	Total	20			
	Grand Total (I +II+III)	100	93	84	55

NAME OF MEMBER

Rushia Aini Days Assistant Unif Bs: 18

SIGNATURE:

Sindh Basela immetament nen

Attendance Sheet

Opening of Fubil Proposal Fearitish Study of CPEC 20me Dia 20th June, 2017
Designation Contact Details Signature Dr. Manson ASLW DG SRI Charke S. No Ph: Fax: cell: Email: Signature Designation Contact Details S. No Name Busishand chief Bushia Aini Ball 021-99211402 Ph: Fax: PSO Dept+ 03372650310 cell: Q Jahoo. com. Email: Bushmannie **Contact Details** Designation Signature S. No Name Depelly scerling Misar Alus Abor Ph: 97222172 Fax: 3 cell: 1533 3087972 Email: **Contact Details** Signature Designation Name S. No Ph: Fax: QAILI cell: **Contact Details** Signature Designation S. No Name Ph: ARIF DEMANI Director Fax: OCL. 0333-3232321 cell: Email: **Contact Details** Signature Designation S. No Name Ph: PALINER ASIM SIDDIQUI Fax: EY FORD RHEDES 03008220793 cell: **Contact Details** Signature Designation S. No Name Breachive Ph: live Karkill Col Ajmas Rakud Dir occ Fax: 0335-3388202 cell: Email: Contact Details Signature Designation ivame S. No Ph: Triculive Amina Hocicla Fax: Manager 03212289849 cell: Contact Details Signature Designation S. No Name Ph: Se (notin) Fax: 9 A-man Grank cell:





No.DIR(P)/SBI/CSEZ/2016-17/53/ Karachi, dated 25th May, 2017.

Subject:

MINUTES OF THE MEETING FOR OPENING DOCUMENTS OF REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL DOCUMENTS FOR HIRING CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CONDUCTING FEASIBILITY STUDY FOR CHINA SPECIAL ECONOMIC ZONE DHABEJI, DISTRICT THATTA WAS HELD ON 16th MAY, 2017 AT 1500 HOURS IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF SINDH BOARD OF INVESTMENT

A meeting of Meeting for opening documents of Request for Proposal for Hiring Consulting Services for conducting Feasibility Study for China Special Economic Zone Dhabeji, District Thatta was held in the Committee Room of Sindh Board of Investment under the Chairmanship of Director General, SBI on 16th May, 2017 at 1500 hours.

2. The following members of the selection committee attended the meeting to open documents invited for the above said work by Sindh Board of Investment:

 Syed Mansoor Abbass Rizvi Director General Sindh Board of Investment

Chairman

2 Abdul Azeem Uqaili Director Projects Sindh Board of Investment

Member

3 Mr. Nisar Abro Δ

Deputy Secretary (Dev-1)

Finance Department

Member

4 Ms. Bushra Aini Dars Assistant Chief (Ind) Planning & Development Board

Member

5 Shaikh Adnan Ali Section Officer (Admn) Sindh Board of Investment

Member

3. The meeting started in the name of Allah. The chair welcomed the meeting participants and briefed them about the procedure of opening of proposals submitted by firms. He further added that, firm acquiring high technical score will be called on for the opening of financial proposal.

Themes Lay

Day Mun)





4. Further, he informed meeting participants that the following firms have submitted documents as per the prescribed format laid down by this office:

S.No.	Applicant Firm
1	Consultation Group
2	Osmani & Company
3	NESPAK

5. The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) scrutinized and evaluated the technical proposals in detail and awards following technical scores to firms:

S. No.	Applicant Firm	Technical Score
1	Osmani & Company	87
2	NESPAK with KPMG	76
3	Consultation Group	55

- 6. The CSC unanimously decided that M/s. Osmani & Company with consortium has acquired the highest technical marks and they will be called for the opening of financial proposals, rest of financial proposals will be returned unopened to firms. Meeting for opening of financial proposal shall be convened on 20th June, 2017
- The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and from Chair.

Shaikh Adnan Ali

Section Officer (Admn)

Sindh Board of Investment

Member

Mr. Nisar Abro

Deputy Secretary (Dev-I)

Finance Department

Member

Mr. Abdul Azeem Uqaili

Ms. Bushra Aini Dars

Assistant Chief

Planning & Development Board

Member

Director (P),

Sindh Board of Investment Member





Subject:

MINUTES OF THE MEETING FOR OPENING FINANCIAL BID OF FOR HIRING CONSULTING SERVICES FOR CONDUCTING FEASIBILITY STUDY FOR CHINA SPECIAL ECONOMIC ZONE DHABEJI, DISTRICT THATTA WAS HELD ON 20th JUNE, 2017 AT 10:30 HOURS IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF SINDH BOARD OF INVESTMENT

A Meeting for opening financial bid for Hiring Consulting Services for conducting Feasibility Study for China Special Economic Zone Dhabeji. District Thatta was held in the Committee Room of Sindh Board of Investment under the Chairmanship of Director General. SBI on 20th June, 2017 at 1030 hours.

2. The following members of the selection committee attended the meeting to open documents invited for the above said work by Sindh Board of Investment:

1 Syed Mansoor Abbass Rizvi
Director General
Sindh Board of Investment
Chairman

Abdul Azeem Uqaili

Member

Director Projects Sindh Board of Investment

Mr. Nisar Abro Ali
Deputy Secretary (Dev-I)
Finance Department

Member

4 Ms. Bushra Aini Dars
Assistant Chief (Ind)
Planning & Development Board

Member

5 Shaikh Adnan Ali Section Officer (Admn) Member Sindh Board of Investment

3. The meeting started in the name of Allah. The chair welcomed the meeting participants and briefed them that M/s. Osmani & Consultant has acquired highest technical score therefore keeping in view the QBS method, their financial bid will be opened only and rest of bids will be returned to respective bidders.





- Further, he informed meeting participants that M/s Osmani & Co. has quoted Rs. 45,710,000 for the subject task. Committee approved the cost mentioned by consultant.
- The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and from Chair.

Shaikh Adnan Ali Section Officer (Admn) Sindh Board of Investment

ylember

Mr. Nisar Abro AIF Deputy Secretary (Dev-I)

Finance Department Member

> Syed Mansoor Abbas Rizvi Director General Sindh Board of Investment

> > Chairman

Ms. Bushra Aini Dars Assistant Chief

Planning & Development Board Member

> Mr. Abdul Azeem Uqaili Director (P).

Sindh Board of Investment Member