# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER, PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION, HYDERABAD.

NO:TC/G-55/2672 of 2016

Hyderabad Dated:- 8 /12 /2016

To,

The Director (A&F),

Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority,

Karachi.

SUBJECT:-

SUBMISSION OF BID EVALUATION REPORTS.

REF'NCE:-

No.TC/G-55/2405, dated 16-11-2016.

The Bid Evaluation Report against N.I.T No. cited under reference for the following works along with comparative statement, bid evaluation report, Bidders Qualification Report, attendance sheet and minutes of the meeting, with request to upload the same on your authority website an early time please.

- M&R for Repair of Re-Decking of RCC Slab Culvert along Ant Samo Wayo to Qadir Dino Shah Road @ 3/2.
- 2. M&R Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Road @ mile 21/0-24/0 (Town Portion).

3. M&R Road from Maqbool Memon Hafiz Sandhano Road to Jeelani Farm mile 0/0-0/3.

(ENGR: GHULAM SHABBIR MEMON)
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER
PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION
HYDERABAD

 Copy f.w.c.s to the Project Manager, (P.I.U) Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Dual Carriageway Project Hyderabad, for favour of kind information.

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER
PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION
HYDERABAD

2607



# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION HYDERABAD

## **BID EVALUATION REPORT**

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:Exe	cutive Engineer, Provincia	I Highways D	ivision, Hyderabad		
2.	Tender Reference No	TC/G-55/2405, dated	16-11-2016			
3.	Tender Description/Name of work_	M&R for Repair of Re-Dec	king of RCC	Slab Culvert along	Ant Samo Wayo	<u>to</u>
		Qadir Dino Shah Road @	3/2.			
4.	Method of Procurement	Single Stag	e One Envelo	ре		
5.	Tender Published Daily "News Reg	ional" dt: 17/11/16, Daily "l	brat" dt:18/1	1/16, Daily "Jang" o	t: 18/11/2016	
6.	Total Bid documents Sold	03	Nos.			- 197 - 197
7.	Total Bids Received	03	Nos.			
8.	Technical Bid Opening date (if appl	icable)		N/A		
9.	No. of Bid technically qualified (if a					
10.	Bid(s) Rejected					
11.	Financial Bid Opening date					
12.	Bid Evaluation Report:					
S. No.	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost of offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/S Mukhtiar & Co.	Rs.117,941/-	1st	3% below	Being lowest offer	
2	M/S Rasheed Ahmed	Rs.122,036/-	2 <sup>nd</sup>	0.33% Above	Being higher offer	
3	M/S Pir Bux Chandio	Rs.122,144/-	3rd	0.43% Above	Being highest offer	

The tenders were opened by the tendering committee comprised of the officers as below:

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager Project Implementation Unit Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project Hyderabad.

(CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef)
Divisional Accounts Officer
MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer
Provincial Highway Division
Hyderabad
(MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)
Assistant Engineer

Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar (MEMBER)



# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION HYDERABAD

### **COMPARATIVE STATEMENT**

NAME OF WORK:

M&R FOR REPAIR OF RE-DECKING OF RCC SLAB CULVERT ALONG ANT SAMO WAYO TO QADIR DINO SHAH ROAD @ 3/2.

S. No.	Name of Contract to whom tender issued	Receint		Receipt	Percentage Rate Entered in Contract Document		Total amount of Bid	Reason for Acceptance/ Rejection	Remarks
1	M/S Mukhtiar & Co.	06-12-2016	Part-A	8.90% Above except item No.3, 9.80% Above on item No.3	Rs.117,941/-	Being lowest offer			
2	M/S Rasheed Ahmed	06-12-2016	Part-A	13.20% Above except item No.3, 12% Above on item No.3	Rs.122,036/-	Being higher offer			
3	M/S Pir Bux Chandio	06-12-2016	Part-A	13.30% Above except item No.3, 12.10% Above on item No.3	Rs.122,144/-	Being highest offer			

The tenders were opened by the tendering committee comprised of the officers as below:

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager

Project Implementation Unit

Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

Hyderabad.

(CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon) --

**Executive Engineer** Hala Irrigation Division

Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef) Divisional Accounts Officer

MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division

Hyderabad

(MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division

Tando Allahyar (MEMBER)

# **BIDDERS QUALIFICATION REPORT**

### Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad

S.No:	Name of Procuring Agency  Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Hyderabad				
1	Tender Reference No.	No.TC/G-55/2405 Dated: 16-11-2016			
2	Tender Description / Name of Work / Item	M&R for Repair of Re-Decking of RCC Slab Culvert along Ant Samo Wayo to Qadir Dino Shah Road @ 3/2.			
3	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage – One envelope procedure			
4	Name of firm/Bidder	M/S Mukhtiar & Co.			
5	N.T.N	Available 🗸			
6	Registration with P.E.C	Registered ~			
7	Sindh Board of Revenue	Registered ~			
8	Relevant Experience	Available ~			
9	Turnover of at least last three years	Available			
10	Funds/ Budget	Available			
11	02% Earnest Money	Available			
12	Tender fee / Cost of Bidding Document	Deposited			

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager Project Implementation Unit Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

> Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon).

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef)
Divisional Accounts Officer
MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)
Assistant Engineer
Provincial Highway Sub-Division
Tando Allahyar
(MEMBER)



Tender Reference No.\_

M/S Lachman Das

1.

2.

3.

## OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL **HIGHWAY DIVISION HYDERABAD**

TC/G-55/2405, dated 16-11-2016

### **BID EVALUATION REPORT**

4.	Method of Procurement	Single Stage	One Envelo	pe		
5.	Tender Published Daily "News Reg	gional" dt: 17/11/16, Daily "ll	orat" dt:18/1	1/16, Daily "Jang" o	it: 18/11/2016	
6.	Total Bid documents Sold	03	Nos.			
7.	Total Bids Received	03	Nos.			
8.	Technical Bid Opening date (if appl	licable)		N/A		
9.	No. of Bid technically qualified (if a	pplicable)		N/A		
10.	Bid(s) Rejected					
11.	Financial Bid Opening date	06-	12-2016			
12.	Bid Evaluation Report:					
S. No.	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost of offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	Rs.1,986,367/-	1 <sup>st</sup>	0.57% below	Being lowest offer	
2	Engr: Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto	Rs.2,010,666/-	2 <sup>nd</sup>	0.65% Above	Being higher offer	
3	M/S Lachman Das	Rs.2,012,703/-	3rd	0.75% Above	Being highest	

Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer, Provincial Highways Division, Hyderabad

Tender Description/Name of work M&R Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Road @ mile 21/0-24/0 (Town Portion).

The tenders were opened by the tendering committee comprised of the officers as below:

(Mour Oad)

Rs.2,012,703/-

Project Manager Project Implementation Unit Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon)

**Executive Engineer** Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef) Divisional Accounts Officer MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

offer

**Executive Engineer** Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar) Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar (MEMBER)



# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION HYDERABAD

### **COMPARATIVE STATEMENT**

NAME OF WORK:

M&R HYDERABAD-MIRPURKHAS ROAD @ MILE 21/0-24/0 (TOWN PORTION).

S. No.	Name of Contract to whom tender issued	Date of Receipt Sealed Tender	Percentage Rate Entered in Contract Document		Total amount of Bid	Reason for Acceptance/ Rejection	Remarks
	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	06-12-2016	Part-A	0.50% Below	Rs.1,986,367/-	Being lowest offer	
1			Part-B	12.50% Above except item No.5, 9.80% Above on item No.5.			
			Part-A	1% Above		Daine highen	
2	Engr: Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto	06-12-2016	Part-B	12.90% Above except item No.5, 9.90% Above on item No.5.	Rs.2,010,666/-	Being higher offer	
		achman Das 06-12-2016	Part-A	1.10% Above	Rs.2,012,703/-	Daine bishest	
3	M/S Lachman Das		Part-B	13% Above except item No.5, 10% Above on item No.5.		Being highest offer	

The tenders were opened by the tendering committee comprised of the officers as below:

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager

Project Implementation Unit

Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ah<del>med Memoh</del>)

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division

Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef)
Divisional Accounts Officer

MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad

(MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar

(MEMBER)

## **BIDDERS QUALIFICATION REPORT**

### Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad

S.No:	Name of Procuring Agency	Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad
1	Tender Reference No.	No.TC/G-55/2405 Dated: 16-11-2016
2	Tender Description / Name of Work / Item	M&R Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Road @ mile 21/0-24/0 (Town Portion).
3	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage – One envelope procedure
4	Name of firm/Bidder	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio
5	N.T.N	Available
6	Registration with P.E.C	Registered 🗸
7	Sindh Board of Revenue	Registered V
8	Relevant Experience	Available 🗸
9	Turnover of at least last three years	Available 🗸
10	Funds/ Budget	Available ~
11	02% Earnest Money	Available \(
12	Tender fee / Cost of Bidding Document	Deposited

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager

Project Implementation Unit Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

> Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon) ·

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad

(MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef) Divisional Accounts Officer MEMBER (Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad

(MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar

(MEMBER)



1.

# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAY DIVISION HYDERABAD

## **BID EVALUATION REPORT**

2.	Tender Reference No	TC/G-55/2405, dated	16-11-2016			
3.	Tender Description/Name of work_	M&R Road from Maqbool Me	mon Hafiz San	dhano Road to Jeela	ni Farm Mile 0/0-0/	3
4.	Method of Procurement	Single Stage	One Envelo	ре		
5.	Tender Published Daily "News Regi	onal" dt: 17/11/16, Daily "I	brat" dt:18/1	1/16, Daily "Jang" d	lt: 18/11/2016	
6.	Total Bid documents Sold	03	Nos.			
7.	Total Bids Received	03	Nos.			
8.	Technical Bid Opening date (if applie					
9.	No. of Bid technically qualified (if ap					
10.	Bid(s) Rejected					
11.	Financial Bid Opening date					
12.	Bid Evaluation Report:					
S. No.	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost of offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	Rs.2,481,434/-	1 <sup>st</sup>	0.53% below	Being lowest offer	
2	M/S Lachman Das	Rs.2,519,145/-	2 <sup>nd</sup>	0.97% Above	Being higher offer	
3	M/S A.G.S & Co.	Rs.2,521,838/-	3rd	1.07% Above	Being highest offer	

Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer, Provincial Highways Division, Hyderabad

The tenders were opened by the tendering committee comprised of the officers as below:

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager Project Implementation Unit

Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memori)

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad

(MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef)

Divisional Accounts Officer

MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar

(MEMBER)



# OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION HYDERABAD

### **COMPARATIVE STATEMENT**

NAME OF WORK:

M&R ROAD FROM MAQBOOL MEMON HAFIZ SANDHANO ROAD TO JEELANI FARM MILE 0/0-0/3.

S. No.	Name of Contract to whom tender issued	Peceint		Receipt	Percentage Rate Entered in Contract Document		Total amount of Bid	Reason for Acceptance/ Rejection	Remarks
1	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	06-12-2016	Part-A	0.50% Below	Rs.2,481,434/-	Being lowest offer			
2	M/S Lachman Das	06-12-2016	Part-A	0.90% Above	Rs.2,519,145/-	Being higher offer			
3	M/S A.G.S & Co.	06-12-2016	Part-A	1% Above	Rs.2,521,838/-	Being highest offer			

The tenders were opened by the tendering committee comprised of the officers as below:

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager

Project Implementation Unit Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

> Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon) . .

**Executive Engineer** Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef) Divisional Accounts Officer MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

**Executive Engineer** Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar (MEMBER)

## **BIDDERS QUALIFICATION REPORT**

### Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad

S.No:	Name of Procuring Agency	Executive Engineer Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad
1	Tender Reference No.	No.TC/G-55/2405 Dated: 16-11-2016
2	Tender Description / Name of Work / Item	M&r Road from Maqbool Memon Hafiz Sandhano Road to Jeelani Farm mile 0/0-0/3.
3	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage – One envelope procedure
4	Name of firm/Bidder	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio
5	N.T.N	Available
6	Registration with P.E.C	Registered
7	Sindh Board of Revenue	Registered
8	Relevant Experience	Available
9	Turnover of at least last three years	Available
10	Funds/ Budget	Available
11	02% Earnest Money	Available
12	Tender fee / Cost of Bidding Document	Deposited

(Mour Oad)

Project Manager

Project Implementation Unit Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

> Hyderabad. (CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon) .

**Executive Engineer** Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef) Divisional Accounts Officer MEMBER

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

**Executive Engineer** Provincial Highway Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highway Sub-Division Tando Allahyar (MEMBER)

### ATTENDANCE SHEET

# FOR PARTICIPATION VARIOUS CONTRACTORS FOR TENDER PROCESS OF N.I.T NO.TC/G-55/2405, DATED 16-11-2016

#### PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION HYDERABAD HELD ON 06-12-2016

S. No.	Name of Contractor/Agency	Signature of Contractors
1	Mls. Mukhteir 8 C.	Junear Car
2	M/s Rashrod Ahmer	Raseed
3	Ms Pix Bux chardro-	R
4	M/s Mamta= Ac. Busho	Moullie
5	M/z Zuly Quar A & Pohitto	(almon
6	MIS lachman tas.	لكيمناداس
7	M/s. Mumko Aci Bughio	albuu =
8	M/s lachman das	ليمطواس
9	Mlg. A.G. SZC	And

(MOUR OAD)

Project Manager

Project Implementation Unit

Hyd-M.P.Khas Dual Carriageway Project

Hyderabad.

(CHAIRMAN)

(Engr: AMJAD AHMED MEMIN)

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (MEMBER)

(Muhammad Lateef)
Divisional Accounts Officer
(MEMBER)

(Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer
Provincial Highway Division
Hyderabad
(SECRETARY/MEMBER)

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer
Provincial Highway Sub-Division
Tando Allahyar
(MEMBER)

#### OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER, PROVINCIAL HIGHWAYS DIVISION, HYDERABAD

No.TC/G-55/

of 2016

Hyderabad, Dated:

/2016

#### MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING

NIT NO: TC/G-55/2405 DATED: 16-11-2016

DATE OF OPENING: 6th December, 2016

A meeting of the Procurement Committee held in the office of the Executive Engineer, Provincial Highways Division Hyderabad under the Chair of Project Manager, Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas dual Carriageway Project Hyderabad.

The below mentioned members of committee attended the meeting to discuss the bids invited for the procurement of the works vide Executive Engineer, PHW Division Hyderabad NIT No. cited above and subsequently hoisted on the SPPRA website and published in country wide leading news papers in Sindh, English and Urdu through Sindh Information Department.

Engr: Mour Oad

In Chair

Project Manager, Project Implementation Unit, Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Dual Carriageway Project, Hyderabad / Chairman

2. Engr: Ghulam Shabbir Memon

Member

Executive Engineer, Provincial Highways Division, Hyd.

3. Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon

Member

Executive Engineer, Hala Irrigation Division, Hyderabad

4. Muhammad Lateef

Member

Divisional Accounts Officer, Hyderabad

5. Ramesh Kumar

Member

Assistant Engineer, Provincial Highways Sub-Division, Tando Allahyar

During course of meeting following points were discussed.

i) The application of contractors applied for issue of tenders were checked in details with issue of tenders after received amount for cost of tender fees / bidding documents. On scrutiny following contractors were found applied for, as detailed below:

S.#	Name of Applicant.	No. of Works applied	Amount Paid	DR #Date
1	M/S Mukhtiar & Co.	01	3000	74/6-12-2016
2	M/S Rasheed Ahmed	01	3000	75/6-12-2016
3	M/S Pir Bux Chandio	01	3000	76/6-12-2016
4	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	01	3000	77/6-12-2016
5	Engr: Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto	01	3000	78/6-12-2016
6	M/S Lachman Das	01	3000	79/6-12-2016
7	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	01	3000	80/6-12-2016
8	M/S Lachman Das	01	3000	81/6-12-2016
9	M/S A.G.S & Co.	01	3000	82/6-12-2016

Page 1 of 2

oul Dry

ii) The process of tenders received back were started at 02:30 PM. The procurement committee opened such tenders at 3:30 PM in presence of all the participating bidders and / or their authorized representatives.

iii) The method of bidding documents observed as one envelope single stage procedure.

iv) The procurement committee observed received back tenders comparison with issued bids one by one works / items as detailed below:

S#	Name of Work	Name of Firm/Bidder	Ranking	Remarks
1.	M&R for Repair of Re-Decking of RCC Slab	M/S Mukhtiar & Co.	1st Lowest	
	Culvert along Ant Samo Wayo to Qadir Dino Shah Road @ 3/2.	M/S Rasheed Ahmed	2nd Lowest	
		M/S Pir Bux Chandio	3rd Lowest	
2.	M&R Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Road @ mile 21/0-24/0 (Town Portion).	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	1st Lowest	
		Engr: Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto	2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest	
		M/S Lachman Das	3rd Lowest	
3.	MADD 17 M 1 1M 117	M/S Mumtaz Ali Bughio	1st Lowest	
	M&R Road from Maqbool Memon Hafiz	M/S Lachman Das	2nd Lowest	
	Sandhano Road to Jeelani Farm mile 0/0-0/3.	M/S A.G.S & Co.	3rd Lowest	

The Procurement Committee thoroughly scrutinized each case / bidding documents by comparing arithmetically and financially with technical sanctioned estimate / Bill of Quantities and criteria for eligibility and minimum qualification as per bidding documents.

#### RECOMMENDATION / DECISION

The due deliberation / scrutiny of each tender document by the Committee and recommended for award of respective work(s) to the lowest evaluated responsive bidder as shown against each and every work / item, after approval from competent authority.

(Ramesh Kumar)

Assistant Engineer Provincial Highways Sub-Division

TandoAllahyar (Member)

(Engr: Ghualm Shabbir Memon)

Executive Engineer Provincial Highways Division Hyderabad Secretary / Member (Muhammad Lateef)

Divisional Accounts Officer (Member)

(Engr: Amjad Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Hala Irrigation Division Hyderabad (Member)

(Engr: Mour Oad)

Project Manager
Project Implementation Unit
Hyderabad-Mirpurkhas Dual Carriageway Project
Hyderabad
(Member)

Member

Member

Member

Member

Chairman