



**REJECTED**

### BID EVALUATION REPORT

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	Directorate of Alternative Energy, Energy Department, Government of Sindh
2.	Tender Reference No.:	DAE/Solar/2016/100/BD4 dated 6 <sup>th</sup> April, 2017
3.	Tender Description/Name of Work/Item:	Supply, Installation & 3 years Operation and Maintenance of 352 Solar PV Systems under project "Electrification Of Primary Health Facilities Through Solar PV Technology"
4.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
5.	Tender Published:	Daily Dawn & Kawish dated 8 <sup>th</sup> April, 2017, and daily Jang dated 10 April, 2017 vide No. INF/KRY/1820/17 SPPRA Website on 11 <sup>th</sup> April, 2017
6.	Total Bid Document Sold:	Six (6)
7.	Total Bids Received:	Four (4 No.)
8.	Bids Opening Date:	Technical on 24 <sup>th</sup> April, 2017
9.	No. of Bids Technically Qualified:	Two (2 No.)
10.	Bid(s) Rejected:	Two (2 No.)
11.	Financial Bid Opening Date:	3 <sup>rd</sup> May, 2017

#### Item Wise Bid Evaluation Report:

S/No	Name of Firm or Bidder	Estimated Cost	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison in terms of estimated cost	Reasons of acceptance/rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6	
A	352 Complete Solar PV System, Remote Monitoring System, Online Biometric attendance system, wiring & accessories, Installation and Transportation & 3 Years O&M						
1.	M/s Renewable Power Pvt. Ltd	Rs. 422,400,000/-	Rs. 267,520,000	1 <sup>st</sup>	36.6% Lower than the estimated cost	Rejected because of bid security submitted is 25% less than specified bid security amount	
2.	M/s Zaffar Enterprises		Rs. 289,750,000		31.4% Lower than the estimated cost	Higher bid rejected	

**(DR) ROBIN AHMED MEMON**  
Additional Director  
Health Services Sindh  
Member

**(IFTEKHAR AHMED)**  
Deputy Director (Off-Grid Solar & Biomass)  
Member/Secretary

**(MEHFOOZ AHMED QAZI)**  
Director Alternative Energy  
Chairman



DAE/Solar/2016/100/BD4  
GOVERNMENT OF SINDH  
DIRECTORATE OF ALTERNATIVE ENERGY  
ENERGY DEPARTMENT

## COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

Name of Work: Supply, Installation & 3 years Operation and Maintenance of 352 Solar PV Systems under project "Electrification Of Primary Health Facilities Through Solar PV Technology"

S/No	Description of Work	Estimated Cost in Rs.			M/s Renewable Power Pvt. Ltd.		M/s Zaffar Enterprises	
		Qty.	Unit Cost	Total	Unit Cost	Total	Unit Cost	Total
1	Single Complete Solar PV System, Remote Monitoring System, Online Biometric attendance system, wiring & accessories, Installation and Transportation & 3 Years O&M	352	Rs. 1,200,000	RS. 422,400,000	Rs. 760,000	Rs. 267,520,000	Rs. 823153.41	Rs. 289,750,000

**(DR. MOBIN AHMED MEMON)**  
Additional Director  
DG Health Services Sindh  
Member

**(IFTEKHAR AHMED)**  
Deputy Director (Off-Grid Solar & Biomass)  
Member/Secretary

**(MEHFOOZ AHMED QAZI)**  
Director Alternative Energy  
Chairman

- Bid Evaluation Report for Procurement of Solar PV Systems under Project "Electrification of Primary Health Facilities Through Solar PV Technology"

Bid Evaluation Check List

Sr. No.	Item	EBR Energy Pakistan Pvt Ltd	Renewable Power Pvt Ltd	Zafar Enterprises	Solar Tech Pvt Ltd
1	Specific Works Data	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2	Separate Technical & Financial Bids	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3	P.E.C. Registration in Relevant Category	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4	Income Tax Registration	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5	Sales Tax Registration	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6	Registration with Sindh Revenue Board	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7	List of similar projects undertaken	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
8	Project of Solar Solution undertaken worth Rs.300 million during last 3 years	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
9	List of Experienced Staff with CVs	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
10	Certificate of Non Black Listing	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
11	Financial Statement of last 3 Years	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
12	Manufacturer's Quality	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
13	Schedule B to bid duly filled	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
14	Response on Schedule C to bid	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
15	Response on Schedule D to bid	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Remarks		Not Qualified due to not undertaken a Rs.300 M Project during last 3 years	Qualified for Technical Evaluation	Qualified for Technical Evaluation	Not Qualified because the Proposal is non responsive in terms of schedule B to bid of BD and therefore cannot be evaluated

Technical Evaluation Methods

Bidder will be qualified for financial opening if attained 75% marks

Sr. No.	Item	Max. Marks	EBR Energy Pakistan Pvt Ltd	Renewable Power Pvt Ltd	Zafar Enterprises	Solar Tech Pvt Ltd
1	Understanding of the Assignment	5		4.5	4.5	
2	Quality of staff	5		4.5	4.5	
3	Financial stability (Turn over Rs.150 million minimum)	10		7.5	10	
4	Previous experience in similar projects- Letter on performance of installed systems from departments be attached	10		10	10	
5	Quality of the project implementation/management plan	10		8	8	
6	Operation and Maintenance strategy	10		8	8	
7	User information strategy	5		4	4	
8	PV panel	10		10	10	
9	Charge Controller	5		5	5	
10	Battery	10		10	10	
11	Inverter	10		10	10	
12	Remote Monitoring & Biometric System	5		5	5	
13	Cabinet & Mounting Structure	5		5	5	
Total		100		91.50	94.00	
Qualified for Financial Opening			No	Yes	Yes	No

(Engr. Arif Sharif Rajput)  
Assistant Director (On-Grid Solar)  
Member/Secretary

(Iftekhar Ahmed)  
Deputy Director (Off-Grid Solar & Biomass)/Member

(Engr. Shahnawaz Farhan Khahro)  
Deputy Director (Wind)  
Chairman





GOVERNMENT OF SINDH  
DIRECTORATE OF ALTERNATIVE ENERGY  
ENERGY DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

**SUB: MEETING OF THE PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE – OPENING OF FINANCIAL BIDS FOR PROCUREMENT OF SOLAR PV SYSTEMS UNDER THE PROJECT “ELECTRIFICATION OF PRIMARY HEALTH FACILITIES THROUGH SOLAR PV TECHNOLOGY**

The subject meeting was held on 3<sup>rd</sup> May, 2017 at 3:30 pm at in the committee room of Energy Department, Karachi. List of participants is at annexure-I.

2. Followed by the welcome note, the Secretary invited representatives of the bidders to examine the sealed proposal envelopes before their opening. Following financial bid of technically qualified and stand eligible bids were opened i) M/s Renewable Power Pvt. Ltd & ii) M/s Zaffar Enterprises. Earnest money and total bid cost was duly announced and noted as under:

S/No	FIRM	EARNEST MONEY	BID OFFERED
1	M/s Renewable Power Pvt. Ltd	Rs.5,000,000/- (Rupees five million only)	Rs.267,520,000/- (Rupees two hundred sixty seven million five hundred and twenty thousand only)
2	M/s Zaffar Enterprises	Rs.7,243,750/- (Rupees seven million two hundred forty three thousand seven hundred and fifty only)	Rs.289,750,000/- (Rupees two hundred eighty nine thousand seven hundred and fifty only)

3. The Committee observed that M/s Renewable Power Pvt. Ltd. has submitted the lowest price for supply of 352 solar PV systems including transportation, installation and 3 years O&M services but the bid is not followed by specified bid security amount i.e. 6,688,000/- (Rupees six million six hundred and eighty eight thousand only) @ 2.5% of

quoted bid price). The supplied bid security is 25% less than the specified bid security amount.

4. The Committee was of the view that since the bid security provided by M/s Renewable Power Pvt. Ltd. is 25% less than the specified bid security amount and this shortage of security is greater than permissible limit under SPPRA guidelines therefore the bid may be considered as non responsive.

5. The Committee also observed that M/s Zaffar Enterprises is the second lowest bidder but there is a huge difference of Rs.22,230,000/- between the two bidders therefore the SPPRA may be consulted before taking decision whether to re-invite the tender or select M/s Zaffar Enterprises for the assignment and based on SPPRA guidelines the Procuring Agency may decide.

6. **Decision:**

- i. The Procuring Agency will approach SPPRA for their advice whether to re-invite the tender or to select M/s Zaffar Enterprises as qualified bidder
- ii. Based on SPPRA advice further steps in the procurement process may be taken.

6. The Meeting ended with vote of thanks to each other.

\*\*\*\*\*



**(IFTEKHAR AHMED)**

Deputy Director (Off-Grid Solar &  
Biomass)  
Member/Secretary



**(DR. MOBIN AHMED MEMON)**

Additional Director  
DG Health Services Sindh  
Member



**(ENGR. MEHFOOZ AHMED QAZI)**

Director Alternative Energy  
Chairman

## LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

**SUB:** MEETING OF THE PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE FOR THE PROJECT TITLED "ELECTRIFICATION OF PRIMARY HEALTH FACILITIES THROUGH SOLAR PV TECHNOLOGY"

(Held on 3-5-2017, in the Committee Room, Energy Department, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, State Lift Building No. 3, Opp. CM House, Karachi.)

S.No.	Name	Designation	
<b><u>Directorate of Alternative Energy, Govt of Sindh</u></b>			
1.	Mr. Mehfooz Ahmed Qazi	Director Alternative Energy	For Chair
2.	Mr. Iftexhar Ahmed	Deputy Director (Off-Grid Solar & Biomass)	Member/Secretary
<b><u>Health Department, Government of Sindh</u></b>			
1.	Dr. Mubin Ahmed Memon	Additional Director DG Health Services Sindh	Member

====