# THE MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE OF SITE LIMITED HELD UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF CHIEF ENGINEER/ CHAIRMAN PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE.

The meeting of Procurement Committee held on 06/06/2016 at 1.00 p.m. to open the Technical bids for the bidders invited for the works vide NIT dated: 17/05/2016, on the basis of Single Stage Two Envelope procedure. Bidders / Representative, who were present, signed the attendance sheet.

- 1. The sealed technical bids were opened at 1.00 pm the tenders were placed on the table.
- 2. There was no envelope marked "Withdrawal".
- 3. There was no envelope marked "Modification".
- 4. After counting the tenders each tender envelop was identified by representative of the bidder.
- 5. The Bids received after 1.00pm (scheduled time) for submission of bids were not allowed by the Procurement Committee.
- 6. The Financial bids were kept in the tender box and sealed in the presence of the bidders.

Administrative (DMC)
Local Government Deptt:
Government of Sindh.

Representative

Industries & Commerce

Department.

Muhammad Ali Soomo -Dy: Divector, Industries

(Shamsuddin Sahito)

Chief Engineer, SITE Limited, (CHAIRMAN)

Mr. Rehan Arif

Divisional Accounts Office,

K.M.C.

Mr. Arbab Ali Khan

Director Finance,

SITE Ltd, Karachi.

#### Civil Mechanical & Electric Works for Development of Infrastructure of SITE LARKANA I/c Water Treatment Plant Sewerage Treatment Plant & Allied Works.

The Tenders were received and dropped on 06/06/2016. The Technical Proposals were opened on same day at 1:00 p.m. The following contractors / representatives were submitted.

S. No.	Company	Technical Financial
1	Zareef Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers	Submitted & Retained
2	United Construction Co.	Not Participation
3	Kamran & Company	not Parlicipated.
4	Sachal Engineering	Mat Participated.
5	King Enterprises	Not participated
6	Syed Ameer & Brother	Sabmiffed & Refamed
7	Usmani International Associates	fubmitted & Refaired
8	Gul Construction Co.	Submitted and Refained
9	Saeed Khan Construction Company	not participated
10	Sultan Mehmood & Company	Not Participated.
11	Inter Construction	Not Participates.
12	Eco West International	Ment Participated.

Mr Arbab Ali Khan, Director Finance SITE Ltd Karachi (Member)

Representative of Industries & Commerce

GOS. (Member)

Mir Khareefo Nazeer Ahmed,

Executive Engineer,

**Local Government Deptt:** 

Government of Sindh. (Member)

Mr Rehan Arif, Divisonal Account Officer

KMC (Member)

Mr Shamsuddin Sahito, Chief Engineer,

SITE Ltd, Karachi (Chairman)

Client:

SINDH INDUSTRIAL TRADING ESTATES (GUARANTEE) LIMITED

Project:

CIVIL MECHANICAL & ELECTRIC WORKS FOR DEVELOPMENT OF INFRASTRUCTURE OF SITE LARKANA I/C WATER TREATMENT PLANT, SEWERAGE TREATMENT PLANT & ALLIED WORKS.

Sub Head: Assessment Report on Technical Bid

(Assessment Criteria: minimum 70 qualifying marks)

1		T		N	l N							
	C	Ь	Ø	A (ii)	2 A (i)	2	1		1 (i)	_		*
	If Partnership, Names of Partners & their Positions	b If Joint Venture, Name of Joint Venture Partners with name of Leading Partner	Type of Business Organization	2 A (ii) Ownership and Organizational Structure of the firm	2 A (i) Name, address, telephone, fax numbers and e-mail address of firm/individual;	Profile of Firm / Contractor:	Registration with Federal Board of Revenue for Withholding Tax and GST and Sindh Revenue Board for SST.  (Mandatory Requirement).	Engineering Council in category C-1 and above in the relevant specialized field i.e. CE-01, CE-02, CE-09, CE-10, EE-05, EE-06, ME-06 (Mandatory Requirement).	Valid Registration for the year 2016 with Pakistan	Eligibility:	2	Qualification Parameters
											3	Max. Marks (Sub Total)
							Mandatory	Mandatory		6	4	Max. Total Marks
	N/A	N/A	Government Contractors		<b>.</b>		<	31/12/2016	CB (# 00176)		5	M/s. Zarif Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers
1							<	<				Marks Obtained
	N/A	A/N	Government Contractors	813	~		\ \	31/12/2016	C-1 (# 01091)		9	M/s Haji Syed Ameer & Brothers
				3 0 11	×		<	<				Marks Obtained
	N/A	Nr	Government Contractors	aren da	<		<	31/12/2016 In association C-A (# 00030) 31/12/2016	C-A (# 00043)		7	M/s. Usmani International Associates (Pvt.) Ltd.
				1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		ĺ	<	<				Marks Obtained
	Partnership	N/A	Government Contractors	and a second analysis of the second and the second	<		<	31/12/2016	C-1 (# 00078)		8	M/s. Gul Construction Co.
							<	<				Marks Obtained

	-	*1 · ·						_	1					-
	_	(				3			Z (III)		0	d	_	.s. *
		condition; (3 for each assignment)	04.06.00.00.00.00.00.00.00.00.00.00.00.00.			List of similar assignments with cost, under-taken in the last 05 years; (3 for each assignment)	Experience and past performance.		rear or establishment; (One Mark for every 10 years)	Under Present Management Since	If Proprietorship, Name & Title of Owner	If Corporation, Name and Title of Principals	2	Qualification Parameters
	15.00	j.	15.00						5.00				ω	Max. Marks
		-	0					5.00	0				4	(Sub Total)  Max. Total Marks
A A		Road Rs.558, 345 & 273 m. @ 2.0 Bldg. Rs.64,90,78 m. @ 0.50		@ U.50	Sew. Rs. 19.57 m. (v.small) Bldg. Rs. 64,90,78 m.	IDW Rs.53.88 m. (v.small) Road Rs.558, 345 & 273 m. @ 2.0			2007	since start	Proprietorship	N/A	5	M/s. Zarif Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers
A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	7.50	1.5	7.50	.is	0.00	0.00		5.00						Marks Obtained
		IDW Rs. 580 m. @ 3.0 Road 518, 105 m. @ 2.0 Sew. Rs. 30 m. @ 0.50		Bldg. Rs. 164, 197, 133 m. @ 0.50	Sew./Drain Rs.143, 208, 108 m. @ 0.5	IDW Rs.580,627 m. @ 3.0 Road Rs. 518, 561, 493, 115, 105 m, @ 2.0	5		1989	since start	Proprietorship	N/A	6	M/s Haji Syed Ameer & Brothers
\ \ \	7.00	3.0 4.0 0.0	15.00	1.5 1.50 19.00	10.0	6.0		5.00						Marks Obtained
		×		etc.)	(Main experience is of bridges, change over	Road Rs. 597 m. @ 2.0 Bldg. Rs. 82 m. @ 0.5			2006	since start	N/A	N/A	7	M/s. Usmani International Associates (Pvt.) Ltd.
	×	×	2.50			2.0 0.5		5.00						Marks Obtained
		IDW Rs. 945, 842 m. @ 3.0		280, 346 m. @ 0.5 Bldg. Rs. 166, 821, 730, 453 m. @ 0.5	Road Ks. 285,240,232 m. @ 2.0 Drain, W/S Rs. 277,	IDW Rs.945, 783, 842 m. @ 3.0			1985	since start	N/A	N/A	&	M/s. Gul Construction Co.
( 8 -	6.00	6	15.00	1.50 2 <u>.0</u> 18.50	6.0	9.0		5.00						Marks Obtained

								_											
								<b>=</b>						<b>3</b>	4				s. #
	05 Nos. DAE 08 Years experience 05 Projects	Brief CVs of key personnel be attached;		01 No. BE (Mech.) 08 Years experience 05 Projects	01 No. BE (Elect.) 08 Years experience 05 Projects		03 Nos. BE (Civil) 10 Years experience 05 Projects	Experience:	05 Nos. DAE	01 No. BE (Mechanical) max marks 5				Apadamia mulification.	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience.		Performance certificates of assignments / projects completed are to be attached.	2	Qualification Parameters
		7	30.00							25.00								ω	Max. Marks
	_		0							8						_			(Sub Total)
55.00	×								0							30.00		4	Max. Total Marks
	01 No.	Z.					(1 year experience)	B.E.(C) 1 No. = 0	01 No.			Certificate are not submitted)	(Engrs. given in PEC	B.E.(C) 1 No. $\times$ 5 = 5			<	51	M/s. Zarif Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers
5.00	×		0						×	5						15.00			Marks Obtained
	05 Nos.	<				B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 6=06	B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 6=06	B.E.(C) 3 Nos. x 6=18	05 Nos.			B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 5=05	B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 5=05	B.E.(C) 3 Nos. x 5=15			<	6	M/s Haji Syed Ameer & Brothers
55.00	×		30.00						×	25						22.00			Marks Obtained
	06 Nos.	<				B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 6=06	B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 6=06	B.E.(C) 3 Nos. x 6=18	06 Nos.			B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 5=05	B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 5=05	B.E.(C) 3 Nos. x 5=15			<	7	M/s. Usmani International Associates (Pvt.) Ltd.
55.00	×		30						×	25						2.50			Marks Obtained
	02 Nos.	4		submitted)	Certificate are not	(Engrs. given in PEC	B.Sc. 2 Nos. x 6 = 12	B.E.(C) 1 No. x 6 = 6	02 Nos.	submitted)	Certificate are not	(Engrs. given in PEC	B.Sc. 2 Nos. x 5 = 10	B.E.(C) 1 No. $\times$ 5 = 5		4	<b>,</b>	8	M/s. Gul Construction Co.
33.00	×		18.00						×	15						21.00			Marks Obtained

THE STATE OF THE S

1			, ,								
	(iv)	(iii)	(ii)	(i)	6		3	€	Ο'n	_	S. #
	Facilities of Bank Credit Line	Income tax return for the last 03 years.	Annual turnover (Rs. 500 Million)of the last 03 years. 05 Marks	Documentary evidence of financial position, bank statement or audited accounts of the last 03 years.	Financial.		Details of equipments, machineries and transport to be hired/leased by firm/contractor;	Equipment Proposed for the Project.  (i) Details of equipments, machineries and transport owned by firm/contractor;  If relevant equipment are owned by contractor.	Equipment.	2	Qualification Parameters
# 3			5.00					5.00		ယ	Max. Marks (Sub Total)
5.00						5.00				4	Max. Total Marks
1 1 20 2	Nii	Missing for 2014, 2015	Rs. 673.95 + 995.7 m. of 2013 & 2014 only	Bank letter of 2014. Audit Report of last 03 years missing. Bank statement incomplete			×	* Insufficient shutering  * Vibrator missing  * Scafolding missing		5	M/s. Zarif Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers
0			0			2.00		2			Marks Obtained
# A	Rs. 2,000 m.	<	Rs.1359.543 m. (Av)	Audit Report			×	<		6	M/s Haji Syed Ameer & Brothers
5.00	v		5.00			5.00					Marks Obtained
a constant	Rs. 9,000 m.	<	Rs.1187.268 m. (Av)	Audit Report			×	<		7	M/s. Usmani International Associates (Pvt.) Ltd.
5.00			5.00			5.00		5.00			Marks Obtained
	Rs. 500 + 300 m.		Rs. 3035.525 m. (Av)	Audit Report			×	<		8	M/s. Gul Construction Co.
5.00	· ·		5.00			5.00		5.00			Marks Obtained

_	_																
							3					Ξ	4			_	S. #
	05 Nos. DAE 08 Years experience 05 Projects	Brief CVs of key personnel be attached;		01 No. BE (Mech.) 08 Years experience 05 Projects	01 No. BE (Elect.) 08 Years experience 05 Projects		<b>Experience:</b> 03 Nos. BE (Civil) 10 Years experience 05 Projects	05 Nos. DAE	01 No. BE (Mechanical) max marks 5			••	Key Personnel Qualification & Experience.		Performance certificates of assignments / projects completed are to be attached.	2	Qualification Parameters
			30.00						25.00							ω	Max. Marks (Sub Total)
55.00	×							0						30.00		4	Max. Total Marks
	01 No.	Z.					5.E.(C) 1 N0. = 0 (1 year experience)	01 No.			Certificate are not submitted)	(Engrs. given in PEC			4	5	M/s. Zarif Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers
5.00	×		0					×	5					15.00			Marks Obtained
	05 Nos.	<				B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 6=06	B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 6=06	05 Nos.			B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 5=05	B.E.(C) 3 Nos. x 5=15 B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 5=05			4	6	M/s Haji Syed Ameer & Brothers
55.00	×		30.00					×	25					22.00			Marks Obtained
	06 Nos.	<				$\leq$	B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 6=18	5			B.E.(M) 1 Nos. x 5=05	B.E.(C) 3 Nos. x 5=15 B.E.(E) 1 Nos. x 5=05	1		<	7	M/s. Usmani International Associates (Pvt.) Ltd.
55.00	×		30					×	25					2.50			Marks Obtained
	02 Nos.	<		submitted)	Certificate are not	(Engrs. given in PEC	B.Sc. 2 Nos. x 6 = 12	02 Nos.	submitted)	Certificate are not	(Engrs. given in PEC	B.E.(C) 1 No. $\times$ 5 = 5 B.Sc. 2 Nos. $\times$ 5 = 10			<	8	M/s. Gul Construction Co.
33.00	×		18.00					×	15					21.00			Marks Obtained

					8		(ii)	(i)	7	_	#
Mr Shamsuddin Sahito Chief Engineer,SITE Ltd, Karachi. (CHAIRMAN)	However, the response of M/s Gul Construction Co. through their Affidavit dated 16-06-2016 (now attached with the Bid) shows that they have furnished significantly inaccurate and misleading information.	* Note:  During our checking, we noticed that M/s Gul Construction Co. has proposed Engineer Ghulam Asghar Shaikh as Senior Project Manager for execution of work whereas he is presently representing as active Govt. Official for our another running project. For this reason we requested all the bidders, vide our letter No. IDG/SITE/2016/011-1 to 011-4 dated 15-06-2016 (copy already sent to you), "to furnish Affidavit on Stamp Paper that Engineers / Technical Key Personnel shown in your Technical Proposal / Bid are still your employee and working with your organization."	Total Marks		Work Methodology		Affidavit that the firm has never been blacklisted	Details of disputes / Litigation or Arbitration with Client (s)	Litigation	2	Qualification Parameters
A.,	So. throion.	structi ovt. Ot opy alr ee anc								ω	Max. Marks
Division	ough thei	on Co. ha fficial for eady sent	100.00	0		0				4	(Sub Total)  Max. Total Marks
Mr Rehan Arif Divisional Account Officer KMC (MEMBER)	ir Affidavit dated 16-06-2	as proposed Engineer Gour another running protto you), "to furnish Affida with your organization."	0	×			Nii	Nii		<b>C</b> I	M/s. Zarif Khan Hussain Zai & Brothers
Mr. Kh. Exect Gov	016 (nov	ihulam A oject. Fo wit on St	27.00	0		0					Marks Obtained
Mr. Khaleefo Nazeer Ahmed Executive Engineer Local Government Deptt: Government Of Sindh. (MEMBER)	v attached with the Bid	r Ghulam Asghar Shaikh as Senior Project Manage project. For this reason we requested all the bidders, idavit on Stamp Paper that Engineers / Technical Key		<b>\</b>			<	<		6	M/s Haji Syed Ameer & Brothers
Mr. SIT	) shows	<b>ior Proj</b> sted all t ers / Te	92.00	0		0					Marks Obtained
Mr. Arbab Ali Khan Director Finance, SITE Ltd, Karachi. (MEMBER)	s that they have furr	ect Manager for execution the bidders, vide our letter schnical Key Personnel sho		4			<	4		7	M/s. Usmani International Associates (Pvt.) Ltd.
Rep Deputy	nished	ecution of letter No. lel shown	72.50	0		0					Marks Obtained
My Muhament At Scome Representative from Director of Died Findustries GOS.  (MEMBER)		of work	See * note below:	Z			<	<		8	M/s. Gul Construction Co.
of of		f	69.00	0	12	0					Marks Obtained

## SINDH INDUSTRIAL TRADING ESTATE LIMITED

### **Attendance Sheet For Procurement Committee**

The Tenders were received and dropped on 06/06/2016. The Technical Proposals were opened on same day at 1:00 p.m.

Sr no	Name	Signature
1	Mr Shamsuddin Sahito, Chief Engineer, SITE Ltd, Karachi (Chairman)	5
2	Mr. Muhamad Ali Soomo Representative of Industries & Commerce GOS. (MEMBER) Deputy Breeby, Industries	AM
3	Mr Khaleefo Nazeer Ahmed, Executive Engineer, Local Government Deptt: Government of Sindh. (Member)	Attitute
4	Mr Rehan Arif, Divisonal Account Officer KMC (member)	
5	Mr Arbab Ali Khan, Director Finance SITE Ltd Karachi (member)	1.

## SINDH INDUSTRIAL TRADING ESTATE LIMITED

## ATTENDENCE SHEET of Contractors/Representatives

The Tenders were received and dropped on 06/06/2016. The Technical Proposals were opened on same day at 1:00 p.m. The following contractors / representatives were present.

	The Sea	led Tenders Submitted and Opene	d Before us at Scheduled To	ere present.
SR. NO.	Name of Person	Name of Firm/ company	Contact Cell No.	Signature
1	Engl. Rehem Kaheen	Verneum Int'l Associate	0345-2326152	Rahi
2	Azeen Khan	Mr. Haji Sjedameer	03009286985	Car Deen J
3	Zia i o Rehman	Gul constauction	03333158171	Plane o
4	MANZOOR MEHDI	1.D.G. COMSCUTANT	0321-2422600	8 Mm 75/6/10
5				\6/6/ <sub>10</sub>
6	V .			
7				
8				
9				5
10				
11			-	
12				
13		5		
14		-		
15				