

# KARACHI WATER & SEWERAGE BOARD



## TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

on

**Detailed Design &  
Construction Supervision**

**Greater Karachi Bulk  
Water Supply Scheme**

**K-IV**

**Phase-I, 260 MGD**

November 2014

## KARACHI WATER & SEWERAGE BOARD

### Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme **K-IV** Phase-I, 260 MGD

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

S.NO	DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO
1	Executive Summary.....	01
2	Background .....	02
3	Evaluation Criteria .....	02
4	Submission of Firm's Proposals (Technical & Financial) .....	03
5	Formulation of Consultants Selection Committee / Marking of Firms.....	04
6	Analysis of the Proposals .....	05
7	Summary of Scores and Conclusion.....	25

**Executive Summary**

The Members of the Consultant Selection Committee constituted for the Evaluation of Technical Proposals of the Pre-qualified Consultancy Firms for 1<sup>st</sup> Phase (260 MGD) of K-IV Project, carried out the task assigned to them as per the approved T.O.R. The process was conducted through several meetings of the Committee, wherein thorough discussions / deliberations were carried out to evaluate the proposals in detail, and accordingly scores / marks were awarded to each Prequalified Consultancy Firm, which are summarized as under:-

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm	Score	Status
1.	M/s. MMP Pakistan Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. Associated Consultant Engineers (ACE) M/s. Mott McDonald International Ltd. (MMIL) -UK	70.723	Pass
2.	M/s. E.A. Consulting Pvt. Ltd. in association with SAMAN Corporation of Korea, ISAN Corporation of Korea, NEC Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	45.70	Fail
3.	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan in association with Techno Consult Int'l.	75.393	Pass
4.	M/s. Osmani & Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. Doxiadis.	71.218	Pass

After having determined the compatibility and consistency of the Technical Proposals with the L.O.I / R.F.P Document, three (03) Engineering Firms / Consortia are found eligible to take part in the Financial Bidding for the assignment of Detailed Design & Construction Supervision of Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme K-IV, Phase-I, 260 MGD. The Financial Proposals of the technically approved Consultancy Firms will be unsealed in presence of the respective firms representatives on the date and time to be announced later on.

The selection of the Consultants is carried out strictly in accordance with approved selection procedure contained in SPPRA Rules 2010.

The analysis of every individual proposal is discussed in brief under **Section - 4** of this report, with details of marks distribution exhibited in Table - I of the report.



**SECTION - 1**

**1.1 Background**

In order to execute the Design / Construction Supervision and other tasks as per KW&SB requirements, the services of an Engineering Firm is required for the Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme K-IV, Phase-I, 260 MGD.

Accordingly, KW&SB by ~~adopting~~ <sup>adopted</sup> International Competitive Bidding (I.C.B) ~~process~~, through publication in press invited the Engineering Firms to provide Expression of Interest for performing the Engineering Services for Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme K-IV, Phase-I, 260 MGD. Four Engineering Firms / Consortia were short-listed and were informed accordingly.

The Requests for Technical & Financial Proposals were invited from the short-listed Engineering Firms for which LOI / Proposal documents were issued to these Engineering Firms in accordance to SPPRA Rules 2010.

All the four Engineering Firms / Consortia submitted their Technical & Financial Proposals by 04<sup>th</sup> September 2014.

**1.2 Evaluation Criteria**

The L.O.I / R.F.P Document included an Evaluation Criteria, which was duly approved by the Competent Authority for carrying out the evaluation of Technical & Financial Proposals submitted by short-listed Engineering Firms. The maximum marks allocated are 100 and the firms, who obtains minimum of 70% marks will be eligible for the opening of their Financial Proposals as per SPPRA Rules 2010 for the selection of Engineering Firms.

The distribution of the marks as per the Criteria under Section - 10 of the L.O.I/ R.F.P Document are as follows: -

**Table: 1**

Section	Category	Maximum Marks
Section - I	Specific Experience of the Consultants Relevant to the Assignment	10
Section - II	Adequacy of the Proposed Technical Approach, Methodology and Work Plan in Responding to the Terms of Reference	40
Section - III	Key Professional Staff Qualification and Competence for the Assignment (Design Team)	35
Section - IV	Key Professional Staff Qualification and Competence for the Assignment (Supervision Team)	15

**Mandatory Requirement**

- i) Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of international repute and with minimum 15 years of experience.
- ii) For the Key Professional Staff (Design & Construction Supervision Team) (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded.

**SECTION - 2****SUBMISSION OF FIRM'S PROPOSALS**  
**(TECHNICAL & FINANCIAL)**

Two envelopes system was adopted for the submission of Technical and Financial Proposals by the firms, accordingly, they submitted their proposals with one Technical Proposal in original alongwith two copies, and one original sealed Financial Proposal.

The following Engineering Firms / Consortia have submitted their proposals on or by the last date of submission: -

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm
1.	M/s. MMP Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s. Associated Consultant Engineers (ACE) M/s. Mott McDonald International Ltd. (MMIL) -UK
2.	M/s. E.A. Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s. SAMAN Corporation of Korea, M/s. ISAN Corporation of Korea, M/s. NEC Consultants Pvt. Ltd.
3.	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s. Techno Consult International.
4.	M/s. Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s. Doxiadis.

**Technical Proposals**

In accordance with the Terms & Conditions of the LOI / R.F.P Document, the proposals received by KW&SB were opened in the presence of Consultant Selection Committee on 04<sup>th</sup> September 2014. The Technical proposals of each of the four Engineering Firms were presented to all the members of the Consultant Selection Committee for the purpose of review and evaluation.

**Financial Proposals**

The sealed Financial Proposals of all the four Engineering Firms submitted alongwith the Technical Proposals were kept in the office of Project Director [K-IV], for safe custody and opening of the same, after approval of the results of Technical Proposals.



**SECTION - 3****3.1 Formulation of Consultants Selection Committee / Marking of Firms**

The Managing Director, KW&SB constituted a Consultants Selection Committee for the purpose of evaluating the Technical Proposals submitted by the Prequalified Engineering Firms. Later on, the Consultants Selection Committee was reconstituted on 15<sup>th</sup> August 2014, which comprises of the following members:-

1.	Mr. Qutubuddin Shaikh	Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB	(Convener)
2.	Mr. Ayoob Shaikh	Chief Engineer (K-IV), KW&SB	Member
3.	Mr. Faheem Junejo	Director General (Monitoring & Evaluation), Local Govt. Deptt. GoS	Member
4.	Mr. Moazzam Ali Mari	Dy. Secretary (Budget & Expenditure), Finance Deptt. GOS	Member
5.	Mr. Adnan Nazeer	Assistant Chief (PP&H), P&D Department, GOS	Member
6.	Mr. Khurram Shahzad	Project Manager (S-III), KW&SB	Member
7.	Mr. Asif Ali Khan	Dy. Project Manager (K-IV), KW&SB	Member
8.	Mr. Zafar Ahmed	Dy. Project Manager (K-IV), KW&SB	Member
9.	Mr. Saleem Ahmed	Executive Engineer (Water), Gullistan-e-Jauhar, KW&SB	Member / Secretary
10.	Syed Adil Gilani	Transparency International Pakistan	Observer

The Committee held various meetings for the Evaluation of the Technical Proposals from time to time. All members of the Consultant Selection Committee carried out the assessment of the firm's proposals independently comparing it with different requirements as envisaged in the Evaluation Criteria. During the process, the Committee Members exchanged views and sought clarification of certain issues, which have been incorporated in the report accordingly.

The system for the allocation of marks as per Section - 10 of L.O.I / R.F.P Document is adopted and the status on the basis of marks obtained by the respective firms is illustrated as under:-

Sr #	Name of the Firm	Marks obtained	Status
1.	M/s. MMP Pakistan Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. Associated Consultant Engineers (ACE) M/s. Mott McDonald International Ltd. (MMIL) -UK	70.723	Pass
2.	M/s. E.A. Consulting Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. SAMAN Corporation of Korea, M/s. ISAN Corporation of Korea, M/s. NEC Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	45.70	Fail
3.	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan in association with M/s. Techno Consult Int'l.	75.393	Pass
4.	M/s. Osmani & Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. Doxiadis.	71.218	Pass

Being consistent and responsive to the requirement of Section-10 of L.O.I / R.F.P Document, three (03) Engineering Firms / Consortia are passed and found eligible to take part in the opening of Financial Proposals publicly on the date and time approved by the Competent Authority.

**SECTION - 5**  
**SUMMARY OF SCORES AND CONCLUSION**

The Technical Proposals have been evaluated in accordance with the approved Evaluation Criteria and the marks are allocated accordingly as referred in L.O.I / R.F.P Document and the Addendums issued periodically.

The Proposals have been checked and examined in detail. The summarized result is exhibited as under, showing the overall status and the marks obtained by the individual Engineering Firms / Consortia:-

**Table 5.1**

Sr. No.	Name of Firm / Consortia	Marks obtained	Status
1.	M/s. MMP Pakistan Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. Associated Consultant Engineers (ACE) M/s. Mott McDonald International Ltd. (MMIL) -UK	70.723	Pass
2.	M/s. E.A. Consulting Pvt. Ltd. in association with SAMAN Corporation of Korea, ISAN Corporation of Korea, NEC Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	45.70	Fail
3.	M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan in association with Techno Consult Int'l.	75.393	Pass
4.	M/s. Osmani & Company Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. Doxiadis.	71.218	Pass

The Consultant Selection Committee, in the light of the evaluation carried out and subsequent allocation of marks to the Engineering Firms / Consortia as per the approved Selection Criteria explained in the L.O.I Document, finally tabulated the results of the Engineering Firms / Consortia as presented in Table 5.1 above.


  
**Saleem Ahmed**  
Executive Engineer (Water)  
Gulistan-e-Jauhar, KW&SB  
(Member / Secretary)

  
**Zafar Ahmed**  
Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)


  
**Asif Ali Khan**  
Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

  
**Khuram Shahzad**  
Project Manager  
(S-III) KW&SB (Member)

  
**Ayoob Shaikh**  
Chief Engineer (K-IV),  
KW&SB (Member)

  
**Adnan Nazeer**  
Assistant Chief (PP&H),  
P&D Dept., GOS. / Member

  
**Moazzam Ali Mari**  
Dy. Secretary (Budget & Expenditure),  
Finance Department GOS (Member)

  
**Faheem Ahmed Junejo**  
Director General (M&E)  
Local Govt. Deptt. GOS (Member)

  
**Qutubuddin Shaikh**  
Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB  
(CONVENER)

# ANNEXURE - "A"



**M/s. MMP Pakistan Pvt. Ltd.**

in association with

**M/s. Associated Consultant Engineers (ACE)**

**M/s. Mott McDonald International Ltd. (MMIL) – U K**

## EVALUATION CRITERIA Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. M.M. Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. ACE / M/s. M.M.I.L, UK

Section - I

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>I</b>	<b>SPECIFIC EXPERIENCE OF THE CONSULTANTS RELEVANT TO THE ASSIGNMENT</b>	<b>10 Points</b>	
<b>A</b>	Design (Preliminary/Detailed) of major water supply & allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
<b>b</b>	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
<b>c</b>	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
<b>d</b>	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
<b>e</b>	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	5.00
<b>B</b>	Construction supervision of major water supply projects and allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
<b>b</b>	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
<b>c</b>	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
<b>d</b>	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
<b>e</b>	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	5.00
<b>Total :</b>		<b>10 Points</b>	<b>10.00</b>

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

### Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. M.M. Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. ACE / M/s. M.M.I.L, UK

Section - II

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>II</b>	<b>ADEQUACY OF THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND WORK PLAN IN RESPONDING TO THE TERMS OF REFERENCE</b>	<b>40 Points</b>	
a	Understanding of the Scope of Work and Design considerations of K-IV Project (Detailed Description)	6 Points	5.00
b	Understanding of the Time Constraints of the K-IV and its design and supervision stages	4 Points	2.00
c	Specialized Services, skills and access to particular technologies of a consultant, and his approach to Design and Construction Supervision of the K-IV project	4 Points	2.00
d	Technical approach & Methodology of the detailed Engineering Design and its various components	6 Points	4.00
e	Methodology of Construction Supervision and its various components	4 Points	3.00
f	Work Plan: for submittals & deliverables matching with the work plan. Logical sequence of tasks and coverage of all Principal Activities envisaged by the Engineering Firms with respect to the TOR	4 Points	3.00
g	Organization & Staffing Manning Schedule for both Design & Supervision	4 Points	3.00
h	Activity Schedule displaying each and every activity by bar chart	4 Points	3.00
i	Quality Management System covering complexity of the assignment with assured best standard quality	4 Points	2.00
<b>Total :</b>		<b>40 Points</b>	<b>27.00</b>



**EVALUATION CRITERIA**  
**Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project**

M/s. M.M. Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. ACE / M/s. M.M.I.L. UK

Section - III

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	General Qualification Design Stage (30%)				Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)				Experience in Region and Language (10%)				Marks Obtained (A+B+C)
			Ph.D (Full Marks)	Masters (70% Marks)	Bachelors (60% Marks)	Marks obtained (A)	No Adequacy (30%)	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained (B)	
		<b>35 Points</b>													
a	Team Leader Water Supply Design	5 Points	1.50	1.05	0.90	1.05	0.90	3.00	2.10	1.20	3.00	0.50	0.35	0.20	4.55
b	Sr Design Engineer (Hydraulics)	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	3.64
c	Sr. Design Engineer (Pumping Station)	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	3.64
d	Sr Design Engineer (Treatment Plant)	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	3.64
e	Contract Specialist	2 Points	0.60	0.42	0.36	0.36	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	1.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	1.76
f	Sr Design Engineer (Structures)	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.72	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	1.60
g	Sr Professional (Environment)	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	1.20	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	2.32
h	Sr. Geotech / Materials Engineer	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	3.64
i	Sr. Professional (Surveys & GIS)	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	3.64
	<b>Total :</b>	<b>35 Points</b>				<b>7.53</b>						<b>17.64</b>		<b>3.26</b>	<b>28.43</b>

**Mandatory requirements**

i) Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of international repute and with minimum 15 years of experience.

ii) For each of the above positions (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded.

EVALUATION CRITERIA  
Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. M.M. Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. ACE / M/s. M.M.I.L. UK

Sr No.	Description	Max. Marks	General Qualification Construction Supervision Staff (30%)			Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)				Experience in Relevant and Language (10%)				Marks Obtained (A+B+C)		
			Weightage 80%	Masters (Full Marks)	Bachelors (70% Marks)	Marks obtained	Weightage 50%	No Adequacy	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained	25 Years + (Full Marks)		15 to 24 years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 years (40% Marks)
IV KEY PROFESSIONAL STAFF QUALIFICATION & COMPETENCE FOR ASSIGNMENT (SUPERVISION TEAM)	a	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.00	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.00	0.40	0.40	0.16	0.00
	b	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.84	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	1.68	0.40	0.40	0.16	0.40
	c	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	1.20	0.20	0.20	0.08	0.20
	d	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	1.20	0.20	0.20	0.08	0.20
	e	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.00	0.20	0.20	0.08	0.00
	f	1 Points	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.03
	g	1 Points	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.03
	h	1 Points	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.03
	i	1 Points	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.03
	j	1 Points	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.03
	k	1 Points	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.03
	l	1 Points	0.50	0.15	0.11	0.11	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	0.21	0.05	0.05	0.02	0.04
l	1 Points	0.50	0.15	0.11	0.11	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	0.21	0.05	0.05	0.02	0.04	
<b>Total :</b>			<b>15 Points</b>			<b>2.35</b>			<b>7.113</b>			<b>5.23</b>			<b>0.993</b>	<b>8.573</b>

Mandatory requirements

- Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of International repute and with minimum 15 years of experience
- For each of the above positions (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non-submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded

\* The highlighted positions of Key Personnel under Section - III & IV have been awarded 50% Marks due to non submission of Permanent Employment Certificate.

Marks Obtained	Section - I	Section - II	Section - III	Section - IV	Total Marks	Status
10.000	27.000	25.610	7.113	70.773	Pass	

**Saleem Ahmed**  
Executive Engineer (Water)  
Guantanamo-Jaflar - KW&SB (Member / Secretary)

**Zahir Ahmed**  
Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV) KW&SB (Member)

**Adnan Ali Khan**  
Dy. Secretary (Budget & Expenditure),  
Finance Department GOS (Member)

**Abul Ali Khan**  
Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV) KW&SB (Member)

**Khuram Shahzad**  
Promo-Appraiser  
(S-III) KW&SB (Member)

**Fahim Ahmed Jinnoh**  
Director General (R&E)  
Local Govt. Deptt. GOS (Member)

**Ayoub Sattar**  
Chief Engineer (K-IV)  
KW&SB (Member)

**Qasim Shabbir**  
Project Director (K-IV) KW&SB (CONVENER)



**M/s. E.A. Consulting Pvt. Ltd.**  
in association with  
**M/s. SAMAN Corporation of Korea,**  
**M/s. ISAN Corporation of Korea,**  
**M/s. NEC Consultants Pvt. Ltd.**



## EVALUATION CRITERIA Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. EA Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. S.A.M.A.N / ISAN Corporation of Korea

Section - I

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>I</b>	<b>SPECIFIC EXPERIENCE OF THE CONSULTANTS RELEVANT TO THE ASSIGNMENT</b>	<b>10 Points</b>	
<b>A</b>	Design (Preliminary/Detailed) of major water supply & allied works including cost, completed or in-hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
a	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
b	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
c	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
d	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
e	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	5.00
<b>B</b>	Construction supervision of major water supply projects and allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
a	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
b	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
c	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	3.00
d	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
e	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	
<b>Total :</b>		<b>10 Points</b>	<b>8.00</b>

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

### Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. EA Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. S.A.M.A.N / ISAN Corporation of Korea      Section - II

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>II</b>	<b>ADEQUACY OF THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND WORK PLAN IN RESPONDING TO THE TERMS OF REFERENCE</b>	<b>40 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Understanding of the Scope of Work and Design considerations of K-IV Project (Detailed Description)	<b>6 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>b</b>	Understanding of the Time Constraints of the K-IV and its design and supervision stages.	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>1.00</b>
<b>c</b>	Specialized Services, skills and access to particular technologies of a consultant, and his approach to Design and Construction Supervision of the K-IV project	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>d</b>	Technical approach & Methodology of the detailed Engineering Design and its various components	<b>6 Points</b>	<b>4.00</b>
<b>e</b>	Methodology of Construction Supervision and its various components	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>f</b>	Work Plan: for submittals & deliverables matching with the work plan. Logical sequence of tasks and coverage of all Principal Activities envisaged by the Engineering Firms with respect to the TOR.	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>g</b>	Organization & Staffing Manning Schedule for both Design & Supervision	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>h</b>	Activity Schedule displaying each and every activity by bar chart	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>i</b>	Quality Management System covering complexity of the assignment with assured best standard quality	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>1.00</b>
<b>Total :</b>		<b>40 Points</b>	<b>19.00</b>



**EVALUATION CRITERIA**  
**Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project**

M/s. EA Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. S.A.M.A.N / ISAN Corporation of Korea

Section - III

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	General Qualification Design Stage (30%)				Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)					Marks obtained (B)	Experience in Region and Language (10%)				Marks obtained (C)	Marks Obtained (A+B+C)
			30% Weightage	PhD (Full Marks)	Masters (70% Marks)	Bachelors (60% Marks)	60% Weightage	No Adequacy (30%)	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)		25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)			
		<b>35 Points</b>																
a	Team Leader Water Supply Design	5 Points	1.50	1.50	1.05	0.90	3.00	0.90	3.00	2.10	1.20	3.00	0.50	0.35	0.20	0.00	4.50	
b	Sr. Design Engineer (Hydraulics)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.00	3.60	
c	Sr. Design Engineer (Pumping Station)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.00	3.12	
d	Sr. Design Engineer (Treatment Plant)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.00	3.24	
e	Contract Specialist	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.36	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	1.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.20	1.76	
f	Sr. Design Engineer (Structures)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.40	3.64	
g	Sr. Professional (Environment)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.40	3.64	
h	Sr. Geotechnical / Materials Engineer	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.40	3.64	
i	Sr. Professional (Surveys & GIS)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	2.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.16	3.28	
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>35 Points</b>					<b>7.86</b>					<b>21.00</b>				<b>1.56</b>	<b>30.42</b>	

**Mandatory requirements**

- Expert of Pakistan Origin (Ph-D or Masters Degree in relevant field from foreign Universities of International repute and with minimum 15 years of experience)
- For each of the above positions (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded.



**EVALUATION CRITERIA**  
**Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project**

M/s. EA Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. S.A.M.A.N / ISAN Corporation of Korea

Section - IV

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	General Qualification: Construction Supervision Stage (30%)			Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)				Experience in Region and Language (10%)				Marks Obtained (A+B+C)		
			Weightage	Masters (Full Marks)	Bachelors (70% Marks)	Marks obtained	Weightage	No Adequacy (30%)	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained	25 Years + (Full Marks)		15 to 24 years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 years (40% Marks)
IV	KIV PROFESSIONAL STAFF QUALIFICATION & COMPETENCE FOR ASSIGNMENT (SUPERVISION TEAM)	15 Points														
a.	Chief Project Manager	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.94	0.00	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.36	0.00
b.	Chief Resident Engineer	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.84	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.36	0.400
c.	Chief of Surveying & GIS	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.140
d.	Chief Materials Engineer	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.200
e.	Senior Resident Engineer Civil - 6	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.07	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.023
	S.R.E (Civil) - 01	0.33	0.10	0.33	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.023
	S.R.E (Civil) - 02	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.023
	S.R.E (Civil) - 03	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.033
	S.R.E (Civil) - 04	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.033
	S.R.E (Civil) - 05	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.033
	S.R.E (Civil) - 06	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.023
f.	Senior Resident Engineer E/M - 2	3 Points	0.30	0.30	0.21	0.11	0.60	0.18	0.60	0.42	0.24	0.10	0.10	0.070	0.040	0.050
	SRE (E/M) - 01	0.50	0.15	0.15	0.11	0.11	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	0.05	0.050	0.035	0.020	0.035
	SRE (E/M) - 02	0.50	0.15	0.15	0.11	0.15	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	0.05	0.050	0.035	0.020	0.035
	<b>Total :</b>	<b>15 Points</b>				<b>2.36</b>										<b>0.993</b>

**Mandatory requirements**

- Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of International repute and with minimum 15 years of experience.
- For each of the above positions (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded.

• All Positions of Key Personnel under Section - III & IV have been awarded 50% Marks due to non submission of Permanent Employment Certificate.

Marks Obtained	Section - I	Section - II	Section - III	Section - IV	Total Marks	Status
	8,000	19,000	15,210	3,490	45,700	Fail

*Saleem Ahmed*  
Executive Engineer (Water)  
Gulshan-e-Jaahat, KW&SB (Member / Secretary)

*Zafar Ahmed*  
Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

*Asif Ali Khan*  
Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

*Khalid Shahzad*  
Project Manager  
KW&SB (Member)

*Ayash Shaikh*  
Chief Engineer (K-IV)  
KW&SB (Member)

*Asim*  
Asstt. Chief (Proc), P&D  
Department, GOS (Member)

*Muhammad Masud*  
Dy. Secretary (Budget & Expenditure),  
Finance Department GOS (Member)

*Fahim Ahmed Jaleel*  
Director General (M&E)  
Local Govt Deptt GOS (Member)

*Abdulrazzaq Shaikh*  
Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB (CONVENER)

**M/s. National Engineering Services Pakistan  
Pvt. Ltd.**  
in association with  
**Techno Consult Int'l.**

## EVALUATION CRITERIA Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. Techno Consult. Intl.

Section - I

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>I</b>	<b>SPECIFIC EXPERIENCE OF THE CONSULTANTS RELEVANT TO THE ASSIGNMENT</b>	<b>10 Points</b>	
<b>A</b>	Design (Preliminary/Detailed) of major water supply & allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
<b>b</b>	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
<b>c</b>	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
<b>d</b>	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
<b>e</b>	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	<b>5.00</b>
<b>B</b>	Construction supervision of major water supply projects and allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
<b>b</b>	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
<b>c</b>	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
<b>d</b>	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
<b>e</b>	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	<b>5.00</b>
<b>Total :</b>		<b>10 Points</b>	<b>10.00</b>



## EVALUATION CRITERIA

### Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. Techno Consult. Intl.

Section - II

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>II</b>	<b>ADEQUACY OF THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND WORK PLAN IN RESPONDING TO THE TERMS OF REFERENCE</b>	<b>40 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Understanding of the Scope of Work and Design considerations of K-IV Project (Detailed Description)	<b>6 Points</b>	<b>5.00</b>
<b>b</b>	Understanding of the Time Constraints of the K-IV and its design and supervision stages	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>c</b>	Specialized Services, skills and access to particular technologies of a consultant, and his approach to Design and Construction Supervision of the K-IV project	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>d</b>	Technical approach & Methodology of the detailed Engineering Design and its various components	<b>6 Points</b>	<b>5.00</b>
<b>e</b>	Methodology of Construction Supervision and its various components	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>f</b>	Work Plan: for submittals & deliverables matching with the work plan. Logical sequence of tasks and coverage of all Principal Activities envisaged by the Engineering Firms with respect to the TOR	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>g</b>	Organization & Staffing Manning Schedule for both Design & Supervision	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>h</b>	Activity Schedule displaying each and every activity by bar chart	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>i</b>	Quality Management System covering complexity of the assignment with assured best standard quality	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
	<b>Total :</b>	<b>40 Points</b>	<b>27.00</b>





**EVALUATION CRITERIA**  
**Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project**

M/s. NESPAK (Pvt) Ltd. / M/s. Techno Consult Intl.

Section - IV

Sr No.	Description	Max Marks	General Qualification Construction Supervision Staff (30%)			Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)			Experience in Region and Language (100%)					Marks Obtained (A+B+C)			
			10% Weir/bridge (Full Marks)	70% Bachelors (70% Marks)	Marks obtained	60% Weir/bridge (Full Marks)	No Adequacy (30%)	15 to 24 years (170% Marks)	10 to 14 years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 years (170% Marks)	10 to 14 years (40% Marks)		Marks obtained		
a	Chief Project Manager	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.84	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.96	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.400	3.64
b	Chief Resident Engineer	4 Points	1.20	0.84	0.84	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.96	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.400	3.64
c	Chief of Surveying & GIS	2 Points	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.48	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.200	2.00
d	Chief Materials Engineer	2 Points	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.48	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.140	1.94
e	Senior Resident Engineer Civil - 6	2 Points	0.60	0.42	0.42	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	0.48	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.00	0.00
	S.R.E (Civil) - 01	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.033	0.16
	S.R.E (Civil) - 02	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.023	0.29
	S.R.E (Civil) - 03	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.023	0.15
	S.R.E (Civil) - 04	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.013	0.16
	S.R.E (Civil) - 05	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.033	0.30
	S.R.E (Civil) - 06	0.33	0.10	0.07	0.07	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.08	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	0.033	0.30
f	Senior Resident Engineer E/M - 2	1 Point	0.30	0.21	0.21	0.60	0.18	0.60	0.42	0.24	0.24	0.10	0.10	0.070	0.040	0.00	0.00
	SRE (E/M) - 01	0.50	0.15	0.11	0.11	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	0.12	0.05	0.05	0.035	0.020	0.035	0.27
	SRE (E/M) - 02	0.50	0.15	0.11	0.11	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	0.12	0.05	0.05	0.035	0.020	0.050	0.25
<b>Total : 15 Points</b>					<b>3.52</b>							<b>13.113</b>				<b>1.383</b>	<b>13.113</b>

**Mandatory requirements**

- i) Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of international repute and with minimum 15 years of experience
- ii) For each of the above positions (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of score marks shall be awarded.

Marks Obtained	Section - I	Section - II	Section - III	Section - IV	Total Marks	Status
10.000	27.000	25.280	13.113	75.393	Pass	

  
Saad Ahmad  
Executive Engineer (Water)  
Galeash-e-Jadid, KW&SB (Member / Secretary)

  
Zafar Ahmed  
By: Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

  
Asif Ali Khan  
By: Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

  
Muhammad Shahzad  
Project Manager  
(S-II), KW&SB (Member)

  
Ayoub Shaikh  
Chief Engineer (K-IV)  
KW&SB (Member)

  
Asif Ali Khan  
Assistant Chief (P&O)  
Department, GOS / Member

  
M. Aslam  
By: Secretary (Budget & Expenditure),  
Finance Department GOS (Member)

  
Faheem Ahmed Sunjeo  
Director General (MAE)  
Local Govt Deptt. GOS (Member)

  
Qureshi Shaukat  
Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB (CONVENER)



**M/s. Osmani & Company Pvt. Ltd.**  
in association with  
**M/s. Doxiadis.**

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

### Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S

Section - I

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>I</b>	<b>SPECIFIC EXPERIENCE OF THE CONSULTANTS RELEVANT TO THE ASSIGNMENT</b>	<b>10 Points</b>	
<b>A</b>	Design (Preliminary/Detailed) of major water supply & allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
<b>b</b>	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
<b>c</b>	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
<b>d</b>	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
<b>e</b>	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	<b>5.00</b>
<b>B</b>	Construction supervision of major water supply projects and allied works including cost, completed or in hand during the last 10 years in Pakistan or abroad (1 point for each project of Rs. 1 billion or more in water supply)	<b>5 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Completed one Project of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	1	
<b>b</b>	Completed two Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	2	
<b>c</b>	Completed three Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	3	
<b>d</b>	Completed four Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	4	
<b>e</b>	Completed five Projects of Rs. 1 Billion or more during last 10 years.	5	<b>5.00</b>
<b>Total :</b>		<b>10 Points</b>	<b>10.00</b>

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

### Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project

M/s. Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S

Section - II

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Marks obtained
<b>II</b>	<b>ADEQUACY OF THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND WORK PLAN IN RESPONDING TO THE TERMS OF REFERENCE</b>	<b>40 Points</b>	
<b>a</b>	Understanding of the Scope of Work and Design considerations of K-IV Project (Detailed Description)	<b>6 Points</b>	<b>5.00</b>
<b>b</b>	Understanding of the Time Constraints of the K-IV and its design and supervision stages	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>c</b>	Specialized Services, skills and access to particular technologies of a consultant, and his approach to Design and Construction Supervision of the K-IV project	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>d</b>	Technical approach & Methodology of the detailed Engineering Design and its various components	<b>6 Points</b>	<b>5.00</b>
<b>e</b>	Methodology of Construction Supervision and its various components	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>f</b>	Work Plan: for submittals & deliverables matching with the work plan. Logical sequence of tasks and coverage of all Principal Activities envisaged by the Engineering Firms with respect to the TOR	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>g</b>	Organization & Staffing Manning Schedule for both Design & Supervision	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>3.00</b>
<b>h</b>	Activity Schedule displaying each and every activity by bar chart	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>i</b>	Quality Management System covering complexity of the assignment with assured best standard quality	<b>4 Points</b>	<b>2.00</b>
<b>Total :</b>		<b>40 Points</b>	<b>28.00</b>



**EVALUATION CRITERIA**  
**Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project**

M/s. Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S

Section - III

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	General Qualification Design Stage (30%)				Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)					Experience in Region and Language (10%)				Marks Obtained (A+B+C)		
			30% Weightage	Ph.D (Full Marks)	Masters (70% Marks)	Bachelors (60% Marks)	Marks obtained (A)	50% Weightage	No Adequacy (30%)	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained (B)	10% Weightage	25 Years + (Full Marks)		15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)
		<b>35 Points</b>																
a	Team Leader Water Supply Design	5 Points	1.50	1.50	1.05	0.90	1.50	3.00	0.90	3.00	2.10	0.50	0.50	0.35	0.20	0.000	3.60	
b	Sr. Design Engineer (Hydraulics)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	2.40	0.72	2.40	2.40	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.400	3.64	
c	Sr. Design Engineer (Pumping Station)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	1.20	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.400	3.28	
d	Sr. Design Engineer (Treatment Plant)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.84	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.160	2.68	
e	Contract Specialist	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	0.36	0.36	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	0.200	1.40	
f	Sr. Design Engineer (Structures)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	1.20	2.40	0.72	2.40	0.96	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.280	2.44	
g	Sr. Professional (Environment)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	1.20	2.40	0.72	2.40	2.40	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.400	4.00	
h	Sr. Geotech / Materials Engineer	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	1.20	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.400	3.28	
i	Sr. Professional (Surveys & GIS)	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	0.72	0.72	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	0.280	2.68	
	<b>Total :</b>	<b>35 Points</b>									<b>9.06</b>					<b>15.42</b>	<b>27.00</b>	

**Mandatory requirements:**

- Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of International repute and with minimum 15 years of experience.
- For each of the above positions (Expert or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded.



**EVALUATION CRITERIA**  
**Selection of Consultancy Firm for K-IV Project**

M/s. Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. / M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S

Sr. No.	Description	Max. Marks	General Qualification Construction Supervision Stage (30%)				Adequacy for the Assignment (60%)				Experience in Region and Language (10%)				Marks Obtained (A+B+C)			
			Weightage 30%	Masters (Full Marks)	Bachelors (70% Marks)	Marks obtained	Weightage 60%	No Adequacy (30%)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)	10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained	Weightage 10%	25 Years + (Full Marks)	15 to 24 Years (70% Marks)		10 to 14 Years (40% Marks)	Marks obtained	
a	Chief Project Manager	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	<b>0.84</b>	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.72	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	<b>0.40</b>	<b>1.96</b>
b	Chief Resident Engineer	4 Points	1.20	1.20	0.84	<b>0.84</b>	2.40	0.72	2.40	1.68	0.96	0.72	0.40	0.40	0.28	0.16	<b>0.40</b>	<b>1.96</b>
c	Chief of Surveying & GIS	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	<b>0.42</b>	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	<b>0.48</b>	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.08</b>	<b>0.98</b>
d	Chief Materials Engineer	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	<b>0.42</b>	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	<b>0.36</b>	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.78</b>
e	Senior Resident Engineer Civil - 6	2 Points	0.60	0.60	0.42	<b>0.07</b>	1.20	0.36	1.20	0.84	0.48	<b>0.06</b>	0.20	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.00</b>
	S.R.E (Civil) - 01	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	<b>0.07</b>	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.06</b>	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	<b>0.03</b>	<b>0.16</b>
	S.R.E (Civil) - 02	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	<b>0.07</b>	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.08</b>	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	<b>0.02</b>	<b>0.17</b>
	S.R.E (Civil) - 03	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	<b>0.07</b>	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.06</b>	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	<b>0.02</b>	<b>0.15</b>
	S.R.E (Civil) - 04	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	<b>0.07</b>	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.06</b>	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	<b>0.03</b>	<b>0.16</b>
	S.R.E (Civil) - 05	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	<b>0.07</b>	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.08</b>	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	<b>0.03</b>	<b>0.18</b>
	S.R.E (Civil) - 06	0.33	0.10	0.10	0.07	<b>0.07</b>	0.20	0.06	0.20	0.14	0.08	<b>0.08</b>	0.03	0.03	0.023	0.013	<b>0.03</b>	<b>0.18</b>
f	Senior Resident Engineer E/M - 2	1 Points	0.30	0.30	0.21	<b>0.11</b>	0.60	0.18	0.60	0.42	0.24	<b>0.09</b>	0.10	0.100	0.070	0.040	<b>0.00</b>	<b>0.25</b>
	SRE (E/M) - 01	0.50	0.15	0.15	0.11	<b>0.11</b>	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	<b>0.09</b>	0.05	0.050	0.035	0.020	<b>0.05</b>	<b>0.25</b>
	SRE (E/M) - 02	0.50	0.15	0.15	0.11	<b>0.11</b>	0.30	0.09	0.30	0.21	0.12	<b>0.09</b>	0.05	0.050	0.035	0.020	<b>0.05</b>	<b>0.25</b>
<b>Mandatory requirements</b>			<b>Total</b>			<b>15 Points</b>	<b>3.16</b>					<b>2.88</b>					<b>1.158</b>	<b>7.198</b>

i) Expert of Pakistan Origin (PhD or Masters Degree in relevant field from Foreign Universities of international repute and with minimum 15 years of experience.  
ii) For each of the above positions (Experts or Engineer / Professional), a permanent employment certificate with the firm for at least 12 months shall have to be submitted by the firm to obtain full marks. In case of non-submission of permanent employment certificate, only 50% of scored marks shall be awarded.

\* The highlighted positions of Key Personnel under Section - IV have been awarded 50% Marks due to non submission of Permanent Employment Certificate.

Marks Obtained	Section - I	Section - II	Section - III	Section - IV	Total Marks	Status
	10.000	28.000	27.000	6.218	71.218	Pass

**Selhem Altamraz**  
Executive Engineer (Water)  
Quatar-e-Jahran, KW&SB (Member / Secretary)

**Zafar Anwar**  
By: Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

**Asif Ali Khan**  
By: Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

**Kherram Shahzad**  
By: Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

**Ayoub Shaikh**  
Chief Engineer (K-IV),  
KW&SB (Member)

**Fahnest Ahmed Junjo**  
Director General (W&E)  
Local Govt. Deptt. GCS (Member)

**Qutubuddin Shaikh**  
Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB (CONVENER)

**By: Secretary (Budget & Expenditure),  
Finance Department GCS (Member)**

**Assistant Chief (PP&E) / IAD  
Department, GCS (Member)**

# KARACHI WATER & SEWERAGE BOARD

## Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme K-IV, Phase-I, 260 MGD

### Bid Evaluation Report

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Water and Sewerage Board
2. Tender Reference No: \_\_\_\_\_
3. Tender Description / Name of work / item: Detailed Design & Construction Supervision of  
Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme K-IV (Phase-I) 260 MGD
4. Method of Procurement: Two Envelop System ( Least Cost Selection Method) ICB
5. Tender Published: 1<sup>st</sup> December to 5<sup>th</sup> December 2012
  - a. DAWN News Paper (English) Dated: Saturday December 1, 2012
  - b. Daily Jang News Paper Dated: Saturday December 1, 2012
  - c. Gulf News Smart Edition-Gulf News Dated: Wednesday December 5, 2012
  - d. NIT Ref: No.CE-P/KW&SB/2014/336, Dated: 14-02-2014, SPPRA Sr. No. 19559  
Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)
6. Total Bids documents Sold: 09 (Nine) (out of 09 firms 04 were pre-qualified)
7. Total Bids Received: 04 (four)
8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) September 04, 2014
9. No. of Bids technically qualified (if applicable): 03 (three)
10. Bid(s) Rejected: One (01)
11. Financial Bid Opening date: December 11, 2014

*Handwritten signatures and initials:*  
Sh, 3/11/14, New, Budget, A, Page 1 of 2



12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S No	Name of Firm of Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance / rejection	Remarks
1	2	3	4	5	6	
1	M/s. Osmani & Company in association with M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S.	599,866,000	1 <sup>st</sup>	10.59% Below (PC-I Provision)	Accepted being Responsive & consistent with LOI/RFP Document	Lowest evaluated Bid
2	M/s. NESPAK in association with M/s. Techno Consult Intl.	871,741,896	2 <sup>nd</sup>	29.93% Above (PC-I Provision)	Accepted being Responsive & consistent with LOI/RFP Document	
3	M/s. M.M. Pakistan Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. ACE, M/s. MMIL	928,413,091	3 <sup>rd</sup>	38.37% Above (PC-I Provision)	Accepted being Responsive & consistent with LOI/RFP Document	

  
Safem Ahmed

Executive Engineer (Water)  
Gulistan-e-Jauhar, KW&SB  
(Member / Secretary)

  
Zafar Ahmed

Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB (Member)

  
Asif Ali Khan

Dy. Project Manager  
(K-IV), KW&SB  
(Member)

  
Khurram Shahzad

Project Manager  
(S-III) KW&SB (Member)

  
M. Aysoob Shaikh


Project Manager (K-IV),  
KW&SB (Member)

  
Adnan Nazeer


Assistant Chief (PP&H),  
P&D Deptt., GOS. (Member)

  
Moazzam Ali Mari

Dy. Secretary (Budget & Expenditure.),  
Finance Department GOS (Member)

  
Faheem Akhtar Junejo

Director General (M&E)  
Local Govt. Deptt. GOS (Member)

  
Saleem Siddiqui

Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB  
(CONVENER)

## KARACHI WATER & SEWERAGE BOARD

### EVALUATION OF FINANCIAL PROPOSALS

#### *Detailed Design & Construction Supervision of Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme, K-IV Phase-I, 260 MGD*

### MINUTES OF THE MEETING

A meeting for concluding the evaluation of Financial Proposals of technically qualified Consultancy Firms / Consortia, for the Detailed Design & Construction Supervision of Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme (K-IV), Phase-I (260 MGD) was held under the Chairmanship of Project Director (K-IV Project) / Convener, Consultant Selection Committee in his office at Block-C, 9<sup>th</sup> Mile KW&SB on Tuesday, the 23<sup>rd</sup> of December 2014.

The following attended the meeting :-

1. Mr. Saleem Siddiqui	Project Director (K-IV), KW&SB	Convener
2. Mr. Ayoob Shaikh	Chief Engineer (K-IV), KW&SB	Member
3. Mr. Moazzam Ali Mari	Dy. Secretary (Bud. & Exp.), Finance Deptt. GOS	Member
4. Mr. Adnan Nazeer	Assistant Chief (PP&H), P&D Deptt. GOS.	Member
5. Mr. Faheem Akhtar Junejo	Director General (M&E), L.G. Deptt. GOS	Member
6. Mr. Khurram Shahzad	Project Manager (S-III), KW&SB	Member
7. Mr. Asif Ali Khan	Dy. Project Manager (K-IV), KW&SB	Member
8. Mr. Zafar Ahmed	Dy. Project Manager (K-IV), KW&SB	Member
9. Mr. Saleem Ahmed	E.E (Water), Gulistan-e-Jauhar, KW&SB	Member / Secretary

The Project Director (K-IV Project) / Convener, Consultant Selection Committee welcomed the participants of the meeting and elaborated the details of on-going Procurement Process for selecting the Consultancy Firm in respect of Detailed Design & Construction Supervision of Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme, K-IV Phase-I, 260 MGD.

Afterwards, the process adopted for evaluating the financial proposals of Consultants was shown to all Members of Consultant Selection Committee, followed by the review of Financial Evaluation Report been prepared to compile the evaluation process in a comprehensive manner strictly in accordance with the procurement guidelines of SPPRA 2010.

The Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee highlighted the analysis of individual Consultancy Firms / Consortia in the Evaluation Report as well as the Statement prepared to compare the submitted Cost of the three (03) technically qualified Consultancy Firms. The summary of cost comparison was also reviewed by all members of Consultant Selection Committee and was finalized as under -



**SUMMARY OF COST COMPARISON**

Sr. No.	Description	M/s. NESPAK in association with M/s. Techno Consult Intl.		M/s. Osmani & Company in association with M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S.		M/s. M.M. Pakistan Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s. ACE. M/s. MMIL		
		Rebate	Quoted Amount (PKR)	Corrected Amount (PKR)	Quoted Amount (PKR)	Corrected Amount (PKR)	Quoted Amount (PKR)	Corrected Amount (PKR)
1	Remuneration (Design Phase)		142,170,840	142,170,840	97,650,000	97,650,000	131,338,921	145,516,923
	Reimbursable Expenses (Design Phase)		81,390,000	81,390,000	63,310,000	63,310,000	4,500,000	58,290,000
	<b>Sub Total : Design Phase (A)</b>		<b>223,560,840</b>	<b>223,560,840</b>	<b>160,960,000</b>	<b>160,960,000</b>	<b>135,838,921</b>	<b>201,806,923</b>
2	Remuneration (Construction Phase)	20%	789,976,320	789,976,320	426,306,000	426,306,000	591,458,857	718,686,168
			631,981,056	631,981,056	-	-	-	-
	Reimbursable Expenses (Construction Phase)		16,200,000	16,200,000	12,600,000	12,600,000	7,920,000	7,920,000
	<b>Sub Total : Construction Phase (B)</b>		<b>648,181,056</b>	<b>648,181,056</b>	<b>438,906,000</b>	<b>438,906,000</b>	<b>599,378,857</b>	<b>726,606,168</b>
	<b>Grand Total of Financial Proposal (A+B)</b>		<b>871,741,896</b>	<b>871,741,896</b>	<b>599,866,000</b>	<b>599,866,000</b>	<b>735,217,777</b>	<b>928,413,091</b>

Subsequently, the Consultant Selection Committee signed the Financial Evaluation Report in respect of Detailed Design and Construction Supervision of Greater Karachi Bulk Water Supply Scheme K-IV, Phase-I, 260 MGD and with consensus recommended the award of work to the lowest evaluated bidder M/s. Osmani & Co in association with M/s. D.O.X.I.A.D.I.S at the corrected cost of Rs. 599,866,000/ (Rupees Five Hundred Ninety Nine Million Eight Hundred Sixty Six Thousand Only).

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.