OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER, PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO. III, KARACH

NO:-TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/ 822 DATED THE:- 09-03 2017

To,

The Director (CB), Government of Sindh, Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority, Karachi.

Subject:

SUBMISSION OF TECHNICAL & FINANCIAL EVALUATION REPORT FOR THE FOLLOWING WORKS:-

- 1. Establishment of Commissioner Club at Korangi, Karachi (ADP # 2100).
- 2. Construction of Office and Accommodation of Deputy Commissioner (East), Karachi (ADP # 2099).
- 3. Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Complex at District Korangi, Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2097).
- 4. Construction of Office and Accommodation of Deputy Commissioner (South) Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2096).
- 5. Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Complex including Residence at District Malir, Karachi. (ADP # 2101).

Reference:

NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016.

<u>Sr #. 31087.</u>

Enclosed please find herewith the following documents for hoisting on the SPPRA website.

- 1. Technical & Financial Evaluation Report (RFP Results).
- 2. Minutes of the Meeting.
- 3. Attendance Sheet.

D.A/As Above

(NAIMATULLAH SHAIKH)
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER,
PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III,
KARACHI.

2642 DATE 21-04-17

OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III, KARACHI

This office NIT No.TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991,

Dated: 09-12-2016

CONSULTANCY

- 1. Establishment of Commissioner Club at Korangi, Karachi (ADP # 2100).
- 2. Construction of Office and Accommodation of Deputy Commissioner (East), Karachi (ADP # 2099).
- 3. Enhancement/Up-gradation including Rehabilitation of office of Commissioner Karachi (ADP # 2098).
- 4. Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Complex at District Korangi, Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2097).
- 5. Construction of Office and Accommodation of Deputy Commissioner (South) Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2096).
- 6. Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Complex including Residence at District Malir, Karachi. (ADP # 2101).

ATTENDANCE SHEET.

Date & Time of Opening:

06.03.2017 @ 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Name of Consulting Firm	Designation with Cell No.	Signature
01	Gamer 9 Associates	Memajer 0321-2322089	Reasoly
02	Cameos Comsutant	Admin affice 0333 7803495	Celola
03	Ms Irchael Nahi & Associates	1	Salward.
04			
05			

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi.

(Member

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member) Executive Engineer Education Works Division-I

Karachi (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member) Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)



PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION-III, KARACHI WORKS & SERVICES DEPARTMENT, GOVT. OF SINDH

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date: 06.03.2017 Time: 3:00 PM

MINUTES OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING FOR EVALUATION OF BID/ RFP OF CONSULTING FIRM FOR THE DETAILED ARCHITECTURAL, STRUCTURAL DESIGN, PREPARATION OF ENGINEERING ESTIMATES/ BIDDING DOCUMENTS & DETAILED CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION FOR THE FOLLOWING WORKS:-

1. Establishment of Commissioner Club at Korangi, Karachi (ADP # 2100).

 Construction of Office and Accommodation of Deputy Commissioner (East), Karachi (ADP # 2099).

3. Enhancement/Up-gradation including Rehabilitation of office of Commissioner Karachi (ADP # 2098).

4. Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Complex at District Korangi, Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2097).

5. Construction of Office and Accommodation of Deputy Commissioner (South) Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2096).

6. Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Complex including Residence at District Malir, Karachi. (ADP # 2101).

The meeting of consultant selection committee was held in the office of the undersigned on 06.03.2017 at 3:00 PM as earlier decided to evaluate the bid proposal/ RFP document of the bidder. Following members attended the meeting:-

Participants:

1.	Superintending Engineer
	Provincial Building Circle,
	Karachi.

2. Executive Engineer
Provincial Building Division-III,
Karachi.

Executive Engineer
 Education Works Division-I,
 Karachi.

4. Representative of Finance Department Govt: of Sindh.

5. Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: Govt: of Sindh.

6. Representative of SGA&C Department Govt: of Sindh.

Chairman

Member

Technical Member

Member

Member

Co-opted Member



PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION-III, KARACHI WORKS & SERVICES DEPARTMENT, GOVT. OF SINDH

- The Executive Engineer, Provincial Building No. III, Karachi issued letter of Invitation and Request for Proposal document to M/s Qamar & Associates. firm for above cited consultancy service vide Letter Ref No. NO:-TC/G-55/2016-17/456 dated 24.02. 2017.
- The submitted proposal opened in the presence of Consultant Selection Committee on the 31-01-2017 at 3:30 PM and it was decided that proposal will be discussed in detail on 06-03-2017. The Tender Item No. 03 remained un-responded due to A.A. not received.
- Afterwards, the proposal received from M/s Qamar & Associates was discussed in detail in the meeting amongst the members and cumulative assessment/score sheet was prepared alongwith comments (enclosed detailed evaluation).
- The Consultant Selection Committee decided in the meeting to open the financial proposal of qualified consultant firm in the same meeting. The bidder / consultant representative of consultant was already called by Member / Secretary.
- In this meeting Consultant Selection Committee opened the financial proposal of qualified firm in presence of their representative and afterward the necessary financial analysis of proposals being done by the Consultant Selection Committee as per 80:20 rule mentioned in RFP'.
- The detailed assessment sheet of both technical & financial analysis of aforementioned consultant firm is enclosed herewith for reference

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and from the chair.

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi. (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member) Executive Engineer Education Works Division-I Karachi (Member)

> Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)

EVALUATION OF EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANTS FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Eligibility Criteria	M/s. Consu	AMEOS Itants		ad Nabi &	M/s. Qamar	& Associates
		Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
1	A firm shall have the legal registration under the law;	✓		1		~	
2	Registered with Pakistan Council of Architects & Town Planners and;	✓			1	~	
3	Registration of Associated Structural, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing Consultants with Pakistan Engineering Council;	√			~	~	
4	Valid Registration with Federal Board of Revenue (FBR).	✓		~		~	
	\ \ Eligibile / Non-Eligible	Elig	ible	Non-E	ligible	Elig	ible

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of

Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

SUMMARY SHEET

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants	M/s. Irshad Nabi & Associates	M/s. Qamar & Associates
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects).		20	10	25
ii	Experience of Architectural Planning & Design, Structure Designing, Project Management / Construction Management and Detailed Construction supervision.	45	20.5	15	42.5
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-	30	23.5	8	28.5
	Total:	100	64	33	96
	\ Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qualified	Not Qualified	Qualified

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of **Finance Department**

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

(Chairman)

Page 1 of 1

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	6 Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
Ĭ	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects). (25 Mark s)		20	80%	10	40%	25	100%
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in last 10 years							
ii (a)	15 Marks shall be given for Architectural Planning and Design.							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Structure Designing.							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Project Management/ Construction Management Approach	LOCATED MARKET ST						
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects	45	20.5	45%	15	33%	42.5	94%
(b)	completed in Detailed Construction supervision. 05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Work Plan for the Project.							
(c)	10 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects							
1	completed in Organization and staffing.							

Sur Joalieu

Jamble 3

Mr L- Bi

1, GL

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	6 Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-							
	Architectural Team Leader (01 No.) (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture / Civil with at least 15 years of relevant experience of managing diversified projects) 7.5 Marks		7.5		0		7.5	
	Senior Architect (01 NO), (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture with at least 10 years of relevant experience) 05 Marks	30	2		0		5	
	Architect / Interior Designer (01 No.), (Bachelors in Architecture / Interior Designing and experience in interior designing with at least 05 years of relevant experience) 2.5 Marks		2		0		1	
	Structural Design Collaborations / Associates Lead Designer (01 No.) (Masters in Structure Engineering and BE in Civil Engineering with at least 15 years of design experience of similar nature projects) 05 Marks		5		5		5	

Mr.

1- 30

19

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
	Electrical Design Collaborator / Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master & BE in Electrical Engineering and relevant experience of 10 years+) 2.5 Marks		1		0		2.5	
	Utility Design Collaborator/ Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master / BE in Civil & Relevant Discipline and relevant experience of 10+ years) 2.5 Marks		1	78%	1	27%	2.5	95%
	Construction Manager (01 No.) (Master/BE in Civil Engineering and having experience of 10 years+ of Construction Supervision & Contract Management of similar nature of projects) 05 Marks		5		2		5	
	Total :	100	64		33		96	
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qu	alified	Not Qu	alified	Qual	ified

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt., (Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BID/REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABGLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI." ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17.

			Specifi	Part-(i) ic Experience (25	Marks)		Addequ	acy of the propos	Part(i ed Methodology (40 Mar	& Work Plan in response to the T	OR's		Key Pro	fessional Staff Quali	Part(iii) ification & Compe (35 Marks)	tence for the Assign	nment)		Total Score
						(a)	Technical Ap	proach & Method	ology	(b)	(c)								
S.No.	Name of the Firm	Criteria	15-20 Related similar projects completed in last 5 years	21-25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Above 25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Architecture planning & desing	Structure Designing	Project Construction Management approch	Detailed Construction Supervision	Work Plan	Organization & Staffing	Architectural Team Leader	Senior Architects	Architect/ Interior Designer	Strucutural Design Collaborations Associate Lead Engineer	Electrical Design Collaborations/ Associate Lead Engineer	Utility Design	Construction Manager	out of 100
		Max. Marks	10	20	25	15	5	5	5	5	10	7.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	2.5	5	
		Marks Obtained		25		14	5	4.5	4	5	10	7.5	5	1	5	2.5	2.5	5	96
		Total Marks Obtained		25				27.5	•	5	10				28.5				
01	M/s. QAMAR & ASSOCIATES	COMMENTS	25 + relevant	years	ieted in last 10	assignment under cons Which inclu- collections Submission Detailed De- structural of cost Estima contracts), manageme Construction describe the consultant	t and cover ideration in ides conce & soil inve & soil inve on of preliminsign (Design & cates Detaile Tender Phant/constructor supervise duties & and discus	ell understood et all required its methodole ptual design, I stigation of sit nary design, S gn development culation, Detad specification ase, Project tition managen ion & also in cresponsibility of the project in deproject in design of the project in design of the proje	aspects ogy in details. Data Lie, ubmission of nt dwgs, iiled Boq & n condition of nent & details of the onsultant at	Consultant distributed the work plan in 03 stages, 1- Planning & Data Collection phase 2-Designing & tender phase 3-Construction Phase Consultant proposed 14 months time for whole job, 4 month for first 2 phases which includes the activities of conceptual plan, topography, site investigation, preliminary design, detailed design, BOQ & tender docs, Prequalification of contractors & issuance of tender documents.	Proposed 18 staff members team to complete the job, staff team for office & 9 staff team for construction site including key professionals. The proposed staff w perform their job in parallel and in disintegrated tim period. The total man months requirements proposed to complete the job	architecture & 9 15 years+ experience	M.Arch & 10 years experience	B.Arch & 11 years Experience	M.s Structure & 26 years experience	B.E. Electrical Engg & 28 years of Experience form M/s ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Electrical & 28 years experience from M/s. ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Civil & 16 years experience	

Executive Engineer, Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi, (Member)

Executive Engineer, Education Works Division-I Karachi, (Technical Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member)

Superintending Engineer, Provincial Buildings Circle Karachi,

ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORANGI, KARACHI (ADP # 2100).

TENDER OPENING PROFORMA (FINANCIAL)

	N	1/s Qamar & Asso	ciates	M/s	Irshad Nabi & As	sociates			M/s CAMOES	
Item/Description	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%		Bid Price ng Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax
Amount in PKR Total of Form-A	6,000,000	900,000	6,900,000	7,470,000	1,120,500		8,590,500	8,350,500	1,252,575	9,603,075
Amount in PKR Total of Form-B	20,000	3,000	23,000	25,000	3,750		28,750	29,000	4,350	33,350
Grand Total (Form-A+B)			6,923,000				8,619,250			9,636,425
Remarks		1st Lowest			2nd Lowest				3rd Lowest	

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of
Planning & Development Deptt:
(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Department

(Co-opted Member)

Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle

Representative of

Karachi. (Chairman)

BID EVALUATION REPORT

NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016. PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III,KARACHI.

1.	Name of Procuring	Agency	Provincia	Buildings Division	on No.III, Karachi.				
2.	Tender Reference I	No.	NIT NO. T	C/G-55/PBD-III/	2016-17/991, DA	TED: 09.12.2016.			
3.	Tender Description	/Name of Work	ESTABLISHMENT OF COMMISSIONER CLUB AT KORAN						
	Items.		KARACHI	(ADP # 2100).					
4.	Method of Procure	ment.	QCBS Me	thod					
5.	Tender Published.		31087 da	ted 04-01-2107.	SPPRA website.				
6.	Total Bid documer	its sold.	03-Nos.						
7.	Total Bids Received	l.	03-Nos.						
8.	Technical Bid Open	ing date	Not Appli	cable					
	(if applicable)								
	(Provide details in s								
9.	No. of Bid Technica	Ily qualified	Not Appli	cable					
	(if applicable).								
10.	Bid(s) Rejected.		NIL						
11.	Financial Bid Openi	ng date.	06-03-203	17.					
12.	Bid Evaluation Rep	ort.							
S.No	Name of Firm or	Cost offered by	Ranking	Comparison	Reasons for	Remarks			
	Bidder	the bidder	in terms	with	acceptance/				
			of cost.	Estimate cost	rejected				
1	2	3	4	5	6	7			
1.	M/s Qamar &	Rs. 6,923,000/-	Ist	Within	Ist Lowest.	Accepted			
	Associates.		Lowest	Estimated					
				Cost.					
2.	M/s Irshad Nabi & Associates.	Rs. 8,619,250/-	2 nd			Highest			
3.	M/s CAMOES.	Rs. 9,636,425/-	3 rd			Highest			

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member) Executive Engineer Education Works Division-I Karachi

(Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member) Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)

EVALUATION OF EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANTS FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFF. & ACCOMMO. DY. COMMI. (EAST) KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2099 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Eligibility Criteria	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants		M/s. Irsha		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
		Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
1	A firm shall have the legal registration under the law;	✓		1		✓	
2	Registered with Pakistan Council of Architects & Town Planners and;	✓			~	·	
3	Registration of Associated Structural, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing Consultants with Pakistan Engineering Council;	~			~	~	
4	Valid Registration with Federal Board of Revenue (FBR).	✓		~		~	
	Eligibile / Non-Eligible	Elig	ible	Non-E	ligible	Eligi	ble

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of

Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

SUMMARY SHEET

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFF. & ACCOMMO. DY.COMMI. (EAST), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2099 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants	M/s. Irshad Nabi & Associates	M/s. Qamar & Associates
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects).		20	10	25
ii	Experience of Architectural Planning & Design, Structure Designing, Project Management / Construction Management and Detailed Construction supervision.	45	20.5	15	42.5
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-	30	23.5	8	28.5
	Total:	100	64	33	96
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qualified	Not Qualified	Qualified

Executive Engineer **Provincial Buildings Division-III** Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of

Finance Department (Member)

Superintending/Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

(Chairman)

Page 1 of 1

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFF. & ACCOMMO. DY. COMMI. (EAST), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2099 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	6 Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates		
	Nacional Scientific Control Co		Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	
l	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects). (25 Mark s)		20	80%	10	40%	25	100%	
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in last 10 years								
(b)	15 Marks shall be given for Architectural Planning and Design. 05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Structure Designing. 05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Project Management/ Construction Management Approach 05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Detailed Construction supervision. 05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Work Plan for the Project. 10 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects	45	20.5	45%	15	33%	42.5	94%	

Halm 152

Jambh of

Tro Jan

199

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFF. & ACCOMMO. DY. COMMI. (EAST), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2099 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates		
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-								
	Architectural Team Leader (01 No.) (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture / Civil with at least 15 years of relevant experience of managing diversified projects) 7.5 Marks		7.5		0		7.5		
	Senior Architect (01 NO), (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture with at least 10 years of relevant experience) 05 Marks	30	2		0		5		
	Architect / Interior Designer (01 No.), (Bachelors in Architecture / Interior Designing and experience in interior designing with at least 05 years of relevant experience) 2.5 Marks	30	2		0		1		
	Structural Design Collaborations / Associates Lead Designer (01 NO.) (Masters in Structure Engineering and BE in Civil Engineering with at least 15 years of design experience of similar nature projects) 05 Marks		5		5		5		

Malum S

mandled Wh

کے کے

L 9

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFF. & ACCOMMO. DY. COMMI. (EAST), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2099 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
	contacts top ordersystems. The sapers return		Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
	Electrical Design Collaborator / Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master & BE in Electrical Engineering and relevant experience of 10 years+) 2.5 Marks		1		0		2.5	
	Utility Design Collaborator/Associates Lead Engineer (01 No. (Master / BE in Civil & Relevant Discipline and relevant experience of 10+ years) 2.5 Marks		1	78%	1	27%	2.5	95%
	Construction Manager (01 No.) (Master/BE in Civi Engineering and having experience of 10 years+ o Construction Supervision & Contract Management of simila nature of projects) 05 Marks	f	5		2		5	
	\ \ Total:	100	64		33		96	
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qu	alified	Not Qu	alified	Qual	ified

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt., (Member) Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

1

Representative of SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer
Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi
(Chairman)

TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BID/REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (EAST), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2099 OF

			Specific	Part-(i) Experience (25 f	Marks)				(40 Mar	& Work Plan in response to the T ks)			Key Pro	ofessional Staff Qual	Part(iii) ification & Comp (35 Marks)	etence for the Assi	gnment)		
N. F						(a)	Technical App	proach & Methodo	ology	(b)	(c)						March Services		1
S.No.	Name of the Firm	Criteria	15-20 Related similar projects completed in last 5 years	21-25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Above 25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Architecture planning & desing	Structure Designing	Project Construction Management approch	Detailed Construction Supervision	Work Plan	Organization & Staffing	Architectural Team Leader	Senior Architects	Architect/ Interio Designer	Strucutural Design Collaboration Associate Lea Engineer		Utility Design		out of 1
		Max. Marks	10	20	25	15	5	5	5	5	10	7.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	2.5	5	
		Marks Obtained		25		14	5	4.5	4	5	10	7.5	5	1	5	2.5	2.5	5	96
01		Total Marks Obtained				27.5				5	10 Proposed 18 staff				28.5	28.5			
	M/s. QAMAR & ASSOCIATES	COMMENTS	20 + relevant p	years (assignment under consi Which inclu collections Submission Detailed De- structural d cost Estima contracts), managemer Constructio describe the consultant of	and covered deration in des concept & soil investo of prelimir sign(Design & calletes Detailetes Detailetes Detailetes Detailetes Detailetes Detailetes detailetes derationstructes de duties & rand discussion descriptions de duties & rand discussion description in supervisite duties & rand discussion description in supervisite duties & rand discussion description in description description in description descri	ed all required its methodolo otual design, I stigation of sit nary design, S in developmer culation, Deta d specification	aspects gy in details. Data e, ubmission of tt dwgs, iled Boq & n condition of nent & letails of the consultant at	Consultant distributed the work plan in 03 stages, 1- Planning & Data Collection phase 2-Designing & tender phase 3-Construction Phase Consultant proposed 14 months time for whole job 4 month for first 2 phases which includes the activities of conceptual plan, topography, site investigation, preliminary design, detailed design, BOQ & tender docs, Prequalification of contractors & issuance of tender documents.	members team to complete the job, staff team for office & 9 staff team for construction site including key professionals. The proposed staff will perform their jobs in parallel and in disintegrated time period. The total 1 man months requirements proposed to complete the job	experience	M.Arch & 10 years experience	B.Arch & 11 years Experience	M.S Structur & 26 years experience	e B.E. Electrica Engg & 28 years of Experience form M/s ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Electrica & 28 years experience from M/s. ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Civil & 16 years experience	

Executive Engineer, **Provincial Buildings Division-III** Karachi, (Member)

Executive Engineer, Education Works Division-I Karachi, (Technical Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member) Superintending Engineer, Provincial Buildings Circle Karachi,

${\bf CONSTRUCTION\ OF\ OFFICE\ AND\ ACCOMMODATION\ OF\ DEPUTY\ COMMISSIONER\ (EAST),\ KARACHI\ (ADP\ \#\ 2099).}$

TENDER OPENING PROFORMA (FINANCIAL)

	N	1/s Qamar & Asso	ciates	M/s	Irshad Nabi & As	sociates	M/s CAMOES				
Item/Description	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax		
Amount in PKR Total of Form-A	11,850,000	1,777,500	13,627,500	14,129,000	2,119,350	16,248,350	14,913,500	2,237,025	17,150,525		
Amount in PKR Total of Form-B	25,000	3,750	28,750	35,000	5,250	40,250	36,000	5,400	41,400		
Grand Total (Form-A+B)			13,656,250			16,288,600			17,191,925		
Remarks	1st Lowest				2nd Lowest	į.		3rd Lowest			

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.

Naraciii.

(Member)

Representative of
Planning & Development Deptt:
(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle

Karachi.

BID EVALUATION REPORT

NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016. PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III,KARACHI.

1.	Name of Procuring	g Agency	Provincial	Buildings Division	on No.III, Karachi.						
2.	Tender Reference		NIT NO. T	C/G-55/PBD-III/2	2016-17/991, DAT	ED: 09.12.2016.					
3.	Tender Descriptio	n/Name of Work	Construct	ion of Office	and Accommoda	ation of Deputy					
	Items.		Commissi	oner (East), Kar	achi (ADP # 2099)).					
4.	Method of Procur	ement.	QCBS Me	thod							
5.	Tender Published.		31087 dat	ted 04-01-2107.	SPPRA website.						
6.	Total Bid docume	nts sold.	03-Nos.								
7.	Total Bids Receive	d.	03-Nos.								
8.	Technical Bid Ope (if applicable) (Provide details in		Not Appli	cable							
9.	No. of Bid Technic (if applicable).	ally qualified	Not Appli	cable							
10.	Bid(s) Rejected.		NIL								
11.	Financial Bid Oper	ning date.	06-03-2017.								
12.	Bid Evaluation Rep	oort.									
S.No	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the bidder	Ranking in terms of cost.	Comparison with Estimate cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejected	Remarks					
1	2	3	4	5	6	7					
1.	M/s Qamar & Associates.	Rs. 13,656,250/-	lst Lowest	Within Estimated Cost.	Ist Lowest.	Accepted					
2.	M/s Irshad Nabi & Associates.	Rs. 16,288,600/-	2 nd			Highest					
3.	M/s CAMOES.	Rs. 17,191,925/-	5/- 3 rd Highest								

M

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi.

Mahum

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member) Executive Engineer Education Works Division-I

Karachi (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)

SUMMARY SHEET

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX AT DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2097 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants	M/s. Irshad Nabi & Associates	M/s. Qamar & Associates
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects).		20	10	25
ii	Experience of Architectural Planning & Design, Structure Designing, Project Management / Construction Management and Detailed Construction supervision.	45	20.5	15	42.5
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-	30	23.5	8	28.5
	Total:	100	64	33	96
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qualified	Not Qualified	Qualified

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of

Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

(Chairman)

Page 1 of 1

EVALUATION OF EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANTS FOR THE PROJECT "ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX, DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2097 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Eligibility Criteria	M/s. C/		M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associate		
		Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	
1	A firm shall have the legal registration under the law;	✓		✓		✓		
2	Registered with Pakistan Council of Architects & Town Planners and;	√			✓	✓		
3	Registration of Associated Structural, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing Consultants with Pakistan Engineering Council;	✓			~	~		
4	Valid Registration with Federal Board of Revenue (FBR).	✓		~		✓		
	Eligibile / Non-Eligible	Elig	ible	Non-E	ligible	Eligi	ble	

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX AT DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2097 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	6 Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates		
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects). (25 Mark s)		20	80%	10	40%	25	100%	
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in last 10 years								
ii (a)	15 Marks shall be given for Architectural Planning and Design.								
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Structure Designing.								
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Project Management/ Construction Management Approach	A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects	45	20.5	45%	15	33%	42.5	94%	
(b)	completed in Detailed Construction supervision. 05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Work Plan for the Project.								
(c)	10 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects		1						
	completed in Organization and staffing.		1 1	1					

Manley

Cambolin &

h.

91

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX AT DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2097 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associate	
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-							
	Architectural Team Leader (01 No.) (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture / Civil with at least 15 years of relevant experience of managing diversified projects) 7.5 Marks	Extraction of the contract of	7.5		0		7.5	
	Senior Architect (01 NO), (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture with at least 10 years of relevant experience) 05 Marks	30	2		0		5	
	Architect / Interior Designer (01 No.), (Bachelors in Architecture / Interior Designing and experience in interior designing with at least 05 years of relevant experience) 2.5 Marks		2		0		1	
	Structural Design Collaborations / Associates Lead Designer (01 No.) (Masters in Structure Engineering and BE in Civil Engineering with at least 15 years of design experience of similar nature projects) 05 Marks		5		5		5	

Maluur Ostal Cambolinia

16

194

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT "ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX AT DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2097 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates		
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	
	Electrical Design Collaborator / Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master & BE in Electrical Engineering and relevant experience of 10 years+) 2.5 Marks		1		0		2.5		
	Utility Design Collaborator/Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master / BE in Civil & Relevant Discipline and relevant experience of 10+ years) 2.5 Marks	Name of Street, Street	1	78%	1	27%	2.5	95%	
	Construction Manager (01 No.) (Master/BE in Civil Engineering and having experience of 10 years+ of Construction Supervision & Contract Management of similar nature of projects) 05 Marks		5		2		5		
) Total:	100	64		33		96		
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qu	alified	Not Qu	alified	Qual	ified	

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi. (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt., (Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

Finance Department (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt. (Co-opted Member) Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BID/REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX AT DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI INCLUDING RESIDENCE, ". (ADP NO. 2097 OF 2016-17).

			Specifi	Part-(i) ic Experience (25	Marks)		Addequ	acy of the propos	Part(i sed Methodology (40 Mar	& Work Plan in response to the T	OR's		Key Pro	fessional Staff Quali	Part(iii) fication & Compe (35 Marks)	lence for the Assign	ment)		Total Score
						(a)	Technical Ap	proach & Method	ology	(b)	(c)			Tall Side of the					
S.No.	Name of the Firm	Criteria	15-20 Related similar projects completed in last 5 years	21-25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years		Architecture planning & desing	Structure Designing	Project Construction Management approch	Detailed Construction Supervision	Work Plan	Organization & Staffing	Architectural Team Leader	Senior Architects	Architect/ Interior Designer	Strucutural Design Collaborations Associate Lead Engineer	Electrical Design Collaborations/ Associate Lead Engineer	Utility Design collaborations	Construction Manager	out of 100
		Max. Marks	10	20	25	15	5	5	5	5	10	7.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	2.5	5	
		Marks Obtained		25		14	5	4.5	4	5	10	7.5	5	1	5	2.5	2.5	5	96
		Total Marks Obtained		25				27.5		5	10				28.5				
01	M/s. QAMAR & ASSOCIATES	COMMENTS	25 + relevant	projects comp years	ieted in last 10	assignmen under cons Which inclu- collections Submission Detailed De- structural of cost Estima contracts), manageme describe the consultant	t and cover sideration in udes conce & & soil inve on of preliminesign(Designesign & ca ates Detaile Tender Phaent/constructon supervise e duties & and discus	ed all required its methodolo ptual design, l stigation of sit nary design, S gn developme lculation. Deta	d aspects ogy in details. Data tee, submission of nt dwgs, ailed Boq & n condition of nent & details of the onsultant at	Consultant distributed the work plan in 03 stages, 1- Planning & Data Collection phase 2-Designing & tender phase 3-Construction Phase Consultant proposed 14 months time for whole job, 4 month for first 2 phases which includes the activities of conceptual plan, topography, site investigation, preliminary design, detailed design, BOQ & tender docs, Prequalification of contractors & issuance of tender documents.	Proposed 18 staff members team to complete the job, 9 staff team for office & 9 staff team for construction site including key professionals. The proposed staff will perform their jobs in parallel and in disintegrated time period. The total 14 man months requirements proposed to complete the job	experience	M.Arch & 10 years experience	B.Arch & 11 years Experience	M.s Structure & 26 years experience	B.E. Electrical Engg & 28 years of Experience form M/s ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Electrical & 28 years experience from M/s. ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Civil & 16 years experience	

M

Executive Engineer, Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi, (Member) Executive Engineer, Education Works Division-I Karachi, (Technical Member) Representative of Finance Department (Member) Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member) Superintending Engineer, Provincial Buildings Circle

Karachi, (Chairman)

ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX AT DISTRICT KORANGI, KARACHI INCLUDING RESIDENCE (ADP # 2097).

TENDER OPENING PROFORMA (FINANCIAL)

	N	1/s Qamar & Asso	ciates	M/s	Irshad Nabi & As	sociates		M/s CAMOES	
Item/Description	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax
Amount in PKR Total of Form-A	11,480,000	1,722,000	13,202,000	13,955,000	2,093,250	16,048,250	14,842,500	2,226,375	17,068,875
Amount in PKR Total of Form-B	30,000	4,500	34,500	30,000	4,500	34,500	33,000	4,950	37,950
Grand Total (Form-A+B)			13,236,500			16,082,750			17,106,825
Remarks	Remarks 1st Lowest				2nd Lowest			3rd Lowest	

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt:

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

uson!

Representative of SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member) Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle

> Karachi. (Chairman)

BID EVALUATION REPORT

NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016. PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III, KARACHI.

1.	Name of Procurin	g Agency	Provincial	Buildings Divisio	n No.III, Karachi.					
2.	Tender Reference	No.	NIT NO. TO	C/G-55/PBD-III/2	016-17/991, DAT	TED: 09.12.2016.				
3.	Tender Descriptio	n/Name of Work	Establishn	nent of Deputy	Commissioner O	ffice Complex at				
	Items.		District Korangi, Karachi including Residence (ADP # 2097).							
4.	Method of Procur	ement.	QCBS Method							
5.	Tender Published		31087 dat	ed 04-01-2107. S	SPPRA website.					
6.	Total Bid docume	ents sold.	03-Nos.							
7.	Total Bids Receive	ed.	03-Nos.							
8.	Technical Bid Ope	ning date	Not Applic	cable						
	(if applicable)									
	(Provide details in	separate form).								
9.	No. of Bid Technic	cally qualified	Not Applicable							
	(if applicable).									
10.	Bid(s) Rejected.		NIL							
11.	Financial Bid Oper	ning date.	06-03-201	7.						
12.	Bid Evaluation Re	port.								
S.No	Name of Firm or	Cost offered by	Ranking	Comparison	Reasons for	Remarks				
	Bidder	the bidder	in terms	with	acceptance/					
			of cost.	Estimate cost	rejected					
1	2	3	4	5	6	7				
1.	M/s Qamar &	Rs. 13,236,500/-	Ist	Within	Ist Lowest.	Accepted				
	Associates.		Lowest	Estimated						
				Cost.						
2.	M/s Irshad Nabi	Rs. 16,082,750/-	2 nd			Highest				
	& Associates.									
3.	M/s CAMOES.	Rs. 17,106,825/-	3 rd			Highest				

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi. (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)

EVALUATION OF EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANTS FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE & ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2096 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Eligibility Criteria	0.000	AMEOS Iltants		ad Nabi &	M/s. Qamar	& Associates
		Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
1	A firm shall have the legal registration under the law;	✓		~		✓	
1 2	Registered with Pakistan Council of Architects & Town Planners and;	✓			√	~	
3	Registration of Associated Structural, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing Consultants with Pakistan Engineering Council;	√			√	√	
4	Valid Registration with Federal Board of Revenue (FBR).	✓		1		~	
	Eligibile / Non-Eligible	Elig	ible	Non-E	ligible	Elig	ible

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

SUMMARY SHEET

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2096 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants Ass Marks Obtained Marks 20	M/s. Irshad Nabi & Associates	M/s. Qamar & Associates
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects).		20	10	25
ii	Experience of Architectural Planning & Design, Structure Designing, Project Management / Construction Management and Detailed Construction supervision.	45	20.5	15	42.5
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-	30	23.5	8	28.5
	Total:	100	64	33	96
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qualified	Not Qualified	Qualified

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member).

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of

Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

(Chairman)

Page 1 of 1

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT "CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	S Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar	& Associates
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects). (25 Mark s)		20	80%	10	40%	25	100%
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in last 10 years							
ii (a)	15 Marks shall be given for Architectural Planning and Design.							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Structure Designing.							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Project Management/ Construction Management Approach							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects	45	20.5	45%	15	33%	42.5	94%
	completed in Detailed Construction supervision.							
(b)	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects					5		
	completed in Work Plan for the Project.				,			
(c)	10 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects				/	1		
	completed in Organization and staffing.				1 /h			

Madein

<u>Landolmaj</u>

Ah.

194

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT "CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar	& Associates
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-							
	Architectural Team Leader (01 No.) (Masters / Bachelors Architecture / Civil with at least 15 years of relev- experience of managing diversified projects) 7.5 Marks		7.5		0		7.5	
	Senior Architect (01 NO), (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture with at least 10 years of relevant experience) 05 Marks	30	2		0		5	
	Architect / Interior Designer (01 No.), (Bachelors in Architecture / Interior Designing and experience in interior designing with at least 05 years of relevant experience) 2.5 Marks		2		0		1	
	Structural Design Collaborations / Associates Lead Designer (01 NO.) (Masters in Structure Engineering and BE in Civil Engineering with at least 15 years of design experience of similar nature projects) O5 Marks		5		5		5	

Meelin

Jambolin D.

1

19/

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT "CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants		M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
	Electrical Design Collaborator / Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master & BE in Electrical Engineering and relevant experience of 10 years+) 2.5 Marks		1		0		2.5	
	Utility Design Collaborator/ Associates Lead Engineer (01 No.) (Master / BE in Civil & Relevant Discipline and relevant experience of 10+ years) 2.5 Marks		1	78%	1	27%	2.5	95%
	Construction Manager (01 No.) (Master/BE in Civil Engineering and having experience of 10 years+ of Construction Supervision & Contract Management of similar nature of projects) 05 Marks		5		2		5	
	Total:	100	64		33		96	
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qu	alified	Not Qu	alified	Qual	ified

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi. (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt., (Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt. (Co-opted Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)

Representative of

Finance Department

(Member)

TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BID/REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH), KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2096 OF 2016-17).

			Specifi	Part-(i) ic Experience (25	Marks)		Addequ	acy of the propos	Part(i ed Methodology (40 Mar	& Work Plan in response to the T	ron's		Key Pro	fessional Staff Quali	Part(iii) ification & Compet (35 Marks)	ence for the Assign	nment)		Total Score
						(a)	Technical Ap	proach & Method	ology	(b)	(c)								
S.No.	Name of the Firm	Criteria	15-20 Related similar projects completed in last 5 years	21-25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Above 25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Architecture planning & desing	Structure Designing	Project Construction Management approch	Detailed Construction Supervision	Work Plan	Organization & Staffing	Architectural Team Leader	Senior Architects	Architect/ Interior Designer	Strucutural Design Collaborations/ Associate Lead Engineer	Electrical Design Collaborations/ Associate Lead Engineer	Utility Design collaborations	Construction Manager	out of 100
		Max. Marks	10	20	25	15	5	5	5	5	10	7.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	2.5	5	
		Marks Obtained		25		14	5	4.5	4	5	10	7.5	5	1	5	2.5	2.5	5	96
		Total Marks Obtained		25				27.5		5	10				28.5	1			30
01	M/s. QAMAR & ASSOCIATES	COMMENTS	25 + relevant	years		assignment under cons Which inclu collections Submission Detailed De structural d cost Estima contracts), manageme Constructic describe th consultant	t and cover sideration in udes conce & soil inve n of prelimi ssign(Desig design & ca ates Detaile Tender Phont/construc on supervise e duties & and discus	ell understood ed all required in its methodols in its methodols plual design, I stigation of sit nary design, Sign developmen iculation, Detaid specification ase, Project cition managem ion & also in cresponsibility of the project in design in the project	aspects ogy in details. Data Le, ubmission of nt dwgs, iiled Boq & n condition of nent & details of the consultant at		including key professionals. The proposed staff will perform their jobs in parallel and in disintegrated time period. The total 14 man months requirements proposed to complete the job	experience	M.Arch & 10 years experience	B.Arch & 11 years Experience	M.s Structure & 26 years experience	B.E. Electrical Engg & 28 years of Experience form M/s ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Electrical & 28 years experience from M/s. ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Civil & 16 years experience	

Executive Engineer, Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi, (Member)

Executive Engineer, Education Works Division-I Karachi, (Technical Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member)

Superintending Engineer, Provincial Buildings Circle Karachi,

CONSTRUCTION OF OFFICE AND ACCOMMODATION OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (SOUTH) KARACHI **INCLUDING RESIDENCE (ADP # 2096).**

TENDER OPENING PROFORMA (FINANCIAL)

	N	1/s Qamar & Asso	ciates	M/s	Irshad Nabi & As	sociates		M/s CAMOES	
Item/Description	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax
Amount in PKR Total of Form-A	11,780,000	1,767,000	13,547,000	13,945,000	2,091,750	16,036,750	14,752,000	2,212,800	16,964,800
Amount in PKR Total of Form-B	25,000	3,750	28,750	31,000	4,650	35,650	35,000	5,250	40,250
Grand Total (Form-A+B)			13,575,750			16,072,400			17,005,050
Remarks	Remarks 1st Lowest				2nd Lowest			3rd Lowest	

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt:

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of **Finance Department**

(Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department

(Co-opted Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle

Karachi.

BID EVALUATION REPORT



NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016. PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III,KARACHI.

1.	Name of Procuring	Agency	Provincial	Buildings Division	on No.III, Karachi.					
2.	Tender Reference	No.	NIT NO. T	C/G-55/PBD-III/2	2016-17/991, DAT	ED: 09.12.2016.				
3.	Tender Description	n/Name of Work			and Accommoda					
	Items.		Commissi	, ,	Karachi includ	ling Residence				
			(ADP # 20							
4.	Method of Procure	ement.	QCBS Me	TAX (157) 70)						
5.	Tender Published.		31087 da	ted 04-01-2107.	SPPRA website.					
6.	Total Bid docume	nts sold.	03-Nos.							
7.	Total Bids Receive	d.	03-Nos.							
8.	Technical Bid Oper	ning date	Not Appli	cable						
	(if applicable)									
	(Provide details in	separate form).								
9.	No. of Bid Technic	ally qualified	Not Appli	cable						
	(if applicable).									
10.	Bid(s) Rejected.		NIL							
11.	Financial Bid Open	ing date.	06-03-201	L7.						
12.	Bid Evaluation Rep	ort.								
S.No	Name of Firm or	Cost offered by	Ranking	Comparison	Reasons for	Remarks				
	Bidder	the bidder	in terms	with	acceptance/					
			of cost.	Estimate cost	rejected					
1	2	3	4	5	6	7				
1.	M/s Qamar &	Rs. 13,575,750/-	Ist	Within	Ist Lowest.	Accepted				
	Associates.		Lowest	Estimated						
				Cost.						
2.	M/s Irshad Nabi	Rs. 16,072,400/-	2 nd			Highest				
	& Associates.									
3.	M/s CAMOES.	Rs. 17,005,050/-	3 rd			Highest				

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.
(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Executive Engineer Education Works Division-I Karachi

(Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member) Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)

EVALUATION OF EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANTS FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE, DISTT. MALIR, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2101 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Eligibility Criteria	M/s. CA		M/s. Irsha		M/s. Qamar	& Associates
		Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
1	A firm shall have the legal registration under the law;	✓		✓		✓	
1 2	Registered with Pakistan Council of Architects & Town Planners and;	1			✓	✓	
	Registration of Associated Structural, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing Consultants with Pakistan Engineering Council;	~			~	*	
4	Valid Registration with Federal Board of Revenue (FBR).	√		1		~	
	Eligibile / Non-Eligible	Eligi	ible	Non-E	ligible	Elig	ible

Executive Engineer **Provincial Buildings Division-III**

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of

Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

SUMMARY SHEET

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE, DISTT. MALIR, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2101 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submision: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS Consultants	Associates	M/s. Qamar & Associates
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
i	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects).		20	10	25
ii	Experience of Architectural Planning & Design, Structure Designing, Project Management / Construction Management and Detailed Construction supervision.	45	20.5	15	42.5
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-	30	23.5	8	28.5
	/ Total:	100	64	33	96
	Qualified / Not Qualified		Not Qualified	Not Qualified	Qualified

Executive Engineer

Provincial Buildings Division-III

Karachi. (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt.

(Member)

Executive Engineer
Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Deptt. (Co-opted Member) Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Orcle, Karachi

Representative of

Finance Department

(Member)

(Chairman)

Page 1 of 1

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE, DISTT. MALIR, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	6 Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates		
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	
I	Specific Experience in similar nature and complexity of Projects with Architectural, Planning & Design Services, preparation of Detailed Engineering Estimates, Tender / Bidding documents. (Details shall be provided for similar nature and buildings projects). (25 Mark s)		20	80%	10	40%	25	100%	
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in last 10 years								
ii (a)	15 Marks shall be given for Architectural Planning and Design.								
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Structure Designing.								
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Project Management/ Construction Management Approach	CONTRACTOR OF STREET							
	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects completed in Detailed Construction supervision.	45	20.5	45%	15	33%	42.5	94%	
(b)	05 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects								
(c)	completed in Work Plan for the Project. 10 Marks shall be given for 05 relevant projects				1				
	completed in Organization and staffing			1	/	+ (

Malun wat

Camble &

Mh.

194

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE, DISTT. MALIR, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Criteria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates		
			Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	
iii	Technical capacity of human resource required for the project:-								
	Architectural Team Leader (01 No.) (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture / Civil with at least 15 years of relevant experience of managing diversified projects) 7.5 Marks		7.5		0		7.5		
	Senior Architect (01 NO), (Masters / Bachelors in Architecture with at least 10 years of relevant experience) 05 Marks	30	2		0		5		
	Architect / Interior Designer (01 No.), (Bachelors in Architecture / Interior Designing and experience in interior designing with at least 05 years of relevant experience) 2.5 Marks		2		0		1		
	Structural Design Collaborations / Associates Lead Designer (01 NO.) (Masters in Structure Engineering and BE in Civil Engineering with at least 15 years of design experience of similar nature projects) 05 Marks		5		5		5		

Mahim Sal-

Jambola 3

194

EVALUATION MARKS FOR EXPRESSION OF INTEREST (EOI) OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT " ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE, DISTT. MALIR, KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2100 OF 2016-17).

NIT No. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, Dated: 09-12-2016

Date of Submission: December 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Date of Opening : Decem ber 29, 2016 upto 3:00 P.M.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70, but it is mandatory to score 60% in each section

S.No	Evaluation Crite	ria	Max Marks	M/s. CAMEOS	S Consultants	M/s. Irsha Assoc		M/s. Qamar & Associates	
				Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age	Marks Obtained	%Age
	Electrical Design Collaborator Engineer (01 No.) (Master & Engineering and relevant experi 2.5 Marks	BE in Electrical		1		0		2.5	
	Utility Design Collaborator/ Associates (Master / BE in Civil & Relevant D experience of 10+ years) 2.5 Marks			1	78%	1	27%	2.5	95%
	Construction Manager (01 No.) (Master/BE in Civil Engineering and having experience of 10 years+ of Construction Supervision & Contract Management of similar nature of projects) 05 Marks			5		2		5	
		Total :	100	64		33		96	
	Qualified		Not Qu	alified	Not Qu	alified	Qual	ified	

Executive Engineer **Provincial Buildings Division-III**

Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt.,

(Member)

Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt.

(Co-opted Member)

Representative of Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi

TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BID/REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL OF CONSULTANT FOR THE PROJECT "ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE AT DISTRICT MALIR KARACHI". (ADP NO. 2101 OF 2016-17).

			Specifi	Part-(i) ic Experience (25	Marks)		Addequa	acy of the propos	Part(i ed Methodology (40 Mar	& Work Plan in response to the Ti	OR's		Key Pro	fessional Staff Quali	Part(iii) fication & Compe (35 Marks)	tence for the Assign	nment)		Total Score out of 100
0.385						(a)	Technical Ap	proach & Methode	ology	(b)	(c)	Call Son Start					100000000000000000000000000000000000000		
S.No.	Name of the Firm	Criteria	15-20 Related similar projects completed in last 5 years	21-25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Above 25 related similar projects completed in last 5 years	Architecture planning & desing	Structure Designing	Project Construction Management approch	Detailed Construction Supervision	Work Plan	Organization & Staffing	Architectural Team Leader	Senior Architects	Architect/ Interior Designer	Strucutural Design Collaborations Associate Lead Engineer	Electrical Design Collaborations/ Associate Lead Engineer	Utility Design	Construction Manager	out of 100
		Max. Marks	10	20	25	15	5	5	5	5	10	7.5	5	2.5	5	2.5	2.5	5	out of 100
		Marks Obtained		25		14	5	4.5	4	5	10	7.5	5	1	5	2.5	2.5	5	96
		Total Marks Obtained		25				27.5		5	10		•	•	28.5				
01	M/s. QAMAR & ASSOCIATES	COMMENTS	25 + relevant p	years		assignment under cons Which inclu collections Submissior Detailed De structural d cost Estima contracts), managemei describe th consultant	and cover- ideration in ides conce & soil inve- & soil inve- sign(Desig lesign & cal ates Detaile Tender Pha int/construct on supervis e duties & i and discus	ed all required its methodolo ptual design, I stigation of sit nary design, S in developmen loulation, Deta d specification	aspects gy in details. Data e, ubmission of tt dwgs, iiled Boq & n condition of nent & letails of the consultant at		Proposed 18 staff members team to complete the job, 9 staff team for office & 9 staff team for construction site including key professionals. The proposed staff will perform their jobs in parallel and in disintegrated time period. The total 14 man months requirements proposed to complete the job	experience	M.Arch & 10 years experience	B.Arch & 11 years Experience	8.26 years experience	B.E. Electrical Engg & 28 years of Experience form M/s ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Electrical & 28 years experience from M/s. ElekEn Associates Consultant	BE Civil & 16 years experience	

Executive Engineer, Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi, (Member)

Executive Engineer, Education Works Division-I Karachi, (Technical Member)

Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member)

Superintending Engineer, Provincial Buildings Circle Karachi, (Chairman)

ESTABLISHMENT OF DEPUTY COMMISSIONER OFFICE COMPLEX INCLUDING RESIDENCE AT DISTRICT MALIR, KARACHI. (ADP # 2101).

TENDER OPENING PROFORMA (FINANCIAL)

	N	1/s Qamar & Asso	ciates	M/s	Irshad Nabi & As	sociates	M/s CAMOES			
Item/Description	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	Professional Charges for the Scheme including income tax	Add Sales Tax @ 10%	Total Bid Price including Sales Tax	
Amount in PKR Total of Form-A	10,745,000	1,611,750	12,356,750	11,792,000	1,768,800	13,560,800	12,931,000	1,939,650	14,870,650	
Amount in PKR Total of Form-B	30,000	4,500	34,500	30,000	4,500	34,500	32,000	4,800	36,800	
Grand Total (Form-A+B)			12,391,250			13,595,300			14,907,450	
Remarks 1st Lowest					2nd Lowest		3rd Lowest			

Executive Engineer Provincial Buildings Division-III Karachi.

(Member)

Representative of

Planning & Development Deptt: (Member) Executive Engineer

Education Works Division-I

Karachi.

(Technical Member)

Representative of

SGA&C Department (Co-opted Member) Representative of

Finance Department

(Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle

Karachi. (Chairman)

BID EVALUATION REPORT



NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016. PROVINCIAL BUILDINGS DIVISION NO.III,KARACHI.

1.	Name of Procurin	g Agency	Provincial Buildings Division No.III, Karachi.							
2.	Tender Reference	No.	NIT NO. TC/G-55/PBD-III/2016-17/991, DATED: 09.12.2016.							
3.	Tender Description	n/Name of Work	Establishment of Deputy Commissioner Office Comple							
	Items.		including Residence at District Malir, Karachi (ADP # 2101)							
4.	Method of Procur	rement.	QCBS Me	thod						
5.	Tender Published	•	31087 da	ted 04-01-2107.	SPPRA website.					
6.	Total Bid docume	ents sold.	03-Nos.							
7.	Total Bids Receive	ed.	03-Nos.							
8.	Technical Bid Ope	ening date	Not Appli	cable						
	(if applicable)									
	(Provide details in									
9.	No. of Bid Technic	cally qualified	Not Applicable							
	(if applicable).									
10.	Bid(s) Rejected.		NIL							
11.	Financial Bid Ope	ning date.	06-03-2017.							
12.	Bid Evaluation Re	port.								
S.No	Name of Firm or	Cost offered by	Ranking	Comparison	Reasons for	Remarks				
	Bidder	the bidder	in terms	with	acceptance/					
			of cost.	Estimate cost	rejected					
1	2	3	4	5	6	7				
1.	M/s Qamar &	Rs. 12,391,250/-	Ist	Within	Ist Lowest.	Accepted				
	Associates.		Lowest	Estimated						
				Cost.						
2.	M/s Irshad Nabi	Rs. 13,595,300/-	2 nd			Highest				
	& Associates.									
3.	M/s CAMOES.	Rs. 14,907,450/-	3 rd			Highest				

Executive Engineer
Provincial Buildings Division-III
Karachi.
(Member)

Representative of

Representative of Planning & Development Deptt: (Member) Executive Engineer Education Works Division-I

Karachi (Member)

Representative of SGA&C Deptt: (Co-opted Member) Representative of Finance Department (Member)

Superintending Engineer Provincial Buildings Circle, Karachi (Chairman)