

Sindh Solid Waste Management Board

2. **Mr. Shafiq-ur-Rehman**
Director (Front End Collection)
Sindh Solid Waste Management Board
3. **Engr. Salahuddin Ahmed**
Deputy Director (Operations), Karachi
Sindh Solid Waste Management Board
4. **Mr. A.K Rind**
Deputy Secretary (Budget)
Finance Department Government of Sindh
5. **Mr. Farman Ali Chandio**
Planning Officer
(P&D) Department Government of Sindh

SPPRA INWARD DIARY
NO: 16756
DATED: 11.5.15

SUBJECT: Minutes Of The 3rd Meeting Of Consultant Selection Committee

I am directed to enclose herewith a copy of minutes of the 3rd meeting of Consultant Selection Committee of Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, held on 10.04.2015 at 4.00 P.M. under the Chairmanship of Secretary Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, for information and necessary action


(Shamsuddin Katpar)
Deputy Director (Finance)
Sindh Solid Waste Management Board

Copy for information to:

1. Managing Director, Sindh Solid Waste Management Board
2. Secretary, Sindh Solid Waste Management Board
3. DS(Staff) to Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh
- ✓ 4. DD(A&F), SPPRA, Govt of Sindh.

SINDH SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD, D-47, Block 2, Clifton, Karachi
Tel: 021 3586 3026 - 28; Fax: 021-3586 3029

Encl: original Technical Evaluation Report

Examined by
11/5
M(E-II)

Sindh Solid Waste Management Board on 07th April, 2015 at 4.00 PM in the Committee Room of Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, to evaluate the EOI's submitted by the interested firms.

- *The list of participants attached*
2. At the outset, the chair briefed the participants regarding the predetermined evaluation criteria stated in EOI response document which included:
 - Experiences of firms in Municipal, Industrial, Hazardous and Medical Waste Management
 - Specific Experience
 - Technical Capacity of Human Resources required for the Project
 - Administrative & Operational Capacity to manage the assignment successfully
 - Financial Capacity of the Firm
 3. Deputy Director (Finance) informed the Committee that EOI's of 13 firms were received by the board in response to the advertisement published in the leading newspapers. The names of Participating firms are as follows:

PARTICIPATING FIRMS

S:no	Name of Firms	Address
1	TSI, NUCLEUS & ENGI. PROTECH	Ce-13, Central Plaza, Barket Market, Garden Town Lahore
2	MECHTECH	Sb 1/2 Al-Hilal Society Main University Road, Karachi
3	NESPAK	13 th Floor Nic Building Abbasi Shaheed Road, Off: Shakra-E-Faisal Karachi
4	G3 ENGINEERING CONSULTANT	H.No: 160, Blockd, Model Town Lahore
5	STRATCON ENVIRONMENTAL DEVELOPMENT & CONSULTANT	C-36, Lower Ground Floor, 21 st Commercial Street Phase II Defence Officers Housing Authority Karachi
6	INTEGRATED EQUITIES (PRIVATE) LIMITED	202 Y-Block, Commercial Block, DHA Phase III, Lahore
7	ARCHEN VISION CONSULTANT	405-406, Shaes Centre, Sb-25, Block 13-C Gulshan-E-Iqbal Karachi
8	TECHNO-CONSULTANT INTERNATIONAL	37-K/6 P.E.C.H.S Main Shakra-E-Faisal Karachi
9	ICEPAK	Icepak, 12 Canal Park, Gulberg Lahore
10	EMC PAK PVT LTD	503, Anum Estate Main Shakra-E-Faisal Karachi
11	NEC PAK PVT LTD	202-A, Sea Breeze Plaza Main Shakra-E-Faisal Karachi
12	MM PAKISTAN PVT LTD	Dolman Estate, 1 st Floor 18-C Union Commercial Area, Shaheed E Millat Road Karachi
13	M/S ALI JAFFAR & ASSOCIATES JV CERES ASSOCIATES GULF EPEM SA	Plot No: 43, Pak Tower Linear Commercial Area Phase 8, Bahria Town Islamabad

eligibility criteria. The firms which secured 60% marks in the aggregate and 40% marks in each section were declared eligible.

MARKS OBTAINED BY EACH FIRM:

S.NO	Name of Firms	Total No Of Marks Obtained	Percentage
1	TSI, NUCLEUS & ENGI. PROTECH	75	75% ✓
2	MECHTECH	05	05% ✓
3	NESPAK	79	79% ✓
4	G3 ENGINEERING CONSULTANT	73	73% ✓
5	STRATCON ENVIRONMENTAL DEVELOPMENT & CONSULTANT	70	70% ✓
6	INTEGRATED EQUITIES (PRIVATE) LIMITED	76	76% ✓
7	ARCHEN VISION CONSULTANT	70	70% ✓
8	TECHNO-CONSULTANT INTERNATIONAL	71	71% ✓
9	ICEPAK	92	92% ✓
10	EMC PAK PVT LTD	84	84% ✓
11	NEC PAK PVT LTD	54	54% ✓
12	MM PAKISTAN PVT LTD	56	56% ✓
13	M/S ALI JAFFAR & ASSOCIATES JV CERES ASSOCIATES GULF EEPEM SA	71	71% ✓

6. As a result 10 out of 13 firms were shortlisted and therefore it was decided by the Committee to issue request for proposal (RFP) to the following ten firms. Four of these firms were conditionally prequalified as they had not provided a copy of their registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC).

SHORTLISTED FIRMS:

1. TSI, NUCLEUS & ENGI. PROTECH
2. NESPAK
3. G3 ENGINEERING CONSULTANT
4. STRATCON ENVIRONMENTAL DEVELOPMENT & CONSULTANT
5. INTEGRATED EQUITIES (PRIVATE) LIMITED
6. ARCHEN VISION CONSULTANT
7. TECHNO-CONSULTANT INTERNATIONAL
8. ICEPAK
9. EMC PAK PVT LTD
10. M/S ALI JAFFAR & ASSOCIATES JV CERES ASSOCIATES GULF EEPEM SA



The following four firms were conditionally prequalified, and therefore it was decided that these firms would be requested to provide a copy of PEC to the Sindh Solid Waste Management Board.

1. TSI, NUCLEUS & ENGL. PROTECH
2. INTEGRATED EQUITIES (PRIVATE) LIMITED
3. ICEPAK
4. M/S ALI JAFFAR & ASSOCIATES JV CERES ASSOCIATES GULF EEPEN SA

7. The following firms could not secure the qualifying marks. Hence they were not shortlisted.

1. MECHTECH
2. NEC PAK PVT LTD
3. MM PAKISTAN PVT LTD

8. In the end the evaluation sheet/ report was prepared on the basis of the marks obtained by each firm. The sheet was signed by the chairman and all the members of the committee to authenticate the results. (Copy of the sheet enclosed)

The meeting ended with the vote of thanks to and from the chair.

(Mazhar Ali)
Deputy Director (Finance) SSWMB/
Secretary, Consultant Selection Committee

EVALUATION REPORT

EVALUATION OF CONSULTANTS PROFILES AS PER ESTABLISHED SCORING CRITERIA FOR IN-HOUSE CONSULTANTS FOR SINDH SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD

PREQUALIFICATION OF CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR PROJECT MGT. CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION

S.No	Name of the Firm	Registration only for GTS	Sr. No. 1 Experience of firm Municipal, Industrial, Hazardous and Medical Waste Management			Sr. No. 2 Specific Experience					Sr. No. 3 Technical Capacity of Human Resource Required for the project					Sr. No. 4 Administrative & Operational Capacity to manage the assignment successfully			Sr. No. 5 Financial capacity of the firm (Audited Statement last 3 years shall be submitted).			TOTAL Minimum Qualifying Marks = 60, but it is mandatory to score 40% in each section 100 Marks	Remarks/Result	
			20 Marks			28 Marks					30 Marks					10 Marks			15 Marks					
			Check the following Registrations PEC registration	Upto 05 years (Municipal = 06 Marks, Industrial = 01, Hazardous = 01, and Medical = 01 Marks)	from 5 to 10 years (Municipal = 06 Marks, Industrial = 02, Hazardous = 02, and Medical = 02 Marks)	above 10 years (Municipal = 11 Marks, Industrial = 03, Hazardous = 03, and Medical = 03 Marks)	a) Studies, Design, Construction Supervision, Total (06 Marks) Studies = 02, Design = 02, Construction Supervision = 01,	b) Environmental Management for the development of Integrated SWM Infrastructure, (08 Marks)	c) Development of Municipal Business Plan (06 Marks)	d) Revenue Models development for Waste Management (06 Marks)	e) Institutions Arrangements and other relevant services to uplift the entire spectrum of SWM (06 Marks)	1) Senior Municipal Solid Waste Management Specialist (PHD in any of the Waste Management sector, with background in Urban Planning, minimum of 15 years of relevant experience is required).	2) Senior Solid Waste Engineer (Design of SWM Infrastructure / GTS / MRF / Landfill sites / Biowaste Processing Plants / Waste to Energy Plants (Masters in Relevant Field with 20 years of similar experience)	3) Solid Waste Management Operation Manager (Masters in relevant field with 15 years of experience in managing MSWM of handling of 1000 tons of waste per day).	4) Municipal Tariff Specialist (Finance Specialist with Master in Relevant field and 15 years of relevant experience)	5) Solid Waste Legal Expert (Incumbent must be well versant of local and special laws related to SWM with atleast 15 years of experience)	Outside Country (03 Marks)	Office in Asia & Pacific (03 Marks)	Offices in Pakistan (04 Marks)	One Year	One Year			One Year
		(Y/N)	06 marks	12 marks	20 marks						09 marks	06 marks	05 marks	05 marks	05 marks	03 marks	03 marks	04 marks	05 marks	05 marks	05 marks	15 marks		
1	M/S NES PAK	Y		14	20	5	5	4	4	2	7	4	4	5	5	3	3	4	5	5	0		79	
2	M/S M.M PAK	Y		12	17	4	4	4	2	3	7	4	3	2	3	0	0	4	4	0	0		56	
3	M/S STRAT CON	Y		12	19	6	2	4	4	3	4	4	2	2	2	3	3	4	5	5	5		70	
4	M/S ICE PAK	N		20	19	5	3	2	5	4	9	5	4	5	5	3	3	4	5	5	5		92	
5	M/S ARCH VISSION	Y		14	18	5	5	5	2	1	9	4	2	2	2	1	1	2	5	5	5		70	
6	M/S INTEGRATED EQUITIES	N		12	13	4	5	3	1	0	9	5	5	3	4	3	3	4	5	5	5		76	
7	M/S G3 ENGINEERING	Y		08	17	5	5	3	2	2	9	5	3	2	4	3	3	4	5	5	5		73	
8	M/S NATIONAL ENGINEERING CO	Y		09	11	5	2	2	1	1	7	5	2	1	2	0	3	4	5	5	0		54	
9	M/S EMC PAK	Y		16	18	5	5	3	3	2	9	5	4	3	4	3	3	4	5	5	5		84	
10	M/S TSI NUCLEOUS	N		15	25	5	5	5	5	5	1	5	3	2	2	3	0	4	5	5	5		75	
11	M/S MECH TECH	Y		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0		05	
12	M/S TECHNO CONSULTENT	Y		12	21	5	4	5	3	4	8	4	4	2	3	0	3	4	0	5	5		71	
13	M/S ALI JAFFAR	N		12	21	5	5	3	4	4	7	4	2	2	3	3	3	4	5	5	0		71	

• TOTAL FIRMS PARTICIPATED = 13 (THIRTEEN)
 • TOTAL NO OF FIRMS QUALIFIED = 10 (TEN)
 • TOTAL NO OF FIRMS WHICH COULD NOT QUALIFY = 03 (THREE)

Committee Members
 10/11/2015
 M. Shauqatullah

Dr. A. B. Sajwan
 ED (Kash)

SYED SALAUDDIN AHMED
 Dy Dir SSWMB.
 Planning Officer, P&D
 Farouq Ali

M. H. Jaffer
 Dy Dir SSWMB.

MAZHAR ALI
 D.D (Finance)
 SSWMB