

WORKERS WELFARE BOARD SINDH

GOVERNMENT OF SINDH





No. WWBS/E.S/Admin/H.S.G/1(1445)/ 2018/ 367

Dated 15/4/2018

To,

The Managing Director,
Public Procurement Regulatory Authority,
Govt. of Sindh
Barrack 8 Secretariat 4 A,
Court Road,

Phone: -21-99205356

Karachi.

SUBJECT:

HOISTING OF BID EVALUATION REPORT & BIDDER QUALIFICATION REPORT (SR.

NO. 37229).

Enclosed please find here with copies of Bid Evaluation Report, minutes of Procurement Committee (Technical & Financial proposals), Comparative Statement, Bid Evaluation Report & attendance sheets duly signed by the Convener & members Procurement Committee regarding Hiring of Security Guards with the request to may please be uploaded enclosed reports on the official Website of SPPRA as per rules.

Encls:

As above

Assistant Secretary (Admin)
FOR SECRETARY
Workers Welfare Board Sindh

MINUTES OF MEETING

A meeting of the Procurement Committee was held on 05.04.2018 at 11:30 a.m. in the Office of the Secretary, Sindh Workers Welfare Board, 8th Floor Marine Faisal Building, Main Nursery Stop, Shar-e-Faisal Karachi, to open the *Financial Proposals* (of technically qualified / accepted bidders) invited for procurement of Security Guards for Sindh Workers Welfare Board and their others administrative units in Sindh. Following attended the meeting:

1. Syed Anwar Ausaf,

Director (Finance) WWB, Sindh.

Convener

2. Mrs. Nuzhat Habib,

Dy: Secretary (A&C) Education Section, WWB, Sindh.

Member/Secretary

3. Mr. Khalid Hussain Khokhar

Deputy Director (Admin) WWB, Sindh

Member

4. Mr. Abdul Manan

Representative of Industries Dept: Govt of Sindh.

Member

5. Mr. Noor-Ul- Hadi,

Deputy Director (NILAT), Government of Sindh.

Member

In response to Advertisement the (12) twelve interested firms purchased the tender documents and out of which the following (06) six firms submitted their bids; containing technical & financial proposals along with their company's profiles:-

- 1. M/s. Dragon Security Services (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.
- 2. M/s. Zulfigar Security Company (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 3. M/s. Rehman Security System (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.
- 4. M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 5. M/s. Famous Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 6. M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.

The technical proposals of bidding firms were evaluated with regard to experience of bidding firms in relevant filed, financial worth, NTN & Sales Tax registration, List of team members, Detail (Client) list of Security Services provide, Registration with Ministry of Interior or provincial Home Department, CEO, Managing Directors ex-Army Personal, Prove of trained Security Guards/persons and Prove of latest weapons and security equipments available with the firm etc

As per technical evaluation reports the technical proposals following (03) three participated firms were found qualified and accepted by the Procurement Committee.

- I. M/s. Zulfiqar Security Company (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- II. M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- III. M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.

Accordingly, letters of intimation regarding acceptance of technical proposals and inviting to attend opening of financial proposals, were issued to firms' qualified for bidding. The financial proposals of the technically accepted bidders were opened by the Procurement Committee in presence of representatives of the bidding firms.

my All West

After opening of financial proposals, the committee preliminary prepared separate attendance sheets for bid, showing the names of the technically accepted bidding firms, the amount of earnest money provided with the bid, total amount/ value of bid quoted by the bidders and the total amount/ value calculated by the committee after checking of individual quoted rates and amount thereof. The amount based on 12 months in 17 Workers Model Schools and Colleges. The position of the quoted rates by the participated firm is given as follows:

Sr. No.	Name of Bidding Firm	Amount of Pay Orders submitted by bidders	Total Bid Value quoted by the bidders	Total Value calculated by the Committee	Remarks
1	M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd.	236,400/-	11,820,000/-	11,820,000/-	1 st Lowest Quote
2.	M/s. Zulfiquar Security Co (Pvt) Ltd.	245,000/-	12,247,200/-	12,247,200/-	2 nd Lowest Quote
3	M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd.	258,240/-	12,912,000/-	12,912,000/-	3rd Lowest Quote

After detailed evaluation of technical and financial bids, and discussion matter of earnest money, committee has decided as following :

Decision.

2.

- 1. Procurement Committee decided that the contract for procurement of security guards to our all Workers Model Schools and Colleges to *M/s. The Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd., Karachi*, which is the 1st lowest quote with the amount of Rs. 11,820,000/-
 - The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Committee Members	Signature	Committee Members	Signature
(Nuzhat Habib)		(Abdul Manan)	
Dy: Secretary (A&C), WWB, Sindh (E.S), Member/ Secretary.	1997	Examiner of Store, Representative of Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh/ Member	Alles
(Khalid Hussain Khokhar)	(1d · 1	(Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi)	
Dy: Director (Admin) WWBS/Member		Deputy Director (NILAT) Govt. of Sindh/ Member	nd
(Syed Anwar Ausaf,)			
Director (Finance), WWB,	1		
Sindh/ Convener of	5	d X	
Committee	V V		

MINUTES OF MEETING

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE HELD ON 29.03.2018 AT 11:00 A.M. TO OPEN THE BIDS INVITED FOR PROCUREMENT OF SECURITY GUARDS FOR OUR ALL WORKERS MODEL SCHOOLS AND COLLEGES IN SINDH.

A meeting of the Procurement Committee was held on 29.03.2018 at 11:00 a.m. in the Office of the Secretary, Sindh Workers Welfare Board, 8th Floor Marine Faisal Building, Main Nursery Stop, Shar-e-Faisal Karachi, to open the Bids (Technical proposals only) invited for procurement of Security Guards for Sindh Workers Welfare Board and their others administrative units in Sindh. Following attended the meeting:

1. Syed Anwar Ausaf,

Director (Finance) WWB, Sindh.

Convener

2. Mrs.Nuzhat Habib.

Dy: Secretary (A&C) Education Section, WWB, Sindh.

Member/Secretary

3. Mr.Khalid Hussain Khokhar

Deputy Director (Admin) WWB, Sindh

Member

4. Mr. Abdul Manan

Representative of Industries Dept: Govt of Sindh.

Member

5. Mrs. Noor-Ul- Hadi,

Deputy Director (NILAT), Government of Sindh.

Member

The Committee was informed that a tender notice was got published in leading newspapers; Daily Dawn (English), Daily Kawish (Sindhi) and Daily Jang (Urdu) on 11.03.2018. The same was also hoisted/put on the official website of SPPRA on 12.03.2018 vide Sr# 37229 dated: 12.03.2018. As per SPPRA rules this tender was invited Single stage - two envelopes bids, containing Technical and Financial Proposals.

In response to Advertisement the (12) twelve interested firms purchased the tender documents and out of which the following (06) Six firms submitted their bids; containing technical & financial proposals along with their company's profiles. Only Technical bids were opened and held the financial proposals in our custody:-

- 1. M/s. Dragon Security Services (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.
- 2. M/s. Zulfiqar Security Company (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 3. M/s. Rehman Security System (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.
- 4. M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 5. M/s. Famous Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 6. M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.

After opening the technical proposals, the Committee prepared Technical evaluated Sheet (enclosed at Flag "A") on the basis of documents provided by the bidding firms in support of their technical proposals.

As per Technical Evaluated Sheet the participated firms obtained the marks as mentioned below:-

Name of riffis	Total Marks	Total Marks obtained by the firm)	Remarks
----------------	----------------	----------------------------------	---	---------

M/s. Zulfiqar Security C—pany (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.		1175	Qualified
M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi	-	1150	Qualified
M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	1,000	1140	Qualified
M/s. Rehman Security System (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	1200	880	Not Qualified
M/s. Dragon Security Services (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.	-	870	Not Qualified
M/s. Famous Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.		750	Not Qualified

In the light of above summarized preliminary technical evaluation of bids, the Tender Opening Committee decided as follows:-

Decision:

- I. Committee approved the Technical Proposals of the following firms as **Qualified & Responsive** and decided to accept their technical bids to open their Financial Proposals to finalize the recommendations for award of contract:
 - I. M/s. Zulfiqar Security Company (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
 - II. M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
 - III. M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.
- 2. Technical proposals of the following firms were found **non-responsive**/do not conform to the basic qualifications requirements. Hence, Committee decided not to consider the same for further evaluation and to return their Financial Proposals unopened along with Bid Security. Intimation with reason may also be given.
 - I. M/s. Dragon Security Services (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.
 - II. M/s. Rehman Security System (Pvt.) Ltd, Karachi.
 - III. M/s. Famous Security (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

Committee Members	Signature	Committee Members	Signature
(Nuzhat Habib) Dy: Secretary (A&C), WWB, Sindh (E.S), Member/ Secretary.	May 1	(Abdul Manan) Examiner of Store, Representative of Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh/ Member	All Lon
(Khalid Hussain Khokhar) Dy: Director (Admin) WWBS/Member	Mil	(Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi) Deputy Director (NILAT) Govt. of Sindh/ Member	Li
(Syed Anwar Ausaf,) Director (Finance), WWB, Sindh/ Convener of Committee	fin		1

BID EVALUATION REPORT

PROVIDING SECURITY GUARDS SERVICING IN BOARD INSTITUIONS IN ALL OVER PROVINCE OF SINDH FOR 12 MONTHS.

1)	Name of Procuring Agency:	Workers Welfare Board, Sindh.				
2)	Tender Reference No.	WWBS/E.S/Admin/H.S.G/01(1445/2017				
3)	Tender Description/Name of work/item:	Hiring Security Guards for Board Institutions located in all province of Sindh for 12 months in the current Financial year 2017-18.				
4)	Method of Procuring:	Single Stage ~ Two Envelopes.				
5)	Tender published:	NIT were published in Dawn (English), Daily Kawish (Sindhi) and Daily Jang (Urdu) on 11.03.2018. The same was also hoisted/put on the official website of SPPRA on 12.03.2018 vide Sr# 37229 dated: 12.03.2018.				
6)	Total Bids Documents Sold:	Twelve(12)				
7)	Total Bids Received:	Four (06).				
8)	No. of Bids Rejected:	Nil				
0)	Bid Opening Date: Technical Proposals	29.03.2018				
9)	Technically Qualified firms.	Three (03)				
	Financial Proposals.	05.04.2018				

Bid Evaluation Report

Sr#	Name of Bidding Firms	Quoted Rate as passed by the Committee	Ranking in Terms of Cost
1	M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd.	11,820,000/-	1 st Lowest
2	M/s. Zulfiquar Security Co (Pvt) Ltd.	12,247,200/-	2 nd Lowest
3	M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd.	12,912,000/-	3 rd Lowest

vsi /

1 1

Jun

Alle

Following members of Procurement Committee after due consideration has recommended to accept the 1st lowest best evaluated bid in favor of M/s. . Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd. Karachi, with the amount of $\it Rs.~11,820,000$ /-

Committee Members	Signature	Committee Members	Signature
(Nuzhat Habib) Dy: Secretary (A&C), WWB, Sindh (E.S), Member/ Secretary.		(Abdul Manan) Examiner of Store, Representative of Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh/ Member	Alle
(Khalid Hussain Khokhar) Dy: Director (Admin) WWBS/Member		(Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi) Deputy Director (NILAT) Govt. of Sindh/ Member	"di
(Syed Anwar Ausaf,) Director (Finance), WWB, Sindh/ Convener of Committee	J 51	rlig	

Comparative Statement for Providing Security Guards Servicing in Board Institutions in all over province of Sindh 2017-18

Sr. N	N Demanded Description	QTY. of	M/s.Internet Security System (Pvt) Ltd	curity System Ltd	M/s.Muhafiz	M/s.Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd	M/s.Zulfic Compar	M/s.Zulfiqar Security Company (Pvt) Ltd
		Guards	Rate	Amount (12	Rate	Amount (12 months)	Rate	Amount (12 months)
	Supervisor or Shift incharge	2	21,400	513,600	40,000	480,000	Free of Cost	
	Workers Model School, korangi, karachi	4	19,400	931,200	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
2	Workers Model School, Landhi, karachi	4	19,400	931,200	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
ω	Workers Model School, New karachi	4	19,400	931,200	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
4	Workers Model School, Hyderabad	4	19,000	912,000	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
77	Workers Model School, Sukkur	4	19,000	912,000	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
<u></u>	Workers Model School, Nooriabad	4	19,400	931,200	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
7	Workers Model School, (Boys), Mirpurkhas	4	19,000	912,000	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
8	Workers Model School, (Girls), Mirpurkhas	4	19,000	912,000	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
9	Workers Intermediate College of Girls, Kotri	4	19,000	912,000	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
10	Workers Intermediate College of Boys, Kotri	4	19,000	912,000	70,000	840,000	18,900	907,200
_ <u>`</u>	Workers Primary School Thatta	2	19,000	456,000	35,000	420,000	18,900	453,600
12	Workers Primary School, Nooriabad	2	19,400	465,600	35,000	420,000	18,900	453,600
13	Workers Primary School, Larkana.	2	19,000	456,000	35,000	420,000	18,900	453,600
14	Workers Primary School, Lakhra	2	19,000	456,000	35,000	420,000	18,900	453,600
15	Workers Primary School, Khairpur	2	19,000	456,000	35,000	420,000	18,900	453,600
			-		<u> </u>			

ML

M. Kal

frey war

Comparative

245,000		236,400		258,240			Participated firms submitted pay order agaisnt 2% Earnest Money	
244,944		236,400		258,240			2% Earnest Money on quoted rates	
12,247,200		11,820,000		12,912,000		56	Total:	
453,600	18,900	420,000	35,000	456,000	19,000	2	Vvorkers Primary School, Daharki	T
453,600	18,900	420,000	35,000	456,000	19,000	2	16 Workers Primary School, Mirpur Mathelo	

it is certified that M/s. Muhafiz Secruity (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi found as lowest quotee with the amount of Rs.11,820,000/-

Mrs. Nuzhat Habib

Deputy Secretary (A&C). WWBS (E.S)

Member/ Secretary

Mr. Khalid Hussain Khokhar Deputy Director (Admin)

Workers Welfare Board Sindh

Member

(Syed Yanwar Authf)
Director (Finance), WWBS
Convener

Mr. Abdul Manan
Examiner of Store

Representative of Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh Member

Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi
Deputy Director (NILAT)
Govt. of Sindh
Member

Bid EVALUATION CRITERIA of the participated Security Companies in Bidding process (Technical Proposals) on 29-03-2018 at 11:00 a.m

		'महाएटी (m the basis of following parameters:	M/s. Dragon Security Services (Pvt). Ltd. Karachi	M/s. Zulfiqar Security Company (Pvt). Ltd. Karachi	M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt). Ltd. Karachi	M/s. Rehman Security Systems (Pvt). Ltd. Karachi	M/s. Famous Security Company (Pvt), Ltd. Karachi	M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt). Ltd Karachi
ľ	Company Profile			Obtain Marks	Obtain Marks	Obtain Marks	Obtain Marks	Obtain Marks	Obtain Marks
	Business Experience (No. 0) Years)	50	50 marks of the firm provides 5 sears experience in relevant tield is 30 marks it firm provides 5 years experience, in relevant field Please attach documentary evidence.	50	50	50	50	50	50
1	Annual Turnover in Millions	200	200 marks, if the annual turnover of firm is more than 25 million during last three years	200	200	200	200	200	200
1	CFO Managing Directors ex- 4rms Personal	50	Stimarks, if the tiem's CFO Akmergare Directors is of ex-Army Personal Picase attach CU's along with last Emonths	0	50	50	50	0	50
	Supervisor's ex-Arms personal	7,5	5 marks, if the firm's Supervisor's is of ex- 4rmy person Please attach CV's along with last 3 months pension slips and prove of company employee pay roll.	75	75	75	0	0	50
	Prove of trained Security mards persons	30	50 marks, if the firm proves that they have trained security Guards. Please attach CV's along with last 06 month's pay roll to prove that they are permanent employees of the company.	50	50	50	50	0	50
ı	Prove of latest weapons and security equipments available with the firm	25	25marks if the firm has establishedhat they have latest weapons and security equipments. Please attach documentary evidence.	0	25	25	25	25	25
1	NOP Deployment Plan of security values for Sentiols and Colleges	200	200 marks, if the firm has submitted the chards Deployment Plan for ad Workers Model Schools and Colleges in Small as mentioned in the Linancial Proposal Please attach deployment plan describing stating methodology and SOP for comprehensive security of the schools	0	200	200	O	0	200
1	List of team members protessionals directly associating in making Deployment Plan and Site S.C.P.S	50	50 marks if the firm has minimimin 10 ex- Army afficers Retired from Intantry Aratlery EME Ordinance qualified for making Deployment Plan and 8 () 17's as per client's requirement Please attach CF's along with last 06 month's pay roll to prove that they are permanent employees of the company.	20	50	20	50	50	50
	Detail (Chent) list of Security Services provide in, Private Organizations - Government Sem: Government Departments	150	75 mark if the firm has contracts of 500 Guards per Ammin in Private Organizations Government Semi Government Departments I Sumarks at the firm has contracts of 1000 Guards per Jonain in Private Organizations Government Semi Government Departments Please attach documentary	150	150	150	150	75	150
	Registration with Ministry of Interior - Provincial Home Department	25	25marks of the turn has Registration Certificate from Interior Division or Provincial Home Department Please attach documentary evidence	25	25	25	25	25	25
	Registration with Securities & Exchange Commission of Pokision	20	20marks if the firm has Registration Certificate from Securities & Exclining Commission of Pokisian Please attach Jocumentary cyclence.	20	20	0	0	20	0
	Registration with all Pakistan Security Agencies Association	20	All Pakistan Negarity Agaica ies Association Please attach dicumentary evidence.	20	20	20	20	20	20

M - 100

All home 4 -1

/3	Performance & Clearance certificate from Police, Special Brooch and Investigation purcon	25	25marks if the firm has Performance & Clearance Certificate from Police, Special Branch and Investigation Bureau Please attach documentary evidence	0	0	25	0	25	10
1 ''	NIN & SRB Registration Certificates		Mondatory	Mandatory	Mandatory	Mandatory	Mandatory	Mandatory	Mandator
	Income Lax Annual Returns of 05 Years	60	20 marks for every year on production of cannual tax pand returns, subject to maximum 60 marks.	60	60	60	60	60	60
•	Audited Emancial Statements Baiance Sheet of 3 years	200	Financial Statement Report - Balance Sheet,	200	200	200	200	200	200
				870	1175	1150	880	750	1140

NOTE: I am must get 80% a e-960 [200 marks in Jechnical Proposa; for qualifying as per above mentioned criteria

Mrs. Nuzhat Habib

Deputy Secretary (A&C). WWBS (E.S)

Member/ Secretary

Mr. Khalid Hussain Khokhar

Deputy Director (Admin) Workers Welfare Board Sindh

Member

Mr. Abdul Manan

Examiner of Store

Representative of Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh

Member

Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi
Deputy Director (NILAT)

Govt. of Sindh Member

(Syed Anwar kusaf)

Director (Finance), WWBS Convener

Workers Welfare Board Sindh ATTENDANCE BID OPENING SHEET (FINANCIAL PROPOSAL)

Subject: Procurement of Security Guards

Dated:- 05/4/2018

	u	,	2	F	-		Sr. No.	<u> </u>
	IM/s. Zulfiquar Security Co. (Pvt) Ltd		M/s. Muhafiz Security (Byt) (+)	W/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd.		Participated Firms	Name of	
_	\mathcal{A}	2364001-1	1-102-101-1	10116436	earnest money	and Amount of	Pay Orders No.	
144/140/	100011001	1 x zoon	12712001		- FIFM	Amount Quoted by the		
+01158100 0021421X/00116021	11/1520 2087 000mg	1, 6,7 4-	12912000		Procurement Committee	Amount as Calculated		
03613511007	1300 2081411	1140000	0400 800 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 1		Phone No./ E-mail	2	Time :-	ļ.
1:1/1			11-11	participated firm	representative by	Signature of the	Time :- 11:30 am	•

Deputy Secretary WWBS (E.S) (Mrs. Nuzhat Habib) Member/ Secretary

(Abdul Manan)

Representative, Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh

Member

Deputy Director (Admin) WWBS. (Mr. Khalid Hussain Khokhar) Member

Deputy Director (NILAT) (Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi) Member

Director (Finance), WWBS. (S¥ed Anw∯r Ausaf)

105 4/18

Convener

ATTENDANCE BID OPENING SHEET Workers Welfare Board Sindh

(TECHNICHAL PROPOSAL)

Subject: Procurement of Security Guards

Dated: 29/3/2018 (Tirne: 11:00 A.M)

•			
Sr. No.	Name of Participated Firms	Phone No./ E-mail	Signature of the representative by the participated firms,
1	M/s. Zulfiquar Security Co. (Pvt) Ltd	03013511007	Salvan Supposition Ifth.
2	M/s. Sakru Security Services (Pvt) Ltd		
ω	M/s. (SPS) Security & Protection System (Pvt) Ltd.		
4	M/s. Internet Security Systems (Pvt) Ltd.	0300.8217424	Manytor ALI Above Mally
5	M/s. Griffin Security Services (Pvt) Ltd		
6	M/s. Muhafiz Security (Pvt) Ltd.	0300-2051411/1300 8254721	4 ABUJAL 2
7	M/s. Rapid Security Guards (Pvt) Ltd		100
8	M/s. Raja Iftikhar Security Services (pvt) Ltd		
9	M/s. Rehman Security System (Pvt) Ltd.	0300-3485021	8164 a marin of 174 11.
10	M/s. Famous Security Co. (Pvt) Ltd.	0331 - 2645-253	Muhammod How Rakar St
11	M/s. Dragon Security Services (Pvt) Ltd.	754.314537	Muhammard Kassind Mr.
12	M/s. Quick Action Security Services (Pvt) Ltd.		

(Mrs. Nuzhat Habib)

Deputy Secretary WWBS (E.S) Member/ Secretary

> Deputy Director (Admin) WWBS (Mr. Khatid Hussain Khokhar)

Member

Representative, Industries Dept: Govt. of Sindh (Mr. Abdul Manan)

Member

(Syed Anwer Ausaf)

Deputy Director (NILAT) (Mr. Noor-ul-Hadi)

Member

Director (Finance), WWBS

Convener