

SINDH PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY

CONTRACT EVALUATION FORM

TO BE FILLED IN BY ALL PROCURING AGENCIES FOR PUBLIC CONTRACT OF WORKS, SERVICES & GOODS

- 1) NAME OF THE ORGANIZATION / DEPTT: Agricultural Engineering, Agriculture Department, government of Sindh.
- 2) PROVINCIAL / LOCAL GOVT./OTHER: Provincial
- 3) TITLE OF CONTRACT: Purchase of Crawler tractors under "Scheme Replacement of Earth Moving Machinery in Sindh".
- 4) TENDER NUMBER: DAE/Stores-941/1769/11 dated 28-9-2011
- 5) BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CONTRACT:
 - a. Crawler Tractors 143 HP, (16 Nos.) ON DDP BASIS.
 - b. Spare parts Valuing 10% Price of the Crawler Tractors / Bulldozers, on DDP BASIS.
- 6) FORUM THAT APPROVED THE SCHEME: PDWP.
- 7) TENDER ESTIMATED VALUE: RS:422.875 MILLION
- 8) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE (For civil works only) NOT APPLICABLE
- 9) ESTIMATED COMPLETION PERIOD (AS PER CONTRACT): BEFORE 30TH JUNE 2012
- 10) TENDER OPENED ON (DATE & TIME): 02/11/2011 AT 12:00 NOON.
- 11) NUMBER OF TENDER DOCUMENTS SOLD: **Seven (7) Nos. were sold:**
 - i. M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi
 - ii. M/s Multiline Enerprises, Lahore.
 - iii. M/s Modern Motors (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi.
 - iv. M/s Rastgar & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi.
 - v. M/s Jaffer Brothers (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi.
 - vi. M/s Allied Engineering & Services Ltd. Karachi.
 - vii. M/s Ahmed Jaffar Co. Ltd. Karachi.
- 12) NUMBER OF BIDS RECEIVED: Two (2) Nos.
 - i. M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi
 - ii. M/s Multiline Enerprises, Lahore.

NUMBER OF BIDDERS PRESENT AT THE
TIME OF OPENING OF BIDS:

Two (2) Nos.

- i. M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi
- ii. M/s Multiline Enterprises, Lahore.

- 14) BID EVALUATION REPORT:
(Enclose a copy)
- 15) NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE
SUCCESSFUL BIDDER:
- 16) CONTRACT AWARD PRICE:

Attached as Annexure – A.

M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd.
Plot # 16, Sector 24, Korangi Industrial
Area, Karachi.

- M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi.
Crawler Tractor 143 HP 16 Nos.
Rs. 368.00 million.
- + Spare parts of
10% value of Crawler
Tractors. *Rs. 36.80 million.*

Total Rs.404.80 million.

- 17) RANKING OF SUCCESSFUL BIDDER IN
EVALUATION REPORT
(i.e. 1st, 2nd, 3rd Evaluation Bid)

Crawler Tractor 143 HP 16 Nos.
New Holland model D150B
M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd.
Karachi.
Ranking 1st

- 18) METHOD OF PROCUREMENT USED:
(Tick one)

- a) SINGLE STAGE ONE ENVELOPE
PROCEDURE
- b) SINGLE STAGE TWO ENVELOPE
PROCEDURE
- c) TWO STAGE BIDDING PROCEDURE
- d) TWO STAGE – TWO ENVELOPE BIDDING
PROCEDURE

Domestic / Local
--
✓
--
--

PLEASE SPECIFY IF ANY OTHER METHOD OF PROCUREMENT WAS ADOPTED i.e
EMERGENCY, DIRECT CONTRACTING / NEGOTIATION ETC. WITH BRIEF REASONS.

- 19) APPROVING AUTHORITY FOR AWARD OF
CONTRACT:
- 20) WHETHER THE PROCUREMENT WAS
INCLUDED IN ANNUAL PROCUREMENT
PLAN?
- 21) ADVERTISEMENT:
i) SPPRA Website:
(If yes, give date and SPPRA Identification No.)

**Secretary Agriculture Department
Government of Sindh.**

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

Yes	✓
No	--

i) News Papers

(If yes, give names of newspapers and dates)

- a) Daily Business Recorder Dated 30-9-2011.
- b) Daily Ibrat Dated 01-10-2011.
- c) Daily Sindh Dharti Dated 01-10-2011
- d) Daily Bakhar Dated 01-10-2011.
- e) Daily Deyanat Dated 02-10-2011.

Yes	✓
No	--

22) NATURE OF CONTRACT

Domestic / Local	✓	Int.	--
---------------------	---	------	----

23) WHETHER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA WAS INCLUDED IN BIDDING / TENDER DOCUMENTS?

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

(COPY ENCLOSED AS ANNEXURE-B)

24) WHETHER BID EVALUATION CRITERIA WAS INCLUDED IN BIDDING / TENDER DOCUMENTS?

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

(COPY ENCLOSED AS ANNEXURE-C)

25) WHETHER APPROVAL OF COMPETENT AUTHORITY WAS OBTAINED FOR USING A METHOD OTHER THAN OPEN COMPETITIVE BIDDING?

Yes	--	No	--
-----	----	----	----

Not applicable

26) WAS BID SECURITY OBTAINED FROM ALL THE BIDDERS?

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

27) WHETHER THE SUCCESSFUL BID WAS LOWEST EVALUATED BID / BEST EVALUATED BID

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

(in case of consultancies)

28) WHETHER THE SUCCESSFUL BIDDER WAS TECHNICALLY COMPLIANT?

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

29) WHETHER NAMES OF THE BIDDERS AND THEIR QUOTED PRICES WERE READ OUT AT THE TIME OF OPENING OF BIDS?

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

30) WHETHER EVALUATION REPORT GIVEN TO BIDDERS BEFORE THE AWARD OF CONTRACT?

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

(Attach copy of the bid evaluation report)

31) ANY COMPLAINTS RECEIVED (If yes, result thereof)

Bidders were informed personally

Yes	--
No	✓

32) ANY DEVIATION FROM SPECIFICATIONS GIVEN IN THE TENDER NOTICE / DOCUMENTS (if yes, give details)

Yes	--
No	✓

- 33) WAS THE EXTENSION MADE IN RESPONSE TIME?
(if yes, give details)
- 34) DEVIATION FROM QUALIFICATION CRITERIA
(if yes, give details reasons)
- 35) WAS IT ASSURED BY THE PROCURING AGENCY THAT THE SELECTED FIRM IS NOT BLACK LISTED?
- 36) WAS A VISIT MADE BY ANY OFFICER / OFFICIAL OF THE PROCURING AGENCY TO THE SUPPLIERS PREMISES IN CONNECTION WITH THE PROCUREMENT? IF SO, DETAILS TO BE ASCERTAINED REGARDING FINANCING OF VISIT, IF ABROAD
(if yes, enclose a copy)
- 37) WHERE PROPER SAFEGUARDS PROVIDED ON MOBILIZATION ADVANCE PAYMENT IN THE CONTRACT (BANK GUARANTEE ETC.)?
- 38) SPECIAL CONDITIONS, IF ANY
(If yes, give Brief Description)
(COPY ENCLOSED AS ANNEXURE -D)

Yes	--
No	✓

Yes	--
No	✓

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

Yes	--	No	✓
-----	----	----	---

Yes	✓	No	--
-----	---	----	----

Yes	✓
No	--



Director
Agriculture Engineering Sindh
Hyderabad

For Office use only

Bid Evaluation Report

- | | | |
|----|--------------------------------------|---|
| 1 | Name of Procuring Agency | <u>Agriculture Department, Government of Sindh, through Directorate Agriculture Engineering, Sindh, Hyderabad</u> |
| 2 | Tender Reference No: | <u>DAE/Stores-941/1769/11 dated 28-09-2011.</u> |
| 3 | Tender Description/Name of work/item | <p><u>PROCUREMENT OF:-</u></p> <p>a. Crawler Tractor 140-150 HP.</p> <p>b. Spare Parts valuing 10% Price of the Crawler Tractors / Bulldozers, on DDP Basis.</p> <p>c. Under ADP scheme "Replacement of Earth Moving Machinery"</p> |
| 4 | Method of Procurement | <u>As per Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Rules 2010.</u> |
| 5 | Tender Published | <p><u>Tender Notice was published in Newspapers:-</u></p> <p>a. Daily Business Recorder dated 30.09.2011.</p> <p>b. Daily Ibrat dated 01.10.2011.</p> <p>c. Daily Sindh Dharti dated 01.10.2011.</p> <p>d. Daily Bakhar News dated 01.10.2011.</p> <p>e. Daily Deyanat dated 02.10.2011.</p> |
| 6 | Total Bid documents Sold | <p>Seven (07) Bid documents were purchased by the following:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. M/s Allied Engineering & Services, Karachi. 2. M/s Rastagar & Company Pvt Ltd, Karachi. 3. M/s Jaffer Brothers (Private) Limited, Karachi. 4. M/s Multiline Enterprises, Lahore. 5. M/s Orient Energy System (Private) Limited, Karachi. 6. M/s Modren Motors (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi. 7. M/s Ahmed Jaffer Co. Ltd, Karachi |
| 7 | Total Bids Received: | <p>Two (02) bids documents were submitted by the following firms:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. M/s Multiline Enterprises, Lahore. 2. M/s Orient Energy System (Private) Limited, Karachi. |
| 8 | Technical Bid Opening date: | 02/11/2011 |
| 9 | No. of Bid technically qualified | M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi qualified for the opening of Financial proposal. |
| 10 | Bid(s) Rejected | M/s Multi-line Enterprises, Lahore, the bulldozer offered by the firm SHANTUI SD16 ECTIER3A Bulldozer of 160 HP, which is more than the specification mentioned in the tender requirement. |
| 11 | Financial Bid Opening date | 03/12/2011. |

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

Make & Model	Country of Origin	Manufacturer
New Holland Model # D150B (Italy Net 107KW – 143 HP)	U.S.A.	New Holland Kobelco Construction Machinery S.P.A. Italy.

S No	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6
1.	M/s Orient Energy System (Pvt.) Ltd. Karachi	Rs. 23.00 Million Per Unit	1 No.	Offer model is higher than the Estimated cost in PC-I, Rs. 20.00 Million	Bid was found technically responsive.	

Signatures of the Members of the Committee.

Director
Agriculture Engineering, Sindh Hyderabad.



Director General
Agriculture Extension,
Hyderabad



Additional Secretary (Tech)
Agriculture Department,
Government of Sindh, Karachi



Director General
Agriculture Engineering
& Water Management
Sindh, Hyderabad

SCHEDULE OF QUALIFICATION OF BIDDERS/TENDERERS

Note: Please supply the following information with the Technical proposal bid separately.

S. No.	Information to be supplied	Bid Reference
1.	Name of the Authorized Sole Agent of the Bulldozer Manufacturer nominated for Pakistan and business address	
2.	Legal status of the Bidder/Tenderer (Company / Partnership / Sole Proprietorship)	
3.	Certificate from the Bulldozer Manufacturer certifying the nomination of the Bidder/Tenderer as Authorized Sole Agent with year of nomination and current year's renewal agreement.	
4.	Name and address of the quoted Bulldozer Manufacturer.	
5.	Names, qualification and experience of the service engineers and technicians trained by the Manufacturer. Certificate of training should be appended.	
6.	Duly authenticated annual reports of the Authorized Sole Agent for the last five years giving general description, sort of business carried out, financial statement, turnover and business done.	
7.	The time since the firm/company has been in this business and the time since it has been doing work of similar nature.	
8.	The time since the particular equipment offered has been manufactured and the time for which it has been in service.	
9.	Reference list of similar works done by the Bidder/Tenderer indicating the name of customer, description and quantity of products, year of supply and approximate value.	
10.	Performance certificate from Government Organization or renowned private companies using bulldozers of similar specifications in Pakistan or abroad	
11.	Bank reference, name of banks and address may be given. The Banker's certificate regarding financial capability of the Bidder/Tenderer shall be furnished.	
12.	Details of similar nature projects under execution.	
13.	Details description of quality control testing and research facilities, if the equipment is manufactured under license, the name of the licensor and detail of the licensing arrangement, such as the duration of the license, the facilities provided to the bidder by the licensor and whether future improvement are available or not etc. A copy of the license agreement may be attached.	

BID EVALUATION CRITERIA (TECHNICAL)

a) PRELIMINARY SCREENING

1. Name of the Bidder/Tenderer

2. Whether appointed as Local Authorized Sole Agent by the Bulldozer's Manufacturer? Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)
3. Whether registered with Sales Tax Deptt. Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)
4. Whether registered with Income Tax Deptt. Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)
5. Whether a Certificate from the manufacturer confirming to supply quoted make/ model of Bulldozer, prescribed Schedule of Delivery attached? Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)
6. Whether HP of the quoted Bulldozer is within prescribed limit (140-150 HP) ? Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)
7. Whether Bid Security in shape of Demand Draft / Pay Order is attached? Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)
8. Whether 'Financial Proposal' attached with the bid? Responsive / Non-Responsive
(If Responsive, pl attach proof)

NOTE: *The bid/tender will be considered eligible for technical evaluation if answers to all points at S.No.2-8 are "RESPONSIVE".*

b) EVALUATION CRITERIA (TECHNICAL)

S. No.	Salient Features	Status
		Responsive/ Non-Resp:
1.	Matching with the prescribed specifications	
a)	Engine	
	i) Pl attach engine performance test report from accredited test lab/institution in accordance with SAE J1349 or equivalent standards, OEM authorization for engine manufacturing and valid licensing agreement, if applicable	
b)	Undercarriage	
	i) Undercarriage comprises of Track Link Assembly (L & R), Shoe Plates with nuts & bolts, Track Rollers (single & double flange), Carrier Rollers, Idler Wheels, Sprocket segment.	
	ii) Track should be compatible with the model offered.	
	iii) For undercarriage system minimum warranty for 2000 hours is required.	
c)	Blade	
	i) Angle	
	ii) Blade Capacity (m ³)	
2.	Average annual volume of sales of the Bulldozer by the Bidder/Tenderer (Local Authorized Sole Agent) for the last five years.– Attach certified copies of the Financial Statements.	
3.	Provision of After Sales Services (<i>Bidder/Tenderer to attach existing facilities available with all human and technical resources after Sales Services in conformity with Clause 7 of Section III - to be made part of the Contract Agreement</i>)	
4.	End user report about performance of similar kind of Bulldozer supplied to any Government or private organization locally or abroad.	
<p>NOTE: The Supplier should note that after sales services and facilities is core factor to accept or reject any bid..</p>		

BID EVALUATION CRITERIA (FINANCIAL)

The Financial Proposals of Technically Responsive Bids in conformity with Clause 24.7(ii) of Section-I only shall be evaluated on the basis of Criteria considering:

- a. Schedule of Prices
- b. Schedule of Delivery
- c. Schedule of the Life Cycle cost.
- d. Parts catalogue with prices.

The value for money shall be determined on the basis of Life Cycle Cost Analysis (LCCA) which shall include (a) cost of owning, (b) cost of periodic repair & maintenance, (c) cost of engine overhauling and (d) cost of undercarriage replacement over the period of designed life of bulldozers.

LIFE CYCLE COST OF THE CRAWLER TRACTORS (BULLDOZERS)

S.#.	DESCRIPTION	TO BE PROVIDED BY THE BIDDER
1	Bulldozer	
2	Make	
3	Modal	
4	Horse Power	
5	Cost of Bulldozer.	
6	Life of Bulldozer in Hours.	
7	Cost of engine Overhauling in Pak rupees.	
8	1 st engine Overhaul due after Hours.	
9	Spare Part to be replaced during first overhaul	
10	Fuel consumption, Litter per Hour	
11	Normal periodical maintenance of the Bulldozer (provide periodical maintenance Schedule)	
12	Component wise change interval of oil	
13	Component wise change interval of filters	
14	Component wise type & quantity of lubricant to be replaced during maintenance	
15	Component wise price of filters etc replaced during maintenance.	
16	Cost of undercarriage parts i.e. track links, Track Rollers (single, double, carrier) sprocket segment, idlers, shoe plates.	
17	Life of undercarriage recommended by the supplier in hours.	

NOTE: If any bidder fails to provide above mentioned information, the offer / bid shall be rejected.

SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF THE CONTRACT

The following Special Conditions of the Contract are deemed to be additional Clauses or shall supplement the "General Conditions of Contract". Whenever there is a conflict, the Provisions herein shall prevail over those in the "General Conditions of the Contract".

1. DEPARTMENT AND ENGINEER (Clause-1 of Section-II)

Pursuant to Para (g) and (h) of Clause 1.1 of Section-II, following are the Duties & Powers of the Department and the Engineer.

- 1.1 Department's Duties: The Department shall carry out such duties in issuing decisions, certificates and orders as are specified in the Contract.
 - 1.2 Department's power to delegate to the Engineer: The Department may from time to time in writing delegate to the Engineer any of the power, discretions, functions and/or authorities vested in her and may at any time revoke any such delegation.
 - 1.3 Any written decision, instruction or approval given by the Engineer to the Supplier in accordance with the terms of such delegation (but not otherwise) shall bind the Supplier and the Purchaser as though it had been given by the Department provided always that:
 - (a) any failure of the Engineer to disapprove any Goods, supply or materials or workmanship shall not prejudice the power of the Department thereafter to disapprove such Goods, supply of materials or workmanship as not acceptable and to order the rectification thereof in accordance with these conditions;
 - (b) If the Supplier shall be dissatisfied by reasons of any decision of the Engineer, they shall be entitled to refer the matter to the Department who will either confirm, reverse or vary such decision.
 - 1.4 Duties and Power of the Engineer: The Engineer shall be responsible to the Department and his duties are to watch, supervise and certify delivery of the Goods to the consignee and to examine and supervise testing of any Goods or materials to be used or workmanship employed in connection with the Goods. Further the Engineer will process the commercial invoice of each partial shipment submitted by the Supplier for payment after fulfilling codal formalities. The Engineer shall have no authority to relieve the Supplier of any of his duties or obligations under the Contract nor to make any Variation in order nor accept as expressly provided in the Contract, to order any delivery involving delay in completion or any extra payment to the Supplier by the Department.
- 2. DESIGN AND DRAWING (Clause 3 of Section-II)**
- 2.1 The Supplier shall, within the time stated in Clause 3.3 of Section-II, submit plan showing overall dimensions, construction details, installation procedures and data necessary to demonstrate that all parts of the Goods being supplied conform to the requirements of the Specifications.