



OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR DESIGN IRRIGATION IN SINDH HYDERABAD

NO. DD/CRC/196 of 2020
Hyderabad, dated: 05/ 08 /2020

To,

✓ The Assistant Director (Legal-II),
Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority,
(SPPRA) Govt. of Sindh,
Karachi.

Subject:- **MINUTES OF MEETING.**

Reference:- M/S Muhammad Iqbal Shaikh & Co. letter No.231, 232 & 233 dated 27.07.2020.

With reference to above referred letters, a meeting was held on 05.08.2020 under the Chairmanship of undersigned, the Complaint Redressal Committee scrutinize the proceedings submitted by the Executive Engineers, Small Dams Divisions, Kohistan-I, Dadu, Kohistan-II, Jamshoro and Nagarparkar & Mitthi, the minutes of meeting are enclosed herewith for further necessary action.

This is for favour of your kind information.


CHAIRMAN (CRC)/DIRECTOR DESIGN
IRRIGATION IN SINDH
HYDERABAD

c.c to:-

1. The Secretary to Government of Sindh, Irrigation Department, Karachi.
2. The Chief Engineer, Small Dams, Hyderabad.
3. The Superintendent Engineer, Small Dams Circle, Hyderabad.
4. The Executive Engineers, Small Dams Division Kohistan-I, Dadu / Kohistan-II. Jamshoro / Nagarparkar & Mitthi.

CHAIRMAN (CRC)/DIRECTOR DESIGN
IRRIGATION IN SINDH
HYDERABAD

*Post the CRC
decision - I have
put up urgent
memorandum
10/08/2020*

SPPRA INWARD DIARY
NO : 566
DATED : 07-08-20

*D
7/8
DD (Legal)*

**MINUTES OF MEETING OF COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 5th
AUGUST 2020 UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF DIRECTOR DESIGN IN SINDH /
CHAIRMAN CRC, IRRIGATION DEPARTMENT HYDERABAD REGARDING
COMPLAINT AGAINST DISQUALIFICATION IN TENDERING OF SMALL DAMS
ORGANIZATION.**

A meeting of Complaint Redressal Committee (CRC) constituted vide Irrigation Department Notification No.SO(RS)8-110/218-19 Dated 30th December, 2019 was held under the chairmanship of Director Design in Sindh, Irrigation Department Hyderabad @ 28-A, Civil Lines, Hyderabad on 5th August 2020 @ 11.00 A.M. in connection with complaint lodged by M/s Muhammad Iqbal Shaikh & Co. regarding following NITs of Small Dams Organization Sindh Hyderabad:

1. NIT No. TC/SDD/NGP/671 Dated: 15-05-2020.
2. NIT No. XEN/SDO/K-II/160 Dated: 13-05-2020.
3. NIT No. XEN/SDO/K-I/358 Dated: 13-05-2020.

The CRC comprises as under:

- | | | |
|----|---|-------------------|
| 1. | Director Design in Sindh | Chairman |
| 2. | Superintending Engineer,
Small Dams Organization | Member |
| 3. | Divisional Account Officers,
Small Dams Division Kohistan-I,
Small Dams Division Kohistan-II
Small Dams Division Nagarparker @ Mithi
(Representative of AG Sindh) | Members/Secretary |
| 4. | Executive Engineer,
Small Dams Division Kohistan-I,
Small Dams Division Kohistan-II
Small Dams Division Nagarparker @ Mithi | Members |
| 5. | Independent Professional | Member |

The CRC formally examined the grievances/complaints of the above said bidder/complainant vide his letter No. 231, 232 & 233 Dated the 27th July 2020 in terms of Rule-31 of SPP Rules-2010 (amended up to date).

The chair briefed the participants about the agenda of the meeting.

Meeting started with recitation of verse of Holy Quran. Chair welcomed the participants and then commenced the proceedings.

The Procuring Agency apprised the participants that:

1. The instant NITs were invited from the bidders/firms registered with PEC having appropriate specialized codes and eligibility criteria given in NIT & bidding Document in accordance with SPP Rules-2010 (amended up to date) SPPRA Procurement Regulations (WORKS) under Single Stage Two Envelope procedure with date of opening of Technical Proposals/bids on 02-07-2020.
2. The NIT was well advertised in leading Newspapers.
3. Following are the Technical Bids received, No. of qualified & unqualified Bidders:

S. No.	Name of Division	Technical Bids Received	No. of Qualified Bidders	No. of Disqualified Bidders
1	Small Dams Div. Kohistan-I	07	03	04
2	Small Dams Div. Kohistan-II	11	3	08
3	Small Dams Div. Nagarparker	10	04	06

4. The Technical Bids / Proposals were publicly opened on 02-07-2020.

The Complaint Redressal Committee heard the bidder/complainant as under:


Mr. Muhammad Iqbal Shaikh, proprietor of the firm, confirmed about his complaint lodged by him. He was heard about the contents of his complaint along with replies of Procurement Committee as under:

S. No:	Contents of Bidder/Complainant	Reply
1	Sir it is for your kind information that my firm has adequate experience in constructing all sort of large & small storage reservoirs, whereas, I have not been given due consideration in the field of specific experience.	The Bidder/Complaint doesn't hold the specific PEC Category of CE-04 (Construction of Dams) as mentioned in eligibility criteria.
2	Sir the Procurement Committee has not taken in to account my last six months bank account statement.	The bidder/Complainant has submitted his financial statement up to June 2019, however, if the Chair allows, he can submit his last six months financial statement. Even, after inclusion of his financial statement upto June 2020, the required score for qualification is not achieved.

CONCLUSION/DECISION:

After examining all the contents of complaint, technical findings & evaluation of technical bids, the Committee concluded that the procurement regime has been complied in accordance with SPP Rules-2010 (amended up to date) SPPRA Procurement Regulations (Works) & are based on merits. The CRC unanimously **reject** the complaint lodged by **M/S Muhammad Iqbal Shaikh & Co.** taking into account the views of the complainant & procuring agency in accordance with SPP Rules-2010 (amended up to date).

Chairman CRC/Director Design


Superintending Engineer
Small Dams Organization in Sindh
Hyderabad.


Independent Professional


EXECUTIVE ENGINEER
Small Dams Division
Nagarparkar @ Mithi


EXECUTIVE ENGINEER
Small Dams Division Kohistan-II
Jamshoro


Divisional Accounts Officer
Small Dams Division
Nagarparkar @ Mithi


(Pawan Kumar)
DIVISIONAL ACCOUNTS OFFICER
Small Dams Division Kohistan-II
Jamshoro.


EXECUTIVE ENGINEER
Small Dams Division
Kohistan-I Dadu


NIZAMUDDIN MEMON
Divisional Accounts Officer
Small Dams Division Kohistan-I Dadu