



Say No to Corruption

**OFFICE OF THE
DIRECTOR HEALTH SERVICES
LARKANA DIVISION LARKANA
dhslarkanadiv@gmail.com**

NO. DHSL/ (NIT # T00738-21-0006 CMCH)/-

Dated 30th April, 2022.

To,

The Medical Superintendent,
CMCH Larkana.

SUBJECT: DECISION OF THE COMPLAINT REDRESSAL MEETING HELD ON 30-04-2022 REGARDING NIT # T00738-21-0006 UPLOADED ON SPPRA WEBSITE ON 24-04-2022.

The subject meeting was held on Saturday 30-04-2022 at the office of the undersigned, copy of the Complaint Redressal Committee decision (M/S Jalaluddin Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers, M/S Asghar Ali, Government Contractor and General Supplier, M/S Mujeeb Rehman Tunio, Government Contractor and General Order Supplier, M/S Ashraf Ali, Government Contractor and General Supplier) is sent herewith for further necessary action.

DIRECTOR HEALTH SERVICES
LARKANA DIVISION LARKANA

Cc to:

1. The Managing Director, Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority, Karachi.
2. The PS to Minister Health and Population Welfare Department, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi.
3. The PS to Secretary to Health Department, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi.
4. The PS to Additional Secretary (PM & I), Health Department, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi.
5. The Appellants, (M/S Jalaluddin Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers.
6. The Appellant M/S Asghar Ali, Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers.
7. The Appellant M/S Mujeeb Rehman Tunio, Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers.
8. The Appellant M/S Ashraf Ali, Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers.

DIRECTOR HEALTH SERVICES
LARKANA DIVISION LARKANA

SPPRA INWARD DIARY

NO : 4068

DATED : 16/5/22

pls.
pull-up for hosting on
SPPRA website.
AD/LY
17/5



**OFFICE OF THE
DIRECTOR HEALTH SERVICES
LARKANA DIVISION LARKANA
dhslarkanadiv@gmail.com**

NO. DHSL/ (NIT # T00738-21-0006_CMCH)/-

Dated 30th April, 2022.

**BEFORE THE COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE
DECISION OF THE COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON
30-04-2022 REGARDING NIT # T00738-21-0006 UPLOADED ON SPPRA WEBSITE ON 24-04-
2022.**

Complaint Redressal Committee Notification No:	No. SO)PM&I)2-1/2021-22/M-07(CMCHL) By the Secretary Health Department Sindh.
Appellant	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. M/S Jalaluddin Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers 29-04-20222. M/S Asghar Ali, Government Contractor and General Supplier 30-04-20223. Mujeeb Rehman Tunio, Government Contractor and General Order Supplier 30-04-20221. M/S Ashraf Ali, Government Contractor and General Supplier 30-04-2022
Procuring Agency	Medical Superintendent CMC Hospital Larkana
PPMS ID# Reference No.	T00738-21-0006 UPLOADED ON SPPRA WEBSITE ON 24-04-2022.
Total Works in NIT	One Work
Appellant Related Work	Tender Regarding diet to patients at CMC Hospital & SZWHL.
Issue involved	Request for Revision /Modification of Evaluation criteria of Diet Contract 2021- 2022 of CMC hospital Larkana

Rjm
30/4/2022

[Handwritten signature]
30/4/2022

[Handwritten signature]

The Joint version of following before Redressal Committee on 30.4.2022:-

1. M/S Jalaluddin Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers 30.04-2022.
2. M/S Asghar Ali, Government Contractor and General Supplier 30-04-2022.
3. Mujeeb Rehman Tunio, Government Contractor and General Order Supplier 30-04-2022.
4. M/S Ashraf Ali, Government Contractor and General Supplier 30-04-2022.

MAIN AGGRIVATION OF ALL BIDDERS ARE COMMON AS UNDER:-


1. The above appellants submitted complaints before the Redressal Committee having grievances of experience of bidder completed at least last three contracts continuously of similar nature and cost during the last three financial years certificate/continued (2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021), This criteria has been made to give the benefit to the existing contractor, requesting for change of experience on similar assignments for convenience of all the competent bidders.
2. The demand PKR 30 million annual turnover per each year during last three financial years (2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021) also appears to be conveniently in favour of existing contractor who has been running kitchen in CMC Hospital Larkana for past 05 years. We demand change it in the experience 03 years of relevant field as per SPPRA Rules for supply to establish fairness.

The versions of the Procuring Agency's Dr.Abdul Sattar Shaikh, Medical Superintendent CMC Hospital Larkana.

The procuring Agency submits that all the terms and conditions mentioned in the NIT # T00738-21-0006 UPLOADED ON SPPRA WEBSITE ON 24-04-2022 are in accordance with the SPPRA Rules and regulations.


Observation of Complaint Redressal Committee:


1. Procurement Agency has upload NIT on SPPRA Website on **24.4.2022**, for financial year 2021-22, it is too late that **10 month's period** has already passed.
2. In NIT # **T00738-21-0006** uploaded on SPPRA website on **24-04-2022** the procurement Agency has mentioned no bid cost.
3. The Procurement Agency has demanded the security deposit of **PKR 1250000** as a fix amount without any specific percentage of bid cost.
4. No any related documents i.e. minutes of meeting of procurement committee for NIT preparation.


Rmy
30/4/2022
30.4.2022


Decision of Complaint Redressal Committee under rule 31:

1. **SPPRA RULES 27 2 (a)** experiences and past performance on similar assignments.
CRC has decided that instead of consecutive three years of experience, only at least three years of working experience on similar assignments in any government or semi-government institution should be fixed in evaluation criteria.
2. **SPPRA RULES 27 (c) Financial capability;**
CRC decided that **turnover of PKR 30 million** per year during last three years mentioned in evaluation criteria is right because satisfactory financial position of bidders are needed for the serious work of diet to the patients. Moreover, audit statement of accounts and income tax return forms of three years must be attached as supporting documents.


(DR. SYED MEHBOOB ALI SHAH)
EX: MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT
CMC HOSPITAL LARKANA
MEMBER OF CRC


(MR. NAVEED AHMED UNAR)
REPRESENTATIVE OF DISTRICT
ACCOUNTS OFFICER LARKANA/
MEMBER OF CRC.


(DR. RUSTAM ALI BHUTTO)
DIRECTOR HEALTH SERVICES LARKANA
DIVISION LARKANA & CHAIRMAN CRC